GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT

etf
SHARING EXPERTISE
IN TRAINING

THE EUROPEAN TRAINING FOUNDATION IS THE EUROPEAN UNION'S CENTRE OF EXPERTISE SUPPORTING VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING REFORM IN THIRD COUNTRIES IN THE CONTEXT OF THE EU EXTERNAL RELATIONS PROGRAMMES

HOW TO CONTACT US

Further information on our activities, calls for tender and job opportunities can be found on our web site: www.etf.europa.eu

For any additional information please contact:

External Communication Unit
European Training Foundation
Villa Gualino
Viale Settimio Severo 65
I – 10133 Torino
T +39 011 630 2222
F +39 011 630 2200
E info@etf.europa.eu

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT

CONTENTS

FOREWORD

Since its establishment the ETF has been extensively involved in the identification, monitoring, and evaluation of European Commission (EC) programmes aimed at developing human resources and promoting labour market reforms.

In order to be fully aligned with the commitment of the EC to mainstreaming gender equality into its cooperation for development, the ETF has adopted a policy for this for its services and products.

As part of this policy, and in particular in relation to the ETF's institutional task of collecting and disseminating information, these papers were commissioned to analyse gender mainstreaming policies in the fields of education, training and employment at international level and gender equality in the same fields in Jordan, Morocco and Turkey, which are priority countries for ETF work.

The papers provide an interesting overview of the situation in these countries, and might help potential donors to focus on gender mainstreaming policies in future assistance programmes/projects. The ETF is willing to continue to analyse the situation in these countries with a specific policy learning approach.

The papers were prepared by Dr Mieke Verloo, Dr Anna van der Vleuten, Dr Willy Jansen and Dr Feride Acar.

Dr. Mieke Verloo is a lecturer on political science and women's studies at the School of Public Affairs, University of Nijmegen, the Netherlands, and research director of MAGEEQ (Mainstreaming Gender Equality) 5th Framework Project based in Vienna.

Dr Anna van der Vleuten is Assistant Professor at the Institute for Management Research of the Radboud University, Nijmegen.

Dr Willy Jansen is an anthropologist and Professor of Gender Studies at the Institute for Gender Studies of the Radboud University, Nijmegen. She has extensive experience in the Middle East and Northern African countries.

Dr Feride Acar is Professor of Political Sociology and Chair of Gender and Women's Studies in Middle East Technical University and was the Chairperson of the UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) 2003–05.

The ETF's Thematic Group on Gender Equality
Ummuhan Bardak
Milena Corradini
Franca Crestani
Eva Jimeno Sicilia
Outi Kärkkäinen
Natalia Popova

1. INTRODUCTION

Mieke Verloo

1

More than a decade after the UN Fourth World Conference at Beijing in 1995, the strategy of gender mainstreaming has been endorsed and adopted by the governments of many countries (True and Mintrom, 2001), by the European Union (Theisen et al., 2005; Webster, 2005), and by 'nearly every important international organisation' (Hafner-Burton and Pollack, 2002)[1].

Studies of the introduction, development and implementation of this strategy are starting to analyse the conditions for the relative success of its fast introduction and the reasons for a general slowness in implementation. This report builds on the few sound evaluation studies that exist, and complements this review with internal reviews and critiques from other stakeholders.

Even though gender mainstreaming is a strategy that has existed for at least a decade, assessing its successes or weaknesses and drawing lessons for the future of gender mainstreaming in the fields of education, training and employment are not easy tasks. To begin with, there are a number of problems related to the strategy of gender mainstreaming per se. Several of the characteristics of gender equality policymaking in general and of gender mainstreaming in education, training and employment in particular contribute to the difficulty of assessing it.

MEASURING THE SUCCESS AND FAILURE OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING

- *Recent approaches to identifying the success and failure of gender mainstreaming prioritise the depth of the gender analysis (structural approach) and the inclusion of women's voices in the gender mainstreaming process (empowerment).*
- *Success can be measured according to policy stages and policy output: good gender mainstreaming is found not only in policy and planning but also in implementation and evaluation.*

1 Full references to works cited in this paragraph are given in subsequent chapters.

- *The presence or absence of prerequisites, mobilising and strategic framing is linked to success and failure.*

The first problem is that gender mainstreaming is a strategy which, while being analytically different from other gender equality strategies such as equal treatment, equality in legislation, positive action or targeted projects for women, is in practice not always easily distinguished from such strategies. As a result, policy plans and policy reviews often conflate gender mainstreaming and other strategies, thereby complicating the possibilities for clear assessment of its strengths and weaknesses.

A second problem is that the process of defining what would count as a success in gender mainstreaming is still at a very preliminary stage. In fact, Walby (2005) sees the elaboration of criteria for the success of gender mainstreaming as one of the hot issues related to this strategy. This is connected to a general weakness of political theory with regard to the theoretical modelling of success and failure. This report will build upon the work of Verloo and Moser to present a structural and critical process approach for the assessment of the quality of gender mainstreaming.

Moreover, there is often a fundamental lack of data illustrating before-and-after situations, further complicating matters. At present there is little information on what determines the extent of the impact of gender mainstreaming on policy changes, although factors such as timing and administrative and political support seem to make some difference.

More information is available on the prerequisites for starting gender mainstreaming. These are identified as:

- political will (at the top of the organisation);
- adequate resources;
- gender-disaggregated statistics;
- training for civil servants;
- the development of an infrastructure such as focal points;
- representation of women in decision-making processes;
- openness or transparency in policy-making processes.

(Council of Europe, 1998; Verloo, 1999)

Underlying these prerequisites is the need for a properly functioning democracy. Early assessments of success and failure of gender mainstreaming show that the existence of political opportunities, mobilisation on the part of civil society and the framing of gender mainstreaming in terms of mainstream goals are factors that can explain the (relative) successes found (Hafner-Burton and Pollack, 2002).

At present, the process of installing mechanisms to monitor progress in gender equality, the development of gender mainstreaming and the effectiveness of new policies is rather recent. Not all countries, and hardly any international organisations, have monitoring mechanisms in place. This lack of independent evaluation is detrimental to the identification of good practices. In most countries the bodies responsible for developing or implementing gender equality policies – usually government agencies – are also responsible for monitoring or evaluating them, usually in the form of annual reporting. In some cases there are specific monitoring mechanisms for certain policy areas, such as observatories on violence against women. The best practice so far can be found in the Netherlands, which has a biannual Gender Equality Monitor compiled by an independent research institution and an independent assessment committee which reviews progress and problems with gender equality and gender mainstreaming in all ministries.

Gender mainstreaming in education, training and employment in Jordan, Morocco and Turkey

- *Gender inequality in education and employment is linked closely to gender inequality in citizenship and in private relations.*
- *Poverty reduction programmes often offer lessons from international organisations.*

- *Jordan, Morocco and Turkey are very different countries in terms of their institutional and democratic capacity, colonial history, European future, and patterns of gender relations.*

The thematic focus of this report on the fields of education, training and employment, and its geographical focus on Jordan, Morocco and Turkey, introduce a number of other specific difficulties. The first is related to the systemic character of the problem of gender inequality. Education, training and employment are closely linked: professional education is often the starting point for occupational segregation in many different sectors (Neimanis, 2002). Gender theory and gender analyses of labour show clearly that the gender division of labour is strongly related to the organisation of care, citizenship and private relations. If women need a formal identity card in order to obtain formal employment, then the theoretical definition and practical consequences of citizenship are crucial to their participation in the labour market. This report therefore includes a short section identifying the connections between labour inequalities and other fields that might be relevant when working on gender equality in the fields of education, training and employment. Moreover, the varying focuses of activities by international organisations do not always centre on these exact fields, complicating the extent to which lessons can be drawn from them for this report. This is of particular importance in UN organisations, since poverty reduction is obviously related very closely to education, training and employment, although its scope is wider.

As regards geographical focus, one of the three countries involved in this study, Turkey, is aspiring to EU membership, while the other two (Jordan and Morocco) have a very different relationship to the EU. In fact the three countries are not very comparable. They differ in their former colonial links to western Europe, their current patterns of gender relations, their current patterns of education and employment and the problems these raise, their dominant religion, and their recent and not-so-recent experiences of authoritarian regimes, democracy and conflict.

This report takes a structural, critical and holistic approach to the fields of education, training and employment, using lessons from approaches on poverty reduction where relevant. It presents its own normative framework for assessing the quality of gender mainstreaming in education, training and employment, and outlines the need for additional information in each of the focus countries.

A STRUCTURAL AND CRITICAL PROCESS APPROACH TO THE ASSESSMENT OF THE QUALITY OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION, TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT

- *Gender mainstreaming is transformative because it addresses the gendered nature of systems and processes (structural approach).*
- *Gender mainstreaming should also be a strategy for empowerment by organising space for (non-hegemonic) civil society.*

To enable an assessment of which practices of gender mainstreaming are achieving what they aim to do, a short introduction to the strategy of gender mainstreaming is necessary. At the heart of this strategy lies the recognition that gender inequality not only pervades the behaviour and experiences of people but is so deeply rooted in systems, institutions and structures that a transformation of these is needed in order to bring about gender equality. This is most visible in the Council of Europe's definition of gender mainstreaming, which has been adopted by many policy actors. This definition calls for

> 'the (re)organisation, improvement, development and evaluation of policy processes, so that a gender equality perspective is incorporated in all policies at all levels and at all stages, by the actors normally involved in policy-making' (Council of Europe, 1998).

As a strategy, gender mainstreaming is seen as **transformative** because it claims to address and redress the gendered nature of systems and processes.

The first criterion for assessing the quality and success of gender mainstreaming is related to this. Gender mainstreaming should be more than a strategy of inclusion which seeks gender neutrality and aims at the inclusion of women in the world as it is, in a political order from which they are currently excluded. Gender mainstreaming is rather to be seen as a strategy of '**displacement'** (Squires, 1999), aspiring to move 'beyond gender', seeking to displace patriarchal gender hierarchies, and deconstructing discursive regimes that engender the subject. What is problematised is not (only) the exclusion of women or men as a norm, but the gendered world in itself. Gender mainstreaming is therefore a strategy that addresses the level of structures, and one criterion for its success can be whether or not it succeeds in addressing this level.

Next to 'displacement' as a label for the structural character of gender mainstreaming, a second criterion emerging from recent debates is **empowerment**. What Jahan calls the agenda-setting approach to gender mainstreaming is based on the participation of women as decision-makers: 'Women participate in all development decisions and through this process bring about a fundamental change in the existing development paradigm' (Jahan, 1995). In her analysis, it is important that women's voices steer the transformation. While it is obviously simplistic to assume that the participation of women will in itself lead directly to fundamental change, as this would deny the different political positions taken by women and hegemonic dynamics within feminism, some concept of voice seems to be needed. Here, Fraser's concept of 'subaltern or non-hegemonic counterpublics' might be useful, because it offers a perspective on actors and struggle in the politics of implementation of gender mainstreaming (Fraser, 1989 and 1997). In Fraser's view, under conditions of inequality deliberative processes will tend to serve dominant groups and subordinated groups will not get the opportunity to think through and articulate their interests fully. In other words, transformation of the hegemonic order will not come about simply through women's participation, for such participation will be readily absorbed under conditions of inequality, and there will only be a chance to resist ongoing hegemonisation if there is space for subaltern counterpublics. To be transformative, then, gender mainstreaming should be not only a strategy of displacement but also a strategy of empowerment, by organising space for non-hegemonic actors to struggle about the agenda of gender equality and its promotion.

Models to assess gender mainstreaming

- *Gender mainstreaming needs to encompass four policy stages: rhetoric, planning, implementation and evaluation.*
- *Lack of implementation can show as evaporation, invisibilisation and resistance.*
- *Input, output, effect and impact indicators are needed.*

One of the few authors to present both an overview of gender mainstreaming in practice and a model to assess progress is Caroline Moser. Moser (2005) discusses progress in gender mainstreaming in terms of four related stages:

1. embracing the terminology of gender equality and gender mainstreaming;
2. getting a gender mainstreaming strategy in place;
3. implementing gender mainstreaming in practice;
4. evaluating or auditing the practice of gender mainstreaming.

By using a process approach Moser is able to conclude that development institutions, national organisations and international NGOs have all adopted the terminology of gender equality and gender mainstreaming. Based on a desk review, Moser and Moser (2003) also find that most organisations identify a dual strategy of mainstreaming gender equality issues

into all their polices, programmes and projects, with supporting targeted actions for gender equality. Seven achievements are identified in an expert consultation:

- greater public awareness;
- significant strengthening of women's organisations;
- strengthening of women's machineries;
- more resource allocations to social sectors;
- legal reforms;
- the use of a human rights framework;
- considerable improvements in sex-disaggregated data.

A large majority of organisations (80–90%) use gender training, systems and tools for monitoring and evaluation, gender analysis in some form, and support to women's active role in decision-making. Putting gender mainstreaming into practice is more difficult, however, and in that respect progress is less visible and more uneven. Here three concepts are used to measure a lack of implementation: **evaporation**, when good policy intentions are not followed through in practice; **invisibilisation**, when monitoring and evaluation procedures fail to identify what is occurring on the ground; and **resistance**, when effective mechanisms block gender mainstreaming, with opposition being essentially political rather than technical. A number of studies are mentioned, mostly referring to bilateral agencies, that assess most efforts towards gender mainstreaming as insufficient, inconsistent or patchy. Moser identifies the need for four interrelated sets of indicators: on input, output, effects and impacts; she comments that impact indicators on the empowerment of women are the main ones used in the existing research, chiefly through focus groups or staff interviews. Independent evaluation is rare.

GENDER, EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT

Gender and education

The two most important goals are:

- *gender parity = achieving equal participation of girls and boys, men and women in all forms of education, based on their proportion in the relevant age groups in the population;*
- *gender equality = ensuring educational equality between boys and girls, women and men.*

A very good and concise presentation of gender equality issues in education is given by Subrahmanian (2005). The abstract of her paper reads as follows:

> International consensus on education priorities accords an important place to achieving gender justice in the educational sphere. Both the Dakar 'Education for All' goals and the Millennium Development Goals emphasise two goals, in this regard. These two goals are distinguished as gender parity goals [achieving equal participation of girls and boys in all forms of education based on their proportion in the relevant age-groups in the population] and gender equality goals [ensuring educational equality between boys and girls]. In turn these have been characterised as quantitative/numerical and qualitative goals respectively. In order to consider progress towards both types of goal, both quantitative and qualitative assessments need to be made of the nature of progress towards gender equality. Achieving gender parity is just one step towards gender equality in and through education. An education system with equal numbers of boys and girls participating, who may progress evenly through the system, may not in fact be based on gender equality. Following Wilson (Human Rights: Promoting gender equality in and through education. Background paper for EFA GMR 2003/4, 2003) a consideration of gender equality in education therefore needs to be understood as the right to education [access and participation], as well as rights within education [gender-aware educational environments, processes, and outcomes], and rights through education [meaningful education outcomes that link education equality with wider processes of gender justice].

As Subrahmanian argues, the most important issues in education are **gender parity**, both in participation in education and in completion of education, and **gender equality** within the education system, in the teaching profession (this is linked closely to gender equality in employment), in school curricula and teacher training (norms and values transmitted in education), and in parents' involvement in education (see also Gender Briefs in Neimanis, 2002).

Gender, training and employment

The two most important goals are:

- *gender parity = achieving equal participation of men and women in all forms of employment;*
- *gender equality = ensuring equality between women and men in the labour market (labour conditions that enable reconciliation of work and family life for men and women, equal wages and benefits, equal career opportunities, unbiased job descriptions, measures against sexual harassment, equality in private governance).*
- *Four types of segregation are very important: horizontal segregation, vertical segregation, job time segregation and contract segregation.*

For the gender problematic as related to employment issues, Neimanis (2002) also provides a good introduction in her Gender Briefs. Parallel to Subrahmanian, she argues that there is a need for gender parity in employment (equality of participation), and a need for gender equality in the labour market (labour conditions that enable the reconciliation of work and family life for both men and women, unbiased hiring practices, training schemes and job descriptions, and equal pay). The problem embraces all types of gender segregation: **horizontal** segregation (women and men working in different sectors offering different chances for jobs, careers and high payment), **vertical** segregation (differences in the level of the job), **job time** segregation (differences in part-time and full-time employment, including different chances for training and careers), and **contract** segregation (differences in permanent and temporary contracts, leading to inequality in wages and benefits).

Three further issues need to be stressed. First, gender inequality in employment at meso and micro level is caused by a lack of attention to gender equality in macroeconomic policies. Second, the organisation of unpaid care work not only causes gender inequality in itself but is also a major source of inequality in employment more broadly, because it hinders women's equal chances on the labour market. Third, the increasing privatisation in both employment and education is often detrimental to equality between women and men in decision-making in private governance.

When engaging in gender mainstreaming in employment, there is thus a need to include attention to gender mainstreaming in macroeconomic policies, unpaid care work, and decision making in private governance.

CONCLUSION

To summarise, the success of gender mainstreaming can be measured in terms of the extent to which its approach is structural and empowering: whether it addresses structures and institutions, and whether it provides more space for women's voices in policymaking. It can also be measured in terms of its integration into the stages of the policy process, whether the principal prerequisites and the relevant terminology are in place, whether plans for implementation have been made, whether practical action has occurred, and whether independent monitoring and evaluation based on sound indicators is planned or executed.

A gender perspective on education and employment should pay attention to gender parity (equal participation of girls and boys, men and women) in education and should incorporate a gender perspective in all polices and programmes that aim to influence the numbers of children and adults who receive and complete education. Attention should also be paid to

gender-aware educational environments and to educational segregation. As regards employment, different types of gender-based occupational segregation are a constitutive part of gender inequality, and policies focused on the labour market need to be screened so that they counterbalance tendencies towards occupational segregation. In a wider sense, gender equality needs to be mainstreamed into macroeconomic policies, policies and regulations on unpaid care work, and decision-making in private governance. In all gender mainstreaming practices, women's voices must be included.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Council of Europe, Group of Specialists, *Gender mainstreaming: Conceptual framework, methodology and presentation of good practices*. Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 1998.

European Commission, *Incorporating equal opportunities for women and men into all community policies and activities*, Communication from the Commission, COM (96) 67 final,1996.

Fraser, Nancy, *Unruly practices: Power, discourse and gender in contemporary social theory*, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1989.

Fraser, Nancy, *Justice interruptus*, Routledge, London, 1997.

Hafner-Burton, E. and Pollack, M., Mainstreaming gender in the European Union, *Journal of European Public Policy* 7 (3) (Special issue), 2000, p. 432–456.

Jahan, R., *The elusive agenda: Mainstreaming women in development*, Zed Books, London, 1995.

Moser, C. and Moser, A., *Gender mainstreaming since Beijing: A review of success and limitations in international institutions*, Oxfam, 2003.

Moser, C., Has gender mainstreaming failed? A comment on international development agency experiences in the South, *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 7 (4), 2005, p. 576–590.

Neimanis, A., *Gender mainstreaming in practice. Handbook.* UNDP / Regional Bureau for Europe and CIS. Part II: Gender briefs, 2002. http://gender.undp.sk/index.cfm?module=database&page=event&eventID=441

Subrahmanian, R., Gender equality in education: Definitions and measurements. *International Journal of Educational Development* 25 (4), 2005, p. 395–407.

Squires, J., *Gender and political theory*, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1999.

Verloo, M., Displacement and empowerment: Reflections on the concept and practice of the Council of Europe approach to gender mainstreaming and gender equality, *Social Politics* 12 (3), 2005, p. 344–365.

Walby, S., Gender mainstreaming: Productive tensions in theory and practice, *Social Politics* 12 (3), 2005, p. 321–343.

2. GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

2

Anna Van Der Vleuten and Mieke Verloo

INTRODUCTION

- *Equality between women and men is one of the fundamental principles of the European Union.*
- *The European Union pursues a three-pronged strategy towards gender equality, combining legislation, positive actions and gender mainstreaming.*

Equality between women and men is one of the fundamental principles of the European Union, as expressed in European Community law and in rulings by the European Court of Justice. It is enshrined in Article 119 (now 141 EC) of the Treaty of Rome (1957) on equal pay for equal work or work of equal value. In order to make gender equality a reality, the European Union pursues a three-pronged strategy, combining legislation, positive actions and gender mainstreaming.

The concept of gender mainstreaming appeared in European Commission documents for the first time in 1989, in a working paper by Helle Jacobsen, a Danish expert on equal opportunities. It was included in the Third Community Action Programme on Equal Opportunities between Women and Men 1991–1995. It was intended to tackle the structural causes of inequality, but the concept was poorly understood and few actions were undertaken to implement it until, following the Fourth World Conference on Women at Beijing, it was adopted as a strategy by the European Commission in 1996[2]. In the Treaty of Amsterdam, which entered into force in 1999, gender mainstreaming obtained a legal basis, being included in Articles 2 and 3 (2) EC as the commitment to eliminating inequalities and promoting equality between women and men in all Community activities.

2 European Commission, *Incorporating equal opportunities for women and men into all Community policies and activities*. Communication from the Commission COM (96) 67 final, 1996.

Institutionally, the Commissioner for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities is in charge of gender equality policies. Within the Directorate-General for Social Affairs, Employment and Equal Opportunities, Directorate G (Equal Opportunities), Unit G/1 (Equal Opportunities for Women and Men: Strategy and Programme) is in charge of the overall coordination of gender mainstreaming. The unit is assisted in its work by an advisory committee, a programme committee, a high-level group of senior member state officials, and a Commission interservices group. The Women's Rights Committee of the European Parliament and the European Women's Lobby also play an active role in monitoring.

The practical implications of gender mainstreaming are elaborated in the Community Framework Strategy on Gender Equality (2001–05, to be renewed in 2006) which is an umbrella for all activities of the European Commission's services and which coordinates their efforts to 'combat inequalities between the sexes in economic, political, civil and social life, and to change roles and remove stereotypes in this area'. It involves policy analysis and planning, the collection of sex-disaggregated data, and the training and awareness-raising of key actors. The strategy is supported by a financial programme for 2001–2005 of €50 million. A Community Action Programme accompanies this global strategy. Since 1999, gender mainstreaming has been a requirement of the Structural Funds regulations[3]. In addition, gender mainstreaming is a requirement of the Employment Guidelines, which seek to coordinate the approaches of member states to employment and training issues. The European Employment Strategy (EES) was developed in 1997 and revised in 2003. Its objectives are translated into guidelines, which have been mainstreamed and include gender-sensitive objectives[4].

REVIEWS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

There has been no specific review of gender mainstreaming in education and employment, but material has been taken from general reviews.

Non-academic sources

ADE, *Evaluation of European Community support to private sector development in third countries*, Final report, December, ADE s.a., Louvain la Neuve, 2005. http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/32/25/36029538.pdf

Advisory Committee on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men, *Opinion on the implementation of gender mainstreaming in EU Policies*, DOC EQOP 59–2001 final, rev. 20 February 2002.

ETG 4, EQUAL as a driving force for gender mainstreaming, Summary, ETG4–Doc022–EN–v1, 2005.

European Commission, *Report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on equality between women and men*, COM (2004) 115 final, 2004.

European Commission, *Report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on equality between women and men*, COM (2005) 44 final, 2005a.

European Commission, EQUAL Success Stories, Development Partnerships working against discrimination and equality in Europe, 2005b. http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/equal/data/document/sucstor05_en.pdf

3 European Commission, *Implementation of gender mainstreaming in the Structural Funds programming documents 2000–2006*. Communication from the Commission. COM (2002) 748 final.

4 Council Decision of 12 July 2005 on Guidelines for the employment policies of the Member States, 2005/600/EC, OJ L 205/21–27, 6.8.2005.

Theisen, A.-M., Spoden, N., Verloo, M. and Walby, S., *Beijing+10: Progress made within the European Union.* Report of the Luxembourg Presidency of the Council of the European Union, Luxembourg Presidency, Ministry of Equal Opportunities, Luxembourg, 2005.

Webster, J., *Changing European gender relations: The findings of recent social research and their implications for gender equality policy*. Policy Synthesis Report to the European Commission, DG Research, 2005.

Academic sources

Beveridge, F. and Nott, S., Mainstreaming: a case for optimism and cynicism, *Feminist Legal Studies* 10, 2002, p. 299–311.

Braithwaite, M., *Mainstreaming gender in the European Structural Funds*, 2000. http://eucenter.wisc.edu/Conferences/Gender/braith.htm

Braithwaite, M., *Gender-sensitive and women friendly public policies: A comparative analysis of their progress and impact (EQUAPOL). State of the Art Report*. Athens: KEKMOKOP. A 5th Framework Programme research project funded by the European Commission, 2003.

Hafner-Burton, E. and Pollack, M., Gender mainstreaming and global governance. *Feminist Legal Studies* 10, 2002, p. 285–298.

Liebert, U., Europeanising gender mainstreaming: constraints and opportunities in the multilevel Euro-polity. *Feminist Legal Studies* 10, 2002, p. 241–256.

Mosesdottir, L. and Erlingsdottir, Rosa G., Spreading the word across Europe. Gender mainstreaming as a political and policy project. *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 7 (4), 2005, p. 513–531.

Pollack, M. and Hafner-Burton, E., Mainstreaming gender in the European Union. *Journal of European Public Policy* 7 (3), 2000, p. 432–456.

Rees, T., *Mainstreaming equality in the European Union: Education, training and labour market policies*. Routledge, London, 1998.

Rubery, J., Gender mainstreaming and gender equality in the EU: The impact of the EU employment strategy. *Industrial Relations Journal* 33 (5), 2002.

Rubery, J., Gender mainstreaming and women's employability in EU countries. Paper presented at regional symposium on mainstreaming gender into economic polices, Geneva, 28–30 January 2004.

Verloo, M., Mainstreaming gender equality in Europe: A critical framework analysis. *Greek Review of Social Research* 117 B, 2005, p. 11–35.

FINDINGS OF THE REVIEWS

General observations

- *Gender mainstreaming is understood very differently across Member States*
- *Real implementation is still lacking.*
- *The suite of indicators to monitor progress on gender equality is incomplete.*

The academic reviews of gender mainstreaming all come to similar conclusions (Verloo, 2006). Understanding and adaptation of the concept of gender mainstreaming vary widely in the EU Member States, ranging from the equation of the concept with equal opportunities and equality to its being understood as embracing affirmative action, equal treatment, equal participation, and reform of government. At the level of implementation, most policies implemented in the Member States are simply a continuation of previous policies (Behning and Serrano Pascual, 2001; Stratigaki, 2004). There are different 'gender equality frameworks' and different and sometimes competing ideas about what the problem is, who is responsible for it, what the causes and effects are, and what a solution would be. In particular, Ulrike Liebert (2002) explores the conditions for empowering gender mainstreaming as a new policy framework in the member states, the patterns and dynamics of mainstreaming

implementation in different EU Member States; which mechanisms have done most to ensure effective cross-border diffusion of good mainstreaming practices in the face of diverging gender regimes.

The Luxembourg Presidency stated in its report (Theisen et al., 2005) that the 1998 EU pledge to develop a simple suite of indicators to monitor progress on the Beijing Platform for Action (BPfA) is as yet unfulfilled, and that there are serious challenges to the development of the indicators and statistical data necessary to monitor the effectiveness of policy developments relevant to the BPfA. The development of indicators has progressed furthest in areas associated with the economy, though even here there are major gaps, especially in relation to the adequacy of the data. In several areas, there are no agreed indicators. The report identifies several specific needs:

- to develop an indicator on **poverty** and collect data that would capture resource distribution within as well as between households;
- to agree on relevant and available indicators on **education** for the purposes of gender equality, not limited to the European Employment Strategy alone;
- to collect data on the **gender pay gap** that is fully comparable, inclusive and annual;
- to provide statistics to support the Presidency's indicators on the **provision of care** for children and other dependants, relevant to the Barcelona targets.

Braithwaite (2000 and 2003) comes to similar conclusions, focusing on the Structural Funds. One of the general risks of the gender mainstreaming approach is that it does not set precise objectives for reducing gender inequalities. As a result, the treatment of gender can easily be absorbed by other policy goals, such as employment creation, economic growth or poverty reduction. To date, Braithwaite says, the main gender equality objective of the Structural Funds is to improve female participation in the labour market. Reconciliation of home and professional life is then treated as a means to facilitate women's more active participation in the labour market, rather than as an equality objective in its own right. Contrary to the rhetoric of gender mainstreaming, in the practices analysed by Braithwaite, efficiency and effectiveness, rather than equity, serve as convincing arguments for integrating equality concerns into Structural Funds programmes.

The mainstreaming strategy in the Structural Funds has led to contrasting results. It has had positive results insofar as increasing emphasis was put on gender equality in projects cofunded by the Member States and the Community, especially those supported by the European Social Fund in the field of education and vocational training. On the negative side, the mainstreaming strategy in the Structural Funds has led to the replacement of the women-only NOW initiative by EQUAL (www.ec.europa.eu/equal), which covers all social groups. Gender mainstreaming has not supplemented but replaced positive action in favour of women (Advisory Committee, 2002, p. 4). Therefore it is recommended that monitoring of spending be reinforced in order to avoid the shift of gender-centred funding towards other objectives and structural priorities (p. 5), and that Member States assess *ex ante* the impact on women and men of all policies, measures and actions financed by the Structural Funds (European Commission, 2004, p. 11). After 2006, Structural Funds policies will be refocused in order to contribute more to Lisbon objectives such as higher employment and an inclusive society, but the latter concept has been 'translated' as removing discrimination and paying special regard to 'vulnerable' groups such as people with special educational needs, without addressing the issue of gender equality (Braithwaite, 2003).

The Commission has produced a guide to gender mainstreaming in policy design for all those involved in the national EQUAL programmes[5], and an overview of projects

5 EQUAL Guide on Gender Mainstreaming (n.d.), at http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/equal/data/document/gendermain_en.pdf

developed in the framework of the EQUAL programme, offering examples of best practice in the fields of employability, entrepreneurship, adaptability and equal opportunities (European Commission, 2005b; see also ETG 4, 2005). Some of these projects aim to gender mainstream a policy. However, these practices predominantly target public authorities, and they are typically national projects: examples include the Danish project **Youth, gender and career**, which aims to make gender mainstreaming an integral part of the national system of educational and vocational guidance; the Austrian project **Just GEM**, which targets decision-makers who control labour market policies in a specific region; and the Dutch project **Bridging the gender gap at universities**. There is no analysis of the underlying factors for success or the potential replication of these projects.

Education

- *The EU has very limited competences in the field of education.*
- *Education is always addressed as linked to economical needs.*

EU efforts directed towards gender mainstreaming in education suffer from two key limitations. The first is the limited competences of the EU, and the second is the narrow scope for gender mainstreaming in the EU view of education, which focuses on the 'competitive and knowledge–based economy'. This has resulted in activities that are limited in both number and scope.

The EU has no treaty-based own competencies in the field of education and learning programmes. Responsibility for this domain belongs to the Member States (or in federal states, their regions). The EU acts only in a complementary way in certain domains, notably those related to the labour market and the Lisbon objectives ('the EU as a knowledge-based economy'). For instance, the Commission recommends that Member States eliminate sex-stereotyped subject and curriculum choices from early school age onwards in order to avoid the transmission of educational sex segregation into the labour market (European Commission, 2004, p. 11). The EU has sponsored some equal opportunities initiatives in the Erasmus, Leonardo, Socrates and Youth programmes, but there has been no systematic approach. Rees (1998) assessed the programmes, and observes that the policy is not based upon a sound analysis of the gendered nature of education and vocational training and that, therefore, the initiatives remain isolated and fundamental flaws in education policies are not tackled. Gender equality objectives in EU education policy are limited to increasing female recruitment in scientific and technical studies and ensuring gender parity in tertiary and continuing training. The effectiveness of such measures for eliminating gender gaps is doubtful. Research shows that gender bias 'lies in the education system and its teaching practices, not in any inherent physical or intellectual barriers on the part of girls or women' (Braithwaite, 2003, p. 32). Mainstreaming gender equality into curriculum and assessment practices, classroom and school cultures and teacher education programmes would a be more promising strategy – but this falls predominantly under the exclusive competence of national authorities.

The field of research may be partially excepted from the above analysis. EU research policy is even mentioned often as a success story in gender mainstreaming, because of its comprehensive and integrated approach. In the framework of the Women and Science programme of DG Research, a comprehensive set of activities has been initiated, including the production and dissemination of an influential report on the situation of women in research[6], the development of an internal monitoring system (Gender Watch System), the creation of a network of national experts (the Helsinki Group), the organisation of European conferences, and

6 ETAN, *Science policies in the European Union: Promoting excellence through mainstreaming gender equality*, European Technology Assessment Network on Women and Science for the European Commission, DG Research, 2000.

gender impact assessments of all research fields, including the 5th Framework Programme Research Project. Gender mainstreaming has also been adopted as an approach in the 6th Framework Programme. Nonetheless, the field of research also suffers from being restricted within the narrow scope of the 'knowledge-based economy'. The Commission frames gender mainstreaming as 'realising fully the potential of the European Research Area' and therefore recommends reinforcing mechanisms for involving women scientists more actively in scientific research and in the research policy process (European Commission, 2004, p. 11).

While the Presidencies and Councils have not agreed on an indicator for the education and training of women and girls in relation to the BPfA, there are three relevant structural indicators, which are reported annually to the Spring Council. These are:

- 'lifelong learning' (adult participation in education and training);
- 'science and technology graduates';
- 'the educational attainment of women and men'.

The data for these are adequate and available from ESTAT. A further issue, for which there is no proposed indicator, is that of the segregation of women into subject areas which tend to lead to less well-paid jobs. The challenge identified by the Luxembourg Presidency is to agree on relevant and available indicators for purposes of gender equality, not only the European Employment Strategy.

Employment

- *Reasonable data and indicators in the field of employment exist.*
- *The EES is limited because it does not address the structures that create gender inequality and because it is not empowering.*

The EU has a number of indicators that apply to gender equality in the economy. Corresponding to the gender pay gap, which is a Structural Indicator, the 2003 Council recommended the target of a significant closing of the gender pay gap. While there are some reasonable data to support this, they are not fully comparable, inclusive, or annual. For example, some countries provide data for full-time workers only – even though the operational definition of the Structural Indicator includes those working more than 15 hours a week – thereby excluding a particularly low-paid set of women workers in some, but not all, countries. There is currently a gap in the main source of data collection, as the European Household Panel Survey (EHPS) is coming to an end and its replacement, the Statistics on Income and Living Conditions (SILC) survey, has not yet started. The EU has had indicators for the provision of care for children and other dependants since 2000, and the Barcelona Council in 2002 set hard targets, within the European Employment Strategy, on childcare, so that, by 2010, the Member States should be providing childcare places for at least 90% of children between 3 years and school age and at least 33% of children under 3. However, there is no Structural Indicator in this area, and annually collected, cross-nationally comparable data are currently lacking. Eurostat has announced plans to include questions about care in two future surveys (Eurostat, 2004). In the Labour Force Survey for 2005, an ad hoc module will contain a set of questions on how childcare and other care responsibilities are dealt with and will also ask about the take-up of parental leave. In a couple of years SILC will include questions on childcare.

Statistical information on two further topics relevant to gender equality in the economy, the gender gaps in employment and in unemployment, is managed by Eurostat, since these are Structural Indicators. Under the early version of the European Employment Strategy, these were both indicators of equal opportunities. There have been hard targets to narrow these gender gaps, qualified by age, since 2000. Gender equality has been successfully included in the European Employment Strategy as the fourth pillar of the Guidelines for the National Action Plans[7].

7 OJ L 197/13, Council Decision of 22 July 2003.

This requirement has provided an impetus to the integration of equal opportunities issues in the employment framework. At the 2000 Lisbon summit, a specific target for the female employment rate of 60% by 2010 was included.

The European Commission presents an annual report on progress including recommendations for mainstreaming the gender dimension in the various policies (most recent issues: European Commission, 2004, 2005a). The reports generally focus on measuring progress in the reduction of the gender gap in educational enrolment, pay, employment rates, unemployment, sex segregation in the labour market and participation in decision-making (see annexes to the reports). However, in the 2005 report, the monitoring of gender mainstreaming is limited to immigration and integration policies, which are not of direct relevance to the present study. The statistics in the reports are not subjected to further analysis and do not result in practical recommendations or identify good practices with a high potential for replication. The recommendations are formulated in a rather general way; they insist on the necessary enduring commitment by Member States, Commission and Council to a series of tasks:

- providing coherent and comparable sex-disaggregated data in all relevant policy fields;
- further developing gender equality indicators to enable assessing progress[8];
- tackling gender-based segregation in a concrete and comprehensive way (not further specified);
- revising job classification systems and making job evaluation systems transparent;
- applying active labour market policies to bring women back into the workforce after extended periods of parental leave;
- removing the obstacles faced by women trying to reach higher and managerial positions;
- promote a gender-balanced participation of scientists, engineers and technicians.

(European Commission, 2004, p. 8).

The EC's Expert Group on Gender and Employment (EGGE) has conducted a gender impact assessment of European employment policy and the EES (Rubery, 2002). The Group argues that the practical definition and impact of gender mainstreaming are strongly shaped by the general EU objectives of a competitive economy (see also Pollack and Hafner-Burton, 2000), and have focused on supply-side measures without changing employers' attitudes (and even less adopting a more holistic approach to employment and social and welfare policy). The impact is greatest in the areas which are most consistent with the main aims and objectives of the EES: improving access for women to active labour market policies (for instance through targets or minimum quotas for the underrepresented sex), lifelong learning programmes, facilitating access to the labour market through the promotion of gender-neutral tax policies, the development of schemes to assist women entrepreneurs, and the expansion of childcare provisions. Even in these areas the development of policies has been patchy (Rubery, 2002). Actions to desegregate labour markets mainly consist of diversifying training programmes for unemployed women or women returning to employment, programmes to influence the initial choice of education, training and career, positive action programmes, and some limited incentives for employers to diversify occupations. However, there are few initiatives to reduce vertical segregation and no gender dimension is included in the measures to deal with skill shortages: women are not considered as a possible source of supply to key job shortage areas such as IT, and skill shortage in female-dominated areas such as teaching and nursing is not mentioned. Moreover, the EES is subject to the 'open method of coordination', which implies that member states ultimately define how they will implement the strategy and many different national outcomes are compatible

8 Every Presidency since that of France in 2000 has proposed a specific action in this field, but the only set of indicators in the fields of employment and education to date is equal pay.

with the EES and the gender mainstreaming 'pillar'. EGGE's reports show the divergent institutional embedding of gender mainstreaming in the Member States and the different timescales and measures applied. Gender mainstreaming measures in the framework of the EES do not deal with more general questions such as whether equality in the labour market means job equality or income equality, or how to change the behaviour of men and the gendered division of non-waged work. Even less attention is paid to the question of transforming underlying economic and social structures (Rubery, 2002).

Similar conclusions can be found in Mosesdottir and Erlingsdottir (2005), who recently assessed the quality of gender mainstreaming in the EES for the period 1997–2002. They conclude that the countries in their study (Denmark, Finland, Hungary, Spain, Austria, the Netherlands and Iceland) rely more on special action and measures based on the principle of equal treatment and the women's perspective than on gender mainstreaming. Moreover, they find that a lack of cooperation between social actors, bureaucrats, experts on gender equality and political actors hampers the implementation of gender mainstreaming, which requires the involvement of all these actors. They argue that there is a lack of attention to the interests of different women. They point out that the lack of a clear definition of gender equality or a clear identification of the desirable outcomes of efforts to promote equal opportunities is one of the reasons why it is difficult to measure the results of the EES. Targets are set to support the objectives of the EES, but they do not address the gender pay gap or gender segregation, the most urgent gender-related problems affecting employment in the Nordic countries. All in all, Mosesdottir and Erlingsdottir conclude that the EES has had limited empowering effect.

A recent evaluation report of European Community support to private-sector development (PSD) in third countries (ADE, 2005) is also negative in its assessment of how gender is used as a crosscutting issue in practice. Four cross-cutting issues are analysed: gender, environment, social issues such as working conditions or child labour, and good governance. Although most country programming documents explicitly mention cross-cutting issues, they do not give directions for the systematic integration of these issues into the cooperation strategy and in particular into the PSD strategy. Further, they seldom provide monitoring indicators and baseline information. In addition, the evaluators did not find evidence of any systematic attempt at concretely integrating cross-cutting issues into EC PSD interventions.

Progress and challenges at the EU level

Gender mainstreaming in employment and education is subject to two major constraints: first, the dominant position of the member states and the absence of a strong committed agenda-setter, leading to a picture of quite uneven implementation and impact of gender mainstreaming; second, the dominance of general EU objectives, which reduces the potential impact of gender mainstreaming to measures improving the EU as a competitive knowledge-based society. The use of indicators as a tool is not fully developed yet, and their development and use calls for improvement.

3. GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT IN THREE INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS

3

Mieke Verloo and
Anna Van Der Vleuten

INTRODUCTION

There is still no consensus on the failure or success of gender mainstreaming at the international level, and evaluation studies are still rare, fragmented and mostly not independent. In 2006, most international institutions put in place gender mainstreaming policies, but successes in implementation are hard to find. Almost a decade of gender mainstreaming practice has revealed its limited impact, according to Charlesworth (2005), and Moser and Moser (2003). Although the vocabulary of mainstreaming has been adopted, there is little evidence of monitoring or follow-up. A consistent problem for all the organisations that have adopted gender mainstreaming is the translation of commitment into action. Most evaluations of institutional inputs identify some successes but also reveal limitations. By contrast, very few assessments have addressed the operational and programming implementation of gender mainstreaming. As a result, the outcomes and impact of implementation in terms of gender equality are still largely unknown.

Some authors find that gender mainstreaming in practice has encountered sustained resistance (Charlesworth, 2005). For example, a review of gender mainstreaming policy as implemented by the UNDP, the World Bank, and the ILO (Razavi and Miller, 1995) found inadequate budgeting for the gender components of projects, insufficient development of analytical skills, poor supervision of the implementation of gender components, and a general lack of political commitment both within the organisation and at country level.

Thus, according to Moser and Moser (2003), the next decade calls for a twofold strategy: implementation of gender mainstreaming

(with far greater transparency in terms of documentation), and the development of more robust evaluations of output and outcome processes. While progress has been made, the next decade will provide the real test of gender mainstreaming in practice.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Charlesworth, H., Not waving but drowning: Gender mainstreaming and human rights in the United Nations. *Harvard Human Rights Journal* 18, 2005, p. 1–19.

Hafner-Burton, E. and Pollack, M., Mainstreaming gender in global governance, *European Journal of International Relations* 8, 2002, p. 339–373.

Moser, C. and Moser, A., *Gender mainstreaming since Beijing: a review of success and limitations in international institutions*, Oxfam, 2003. http://www.oxfam.org.uk/what_we_do/resources/downloads/FOG_MGD_3.pdf

Razavi, S. and Miller, C., *Gender mainstreaming: A study of efforts by the UNDP, the World Bank and the ILO to institutionalize gender issues*. Occasional Paper 4, UNRISD, 1995. http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/document.nsf/0/FC107B64C7577F9280256B67005B6B16?OpenDocument

True, J. and Mintrom, M., Transnational networks and policy diffusion: The case of gender mainstreaming. *International Studies Quarterly* 45, 2001, p. 27–57.

Villagomez, E., *Gender responsive budgets: Issues, good practices and policy options*. Background paper V, Regional Symposium on Mainstreaming Gender into Economic Policies, Geneva, 28–30 January 2004. http://www.unece.org/oes/gender/documents/gender.2004.grb.pdf

THE INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANIZATION

The primary goal of the International Labour Organization (ILO) is 'the promotion of opportunities for women and men to obtain decent and productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity'[9]. Decent work is the converging focus of the four strategic ILO objectives, namely rights at work, employment, social protection and social dialogue. The ILO's gender equality policies are linked to the concept of decent work, and its mandate on gender equality is grounded in the Conventions on Employment and Occupation (1958, No. 111), Equal Remuneration (1951, No. 100), Workers with Family Responsibilities (1981, No. 156) and Maternity Protection (2000, No. 183)[10].

The International Labour Conference has adopted Resolutions in 1985, 1991 and 2004 that outline the need to adopt and promote comprehensive strategies to eliminate the continuing barriers to equal participation of women in employment, the proper recognition and fair valuation of all work, including work which has traditionally been done predominantly by women, and the adoption of measures to help women and men to reconcile work with family responsibilities. These resolutions primarily concerned the efforts required of ILO constituents (governments, employers and trade unions); they insisted, for instance, on including more women in delegations to the ILC and other major ILO meetings.

The concept of gender mainstreaming was used at the ILO for the first time in 1999, when the new Director-General, Juan Somavia, announced that 'mutually-reinforcing action to promote gender equality should take place in staffing, substance and structure' of the ILO itself[11]. The policy was made operational through the *ILO Action Plan on Gender Equality and Mainstreaming in the ILO* (2001).

In the Plan the ILO chose three fronts for gender equality mainstreaming: staffing, substance and structure. Concerning substance, one of the aims was to apply a new methodology for analysis, which would involve (a) looking at the complexity of gender differentials in labour market

participation; (b) understanding the different constraints and opportunities affecting women and men, and (c) reviewing the different implications for men and women of the proposed solutions to ensure that gender concerns would be incorporated in planning, programming, implementation, monitoring and evaluation; (d) collecting gender-specific data and indicators[12].

Gender was also included as a cross-cutting concern in the Strategic Policy Framework 2002–05 and in the ILO Programme and Budget for 2004–05. The five regional ILO offices (Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean, Arab States, Asia and the Pacific, and Europe and Central Asia) have also adopted gender mainstreaming policy statements for their respective regions. Concerning the UN Millennium Development Goals, the ILO is responsible for providing data and analysis relating to the indicator on women in non-agricultural paid employment.

ILO documents mainly refer to the definition of gender mainstreaming formulated by the UN Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) in 1997:

> Mainstreaming a gender perspective is the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any area and at all levels. It is a strategy for making the concerns and experiences of women as well as of men an integral part of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres, so that women and men benefit equally, and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal of mainstreaming is to achieve gender equality[13].

Institutionally, the Bureau for Gender Equality (GENDER, created in 1999), based in Geneva as part of the Secretariat of the ILO, is the advocate for gender equality throughout the organisation. The Bureau reports directly to the Director-General. It advises ILO member states and staff. It coordinates and manages the gender Action Plan and the organizational Gender Audits. It also coordinates the ILO Gender Network, a team of Senior Gender Specialists (one or two per region), the Sector Coordinators at the Headquarters (four) and the Gender Focal Points all over the world (100) to assist in the process of gender mainstreaming in their respective unit or office.

REVIEWS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT

There has been no specific review as yet of fundamental policy documents on gender mainstreaming in education and employment by the ILO. Some of the following material provided building blocks for such a review. In the following list, numbers in square brackets indicate documents which will be discussed in the 'Findings' section.

General reviews

[1] Bureau for Gender Equality, *Final Report, ILO Gender Audit 2001–02* (internal report), ILO, Geneva, 2002. This is the report of the first organisation-wide gender audit. Gender audits are used as a key tool to implement gender mainstreaming within the ILO. An audit has two main components: (1) participatory gender audits in work units; (2) a review of key documents and publications. Gender audits improve the competence of staff on gender. They facilitate self-assessment and learning and establish a baseline on areas to improve. General information about the audit can be found at http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/gender/newsite2002/about/audit.htm

12 *ILO Action Plan on Gender Equality and Mainstreaming in the ILO*, submitted to the ILO Governing Body in March 2001.

13 www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/gender/newsite2002/about/defin.htm

Mata-Greenwood, A., *Incorporating gender issues in labour statistics*. Bureau of Statistics, ILO, 1999.
http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/stat/papers/index.htm
The main objectives of this working paper are to make differences and similarities between men and women visible in labour statistics; to understand and analyse the particular position and constraints of women workers compared to men workers; and to provide a basis for promoting gender equality in the labour market. Contains measurement methodologies used to assess gender distinctions in labour statistics.

Education

[2] ILO/IPEC, *Good practices: Gender mainstreaming in actions against child labour*, ILO, Geneva, 2003.
Includes some good practices on education as part of the fight against child labour.

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC).
http://www.ilo.org/ipec.
IPEC has recently produced a series of publications on gender, education and child labour, which tackles the interrelation between educational systems, child labour and gender. Each volume deals with one country. The series can be accessed through http://www.ilo.org/childlabour: click on 'publications' and then 'gender mainstreaming'. No review available.

Employment

[3] Bureau for Gender Equality, *Gender equality and decent work. Good practices at the workplace*, ILO, Geneva, 2005.
http://www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/docs/RES/398/F1448380228
Review of good practices at the workplace, presenting 25 good practices drawn from all ILO regions. These illustrate the experiences of governments, trade unions and employers' organisations.

Gender Promotion Programme (GENPROM).
This unit, part of the Employment Sector, is responsible for the global programme on More and Better Jobs for Women and Men. It has edited a CD-Rom containing information on legislation, national action plans, trade unions policies, etc. entitled 'e.quality@work: an Information Base on Equal Employment Opportunities for Women and Men' (http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/advance/surf.htm). GENPROM disseminates good practices by publishing booklets on specific topics and projects. However, there is no assessment available.

[4] Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality (WEDGE).
WEDGE's website contains 'lessons learned' sections based on experiences with different programmes. See http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/index.htm (to access, click on InFocus Programme (under Job Creation and Enterprise Development), click on Women's Entrepreneurship development.

[5] Kantor, P., *Promoting women's entrepreneurship development based on good practice programmes: Some experiences from the North to the South*. SEED Working Paper 9, ILO, Geneva, 2001.
www.ilo.org/dyn/empent/empent.portal?p_docid=SWEKNOWLEDGEandp_pro
Review of relevant good practices from small enterprise development programmes in the developed world that have potential for replication to promote and support women's entrepreneurship in developing country contexts.

Valenzuela, M. E., *The incorporation of gender in employment and anti-poverty policies: Challenges for the future*, ILO, Geneva, 2003.
Analysis of links between gender inequalities and women's poverty with an emphasis on Latin America. Recommendations primarily aimed at governments and at incorporating a

gender dimension in anti-poverty policies. Based on secondary literature; no discussion of good practices.

Mayoux, L., *Micro-finance and the empowerment of women. A review of the key issues*, http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/finance/download/wpap23.pdf
This paper concludes that women's empowerment needs to be an integral part of policies. Empowerment cannot be assumed to be an automatic outcome of microfinance programmes, whether designed for financial sustainability or poverty targeting. More research and innovation on the conditions of microfinance delivery are needed. The paper finds that cost-effective ways of integrating microfinance with other empowerment interventions, including group development and complementary services, are still lacking. Unless empowerment is an integral part of the planning process, the rapid expansion of microfinance is unlikely to make more than a limited contribution to empowerment. This paper aims to clarify these issues in the context of the debate about gender mainstreaming. It is based on research by the author and secondary source material. Fifteen case studies form the main basis of the arguments.

Training materials

[6] *Mainstreaming gender eQuality in the world of work*, http://learning.itcilo.it/gender/gms/
Online course designed and offered by the Gender Coordination Unit at the ILO International Training Centre (ITC-ILO), based in Turin. No review available; some information and preliminary assessment below.

[7] *Modular package on Gender, Poverty and Employment*. http://learning.itcilo.it/gender/gpe/gate_gpe.asp?p=1_0
Online course developed by the ITC-ILO in the framework of the ILO Gender, Poverty and Employment (GPE) Programme, as a basic tool for building an information base, awareness-raising and training. No review available; some information and preliminary assessment below.

Bauer, S., Finnegan, G. and Haspels, N., *GET Ahead for women in enterprise. Training package and resource kit*, ILO, Bangkok, 2004. http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/bangkok/library/pub4c.htm, link on WEDGE website.
Programme on training in business skills adapted by WEDGE from the ILO programme 'Start and Improve Your Business' (SIYB), which has already trained 100,000 entrepreneurs in 80 countries. WEDGE has incorporated issues on gender equality into the SIYB programme and called it 'Gender and Enterprise Together' (GET). The GET Ahead training package focuses on developing women's confidence, creating a 'business mentality', managing people and risks, and grasping opportunities in the business environment. No review available.

FINDINGS OF THE REVIEWS

First ILO Gender Audit

[1] The Gender Audit concentrates mainly on the institutional aspects of gender mainstreaming (staff and structure), since the ILO Action Plan also focused on mainstreaming the ILO organisation first, rather than on the substance of the work.

Analysis of relevant documents revealed that only a minority of ILO documents could be considered to be fully gender-mainstreamed in the sense that they addressed gender in terms of data and analysis systematically throughout the text or project cycle. Where data was not disaggregated by sex, the authors explained why. The majority of the documents were largely 'gender-blind'. In all key documents elaborating the Decent Work agenda, gender equality was a central concern. This is important as it stresses the inseparability of gender equality from decent work. Nonetheless, the documents are often more women-specific than gender-specific and do not address gendered power relations

and the way they are embedded in structures and institutions of society and of the ILO itself. The gender dimension tends to be operationalised in terms of women-specific projects. The complementary character of actions addressing women's urgent practical needs and those addressing strategic gender interests which challenge gendered power relations needs to be clarified.

Education

[2] The report *Good practices: Gender mainstreaming in actions against child labour*, 2003, assesses 19 recent initiatives to promote equality between girls and boys, and men and women, in the battle against child labour. Specific criteria determine the activities that qualify as 'good practices' in terms both of action against child labour and of gender mainstreaming goals (p. 3–4). Each good practice is graded according to whether it is well developed and has been tested or is a first trial. The good practices were put in four categories:

1. Gender analysis of a situation: for example, a gender analysis of a child labour survey (p. 21–25). Not only were sex-disaggregated data collected on paid and unpaid labour, but the information collected was comprehensively analysed and interpreted, using the concept of gender roles to explain inequities in domestic chores done by boys and girls, reasons for employment, and given levels of income.
2. Gender-specific actions to combat child labour: for example, a project providing vocational training for girls involved in rural and domestic labour in Eastern Turkey combined with awareness-raising, anti-poverty measures, educational support and training in family planning. MainSCREAMing gender through education, the arts and the media is another good practice in this category: it consists of a series of educational modules using visual, literary and performing arts and applying networking and campaigning methods.
3. Gender-sensitive procedures which incorporate a gender perspective as part of the ongoing ILO/IPEC work: for instance, a practical guide for promoting gender equality in actions against child labour (*The GECL guide*), and guidelines for gender mainstreaming in the design and preparation of project documents at ILO/IPEC.
4. Initiatives that give girls and women a voice.

The lessons learned were:

- For all categories of good practices, staff and partners with technical expertise in both gender and child labour issues are required.
- Even where sex-disaggregated data are not readily available, requesting such information may motivate partner organisations to start to collect them and set off the gender mainstreaming process.
- To achieve real change, strategies should not be exclusively gender-specific but also involve the other sex as partner and ally. They must focus on men and boys as well as girls and women and on the relations between them.
- Routinised procedures and reminders make it easier to mainstream gender in child labour projects and make it less ad hoc and less dependent on the commitment of particular staff members.
- Specific activities (participatory approaches) are needed to make girls and women more visible and ensure their representation in projects.

Employment

[3] *Gender equality and decent work. Good practices at the workplace*, 2005, contains 25 good practices that demonstrate how ILO constituents – governments, trade unions and employers' organisations – have developed strategies to enhance gender equality in their respective structures. It is the first part of a forthcoming ILO Toolkit on Gender Mainstreaming in the World of Work. The selection contains examples of practices ranging from national-level plans involving many activities to specific smaller actions

addressing particular gender concerns. It issues a reminder that a good gender mainstreaming practice must be context-specific: what is good in one setting is not necessarily good in another. Therefore good practices should not be taken as blueprints which can be applied everywhere. Actions specifically geared to improving the position of women workers can be an appropriate way to narrow gender gaps, but the reasons for working with women only should be clearly understood and expressed. Actions that target men and boys can also be an effective gender mainstreaming strategy.

The good practices are classified according to eight strategies:

1. A multisectoral approach to gender equality in legislation, policies and strategies: for instance, governments enshrining the principle of gender equality in national legislation, employers adopting family-friendly business policies, trade unions addressing sexual harassment;
2. Policies and planning for gender equality: the adoption of action plans to promote women's right of access to economic resources (credit), women's entrepreneurship, equal participation at all levels of the union;
3. Use of sex-disaggregated data and information: for example, on migrant workers, on employee profiles;
4. Use of gender expertise, strategically placed: a ministry for the promotion of women, a women's entrepreneurship development unit, a women's department in a trade union;
5. Gender-specific actions, targeting women only or men only: policies on paternal leave, family-friendly human resources policies, quota systems to increase the number of women in union structures;
6. Building knowledge and capacity on gender equality: toolkits, setting up pools of experts, mandatory 'dignity at work' training for managing directors;
7. Strategic partnerships: sharing knowledge and resources between governments and employers, governments and trade unions, employers and trade unions, tripartite partnerships, partnerships with women's organisations, international alliances;
8. Participatory approaches involving stakeholders in the process, which is important for gathering good information (e.g. about boys and girls in child labour) and ensuring that the users of tools understand them and have a sense of ownership over them.

The book covers a wide range of activities and actors, showing how different actors in different contexts implement gender mainstreaming and the effects and effectiveness of different types of intervention. It has added a questionnaire for identifying good practices on gender mainstreaming. The report does not offer recommendations or summarise lessons learned. It has not focused on innovative practices.

[4] In the InFocus Programme for Small Enterprise Development (IFP/SEED), special emphasis is placed on increasing economic opportunities for women and on gender mainstreaming. WEDGE, established in 2001, spearheads SEED's work in this field. The remit of the WEDGE unit is to ensure that all of the ILO's work in small enterprise development (SME policies, business development services, job quality, association building and the informal economy) addresses key gender issues and concerns. The WEDGE website documents good practices.

Lessons learned include:

- Women entrepreneurs require business support services rather than support in the form of welfare or charity.
- It is advisable to provide support through 'women-friendly' channels such as special financing windows, or by using women trainers and business advisers.
- Women experience specific barriers mainly at the stage of entering into business. once established they face the problems common to all entrepreneurs.
- Women have difficulty in getting access to finance.
- Women entrepreneurs are not a homogeneous group.

- Women are underrepresented in business or employers' associations.
- Networks of women entrepreneurs can provide much-needed support and boost women's self-confidence).
- Programmes for women entrepreneurs should take account of women's reproductive and household responsibilities, as well as existing gender relations and roles between women and men.
- Women's mobility is often limited (personal security, limited access to transport).
- Integrated approaches to the economic empowerment of women should be developed, including support for literacy, skills training (marketing approaches, modern means of distribution), and training in legal rights, health education and HIV awareness.

[5] *Promoting women's entrepreneurship development based on good practice programmes: Some experiences from the North to the South* does not describe specific good practices (apart from two case studies), but makes a systematic analysis of programmes offering support services. It identifies 11 success factors related to services supporting women's entrepreneurship, such as establishing partnerships between service providers in an area, promoting gender training for agency staff, decentralised service provision, a supportive public sector, and the use of female mentors. It also enumerates 10 success factors relating to different types of programme, for example:

- Design both group-based and individual programmes;
- Adapt programmes in terms of content, scheduling and length because women's multiple roles exclude them from participation in many programmes;
- Focus on sectors that can provide women with an adequate income, for instance moving women into higher-value markets;
- Provide basic business training using a flexible modular approach;
- Provide mentoring as post-start-up support;
- Provide training in new information technologies and develop ICT networks of women entrepreneurs.

The report also provides a gender checklist for evaluating programme design and delivery. It formulates recommendations on the importance of recruitment and awareness campaigns among potential women entrepreneurs, the need to investigate differences in outcomes between moderate-income and low-income women entrepreneurs, the importance of gender-sensitive needs assessments, the role of the ILO in coupling programme actions with policy work supporting women's entrepreneurship (p. 60–69). The report thus constitutes a useful tool for adapting the design of programmes supporting small entrepreneurship to the needs of women.

Training materials

[6] The online course *Mainstreaming gender eQuality in the world of work* consists of seven modules (costing US$400 each) and takes up to seven months to complete. The course touches upon many relevant and useful topics. Modules 3–6 in particular seem to be well adapted to the needs of those who want to apply gender mainstreaming in their organisations.

- Module 3, 'Statistical tools', aims to assist producers and users of labour statistics. It identifies steps to ensure that gender issues are well reflected in statistics (concepts, variables, definitions and measurement methods) and provides tools with which to examine the limitations and strengths of the data being analysed from a gender perspective.
- Module 4, 'Approaches and methodologies', enables course participants to analyse and review commonly used gender policy approaches and methods and to apply them to their own work environment. It evaluates the 'women in development' (WID) and 'gender and development' (GAD) approaches, commonly used gender analysis frameworks (such as the Harvard Gender Roles framework,

the Women's Empowerment framework and the Social Relations approach). It teaches participants how to use a gender mainstreaming strategy and complementary approaches (gender budgeting, 'men and gender') and discusses postmodern feminist critiques of gender analysis frameworks.
- Module 5, 'Planning and evaluation', enables analysis, review and adaptation of practical tools, methodologies and checklists for mainstreaming gender equality issues in technical cooperation projects.
- Module 6, 'Advocacy, sensitization and networking', uses a detailed diagnosis of the organisation where the course participant works to enable him or her to design possible counter-strategies and tools, make suggestions for overcoming obstacles to changing the organisational culture, develop strategies for obtaining management support, and develop advocacy skills (communication, gender-sensitive language, gender training).

[7] The *Modular package on Gender, Poverty and Employment* was developed in 2000 by the ITC-ILO as an online tool for awareness-raising and training. The Gender, Poverty and Employment programme aims to raise awareness about the interfaces between poverty, gender and employment and to enhance national capacities to formulate and adopt gender-sensitive policies and programmes for combating poverty and social exclusion through decent work, as well as for improving the quality of women's employment. The online package fits the aims of:

- enhancing the capacity of policy-makers, trade unions and employers' organisations, local governments and managers of anti-poverty programmes to understand the interlinkages between gender, poverty and employment and to develop, implement and assess anti-poverty and employment policies and programmes which contribute to gender equality;
- integrating the gender and employment perspective into national and international policy agendas on poverty reduction;
- strengthening the ability of development agents (international organisations, national institutions and NGOs) to provide assistance in this area.

The course consists of nine modules, including two on training and employment. Module 5, 'Investing in human capital: Focus on training', analyses inequalities experienced by the poor and women with regard to access to education and training, reviews different non-formal and formal training schemes, and identifies some new approaches. It formulates practical suggestions concerning recruitment, making training schemes flexible in order to cope with different needs and situations, and integrating training programmes and active labour market policies. Module 6, 'Expanding wage employment opportunities', highlights the main factors and processes of discrimination that women face in the wage labour market (including cultural constraints and lack of social services such as childcare), reviews strategies for enhancing women's access to paid jobs (including special employment creation schemes), and identifies the main elements of a gender-sensitive wage employment promotion strategy. There has been no previous review of the package.

Conclusion

The ILO has concentrated first of all on gender mainstreaming in staffing and structure. Therefore, the outcomes of the Gender Audit **[1]** also focus on these issues and on the audit process itself. Only after 2002 did the accent shift to the mainstreaming of 'substance'. Gender mainstreaming projects are still often understood to mean the insertion of a section or a component on women or girls. Many reports describe single projects only, which makes collecting information a time-consuming task. Moreover, the possibilities for replication of these projects have not been assessed. The reports on good practices, on the contrary, assess the lessons learned and show what gender mainstreaming is really about, offering useful recommendations for innovative approaches **[2]**, examples of programmes

by governmental and non-governmental actors **[3]** and recommendations for the support of women's entrepreneurs and the design of business support tools **[4–5]**. The two online courses train participants in how to gender-mainstream projects, but there is no information available assessing their effectiveness **[6–7]**.

UNESCO

UNESCO traditionally operates in the fields of education, science, social and human sciences, culture and communications. Gender is one of its 'mainstreaming issues', an issue that is present in all these thematic fields[14]. In 1994, an evaluation of UNESCO's actions concerning women and gender equality between 1988 and 1993 was carried out, entitled *Evaluation of UNESCO's Transverse Theme Women 1988–1993*. The evaluation showed that women's issues were not being systematically addressed in the planning and programming process. Activities in support of women remained generally scattered and often based on individual initiatives. The evaluation recommended, among other things, the development of an intersectoral and coordinated approach to the design and implementation of activities (UPSWGE, 2000, p. 10–11; see **[1]** below).

This evaluation prompted UNESCO to review its policies in the field of equality of women. It presented a new approach in *The UNESCO agenda for gender equality*, the policy document submitted at the Fourth World Conference of Women in Beijing (1995). One of the new aims was to 'mainstream a gender perspective in the conceptualisation, implementation and evaluation of policies relating to development, peace and security'. The Beijing conference adopted gender mainstreaming as a key strategy to reduce inequalities between women and men. For UNESCO, this also implied a paradigm shift from the WID to the GAD approach. A crucial difference was the extension of policies in favour of the advancement of women and girls to include also men and boys 'as their involvement and attitude change is essential in the process of creating social relations in which neither of the sexes will be discriminated' (UPSWGE, 2000, p. 4).

In November 1995, the General Conference of UNESCO adopted a three-pronged strategy in order to implement the Beijing Declaration and its Platform for Action. The strategy consists of:

1. mainstreaming a gender perspective in all policy-planning, programming, implementation and evaluation activities;
2. promoting the participation of women at all levels and fields of activity, giving particular attention to women's own priorities and perspectives in redefining the goals and means of development;
3. developing specific programmes and activities for the benefit of girls and women that promote equality, endogenous capacity-building and full citizenship.

Gender mainstreaming (or mainstreaming a gender perspective) is defined as 'the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action including legislation, policies, and programmes, in any area and at all levels' (ECOSOC Agreed Conclusions E/1997/100 in GEE, p. 5). Gender mainstreaming aims to:

1. forge and strengthen the political will to achieve gender equality and equity at the local, national, regional and global levels;
2. incorporate a gender perspective into the planning processes of all ministries and departments of government;
3. integrate a gender perspective into all phases of sectoral planning cycles, including the analysis development, appraisal, implementation, monitoring and evaluation policies, programmes and projects;
4. use sex-disaggregated data in statistical analysis to reveal how policies impact differently on women and men;

14 The other mainstreaming issues are youth, priority Africa, least developed countries, culture of peace, and dialogue among civilisations.

5. increase the numbers of women in decision-making positions in government and the private and public sectors;
6. provide tools and training in gender awareness, gender analysis and gender planning to decision-makers, senior managers and other key personnel;
7. forge linkages between governments, the private sector, civil society and other stakeholders to ensure a better use of resources.
(UPSWGE, 2000, p. 7)

Institutionally, the Section for Women and Gender Equality of the Bureau for Strategic Planning (BSP/WGE; also known as the Gender Unit; see http://www.unesco.org/women) coordinates the promotion of gender mainstreaming. The Gender Unit produces gender mainstreaming tools and organises awareness-raising activities in cooperation with the Gender Focal Point Network. Gender focal points have been designated in each programme sector at the UNESCO headquarters (HQ) and in almost all field offices (FOs). Their role is to stimulate the inclusion of gender concerns in all sector programmes and to collect and disseminate best practices and information. Since 2003, the Gender Unit has organised gender training workshops for the Gender Focal Points and other staff (HQ and FOs). Based on the experiences with the workshops, the Gender Unit produced a list of *Tips and good practices for conducting gender training for UNESCO staff* in September 2003. These include the following:

1. Gender training on its own is not sufficient; it is helpful 'if it is part and parcel of a comprehensive corporate culture of learning. This means that both the organisers and the trainees draw lessons from the training and apply this new knowledge to improve their daily work'.
2. Several tips aim at increasing the legitimacy and credibility of gender work, for example by involving external gender expertise, addressing the role of senior managers in encouraging participants to attend, and HQ + BSP presence. Men should be encouraged to attend.
3. Other tips highlight the importance of clarifying key gender terms, the importance of language and careful translation, the importance of experience-based training (reviewing existing UNESCO projects from a gender perspective) and of developing a 'product' that participants will be able to use when they are back at their workplace, e.g. the Gender Lens series of checklists (see **[3]** below).

REVIEWS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN UNESCO

There has been no review yet of fundamental policy documents on gender mainstreaming in education by UNESCO. Some of the following material provides building blocks for such a review. In the following list, numbers in square brackets indicate documents which will be discussed in the 'Findings' section.

General reviews

[1] Unit for the Promotion of the Status of Women and Gender Equality [USPWGE], *Gender equality and equity. A summary review of UNESCO's accomplishments since the Fourth World Conference on Women (Beijing 1995)*, UNESCO, Paris, May, 2000.

[2] UNESCO, *UNESCO Gender Mainstreaming Implementation Framework for 2002–2007* [GMIF], Paris, 2002.

The GMIF provides guidelines on how to implement the policy expressed in the UNESCO Medium-Term Plan.

[3] UNESCO, Series of UNESCO Gender Lens documents, developed during gender workshops, Paris, 2003.

[4] UNESCO, *Handbook for Gender Focal Points in UNESCO National Commissions*, Paris, 2005.

Education

[5] Acharya, S., *Democracy, gender equality and women's literacy: Experience from Nepal*, Kathmandu Series of Monographs and Working Papers, no. 1, UNESCO, Paris, 2004.

[6] UNGEI, *'Scaling up' good practices in girls' education*, UNESCO, Paris, 2005.

UNESCO has also developed basic guidelines for the collection of disaggregated data on education. These include *Gender-sensitive education statistics and indicators – a practical guide* (1997), a handbook produced as a result of workshops in 1996–97 in Ghana, Ivory Coast and Jordan for the training of statisticians; and *UNESCO toolkit on gender indicators for engineering, science and technology* (2000), which aims to provide better quantitative and qualitative information on women and girls in science and technology, career choices and professional development.

FINDINGS OF THE REVIEWS

General reviews

[1] The report *Gender equality and equity. A summary review of UNESCO's accomplishments since the Fourth World Conference on Women* (2000) reviews UNESCO's accomplishments since Beijing. In general, it states that many projects are still anchored in the WID approach (special projects for women and girls) rather than the GAD approach. The inclusion of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary processes that accompany programming processes is still limited to more explicit earmarking of funds for 'women/girls specific projects' within major projects, also reflecting the persistence of the WID approach.

Concerning literacy and basic education for women and girls (p. 25–31), the following lessons learned may be deduced:

- having a higher percentage of female teachers than male teachers has a favourable impact on bringing girls to school;
- parents keep girls at home for security reasons;
- girls' work in the household is often irreplaceable;
- school curricula are most often not adapted to girls' needs and possibilities (p. 26).

The need to develop complementary non-formal delivery systems in education has therefore become a primary concern. Anchored in daily activities, non-formal education programmes offer innovative solutions to everyday needs and open up access to further development for girls and poor women. They place the learners at the centre of the learning process and recognises women's and girls' life experiences and responsibilities. They use radio, printed material, group activities, or short training videos projected on a white sheet or wall. Examples include the following:

- **A Lifeline for Afghan Women** reached women under the Taliban regime through radio soap opera and a cartoon magazine.
- In the framework of the programme **Promoting girls' and women's education in Africa**, a series of postliteracy booklets addressing gender issues is being produced during workshops involving African women and men.
- In several countries, skills-based literacy programmes for women have been developed, the contents of the material (*papad* making and packaging, fish cultivation, cooperative management, etc.) depending on local economic conditions and women's needs. As a result women have gained substantially greater income as a result of the knowledge and techniques gained. In Haiti, for instance, women learned new techniques by watching videos on how to dry fruit, make shoes, sew cloth, etc.

To be effective, the materials used must represent and reflect women's lives and cultures, be practical, incorporate gender sensitivity in their content, and provide income-generating solutions appropriate for illiterate women.

As regards technical, vocational and science education (p. 31–33), UNESCO's activities focus on the elimination of gender stereotyping in the education system. Obstacles for girls include the lack of female teachers, the fact that only courses such as tailoring, dressmaking and

secretarial work are available to girls instead of 'hard' technical courses, and girls' frequent failure to meet the mathematics entry requirement. The roots of the problem lie in biased ideas in the family about the roles of girls and boys. UNESCO's Special Project **Scientific, technical and vocational education of girls in Africa** encourages the revision of curricula, textbooks and teacher training in order to make them less gender-biased and introduce positive role-modelling for girls. There is no assessment of results as yet.

[2] *UNESCO Gender Mainstreaming Implementation Framework for 2002–2007* [GMIF]. One of the international development targets included in UNESCO's Medium-Term Strategy for 2002–07 is gender equality. The target is based on the understanding that gender equality does not yet exist, as women and girls still represent two-thirds of the world's illiterate people and fewer girls than boys finish primary school. 'Progress towards gender equality and the empowerment of women should be demonstrated by eliminating gender disparity in primary and secondary education by 2005' (UNESCO, 2002, p. 16). The GMIF seeks to translate UNESCO's commitment to 'integrate a gender perspective in policy planning, programming, implementation and evaluation activities' into practical directives that yield concrete results. This is seen as the best approach to meet both the immediate practical needs and the strategic needs of women. The GMIF is said to be inspired by current best practice, but it does not discuss or assess existing practices. The 'practical directives' concern the measures necessary to mainstream gender in programme execution (UNESCO, 2002, p. 12):

1. Undertake an analysis of gender needs and gender context, as an integral part of assessments of global, regional and national challenges; a table is added (p. 11) indicating the core issues (women's and men's roles; factors that shape gender roles and the gender division of work; access to and control over resources and opportunities and their systems of distribution; access to and participation in decision-making processes; men's and women's practical and strategic needs and interests) and questions which should be asked for each issue.
2. Establish attainable and clear gender objectives, results and performance indicators in line with international development targets (example of result: increased number of the most disadvantaged sex enrolled and staying in school).
3. Align resources (human and financial) with objectives.
4. Ensure and request equal representation and participation of women and men (ensure at least a critical mass of 30%).
5. Make sure the attainment of gender objectives is measured through gender impact studies and evaluations.
6. Carry out training and knowledge-sharing for staff to raise the level of awareness and provide staff with the skills and tools to apply gender mainstreaming. An online resource centre, available at www.unesco.org/women/, and an online priority-gender discussion group have been created to enable and stimulate knowledge-sharing.

Together these measures constitute a 'gender lens' for the review of project proposals.

[3] UNESCO Gender Lens documents (UNESCO, 2003). A series of Gender Lenses was developed, each consisting of a list of questions which elaborate the measures in the GMIF Gender Lens. The questions are not specific to projects in the field of education. There are gender lenses for project design and review, development of terms of reference (TORs) of UNESCO surveys and research (e.g. 'Is there a gender balance of male and female data collectors?'), and planning and execution of programme evaluation (e.g. 'Did women face particular constraints or obstacles in participating in programme activities? Did men?'). The checklists will be helpful for policy-makers and programme designers. Nonetheless, for UNESCO, checklists with a more specific focus on education might be even more useful.

[4] The *Handbook for Gender Focal Points in UNESCO National Commissions* (available at www.unesco.org/women) is also based on the GMIF. It includes lists of initiatives and actions that a gender focal point (GFP) can take, and checklists as to how it is to best mainstream gender into projects. It guides the GFP step by step, for instance:

- Strategy 1. Get the facts […]
  - 1.1 Read policy documents – obtain a copy of your country's national action plan, […];
  - 1.2 Identify sources of reliable sex-disaggregated statistical data (for example, national census bureaus, universities, women's information services – to find the service nearest to you, consult the IIAV database at www.iiav.nl/eng/index.html);
  - 1.3 Make an inventory of activities driven or co-managed by your National Commission which concern women and/or promote gender equality […]
- Strategy 2. Spread the word […]
- Strategy 3. Network, support, cooperate and build coalitions […]

The Handbook (p. 24–25) offers the following lessons learned from other GFPs:

- You can't do everything, so establish priorities and stay focused on what will have the biggest impact;
- Take pride in your achievements;
- Approach private partners to strengthen their role as drivers of gender-sensitive change;
- Don't hesitate to call on UNESCO's Goodwill Ambassadors and Peace Artists;
- Involve parliamentarians and elected municipal officials, both women and men, in dialogue and national campaigns;
- Establish links among women in policy-making positions, academia, the media, and small and medium enterprises at national levels.

It presents and elaborates the Gender Lens from the GMIF. It gives tips on how to overcome cultural resistance to change (p. 50) and lists useful literature. Unfortunately, it does not contain practical examples of best practice or any assessment of GFPs' gender mainstreaming activities to date.

Education

[5] In *Democracy, gender equality and women's literacy: Experience from Nepal,* Sushan Acharya assesses programmes combating adult illiteracy which evolved from programmes helping citizens to exercise fully their democratic rights to programmes contributing to changing cultural values and gender bias. Acharya sees a major shortcoming in 'gender equality literacy programmes' in the fact that the pedagogical practices and delivery of the materials concentrate only on women. This approach polarises men and women and does not change the social structure in which women are confined to housework. In addition, Acharya recommends that the values of different caste and ethnic groups on gender relations be identified and 'incorporated, nurtured and discarded' as appropriate in literacy curricula and teaching (p. 10). The report offers sex-disaggregated data on literacy in Nepal; an example of cultural values and practices that inform gender relations in specific castes or ethnic groups; and an overview of the revisions of the women's literacy curriculum from a reproductive rights perspective, a legal rights perspective and a gender mainstreaming perspective. This overview shows how the perspectives are complementary but is unfortunately not further elaborated. The report can be read as a recommendation for the inclusion of men's/boys' programmes and the adoption of a context-sensitive approach, warning against 'one size fits all' literacy programmes.

[6] *'Scaling up' good practices in girls' education* (2005). There is much material on mainstreaming gender into education programmes, especially basic education in developing countries, in the framework of the 2000 *Education for All* (EFA) programme. This report offers a review of good practices in this field, prepared by UNGEI, the United Nations Girls' Education

Initiative. It focuses on the strategy of accelerating action through 'scaling up' successful interventions that are amenable to replication.

The report argues that gender equality in education is a question not just of greater educational resources being required for women, but also of education with an empowering content and processes. When women and girls have access to resources they can become drivers of their own change processes. They can serve as change agents within their communities. Achieving gender parity in access is only the first step, and it is not fully achieved yet[15]. Gender equality goes further. In education programmes in developing countries, not enough attention is paid to the systemic reform required by a commitment to gender mainstreaming. There is a bias towards targeted girls' education initiatives. Although targeted interventions are important because they send out a clear message about the importance attached to girls' education and give them access to education, they do not alter the provisions in such a way that girls enjoy equality of treatment and equality of opportunity once they are in the system. Gender-aware reform of education systems is therefore crucial in order to sustain the changes. This gender mainstreaming challenge is not being addressed yet. It is important to know not only what works but also what makes strategies work. This requires donors and national governments to make a considerable investment in empirical research. Further work is needed, especially:

- independent assessments of gender-equality initiatives, investigating how they may be scaled up, what institutional support is required, and who is the responsible authority;
- the development of realistic cost models of gender equality initiatives;
- improving the structures, mechanisms and procedures of implementation, otherwise there will continue to be an imbalance between the development of ambitious and progressive policies and their translation into meaningful change in practice.

Constraints for girls in education include, on the demand side, domestic responsibilities and the imposition of social norms (early marriage, dowry practice); on the supply side, the distance between home and school, an unfavourable school environment (no sanitation facilities for girls, safety), the direct costs of education, the lack of female teachers and the low gender awareness of teachers. Supply-side reforms are important to ensure equal treatment within schools. Demand-side reforms tackle wider social and economic constraints. Both need targeted interventions and systemic reforms. Examples (p. 33) are:

- cutting the costs of school fees and giving scholarships;
- giving girls a second chance after they have dropped out;
- emergency schooling camps in situations of conflict;
- providing female teachers;
- providing separate latrines, and training to handle sexual maturation;
- encouraging teachers to engage with communities to overcome inhibitions about female schooling;
- reducing the distance between home and school through schooling expansion;
- Boys' Empowerment Programme, to include boys in discussions about gender-based violence through workshops;
- Girls' Education Movement (GEM), developing leadership skills for young girls;
- empowering mothers through organising women;
- a school re-entry policy for pregnant girls and adolescent mothers.

Lessons learned:

- Simultaneous and complementary reforms (package of demand and supply-side measures) are important.
- Special measures (e.g. alternative schools or nonformal education) have to be linked to the formal school (bridge schools).
- Approaches must be adapted to particular national circumstances.

15 The costs of missing the goal of gender parity in access amount to a missed opportunity to: increase per capita growth by 0.1–0.3 percentage points; lower fertility rates by 0.1–0.4 children per woman; lower rates of under-5 mortality by 5.8 per 1,000 live births; and lower prevalence of underweight children under 5 by 2 percentage points (*Scaling up*, p. 14).

- Political will makes a critical difference.
- Reaching out-of-school girls through targeted approaches is critical while simultaneously ensuring that the education system becomes gender-responsive.

Six key strategies for 'scaling up' girls' education are presented (p. 39):

1. targeting disadvantaged populations with extra allocation of resources to overcome demand-side constraints;
2. reforming education systems include teacher training, curriculum and pedagogy;
3. improving the accountability of services (through improved disaggregated data collection, monitoring systems, building effective review mechanisms);
4. developing effective partnerships between multiple providers;
5. working with communities in a sustained manner to support changes in social norms;
6. developing strong legal frameworks that support the above changes.

The report shows how scaling up successful projects by using these strategies enables systemic change. It combines information from individual projects and academic literature. It also gives critical perspectives on scaling up: the danger that scaling up means making routine and may thus kill innovation; the danger that it may result in 'one size fits all' projects or 'one large project' which entails the risk of excluding non-state actors. Finally, it offers a concise checklist for operationalising gender equality in educational policy (p. 71). This recent report offers a promising view on strategies for gender mainstreaming in education projects.

Conclusion

After ten years, gender mainstreaming at UNESCO is beginning to become more than a focus on women and girls. The reviews point up some important weaknesses, notably the focus on access to education, the lack of programmes focusing on men and boys, and the lack of programmes focusing on underlying gender relations/social norms. Moreover, such programmes should be designed in a culturally context-specific way. During the past ten years, the focus was also on mainstreaming UNESCO staff. Nonetheless, gender focal points are still too isolated within their sectors and offices to be able to implement a paradigmatic shift. Therefore, the focus on staff training and on developing checklists for project design would seem to be logical steps before further real progress in implementation can be expected.

THE WORLD BANK

The World Bank is one of the strongest international organisations in terms of its implementation capacity. While this makes it a potentially very strong actor for gender mainstreaming, its strong emphasis on 'hard' economic criteria and its traditional resistance to the addition of non-economic or social criteria, and also its weak connections to the NGO community, imply that the implementation of gender mainstreaming is not necessarily a smooth process (Razavi and Miller, 1995).

The start of gender mainstreaming at the World Bank is linked to its participation in the Nairobi conference, as a result of which the first explicit (voluntary) WID guidelines were included in the Bank's *Operations Manual*. From the mid 1980s attention to gender equality was increasingly linked to framing in terms of economic efficiency, which provided a better fit with the Bank's overall mandate (Hafner-Burton and Pollack, 2002). This resulted in a first gender policy paper in 1994, and the adoption of the goal to 'reduce gender disparities and enhance women's participation in the economic development of their countries' (World Bank, 1994; see **[7]** below). The **Women's Eyes on the World Bank** campaign, launched in the aftermath of the Beijing conference, urged the Bank to take further action. Since then, the Bank has promised to implement reforms, and described their efforts in a series of reports. The progress made from 1990 to 2000, according to the Bank, has been mostly in terms of installing gender units and personnel, increasing women in the staff, installing regional resources, and

increasing spending on women's projects. In addition, a database with statistical data has been constructed, gender training has been given to staff, gender impact assessments have showed that some 40% of the projects in the period 1995–99 included some attention to gender, and a monitoring process has been started, even if there is no single Bank-wide set of indicators yet (World Bank, 1998, 2000).

The major issues relevant to education and employment in the gender mainstreaming activities of the World Bank are poverty reduction, and work connected to the Millennium Development Goals.

REVIEWS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN EMPLOYMENT, TRAINING AND EDUCATION

There are a few independent assessments of the development and the results of gender mainstreaming. Most reviews are made within the UN system.

Assessments and reports by international organisations, or requested by them

Miller, C and Razavi, S., *Gender analysis: Alternative paradigms.* Gender in Development Programme, United Nations Development Programme, 1998.

This paper is a good introduction to the changing ideas on the gender relevance of the work of the World Bank in the 1990s. The body of work on gender analysis existing at that time is reviewed in this study.

Gender mainstreaming in the CCA and UNDAF process. Desk review. Inter-agency Task Force on Gender Mainstreaming in the CCA/UNDAF process, draft February 2003.

The empowerment of women and integration of gender perspectives in the promotion of economic growth, poverty eradication and sustainable development. Report of the Secretary-General, A/58/135, July 2003.

Gender mainstreaming in operational work of the United Nations system. Note by the Secretariat, 2004.

[1] Gender mainstreaming in the CCA and UNDAF processes. Desk review, commissioned by UNIFEM, presented to the Inter-agency Task Force on Gender Mainstreaming in the CCA/UNDAF process, May 2002.

[2] The gender perspective in the CCA/UNDAF and PRSP processes and priorities in West and Central Africa, A UNICEF-led inter-agency assessment, 2002.

[3] World Bank, Chapter on Gender in the PRSP Sourcebook. http://www.worldbank.org/poverty/strategies/chapters/gender/gender.htm.

[4] Poverty reduction strategy papers: detailed analysis of progress in implementation, prepared by the staffs of the IMF and World Bank, approved by T. Geithner and G. Nankani, 15 September 2003.

[5] United Nations Development Group, An assessment of the role and experiences of UN agencies in poverty reduction strategy papers, UNDG, 17 November 2003.

[6] World Bank, Gender in the PRSPs: A stocktaking. World Bank Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network, Gender and Development Group, 9 August 2001.

[7] Gender and Development Group, *Implementation of the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy: Second Annual Monitoring Report, FY03*, World Bank, Washington D.C., 2004.

[8] World Bank, *Integrating gender in the World Bank's work: A strategy for action*, 2002. See http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTGENDER/Resources/strategypaper.pdf

Independent assessments

Elson, D., The Millennium Development Goals. A feminist development economics perspective. Dies Natalis Address, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague, 7 October 2004.

Hafner-Burton, E. and Pollack, M., Gender mainstreaming and global governance, *Feminist Legal Studies* 10, p. 285–298, 2002.

Khundker, N., A gentle touch? Gender and the World Bank – a critical assessment, Paper prepared for 'Reforming the World Bank: Will the gender mainstreaming strategy make a difference?', hosted by the Heinrich Böll Foundation, Gender Action and Bank Information Center, Washington DC, 13 January 2004.

Renard Painter, G., *Gender, the Millennium Development Goals, and human rights in the context of the 2005 review processes*. Report for the UK Gender and Development Network, 2004.

Subrahmanian, R., Gender Equality in Education: Definitions and Measurements. Background paper for EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2003.

Zuckerman, E. and Garrett, A., *Do Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) address gender? A gender audit of 2002 PRSPs. A Gender Action Publication*, 2003. Http://www.sarpn.org.za/documents/d0000306/P306_PRSP_Gender.pdf

FINDINGS OF THE REVIEWS

Assessments and reports by international organisations

Recent reports of the World Bank see several problems in the implementation of gender mainstreaming in the organisation. Assessments of country-based experiences with Common Country Assessments (CCAs) of the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), completed in 2002 **[1, 2]**, revealed mixed results as regards the extent to which gender perspectives had been effectively mainstreamed into the CCAs and UNDAF. Although there had been some achievements in mainstreaming gender perspectives into CCA/UNDAF documents, limited attention had been given to gender mainstreaming in country programming follow-up. Building consensus on gender equality and women's empowerment goals and the means of achieving them was identified as a particular challenge. The reviews also revealed that the CCA indicators on women's empowerment were not systematically used to assess women's status and establish trend analyses. While the majority of country offices used the indicators on women's political empowerment, less than half of the countries used the indicators on secondary education and women's share of paid employment. The assessment also emphasised that there were some doubts about ownership and accountability for gender mainstreaming and that gender mainstreaming activities were limited to a few entities.

The analysis and recommendations contained in the CCA/UNDAF documents reviewed tended to focus on women's concerns in education, health and the microeconomy. Economic policies and programmes, for example in finance, taxation, industry and formal and informal sector employment, rarely reflected gender perspectives.

A sourcebook **[3]** developed by the World Bank to assist countries in developing and strengthening poverty reduction strategies includes a chapter on gender which provides a rationale for integrating gender perspectives into the poverty reduction strategy (PRS) process. It outlines ways in which gender analysis techniques can be integrated into the poverty diagnosis and used in defining priority public actions in the PRS. It also provides guidelines for ensuring the monitoring and evaluation of the involvement of women and men in PRS programmes and for evaluating gender differences in the outcomes and impacts of these programmes.

The sourcebook summarises the attention to gender perspectives in a sample of the

I-PRSPs (Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers) and four PRSPs completed up to February 2001. Detailed discussion of gender equality had been provided only for education and health. This was confirmed in a World Bank/IMF study of 2003 **[4]**. Some attention had been given to gender perspectives in relation to labour markets, employment, microenterprise development, agriculture, and some other fields less relevant to this report.

The World Bank and the IMF noted in 2003 that attention to gender issues tended to decline when moving from diagnosis to public actions and monitoring. A report of the United Nations Development Group (UNDG) in 2003 **[5]** noted that the limited focus on sectors other than health and education in PRSPs originated from the lack of sex-disaggregated data in other sectors. A World Bank desk review of 18 full PRSPs, published in 2004, found that the proportion of PRSPs with extensive diagnosis of gender inequalities almost doubled between 2002 and 2003, increasing from 17% to 33% over that period. While only 45% of all 32 PRSPs reviewed proposed gender indicators, 67% of the most recent PRSPs did so, indicating that progress has been made during the last few years.

The *Guidelines for Joint Staff Assessments* [JSAs] *of a Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper* requested staff to assess the participation of women's groups in the process; the extent to which poverty data had been disaggregated by sex; whether indicators and targets appropriately capture disparities by gender; and to what extent the PRSP had included measures to expand opportunities for the poor and to distribute the benefits of growth and public services more equally by sex. Since the Bank and the Fund rely on JSA analyses as a basis for approving PRSPs, JSAs are an important leverage point for ensuring that gender perspectives are reflected in PRSPs.

A 2001 World Bank review on gender in the PRSPs **[6]** found that fewer than one-quarter of JSAs of I-PRSPs recommended further steps in diagnosis, actions or monitoring related to gender equality. Specific plans to consult with poor women or women's organisations were identified in only two of the 19 I-PRSPs. Only one JSA suggested that more attention should be paid to the inclusion of these groups in the consultations. In none of the four JSAs of full PRSPs did staff make any assessment of gender issues in specific sectors. In one case, the JSA made a general suggestion that gender issues could have been treated more thoroughly.

Independent assessments

The work on poverty reduction and the MDGs at the World Bank incorporates attention to both education and employment. The following section, therefore, will not make a distinction between these two fields.

In the paper by Miller and Razavi (1998) several themes emerge. The authors observe that the institutional focus of gender training frameworks has widened over time from the household to other institutions through which gender inequality is reproduced. The type of development intervention targeted by the frameworks has moved from the project level to sectoral and macroeconomic policies. The frameworks differ with regard to their underlying developmental approach. Finally, the extent to which the frameworks view development institutions themselves as 'gendered' has changed over time, raising issues of organisational change for each of them. This analysis of the gendered nature of the World Bank as an institution is at the heart of the gender mainstreaming efforts at the Bank. The aim has been to achieve a structural approach of gender mainstreaming.

The first academic study of the World Bank's efforts toward gender mainstreaming (Hafner-Burton and Pollack, 2002) concludes that the Bank was relatively late in adopting gender mainstreaming, as a result of its relative distance from the international women's movement, and its dominant neoliberal frame. Yet, when it did adopt the strategy, its greater implementation capacity

resulted in a record that exceeds that of the UNDP. The authors describe a strategy of strategic framing in the World Bank as important for this relative success. 'Strategic framing' refers to the linking of the goal of gender equality to another mainstream goal in an attempt to make it more acceptable. For example, people tasked with gender mainstreaming in the World Bank strategically frame the concept of mainstreaming in the instrumental language of efficiency by stating that investing in women will provide better economic returns, rather than in the languages of equity or rights, which are less in keeping with their institution's ways of understanding the world.

Recent independent assessments of the World Bank's efforts to engage in gender mainstreaming are rather critical. Khunder (2004) examines the basic premises which define the World Bank's gender strategy. She concludes that unless these fundamentals are questioned, it would be difficult to make significant progress in terms of gender in key areas such as education. In fact, it may lead to imbalances which affect women adversely. Some of the key premises underlying the Bank's gender strategy are, for instance, that

(a) gender equality, especially with regard to rights, resources and voice, leads to higher economic growth and greater poverty reduction;
(b) men and women face different constraints and opportunities in the process of economic growth;
(c) there is a relationship between inequality in terms of incomes and gender inequality, i.e. there is greater gender inequality amongst the poor within a country, and in poorer countries;
(d) the comparative advantage of the Bank lies in defining economic policies.

Based on these basic premises, the key elements of the Bank's gender strategy, as laid down in documents such as *Integrating gender into the World Bank's work: A strategy for action* **[8]** consist of conducting periodic gender assessments in a country (CGAs), designing country-specific strategies based on cultural and social differences (in particular, different patterns of gender relations), and building partnerships with civil society and other UN bodies to define strategies and share knowledge. The recognition of gender as a cross-cutting issue calls for interventions in a wide range of sectors in a country, not just a few. Gender training of Bank staff is an integral part of this strategy.

Khunder concludes that, at the very least, the Bank has to address the wider issues of social inequality and justice before it can address those of gender equality, given that the two are not divorced from each other. The pattern of growth supported or initiated by the Bank, even if successful, frequently exacerbates social inequalities. Operational imperatives also mean that there is an excessive focus on statistics, rather than mechanisms and policies, in addressing gender issues. Khunder also points out the limitations of the purely individualistic (rights, resources, and voice) approach to attaining gender equality goals, and states that the MDGs will remain largely unrealised unless these imperatives are taken into account.

In the analysis of Zuckermann and Garrett (2003), the World Bank and the IMF are making de facto national plans with budgets, since they introduced PRSPs as a prerequisite for borrowing by their poorest and transition-country clients. To achieve their poverty reduction targets, PRSPs must address the gender dimensions of poverty, including promoting women's rights and committing to other gender-responsive interventions. Unengendered PRSPs implicitly reinforce unequal gender patterns that hinder development. This audit of the 13 PRSPs produced during 2002 demonstrates that only three PRSPs address gender issues commendably, if not completely. Another eight PRSPs apply an outdated WID approach, defining gender issues as reproductive health, girls' education and a few other issues that vary by country. The remaining two PRSPs neglect gender almost entirely. Only two PRSPs actually promote women's rights. No PRSPs engender structural adjustment measures such as trade liberalisation and

privatisation. Most PRSPs state that women are included in their participatory consultations, but none disaggregates the numbers of men and women consulted or indicates whether their surveys included gender-related questions. Few PRSP data are sex-disaggregated. The analysis also found that the majority of JSAs that accompany PRSPs to the Bank and Fund Boards contain superficial gender analyses.

Renard Painter (2004) finds problems with the use of indicators, especially in the MDG reports and the executive summaries of Task Force reports. Both sets of reports show dismal performance in gender mainstreaming. According to Renard Painter, the underlying assumptions are problematic. Women are seen as vulnerable victims and as mothers rather than as agents of development. Statements by the World Bank and the IMF reflect instrumentalist understandings of the links between gender and the MDGs. Renard Painter sees the World Bank's relationship with civil society as problematic. Global civil society organisations are engaging critically with the MDGs, but they have been slow to participate in a process which many feel has been delivered from the top down. Many organisations are engaging with the MDGs at only a superficial level.

According to Subrahmanian (2003) there are several barriers that continue to prevent gender advocacy from being translated from the rhetoric of commitment into the reality of transformation. A fundamental one is the lack of women's 'voice' and their limited inclusion in policy processes. A related problem is the lack of transparency in policy decision-making processes. Advocacy at the international level has resulted in some significant gains, but transparency does not exist further along the process of policy implementation, and there is broad scope for decisions to be subverted or contested. The watchful presence of gender analysts and advocates along the whole process of policy implementation – not just located at the level of aid agencies and international cooperation – is necessary.

Subrahmanian links her analysis to an assessment of current trends in education which are fuelled by an emphasis, driven by human capital theory, on skills and productivity that fit in neatly with neoliberal discourses of the entrepreneurial citizen and the growing policy emphasis on self-employment through microenterprise. Investing in women, it is argued, serves to alleviate household poverty and debt, and also state debt that is based on borrowing development capital from agencies such as the World Bank. All other ends – particularly those that relate to women's political agency and capacities – are seen to become subordinated to the ends of capital and the market. Hence, Subrahmanian interprets the mobilisation of demand for female education as a strategy in which women's development becomes instrumental to furthering the neoliberal agenda. Such instrumentalism is deplored as an extension of the WID era, when arguments that investing in women was good for development proliferated.

The independent studies reviewed here are mostly informed by feminist development economics. According to Elson (2004), feminist development economics goes well beyond the 'engendering development' approach proposed by the World Bank (World Bank, 2001). It does not assume that gender inequality in the economy is primarily a result of 'traditional' social norms or that it resides primarily in households. It shows how competitive markets are quite capable of creating and sustaining gender inequality. It does not assume that economic growth and gender equality are necessarily mutually reinforcing: it shows how fast rates of growth have gone hand in hand with some forms of gender inequality. It argues not only that women should not be economically dependent on men, but also that national economies should not be dependent on poorly governed international markets; and that poor countries should not be dependent on rich countries. It brings together a concern for women's human rights and the use of resources, arguing that economic and social policy must be consistent with human rights. It has a holistic vision.

Conclusion

Gender mainstreaming at the World Bank began relatively late, then took off fast, but there are many implementation problems.

Some studies are available already. These studies criticise the lack of a structural approach and express concerns that gender mainstreaming is largely used as another label for what still is a WID approach. They also express concern about the absence of women's voices.

4. GENDER MAINSTREAMING POLICIES IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT IN JORDAN, MOROCCO AND TURKEY

4

JORDAN

Willy Jansen

NATIONAL CONTEXT

Social and economic context and gender profile

- Gender equality is high in primary, secondary and tertiary education.
- Gender inequality is high in employment and unemployment.

Jordan had a population of 5.35 million in 2004, with an annual growth rate of 2.6%. Its GDP per capita was US$2,130. Jordan is a middle-income country; one-fifth of the population can be considered poor. Besides poverty and unemployment, foreign debt and the difficult regional political situation remain issues for concern. The majority of the population is urbanised; only 18% live in rural areas and only 3.6% of all employed persons work in agriculture (www.dos.gov.jo).

Social indicators point to relative equality between men and women in some areas and persistent inequality in others. According to the figures of Jordan's Department of Statistics, women make up 48.4% of the total population. Life expectancy is 70.6 years for men and 72.4 years for women, and adult illiteracy is 5.6% for men and 15.1% for women. Of the total of employed people aged 15 and over, only 13.1% are women. The female unemployment rate is 16.5% compared to 11.8% for males (www.dos.gov.jo), although other sources give a higher unemployment rate. The total fertility rate (births per woman) is 3.7, and contraception prevalence among women aged 15–49 is 56%. All girls and boys complete primary education and youth illiteracy (of people aged 15–25) is less

than 1% for both sexes (http://devdata.worldbank.org/genderRpt.asp?rpt=profileandcty=JOR,Jordanandhm=home). The United Nations Development Programme ranks Jordan at 88th place in the Human Development Index and 81 in the gender-related development index (GDI), with a GDI value of 0.698 (www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/cty_f_JOR.html). For the latest updates on population and employment figures and the MDGs, see the website of the Jordanian Department of Statistics (www.dos.gov.jo) and the Human Resources Information System, Al Manar, supported by the ETF (www.elmanar.jo).

Gender equality issues

Policies promoting gender equality and women's empowerment

- Gender equality policies started in the 1990s.
- Jordan ratified CEDAW in 1992, with some reservations.
- Recently there have been important legislative improvements and some integration of gender issues in the Economic and Social Development Plan for 1999–2003.

The Jordanian National Commission for Women (JNCW) notes a growing concern with women's issues and the form and nature of women's participation in society in Jordan in recent decades. The JNCW itself is the government authority that closely monitors all government agencies in all matters relating to women's issues (JNCW 1995; JNCW 2004: 2)[16]. Together with public and private-sector partners, the JNCW prepared a *National Programme of Action for the Advancement of Jordanian Women, 1998–2002*, as part of the Beijing follow-up process, in which certain themes were prioritised, 106 projects to be implemented were formulated, and a national strategy for women in Jordan was outlined. The Programme of Action set the context for significant legislative improvements for Jordanian women; for the incorporation of a gender perspective in the Economic and Social Development Plan for 1999–2003, which states as one of its main objectives 'to bridge the gender gap in the various social and economic fields'; and for mainstreaming a gender perspective in state institutions and their various agencies (JNCW, 2004, p. 3; Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 2). For instance, the newly founded Ministry of Political Development now focuses in its Plan of Action on the importance of active political participation by Jordanian women. Guidelines were also produced to support women's participation in public and political life (Köndgen et al., 1998).

Jordan ratified CEDAW in 1992. It had already amended some of its laws to bring them into line with the Convention, but entered reservations to three of its provisions, relating to a woman's right to transmit her nationality to her children, the right of freedom of movement, and marriage and the custody of children (CEDAW, 1999).

Quite a number of local NGOs and family associations work towards the development of Jordanian women. Several of these are founded or headed by a female member of the Royal Family. In her account of the development organisation Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development (JOHUD), Basma bint al-Talal sketched three broad contexts that profoundly shape development processes in Jordan: the country's limited internal resources, the political instability of the Middle East, and the relation with international donors (Al-Talal, 2003).

Education and training

- Closure of the gender gap in education at all levels has been impressive in recent decades.
- Girls' dropout from secondary and tertiary education reflects ongoing gender inequality.
- The gender impact of the privatisation and Islamisation of education is positive, although not all groups benefit equally.

Special attention for girls in education started in the first schools established in the late nineteenth century by Christian

16 For references cited in this country study, see bibliography of studies on gender equality issues.

missionaries in Jordan, which were open to both boys and girls. The presence of female missionaries and the targeting of girls as the future mothers who would pass on their knowledge further supported girls' participation in the mission schools. Apart from these missionary efforts, education was neglected during the Ottoman period and the British mandate period (Jansen, 1996). A comprehensive public school system was set up in 1923, but this developed only slowly and did not expand to provide a more general primary education until the 1950s (Al-Tall, 1978, p. 53). The first university – Jordan University in Amman – was established as late as 1962.

In the latter half of the twentieth century, however, serious efforts to develop education were undertaken. In this process, girls remained behind somewhat. This was not due to the widespread supposition that study for girls and women was incompatible with Islam, but to a variety of other reasons. One was the unequal development between urban and rural areas. It proved difficult to provide education to both boys and girls in desert areas, but for girls this was more serious as they were less readily allowed to travel long distances to school. Another important reason was structural gender inequality. As daughters would leave their family upon marriage, it was deemed more important to educate boys first. Also, it was thought that girls in their teens should prepare for marriage by showing modesty and learning to do housework.

Despite some remaining illiteracy among elder, rural women, figures show an impressive closure of the gender gap in education at all levels in recent decades. Even at the university entrance level, the first signs of a reversal of the gender gap are visible. This means that Jordan is following the European trend, in which more girls than boys are successfully educated. More women than men now enter university, although they still drop out earlier and more often and they still account for a lower share of participation in professional education and in private institutions (Jansen, 2006). The enrolment rates for boys and girls at the basic education level are the same, but boys to tend to have a higher dropout rate than girls throughout the education cycle (Etyemezian and Taminian, 2003, p. 7).

The last two decades have seen the privatisation of education accelerate. We will see below that international donors contributed to this development, but economic and political decisions, as well as the Islamisation of education, were also important factors (Roald, 1994, Taraki, 1996). The effect for girls was ambiguous (Jansen, 2006). In general, gender and class hierarchies tend to be reinforced by privatisation. Also, private education in Jordan is too expensive for poor people. Lower-income groups that have only limited funds to spend on education often prefer to spend these on boys rather than girls. Rising education costs therefore tend to exclude girls from low-income families. On the other hand, privatisation has increased the density and accessibility of schools and universities, making it possible for many girls from middle- and higher-income families to find a school near their home and to be accepted even if they do not have the highest grades. Private initiatives to expand educational facilities should therefore be supported, but at the same time a state sector that offers education of high quality and an extensive scholarship programme are needed to enable poor female students to obtain higher education and to provide the best conditions for social mobility.

The resurgent Islamisation of Jordanian society had a similar ambiguous effect on girls' education. The foundation of (often private) schools and universities based on Islamic principles has removed the traditional grounds on which many a conservative father objected to sending his daughter to school. The other side of the coin is that girls are confronted here with ambiguous career messages; it is educated motherhood rather than educated economic and political citizenship that is upheld as a feminine ideal (Jansen, 2006).

We may conclude that as a result of these processes of privatisation and Islamisation, the actual number and percentage of female students has increased, leading to

a net positive gender effect in the statistics, but that policies and practices need to be developed to make sure that these improvements reach all strata of the population, and that the education of women also leads to a larger economic and political participation of women in society. Policy-related and statistical information on gender equality in education is available in the national educational statistics of the Ministry of Education (1999) and the Ministry of Higher Education (2001). A confirmation of the general support by parents of the education of girls and boys alike can be found in the excellent and detailed study by Hanssen-Bauer et al. (1998). For more critical voices of the claims for gender equality in education, see Brand (1998). More research is needed into the effects of re-Islamisation and privatisation on the educational chances of girls and on changing women's roles.

Women's employment

- Relative gender balance in education has not been translated into a similar equality in the labour market. Women's participation in the labour market is surprisingly low.
- Equality laws in the field of labour are overruled by the various legal codes that deny women full legal competence.
- Women suffer more from the economic crisis than men.
- Informal activities are common for women, but hardly provide a living.
- Women are not fully taken into account in economic reform plans or social productivity plans.

As participants in the labour market, Jordanian women have been 'unequal partners in development' (Shukri, 1996, 1999; see also Moghadam 1995, 1998, 2002; Shami, 1997; Shami and Taminian, 1990; Shuraydeh and Sabbagh, 1985). The relative gender balance in education has not been translated into a similar equality on the labour market. Sources give different figures on women's participation in the labour market, but they all agree that it is surprisingly low. Hanssen-Bauer et al. (1998, p. 229) mention that 17% of the economically active people in Jordan are women (see also Kawar, 1996, 2000). World Bank figures show a promising gradual increase over the last decade and indicate that in the year 2000, women made up 25% of the labour force – but that might be wishful thinking. Jordan's Statistical Department estimated that 13.1% of the total of employed people aged 15 and over in 2004 were female (www.dos.gov.jo).

The rise in female education had hardly any effect on women's economic participation, largely because of cultural constraints on women and patriarchal control over women's activities. While most parents support their daughters' education, far fewer allow them to use their skills in jobs. At times, girls are annoyed by these limits put on their ambitions, but they usually comply with their parents' wishes. A description of these cultural and familial constraints and young women's reactions to them can be found in Kawar (2000). Women who want to work are dependent upon their father's or husband's approval. Since 1952, women have had the constitutional 'right to work', a right reiterated in the labour laws of 1966, but, in practice, these laws are overruled by the various legal codes that deny them full legal competence, as a result of which women have access to the right to work only if they have male approval (El-Azhary Sonbol, 2003, p. 87, 89).

Other factors than familial control are at work as well. A higher education degree increases employment chances, but does not guarantee a lucrative career or protect against unemployment. Most of the employed women have low-paid jobs in education and health care. Average monthly wages for men are significantly higher than for women in both the public and private sectors. Hanssen-Bauer and colleagues suggest that women may be discriminated against in the labour market, or find the wages in the sectors available to them (primarily education services) to be too low. Women say more often than men that they are unemployed because of the lack of jobs, or because they are waiting for a job in the public sector (Hanssen-Bauer et al., 1998, p. 241–242). While men may be unemployed because of inadequate

educational levels (64% of unemployed males have less than secondary education), women can show diplomas. According to Mayen and colleagues, 'in 2003, 76% of female jobseekers had an intermediate diploma or higher' (2005, p. 7). Yet 31% of highly educated women are unemployed, compared to 12% of highly educated men (Hanssen-Bauer et al., 1998, p. 237).

Rather than seeking the reason for the high unemployment rate of women, even highly qualified ones, in discrimination in the labour market and the traditional gender structures and attitudes, these authors lay the blame with the women who 'tend to enter training in fields for which the market is saturated and in which there are limited job opportunities' (Hanssen-Bauer et al., 1998, p. 9). Yet discrimination is shown in that females apply far more often for a job in the public sector than men but are in fact less often hired than men, even when they have similar diplomas (Mayen et al., ETF, 2005, p. 37–39). Moreover, family and society do strictly limit women's choice of training and jobs.

There is also little 'pull' from the labour market. The unemployment rate is high and the Jordanian economy is not eager to tap the female labour reserve, except for those types of work that are defined as feminine. Women suffer more from the economic crisis than men do. According to Mayen and colleagues, the total unemployment rate was 14.5% in 2003. Female unemployment dropped between 1997 and 2003 from 28.5% to 20.8%. This small improvement, however, was not reflected in an increased activity rate for women. Between 1997 and 2003, the female activity rate no longer increased as it had done in the previous two decades, but dropped from 13.9% to 11.2%, following the trend among males (Mayen et al., ETF, 2005, p. 22–30). So we see here two contradictory movements. This might be an indication that the unemployment rate dropped not because more women found a job, but because less-educated women, especially, stopped looking for a job and thus were no longer defined as being unemployed. More women than men report being tired of trying to find work or give other reasons for giving up seeking a job (Mayen et al., ETF, 2005, p. 32). It would be interesting to find out by qualitative research whether the religious upsurge in the last decade is being used to legitimise a return to the home by female job seekers. Some women have recourse to the informal economy, in activities ranging from knitting and embroidery to raising poultry or selling milk products. Of all Jordanian working women, 12% (approx. 63,000) are engaged in microenterprise activities (Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 2). However, many of these informal activities are doomed to failure as they can scarcely provide a living in the saturated informal market (Jaber, 1997, p. 159). Although informal activities are common for women, they are studied to a remarkably small extent, so a real discussion of them is not possible here.

With the domestic economy only weakly developed, many highly educated Jordanians have sought jobs on the regional labour market, especially in the Gulf countries. Although a few educated women did take teaching jobs abroad, most were kept from doing so because of the male permission needed and because female migrants to the Gulf needed to be accompanied there by a male relative. Thus women mainly depend on the development of the domestic labour market. This information is based on personal contacts with Jordanian women; it has not yet been substantiated by in-depth research about women's labour migration. A further discussion of women's participation on the migrant labour market is therefore not possible here.

In 1998, Mehra and Feldstein recommended that the role of the government in including women in development should be expanded further. The documents on the economic reform programme and the Social Productivity Plan delineated the actions to be taken to alleviate poverty: expansion and reform of the National Aid Fund; development of the physical and social infrastructure, in particular the upgrading of urban squatter areas; employment generation, in particular through support for small and microenterprise development; and

innovative employment training. But women were not mentioned explicitly in the plan except as regards the development of small and microenterprise – a result that the authors attribute to the presence of a woman on the Ministry of Planning's Task Force in that area (Mehra and Feldstein, 1998, p. 19). This shows that policy measures will have to be developed and implemented in two areas to enable the gender improvements in education to have an effect in the labour market. On the one hand, the familial and social constraints on women's employment will have to be reduced, and on the other the labour opportunities and salaries for women have to be improved.

Other equality issues

- The growing participation of women in politics offers chances for empowerment.
- Women's freedom of movement in public spheres is severely limited.
- High fertility is a hindrance to labour force participation.

Despite the positive developments in education, much remains to be done in gender equity in other domains. Political participation of women is limited, although growing (Amawi, 2000, 2001; El-Azhary Sonbol, 2003; ANND, 2005; Dagestani, 1994; Gallagher, 2000; Hasso, 2006). The Ministry of Political Development, founded in 2003 as part of the process of democratisation, emphasises the importance of women's active participation in political life and the need to maintain women's citizenship rights both in law and in practice (Baylouny, 2005). Women's political participation is essential to changing attitudes and policies towards the integration of women in the economy.

Women's political participation is also needed to deal successfully with other issues, such as women's lack of the citizenship right to transmit their nationality to their children (Amawi, 2000). In criminal law, domestic violence, rape, and honour killings continue to need attention (Abu Odeh, 1996, 1997; Faqir, 2001; Latte Abdallah, 1997; Nanes, 2003; Nasser et al., 1999; Warrick, 2005). In Jordan, rapists can escape criminal prosecution if they marry their victims. To avoid social stigma rape victims often succumb to the pressure of their family and agree to such marriages. Jordan was internationally criticised for its honour killings and the tendency to reduce the penalty for male perpetrators (Clark, 2003). As a result, the law was amended slightly in 2001 and the actual number of honour killings has decreased somewhat, but attention is still needed. Girls and women have been killed by their fathers or brothers not only for more serious sexual transgressions such as adultery, premarital sex or marriage to a man the family disapproves of, but also for minor offences such as flirting with, speaking to, corresponding with, or being seen in the company of men not belonging to the family (Warrick, 2005). Honour killings are an extreme expression of men's general control over women's behaviour and mobility, and an extreme example of the difficulties women still encounter not only in deciding about their own sexuality but also in using public space and working together with non-related males. These moral concerns undoubtedly have an effect on women's access to education and the labour market. All women's movements outside the home are subject to male permission and male scrutiny, driven by a basic suspicion of women's good intentions, and this severely limits women's freedom in schools and workplaces.

Another issue is high fertility (Shami and Taminian, 1985). Fertility is declining from an earlier high rate; yet it seems to be less affected by the rising level of women's education in Jordan than elsewhere. A large family can impede the labour participation of women. In development terms, it has led to situations where loans have been used to feed the family rather than to sustain an income-generating project. Seibel and Almeyda (2002, p. 6–7) describe cases in which women took loans to develop a microbusiness such as producing milk, cheese and butter for the market, but the produce was consumed by the family, leaving the families with unrepayable loans and poorer than before.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON THE ASSESSMENT OF DONOR INTERVENTIONS AND EXAMPLES OF BEST PRACTICE

National and international donors

- Women's organisations focus on a women's agenda rather than a gender equality agenda.
- Structural adjustment led to profound economic and social crisis, detrimental to women's position in the labour market.

Jordanian women's organisations were among the first to demand gender equality and provide specific help for women. Many of these were charitable organisations founded by female members of the royal family. In the 1990s an organisational structure consisting of the Jordanian National Commission for Women (JNCW) and the Jordan National Forum for Women (JNFW) under the leadership of Her Royal Highness Princess Basma was designed to coordinate a development programme for women including the work of NGOs. The activities of twelve of these women-oriented NGOs were assessed in a study by Mehra and Feldstein (1998) on women and development in Jordan, in preparation for cooperation with USAID/Jordan. The authors warned that most of these NGOs were constrained by both financial resources and the lack of trained professional staff and that their focus on a 'women's agenda' rather than on integrating women into development could serve to marginalise their objectives. For an overview of the key organisations and larger national NGOs working on women and development issues in Jordan, see World Bank (2005, p. 120–121) or Etyemezian and Taminian (2003, p. 9–10).

Among the international agencies and donors that influence Jordanian policies and development practices are the World Bank, IMF, ILO, the United States (through USAID), the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), the European Union, various European and other countries, e.g. the Netherlands, Italy, the United Kingdom (DfID), France, Germany (the German aid organisation GTZ) and Canada (CIDA), and a variety of international NGOs such as Save the Children, CARE International, and the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). These donors, and the development assistance they provided, have been important for improving the living conditions of Jordanians as well as in maintaining a degree of political and economic stability in the country. The international donor community has not only funded women's development projects but also sponsored studies and research, as we will see below. Currently UNIFEM, the JNCW and the Department of Statistics are jointly executing a study 'to document progress in women's economic advancement and their roles in decision making at the household level and in the public sphere'(World Bank, 2005, p. 121).

In 1999, Jordan received official development assistance (ODA) of US$430 million, which amounted to 5.3% of Jordan's GDP (www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/cty_f_JOR.html, figures for 1999). For future updates of such figures on flows of aid, see this site.

Following an agreement between the Jordanian government and the International Monetary Fund (IMF), a structural adjustment programme was set up in 1989 to reduce the budget deficit, inflation and consumption while increasing the GNP. Compounded by the Gulf crisis, it led to a profound economic and social crisis resulting in increased unemployment and poverty. According to an analysis by Jaber (1997), this had several effects for women, especially the poorer ones. Their husbands brought less food home (most of the shopping is done by men); marriages were postponed and young wives had to move in with their in-laws because couples could no longer afford to have a flat of their own; and labour opportunities in the public sector, which was attractive to women for several reasons, declined and were not taken over by the private sector. Given the gender-differentiated effects of structural adjustment programmes, the report by the Arab States Regional Office of UNIFEM (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 251) identifies the need to cushion disadvantaged groups

from the adverse effects. 'A more gender-sensitive approach to macroeconomic policy formulation and a more gender-aware application is crucial'.

Donor involvement in gender mainstreaming in education

- There are no (independent) evaluation studies of donors' activities on gender and education.
- Privatisation of higher education has unplanned gender effects for poorer segments of the population.
- Reform of education is in process, led by World Bank and USAID.
- Donors are active on gender equality in ICT (UNIFEM).
- The link between education for women and their chances on the labour market is unclear.

No large-scale studies have been done to assess the effect of donors' involvement with a focus on education and gender in Jordan. Gender mainstreaming in educational development, however, does receive attention in various studies. The most important one, albeit covering the whole of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA), is that of the World Bank (1999). The UNIFEM report (2004) that deals with the progress of Jordanian women, also generalises for all Arab women, but has interesting sections on deprivation of basic education, knowledge poverty and building capacities. Other studies focus on Jordan, but deal with various aspects relating to gender, including education. One of these is the report on the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action by the JNCW (2004) which concludes, on the basis of statistics, that 'Jordan has partially attained Goal 3, Target 4 of the Millennium Development Goals, Targets and Indicators, namely "Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and at all levels of education no later than 2015"' (JNCW, 2004, p. 7). Another is a document from the World Bank (2005) on the economic advancement of Jordanian women, which also has a short section on education. It confirms that Jordan has achieved gender parity in school enrolment and can be expected to achieve its MDGs in education in 2005. Jordan plays a leading role in the MENA region in terms of literacy (World Bank, 2005, p. 25).

A problem mentioned in this document is the high dropout rate for females at the tertiary level. It gives early marriage as the primary reason. What the report does not mention, however, is that early dropout is also a side effect of the World Bank's own policies supporting the privatisation of higher education. Privatisation makes higher education, especially the last years of tertiary education, more expensive. In the Jordanian situation of relative poverty and scant resources, this leads families to choose to spend resources on their sons' education rather than that of their daughters, or to discourage girls from going for the highest and most costly degree (Jansen, 2006). The World Bank's analysis is partly based on a UNIFEM (2003) study that uses 1997 figures to show that marriage is the most important reason for female dropout at the tertiary level. It should be noted, however, that this is a more socially respectable answer to this question than the answer that parents cannot afford to pay for their children's education. Parents expressed very high aspirations for their children's educational level, according to the survey by Hanssen-Bauer et al. (1998), but, with 21% of the population below the poverty line, many parents cannot afford to realise these aspirations. To understand the reasons for early dropout fully, more qualitative data are needed and more research needs to be done. More attention, both in research and development policy, should be given to the unplanned gender effect of increasing the costs of education for different strata in society.

Various sources give some details on the policies and processes that have been introduced to reach gender parity in all educational matters. Baylouny summarises the important role of the project **Education reform for the knowledge economy** in the efforts of the new Ministry of Political Development and Parliamentary Affairs to increase the political participation of youth and women, and to inculcate civic values and respect for the law. It is part of the joint programme of USAID and the Jordanian

government to reform the educational system. Through education young people can be taught to become politically and economically responsible citizens. But in order for this to be effective, the school system has to be improved: 'Education reform is designed to tackle the problem of rote memorisation and lack of analytical thinking in the education system, as well as inadequate teacher training, schools and equipment. […] Key to the new curriculum will be incentives for girls' participation, and school-to-work programmes. The World Bank committed over $100 million in loans to the effort, while the majority of USAID's contributions, almost $400 million, are in grants' (Baylouny, 2005, p. 41).

The reform starts with kindergarten. Early childhood education is at present almost entirely in the hands of the private sector, usually charitable or village or family associations. As a result, the quality of kindergartens varies significantly, but the ones I visited were in general poorly equipped and lacked properly trained staff. A more structured approach with greater government involvement is badly needed.

One effect of donor involvement in education reform is the extra stimulus it has given to the process of privatisation of higher education, as was briefly mentioned above. One aim of this was to increase the self-funding capacity of state universities and expand the number of universities in the private sector. The World Bank in particular has shown itself to be concerned with women's education in the Middle East (World Bank, 1999, 2004). The economic restructuring of higher education with more attention to self-funding, imposed by the World Bank through its loans, had an ambiguous effect on gender equality. More universities closer to home meant a higher enrolment of girls, yet it increased the exclusion of poor girls. Moreover, it increased the existing problem of girls' drop-out due to marriage or concepts of modesty, by adding a financial justification. The negative effects of privatisation should be counteracted by a continuing care for the accessibility and quality of the state universities and the development of a scholarship programme for poorer students. University fees should be in line with the local standard of living, and scholarships should be sufficient to cover fees, accommodation and subsistence. Moreover, this should be so for all levels of education, including the highest levels.

Another educational goal is to boost Jordan's position in information and communication technology (ICT). UNIFEM (2002) described how Jordanian women fare in the ICT space and what must be done to achieve 'E-quality' in the ICT sector.

A more critical note on the involvement of international donors with education in the Middle East is voiced by Sayed (2005). According to Sayed, an important strategic motive for US and European involvement with educational reform in the Middle East is the desire to contain the militant Islamic fundamentalist movements, but this is not explicitly stated in the donors' policy documents but subsumed under the phrase 'regional stability' (Sayed, 2005, p. 67, 81).

Some reports deal with education and training from the perspective of the labour market. A major aim of the education reform programme is to make schooling relevant to the needs of the labour market. This poses three problems. The first two are, according to Baylouny (2005, p. 41), to know what the labour market needs, and which labour market – domestic or regional – is being discussed. The third problem is that both these issues have a gender dimension. USAID acknowledges that it does not know what the labour market needs are and suggests doing a study to find this out. Jordanian girls follow an international trend in being less concerned than boys with labour market opportunities or needs when making a choice of discipline. Rather than learning a trade by following technical education, they tend to go to college or university. Rather than choosing a discipline that increases their job chances, they prefer literature or religion. Girls thus come to the labour market less prepared with valuable diplomas than boys. Moreover, they have extra obstacles to overcome, such as objections by parents to their daughters' employment and interference of parents in their disciplinary choices. A large majority

of parents support their daughter's education, even to the secondary or tertiary level, but very few expect them to use their education on the labour market. Girls study to enrich themselves and become more respected wives and better mothers, and to have a source of security to fall back on in case of divorce. But only a few women continue to use their education, and those who do work for preference in the education or health sector.

In Jordan, technical vocational education has low status. People perceive it as a 'last-resort' educational option and even those who attend it often see it as a stepping stone to continuing their education at college or university level. Technical education is inadequately developed and unable to adapt to rapid changes in the economy. A report by the European Training Foundation (ETF, 2000) mentions, however, the importance of improving technical vocational education and training in Jordan. It states that there is 'a high commitment in Jordan, both within the Government and among the main vocational education and training stakeholders, for a reform of the vocational education and training system as part of an overhaul of the overall human resources development system'. And such a reform has already 'become an integral part of the Education Reform Programme that started in 1988' (ETF, 2000, p. 1–2). In Annex A of the report, the projects funded by the European Union and several EU Member States (Italy, France, United Kingdom), amounting to €45.4 million, are mentioned, but without specifying gender as a field of intervention. Nor are the gender effects assessed. The report does not take gender as a special issue, but it does provide interesting sex-disaggregated figures. From this we learn that gender disparities are much higher in technical vocational education than in other types of education. 'Of all those going into vocational education, 75% were boys and 25% were girls' (ETF, 2000, p. 14). The report also gives information about the number of women who have profited from trainings or skills upgrading courses offered by the Vocational Training Corporation. A project description of the EU-funded MEDA-ETE project **Education and Training for Employment**, in which Jordan is one of the target countries, can be found at www.etf.europa.eu. Unfortunately, it makes no special reference to gender. The EU undoubtedly has a policy to fight against gender discrimination, but at the moment of writing there are no assessment reports available to estimate the gender effects of the projects sponsored by the EU in Jordan.

The ILO report *Gender equality and decent work: Good practices at the workplace* (2004), lists a number of good practices, including some that involve preparing women by education and training for participation in the economy. Jordan was not mentioned as an example under the best practice of upgrading women's levels of literacy and education, which is surprising, given its relatively positive educational situation compared to other Arab countries. This may be because the activities undertaken to reach the most illiterate group, that of poor, older, rural women, are limited, and because the growth of female education was a side effect of the expansion of general education and the high value attached to education by the society in general, rather than the result of a women-focused effort. The annotated bibliography by Hulton and Furlong (2001, p. 516) on gender equality in education gives some references related to examples of good practice and lessons learned in relation to education, but these do not concern Jordan. However, this is an informative paper with useful references (e.g. www.worldbank.org/gender/opera/lolinks.htm#E; www.usaid.gov/economic_growth/abel2/; or the Global Education Database 2000 at www.usaid.gov/educ_training/ged.htm).

Donor involvement in gender mainstreaming in the labour market

- Studies are available assessing donor involvement in gender in the economic domain.
- Studies call for gender impact assessment of structural adjustment programmes, employment creation, and gender mainstreaming of microfinance programmes.
- Unemployment and underemployment, wage and non-wage discrimination, and occupational segregation are relatively large problems in Jordan.

- Targeted policies are still urgently needed.
- There is some improvement of sex-disaggregated statistics, but further improvement is needed. Gender budgeting is increasingly used.
- Attention to the gendered impacts of labour migration is called for.

At least three significant studies have been carried out assessing the effect of donor involvement in gender in the economic domain, and these should be put first on the list of further reading. Exemplary in terms of assessing the mainstreaming effects of foreign aid is the gender analysis of USAID's programmes in Jordan in the report by Etyemezian and Taminian (2003). This report aims to analyse the gender implications of the strategies followed and to identify possible entry points for further gender integration. After giving an overview of the status of women in Jordan, the authors apply a gender analysis to three different strategic objectives of USAID in the country, relating to improvements in water resources management, the quality of life of Jordanian families, and economic opportunities for Jordanians. The analysis of the third of these strategic objectives is especially relevant here. The authors remark (2003, p. 20):

> Job creation, increased investment and access to credit are key components of the USAID/Jordan strategy. The analysis of employment creation should include not only number of employees, skill requirements, geographic location, but also gender – what proportion of these jobs will be filled by women or men. Gender is a factor in determining the economic and social impact of the increased employment. For example, studies have consistently shown income controlled by women is more likely to be directed to household consumption than income controlled by men. […] This finding has potential implications for both poverty reduction and poverty alleviation.

In their assessment, USAID/Jordan programmes supporting small and medium business enterprises and in microfinance have increased women's participation, both in absolute numbers and as a percentage of total membership. The authors recommend, among other things, that 'a more rigorous and sector-specific gender analysis would greatly benefit and inform programme design, development, implementation, monitoring and adjustment' (p. 24). They also suggest that gender analysis be included in the selection and design process of sector-specific activities. Support for the training in arts and crafts skills to inhabitants in the project of the Royal Conservatory Nature Society is mentioned as a best practice, as it demonstrates a holistic, gender-integrated, and ecologically sound approach to development (p. 21–25).

A second important, voluminous, and recent study is the report by the World Bank (2005) on the economic advancement of women in Jordan. Containing many detailed annexes, this gives an extensive and detailed gender assessment of Jordan's economy, citing women's limited economic advancement as the main problem. The report tries to explain Jordan's paradox of high female participation in education on the one hand and low female participation in waged labour on the other. It finds the explanation in the fact that Jordanian women, more than women in other countries, face constraints such as unemployment and underemployment, wage and non-wage discrimination, and occupational segregation (p. 23). However, it does not specifically analyse the impact of international donors. It does, however, comment on the strategic approach adopted so far, which has offered only partial solutions to the problem of redressing the below-average presence of women in the economic domain. In order to be more effective, 'more needs to be done to target male roles and to integrate men into the agenda for women's economic advancement as a national goal, so that both sides of the gender equation can be addressed'(p. xviii). Moreover, gender issues need to be systematically included in the policy, planning, and implementation process. A number of recommendations in this respect are given (p. 57–63).

The third key publication on mainstreaming gender in Jordan's economy is that of Seibel and Almeyda (2002) on women and men in microfinance. Projects for developing women's economic participation often take the form of offering credit to small and microenterprises, in line with the government's policy, stated above. The outstanding loan portfolio in Jordan is US$20,624,000 and the number of active borrowers is 9,697. Of the borrowers, 22% is rural and 45% is female, with an average outstanding loan balance of US$2,127. The institutions that provide microcredits are six NGOs, three government programmes, and one UN agency (Brandsma and Chaouali (2001, p. 14). The relative gender equity that can be read from the share of females among the borrowers, however, has only been attained by paying special attention to women. Gender mainstreaming is never a natural effect of development programmes. Whereas Brandsma and Chaouali deal with microfinance in the MENA region at large, Seibel and Almeyda (2002) focus on Jordan and do so from a gender perspective.

Seibel and Almeyda provided the following details on the European Union as donor. The EU provided grants to the amount of JD4.7 million to the Development and Employment Fund (DEF), which started in 1991 to alleviate poverty through microenterprise lending. During the period 1991–2000, DEF provided a total of JD 34.4m for productive projects of the poor and unemployed. IFAD, based in Rome, helped Jordan's Agricultural Credit Corporation (ACC) to increase its outreach to women by supporting the nationwide Income Diversification Project and the Karak and Tafila Agricultural Resource Management Project. In these projects, the share of female borrowers was 35% and 61% respectively. The women borrow money for projects such as cheese making, rabbit or chicken raising, or starting a bakery. They are not considered to be economically independent or responsible for their own loans, however, as monthly repayments are deducted from the husband's salary whenever possible. Both ACC and DEF face huge problems in reclaiming repayments and interest. Assessing DEF and ACC for their gender mainstreaming component it is interesting to note that 27% of DEF's portfolio has been lent to women (Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 2). Despite legal equality of access, and women's participation in the specific projects mentioned above, ACC's overall outreach to women is negligible, according to these researchers. These donors did help a number of women to start or expand their own business, but they also perpetuated some bad practices. Like men, women suffered from overindebtedness as a result of standardised loans that were too big, loan periods that were too long, and inadequate response to failure. But women were also disempowered by the insistence that repayments were made by deductions from the husband's salary. This made women more dependent on their husbands and impeded business growth (p. 9). Although the authors point out this bad practice, they do not suggest a good practice to overcome the problem, but only propose to increase the outreach to all groups, including the landless, low-income groups, and women.

European states also functioned as donors in Jordan. The Embassy of the Netherlands supported the Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development (JOHUD) to set up a dairy project in Ma'in in which 35 women participated, first as employees and later as semi-independent producers, keeping 50% of their sales (Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 13). JOHUD, like the other four MFIs in Jordan, employs international 'best practices'. However, a recurring problem of the enterprises set up with the help of the microcredit they provide is that they produce for a market in which there is too much competition to make them sustainable. Some, however, are more effective than others in achieving sustainability. For instance, the Microfund for Women (MFW), founded in 1996 as an affiliate of Save the Children, was successful, according to Seibel and Almeyda (2002, p. 14–15) because of its client incentive system, a branch image and set-up comfortable and accessible to women, its working toward demand-driven products, and its internal control and linkages with banks. Examples of best practices that helped to build a

microfinance sector with outreach to women are:

- including women, based on performance, in technical and managerial teams;
- allowing for both smaller and larger loans depending on women's specific needs and abilities to grow;
- making women bankable;
- focusing on microenterprise as a market segment;
- making strategic alliances with NGOs and other programmes;
- competitive gender orientation.

This last means that 'under competitive conditions, MFIs become more aware of the relevance of gender considerations in assessing their clients (e.g. gender-specific reasons for dropping out of loan programmes, occupational differences, preferred loan sizes and terms of different occupations such as trade and agriculture). For example, MFW has decided to maintain a focus on women, taking into consideration that poorer women are mainly in trade, lack collateral and prefer to start with small short-term loans'(Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 19).

Seibel and Almeyda also cover the USAID support for four commercially oriented MFIs in Jordan since 1998. These provide credit to both men and women, or, like the MFW, to women only. For January 2002, USAID projected an outreach of its four MFIs to 16,000 active borrowers, 50% (8,000) of whom would be women and 30% (4,800) located outside Amman (Seibel and Almeyda, 2002, p. 4). The two largest, which provide loans for starting up small businesses, are mostly concerned with women: the MFW (100% women clients) and the Jordan Access to Credit Project (JACP) (63% women clients). In terms of gender mainstreaming, these figures show an active policy and practice of economically empowering women. However, especially in rural areas, access by small farmers, women and the poor is still very limited. Sustainability performance is low, both in terms of outreach (number of borrowers) and operational cost recovery. Women can also borrow money from credit NGOs. However, with 13,000 active clients, their outreach is limited.

Apart from these key sources, several other publications are of interest when assessing gender mainstreaming in the Jordanian economy and the role of international donors in promoting it. These do not necessarily take Jordanian women in the workforce as a main focus but deal with this topic in a secondary way. For instance, the ILO is developing a Toolkit on Gender Mainstreaming in the World of Work, part of which is the recent report *Gender equality and decent work: Good practices at the workplace* (ILO, 2004), which lists a set of good practices that have been found to promote gender equality. A Jordanian example is used to illustrate one such case of good practice. This book defines a good mainstreaming practice as 'any type of action which contributes to greater gender equality in any area of intervention and which has perceptible results' (2004, p. 5). Among the good practices mentioned, one was that governments should gather, and act upon, sex-disaggregated and qualitative data to identify and monitor gender differences in the social and economic spheres. This good practice was also upheld in the most recent UN *Special Report on the World's Women* (UN Statistics Division, 2005), which reported that Jordan had conducted a population census in the 2000 decade, had a civil registration system with at least 90% coverage, and had reported population, births and deaths by sex for five years or more between 1995 and 2003, but not births by age of the mother or deaths by sex and age (UN Statistics Division, 2005, p. 42). Mayen et al. (2005, p. 53) made a similar call for more gender-disaggregated statistics in their concrete recommendations to Jordan's statistical agencies; they also recommended the collection of more information by gender on unemployment rates, activity rates and working conditions, and an increase in qualitative statistics, including identifying the reasons given by women for not seeking work. The ILO report (2004, p. 61–62) gave one example of how effective this gathering of sex-disaggregated and qualitative data could be for gender mainstreaming in the case of female migrant labourers in Jordan. In this case, 'gender analysis of workers' migration patterns provided the necessary information for the Ministry of Labour to

design a contractual arrangement that would protect the rights of women migrant workers'. On the basis of a gender analysis of migrant workers from Nepal, India, Indonesia, Philippines and Sri Lanka entering Jordan, measures were taken to guarantee female migrants, in particular, certain rights through a Special Working Contract for Non-Jordanian Domestic Workers, endorsed by the Ministry of Labour. The contract affirms migrant women's rights to be treated in accordance with international human rights standards, and includes the rights to life insurance, medical care, a designated day off every week, rest days, and repatriation upon expiry of the contract. It includes the provision of a minimum wage, equal to the salaries Jordanians receive for the same type of work. The Special Working Contract accompanies the amendment of the new law concerning the registration of recruitment agencies. Several organisations with gender expertise were included in the preparatory process and in the Steering Committee of Empowering Migrant Workers in Jordan Project, including representatives of the embassies of the sending countries, the ILO, UNIFEM, and the JNCW. The project also profited from external technical and financial support by the UNIFEM international programme.

Better quantitative and qualitative data on women's and men's jobs can also be obtained by applying the 'value chain approach'. ASRO/UNIFEM (2004, p. 225) defines the value chain as 'a display of all the positions workers (women and men) can assume in a particular sector, measuring their empowerment through actual financial and non-financial valuation'. These authors have applied this approach to the tourist sector so as to gain a better understanding of the experience of women (p. 226–227). Insight can also be gained by collecting the life histories of women working in a certain sector, as Malt has done for 24 women who founded, curate, administer, and support Jordan's museums (Malt, 2006).

As an example of best practice in microfinance, Brandsma and Chaouali (2001, p. 21) give the Save the Children microcredit programme in Jordan, which targets the poorest urban women. They give a list of best practices aimed at increasing sustainability in general, but do not suggest any best practices regarding gender mainstreaming in particular.

UNIFEM is at present involved in a global initiative to introduce gender analysis into economic policies and decisions regarding the distribution and allocation of public resources by means of gender-responsive budgeting, the collection of sex-disaggregated statistics, and the building of capabilities for gender-responsive budgeting (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 254). It is also active in Jordan in this respect. We have seen that the organisation participated in the study and follow-up of female migrant labourers. But no assessment is available as yet.

The International Finance Corporation (2004) mentions as a best practice in Jordan the targeting of 250 lower-income and middle-income women by the Jordan Forum for Business and Professional Women (JFBPW) to set up a business. The business organisation does this by providing facilities such as cheap office space, training and courses in business planning, accounting, and computer usage, and legal and business advice. In addition, it set up an all-women sales force that sells water-saving devices, which help other women to save money by saving water. Among the positive results mentioned is the fact that not only were 250 women supported in setting up a business, but also that the initiative started a 'gradual positive shift in perception of women as business owners' and increased new business ideas, business skills and useful contacts (p. 3). However, if structural unemployment is to be overcome, such well-meant initiatives can only be a drop in the ocean, and they leave the highly educated women who wish to become entrepreneurs unsupported.

The effect of all these well-meant efforts to create women's jobs was dwarfed by the effect of the political and economic but not gender-motivated USAID support for free trade agreements and qualifying industrial zones. Between 1998 and 2004 seven

such zones were opened up in Jordan, creating 25,000–30,000 jobs, mainly low-skilled jobs in garment manufacturing. Although about 40% of these jobs went to foreign workers, a large proportion were taken by young, rural, single women. Advantages for women were the new labour opportunities and new worker training programmes. Disadvantages are the low wages and limited labour protection characteristic of export processing zones. Moreover, this might be a temporary and artificial boom: the jobs could shift to Egypt, where lower wages can be paid, the construction is too heavily dependent on foreign aid, and most benefits flow back to the foreign investors (Moore, 2005, p. 21–22).

Valentine Moghadam (2005) chose Jordan as one of three countries in which to study the effect of the neoliberal policy of free markets and globalisation. She warns that the effects are complex and can be both positive and negative, and that not only economic policy itself but also the state's gender policies are influential. On the basis of the data she collected, she concludes that the labour market in Jordan appears to continue favouring men and keeping women locked out.

Additional information needed

- More information on the possibilities of strengthening civil society as partners in gender mainstreaming of Action Plans.
- Assessment of gender mainstreaming policies and practices as linked to the need for more equal legislation and more targeted activities towards women, especially linked to microcredit.
- Studies on the lack of transfer of gender equality from education to labour market.
- Gender impact assessment of the privatisation and Islamisation of higher education.
- Ongoing provision of sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data on education and employment.

A key recommendation of Mehra and Feldstein (1998, p. viii) that is still valid is 'to plan and implement a participatory process for developing Action Plans with the women's organisations, determining resource needs, and devising strategies for obtaining resources'. Strengthening civil society as partners in gender mainstreaming of policies and practices is therefore needed. One problem can be that women's organisations often focus on a limited woman's agenda. The growing participation of women in politics offers chances for empowerment on economic issues.

Mehra and Feldstein identify a need for further information about women's current microenterprise activities and about the informal sector as a whole. According to them, there is a 'gap in information about the level of women's skills, education and entrepreneurship in various social classes and in urban and rural areas'. Moreover, 'there is a gap in information about women's roles in agriculture and their activities in rural areas'(Mehra and Feldstein, 1998, p. x–xi). More generally, there is a need for clear guidelines on how and when attention to equal legislation, to targeted activities towards women, and to gender mainstreaming need to be combined in order to be most effective.

The effects of the privatisation and Islamisation of (higher) education for girls being ambiguous, more studies are needed on the gender impacts of these processes. The puzzle of high education of women combined with low female labour market participation needs further attention.

The above account has shown that there is an ongoing need for sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data on education and employment.

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF STUDIES ON GENDER EQUALITY ISSUES

Al-Talal, B., *Rethinking an NGO. Development, donors and civil society in Jordan*, I.B. Tauris, London, 2003.

Al-Tall, A.Y., *Education in Jordan*, National Book Foundation, Islamabad, 1978.

Abu Odeh, L., Crimes of honour and the construction of gender in Arab societies. In Yamani, May (ed.), *Feminism and Islam: Legal and literary perspectives*, Garnet, Reading, 1996, p. 141–194.

Abu Odeh, L., Comparatively speaking: The 'honor' of the 'East' and the 'passion' of the 'West'. *Utah Law Review* 1997, 2, University of Utah College of Law, 1997, p. 287.

Adely, F., The mixed effects of schooling for high school girls in Jordan: The case of Tel Yahya. *Comparative Education Review* 48 (4), 2004, p. 353–373.

Amawi, A., Gender and citizenship in Jordan. In Joseph, Suad (ed.), *Gender and citizenship in the Middle East*, Syracuse University Press, Syracuse, 2000, p. 158–184.

Amawi, A., *Against all odds: Jordanian women, elections and political empowerment.* Al Kutbah Institute of Human Development and Konrad-Adenauer Stiftung, Amman, 2001.

ANND [Arab NGO Network for Development] and International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, *Building democracy in Jordan. Women's political participation. political party life and democratic elections*, IDEA, http://www.idea.int/publications/dem_jordan/index.cfm, Stockholm, 2005.

ASRO/UNIFEM [Arab States Regional Office, United Nations Development Fund for Women], *Progress of Arab women* (English and Arabic), United Nations Development Fund for Women, Arab States Regional Office, Amman, September 2004, http://www.arabwomenconnect.org/hdocs/mainform.asp?p=lib/LibListandlang=andscat=59

Baylouny, A. M., Jordan's new 'political development' strategy. *Middle East Report* 236, 2005, p. 40–43.

Brand, L., Woman and the state in Jordan. Inclusion or exclusion? In Yazbeck Haddad, Y. and Esposito J.L. (eds), *Islam, gender, and social change*, Oxford University Press, New York/Oxford, 1998.

Brandsma, J. and Chaouali, R., *Making microfinance work in the Middle East and North Africa*, World Bank, Private and Financial Sector Development Group, Human Development Group, Middle East and North Africa Region, Washington DC, 2001. http://www.gdrc.org/icm/country/wana/wb-mfworks.pdf

CEDAW, *Consideration of reports submitted by States Parties under Article 18 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women – Jordan, 26 October 1999.*

Clark, J., 'Honor crimes' and the international spotlight on Jordan. *MERIP* 229, 2003, p. 38–41.

Dagestani, A., *Jordanian women and political participation*. Jordan Center for Strategic Studies, Amman, 1994.

El-Azhary Sonbol, A., *Women of Jordan. Islam, labor, and the law. Syracuse University Press*, Syracuse, 2003. See also her work on http://www.AMIR-Jordan.org

Etyemezian, N. and Taminian, L., *Gender assessment for USAID/Jordan*, Devtech Systems, 2003. http://www.devtechsys.com/publications/gender/assesments/Full%20Report_Jordan.pdf

ETF, *An overview of vocational education and training. Country report Jordan*, ETF, Turin, 2000.

Faqir, F., Intrafamily femicide in defence of honour: the case of Jordan. *Third World Quarterly* 22 (1), 2001, p. 65–82.

Flynn, D. and Oldham, L., *Women's economic activities in Jordan – research findings on women's participation in microenterprise, agriculture, and the formal sector*, WIDTech, Washington DC, February 1999.

Gallagher, N., Women's human rights on trial in Jordan: The triumph of Toujan al-Faisal. In Afkhami, M. (ed.) *Faith and freedom. Women's human rights in the Muslim world*, I.B. Tauris Publishers, London, 2000, p. 209–231.

Hanssen-Bauer, J., Pedersen, J. and Tiltnes, A. A. (eds), *Jordanian society. Living conditions in the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan*, Fafo Institute for Applied Social Science, Toyen, 1998.

Hasso, F., *Resistance, repression, and gender politics in Occupied Palestine and Jordan*, Syracuse University Press, Syracuse, 2006.

Hulton, L. and Furlong, D., *Gender equality in education. A select annotated bibliography*, BRIDGE (development – gender), Brighton, 2001.

ILO, *Gender equality and decent work. Good practices at the workplace*, ILO, Bureau for Gender Equality, Geneva, 2004. www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/genderresources.details?p_lang=enandp_category=NEWandp_resource_id=398 or, more specifically, http://www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/docs/RES/398/F1448380228/Good%20practices%20at%20the%20workplace%20-%20text.pdf

International Finance Corporation, *PSD gender notes. Gender dimensions of private sector developments.* Vol. 2, issue 2, *Incubating women's businesses – what works?* Section: Jordan: Overcoming structural unemployment, International Finance Corporation, January, 2004. http://www.ifc.org/ifcext/enviro.nsf/AttachmentsByTitle/art_gendernote2-2/$FILE/PSD+Gender+Notes+2-2+Incubators.pdf

Jaber, H., The impact of structural adjustment on women's employment and urban households. *Jordanies* 4, 1997, p. 148–166.

Jansen, W., Dumb and dull. The disregard for the intellectual life of Middle Eastern women. *Thamyris. Mythmaking from Past to Present* 3 (2), 1996, p. 237–260.

Jansen, W., Gender and the expansion of university education in Jordan. *Gender and Education*, 2006.

JNCW [Jordanian National Commission for Women], *The Jordanian woman: Reality and future aspirations. The Jordanian National Report*, Report for the Fourth International Conference on Women, Beijing, JNCW, Amman, September 1995.

JNCW, *Jordan*, Report by the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan on the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action (1995) and the outcome of the Twenty-Third Special Session of the General Assembly (2000), Amman, 2004. http://www.cities-localgovernments.org/uclg/upload/docs/JORDAN_English.pdf or http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/Review/responses/JORDAN-English.pdf

Kawar, M., Le travail des jeunes femmes à Amman: ses répercussions sur la structure des familles et l'organisation des lieux de travail / Young working women in Amman: Workplace and household perspectives. *Jordanies* 2, 1996, p. 107–113.

Kawar, M., *Gender, employment and the life course. The case of working daughters in Amman*, Konrad Adenauer Stiftung / Community Centers Association, Amman, 2000.

Köndgen, O., Kettaneh Khouri, E. and Salem Pickartz, J., *Jordanian women's guide to participation in public and political life*, Al Kutba Insitute for Human Development / Konrad Adenauer Foundation, Amman, 1998.

Latte Abdallah, S., Les crimes d'honneur en Jordanie / Honour crimes in Jordan, *Jordanies* 4, 1997, p. 184–192.

Malt, Carol, *Women's voices in Middle East museums. Case studies in Jordan*, Syracuse University Press, Syracuse, 2006.

Mayen, G., Guégnard, C., Matheu, X. and Shteiwi, M., *Unemployment in Jordan*, ETF, Turin, 2005.

Mehra, R. and Feldstein, H. S., *Women and development in Jordan. A review of current activities and future opportunities*, International Center for Research on Women / WIDTech, Washington DC, 1998. http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting-programs/wid/pubs/jordan_0198.pdf

Miller, C. and Razavi, S., *Gender mainstreaming: A Study of efforts by the UNDP, the World Bank and the ILO to institutionalize gender issues,* Occasional Paper 4, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD), Geneva, 1995.

Ministry of Education, *The Educational Statistical Report Scholastic Year 1998/1999*, Ministry of Education, Amman, 1999.

Ministry of Higher Education, Higher education in Jordan, internal unpublished report, Ministry of Higher Education, Amman, 2001.

Moghadam,V. M., A political economy of women's employment in the Arab region. In Khoury, N. and Moghadam, V.M. (eds), *Gender and national development*, Zed Books, London, 1995, p. 6–34.

Moghadam, V. M., *Women, work and economic reform in the Middle East and North Africa*, Lynne Rienner Boulder, 1998.

Moghadam, V. M., *Women's livelihood and entitlements in the Middle East. What difference has the neoliberal policy turn made?* Draft report, UNRISD, Geneva, 2005.

Moore, P. W., QIZs, FTAs, USAID and the MEFTA. A political economy of acronyms, *Middle East Report* 234, 2005, p. 18–23.

Nanes, S. E., Fighting honor crimes: Evidence of civil society in Jordan, *Middle East Journal* 57 (1), 2003, p. 112–130.

Nasser, L., Belbeisi, B. and Atiyat, D., *Violence against women in Jordan. Demographic characteristics of victims and perpetrators.* Summary of Field Study, The Human Forum for Women's Rights, Amman, undated.

Roald, A. S., *Tarbiya: Education and politics in Islamic movements in Jordan and Malaysia*, Lund University, Religionshistorisks avdelningen Lund, 1994.

Sayed, F. H., Security, donors' interests, and education policy making in Egypt, *Mediterranean Quarterly* Spring 2005, p. 66–84.

Seibel, H. D. and Almeyda, G., *Women and men in rural microfinance*, *The case of Jordan*, Development Research Centre, University of Cologne, Cologne, 2002.

Shami, S. and Taminian, L., *Reproductive behaviour and child care in a squatter area of Amman,* Population Council Regional Papers, Cairo, 1985.

Shami, S. and Taminian, L., Women's participation in the Jordanian labour force: A comparison of rural and urban patterns. In Shami, S., Taminian, L., Morsy, S., El-Bakri, Z.B. and Kameir, E., *Women in Arab society. Work patterns and gender relations in Egypt, Jordan and Sudan,* Berg, Oxford, 1990, p. 1–86.

Shami, S., Domesticity reconfigured: Women in squatter areas of Amman. In Chatty, Dawn, and Rabo, Annika, *Organizing women. formal and informal women's groups in the Middle East*, Berg, Oxford / New York, 1997, p. 81–100.

Shukri, S. J.A., *Arab women: Unequal partners in development*, Ashgate , Aldershot, 1996.

Shukri, S. J.A., Social changes and women in the Middle East. State policy, education, economics and development, Avebury, Aldershot, 1999.

Shuraydeh, K. and Sabbagh, A., *Women's and employers' attitudes towards female vocational training and employment in Jordan*, Ministry of Labour and Social Development, Amman, 1985.

Taraki, L., Jordanian Islamists and the agenda for women. Between discourse and practice. *Middle Eastern Studies* 32 (1), 1996, p. 140–158.

UNIFEM [United Nations Development Fund for Women], *Paving the road towards empowerment: Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, Palestine, Syria, the United Arab Emirates and Yemen*, UNIFEM Arab States Regional Office, Amman, 2002.

UNIFEM, *Evaluation the status of Jordanian women in the light of the Beijing Platform for Action*, UNIFEM Arab States Regional Office, Amman, 2003.

UNIFEM, *The status of Jordanian women: Demography, economic participation, political participation and violence,* UNIFEM, 2004, (In Arabic, available from dana_khan@unifem.org.jo or gems@unifem.org.jo . For a summary in English of key findings see www.unifem.org/pressreleases.php?f_page_pid=6andf_pritem_pid=163

UN Statistics Division (March 2005). *Special Report of the world's women 2005: Progress in statistics. Focusing on sex-disaggregated statistics on population, births and deaths*, United Nations Statistics Division, Commission on the Status of Women, New York, 2005. http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/products/indwm

Warrick, C., The vanishing victim: Criminal law and gender in Jordan. *Law and Society Review* 39 (2), 2005, p. 315–348.

World Bank, *Education in the Middle East and North Africa: A strategy towards learning for development*, World Bank, Washington DC, 1999.

World Bank, *Gender and development in the Middle East and North Africa. Women in the public sphere*, World Bank, Washington DC, 2004.

World Bank. *The economic advancement of women in Jordan. A country gender assessment*, World Bank, Washington DC, May 2005. http://www.kwdi.re.kr/data/wotrend1/Jordan_Gender_Assessment05.pdf

Other websites relevant to gender mainstreaming:

www.almanar.jo for human resources statistics on Jordan.

www.dos.gov.jo for population statistics on Jordan.

www.siyanda.org/search/qlinx-countryfocus.cfm?code=Jordan for access to key gender resources.

www.siyanda.org/exps/results.cfm?CouOfExp=Jordan to network with, or find, consultants with relevant experience concerning gender and Jordan.

www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/cty_f_JOR.html for ratings for Jordan on human and gender-related development.

http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/products/indwm/indwm2.htm for statistics and indicators on women and men.

MOROCCO

Willy Jansen

NATIONAL CONTEXT

Social and economic context and gender profile

- Gender inequality in education is high: only 55% of girls finish primary education and 63.9% of women are illiterate.
- Gender inequality in employment is also high: women are only 35% of labour force, and 27.6% of female labour force is unemployed.
- Women's organisations actively promoting gender equality have only recently emerged.

Morocco has a population of 28,705,000 people (est. 2000), and a GNP per capita of US$1,180, which makes it a middle-income country. Unemployment is high (22% of the total labour force) and many families survive on remittances sent home by migrant workers. In the UN Human Development Index, Morocco ranks 125th, and in the Gender-related Development Index (GDI) it ranks 100th, with a value of 0.604. (See www.undp.org for more data on this ranking.)

Social indicators reveal inequality between men and women in several areas, particularly education. According to the World Bank Group GenderStats, for 2000, women make up 50% of the total population. Life expectancy is 66 years for men and 70 years for women. The lagging behind of education and the gender disparity in education are major problems. Only 87% of boys and 80% of girls enrol in primary school and the completion rate of the primary cycle is 67% of the boys of the relevant age group and 55% of the girls. Adult illiteracy is 38.2% for men and a staggering 63.9% for women. Women also lag behind in the labour market. Women make up 35% of the total labour force, a figure that has hardly changed the past 25 years. Of the female labour force, 27.6% is unemployed, compared to 22% for the total labour force. The total fertility rate (births per woman) is 2.9 (http://devdata.worldbank.org/genderstats/genderRpt.asp?rpt=prileandcty+MAR,Morocco).

The degree to which women are organised is relatively low. However, Morocco has some internationally renowned feminist sociologists, such as Fatima Mernissi (1975, 1980, 1982, 1990), Soumaya Naamane-Guessous (1992), Aicha Belarbi (1991a, 1991b) or the feminist linguist Fatima Sadiqi (2000), who have all written on women's issues in Morocco[17]. Moreover, the recent democratic movement has given rise to the Association Démocratique des Femmes du Maroc (ADFM) and other women's organisations. The ADFM plays a vital role in advocacy for women's rights in Morocco and in the development and adoption of the national plan for the integration of women into development policies, planning and budgeting (www.macmag-glip.org/focalpoints.htm). A Moroccan woman was among the founding members of Women Living Under Muslim Laws, an international solidarity network 'that provides information, support and a collective space for women whose lives are shaped, conditioned or governed by laws and customs said to derive from Islam' (www.wluml.org/english/about.html). Several scholarly anthropological studies provide an inside view of Moroccan women's lives (Buitelaar, 1993, Carøe Christiansen, 1999; Davis, 1983; Fernea, 1988; Maher, 1974, 1978; Rausch, 2000).

Gender equality issues

Policies promoting gender equality and women's empowerment

- Gender equality policies started in the 1990s. Morocco ratified CEDAW in 1993, but with important reservations.
- The first gender equality plans and gender equality machinery appeared in 1999.
- Important steps towards equality in legislation were taken in 2004 (reform of the Personal Status Code).

17 For references cited in this country study, see bibliography of studies on gender equality issues

The history of gender equality policies in Morocco is relatively short. Individual activists such as Fatima Mernissi (1975, 1980, 1982) and her co-workers (e.g. Salahdine 1988) and foreign scholars (e.g. Howard-Merriam 1984, Messick 1987) wrote on women's subordination in the 1970s and '80s; Touria Hadraoui and Myriam Monkachi (1991) collected the names and publications of 26 Moroccan scholars and activists who had been working on women's issues in the 1980s; but organised efforts to overcome gender inequality were limited.

Gender became more of an issue in the 1990s. Morocco ratified CEDAW in 1993. The Committee that considered the initial report of Morocco in 1997, however, concluded that, despite a number of positive aspects, several difficulties had affected the implementation of the Convention, in particular the large number of important reservations Morocco had made when ratifying the Convention. The committee found no specific women's rights machinery that could coordinate and guide activities and projects for women, found women's representation at the policy-making level minimal, and remarked that considerable discrimination in the areas of marriage, conjugal relations, divorce and the custody of children remained (CEDAW, 1997, p. 1–2). Nevertheless, the first steps toward improving gender equality were taken, and this paved the way for other initiatives.

After the Beijing conference on women in 1995, the Moroccan authorities developed a Plan of Action for the advancement of equality between men and women. In the process of democratisation, modernisation and economic reform of the last decades, women have been recognised as a potential source to be channelled (Morocco 2005, p. 1). The government developed a Plan of Action for the Integration of Women in Development (PAIWD), which was presented in 1999 and opened the discussion between the government and the public on gender issues. The PAIWD focused on increasing women's participation in education, the development of new programmes on reproductive health, the integration of women in development – including the reduction of constraints in the workplace to women's full participation in and benefit from jobs – and reform of the Personal Status Code (*Moudawana*) which would empower women by reducing legal discrimination (USAID, 2003, p. 4). In 2000 the government installed a Ministry in Charge of the Condition of Women, Protection of the Family, Childhood and the Disabled, headed by a female minister. The danger of having a separate ministry of this kind is that gender issues may be marginalised rather than mainstreamed, and this ministry was underfunded, short-staffed, and lacking in sufficient expertise. Setting up special units for women's advancement, however worthwhile, is in itself not sufficient to mainstream gender, for mainstreaming implies, according to our definition, that all bureaucratic units take responsibility for integrating gender considerations. This ministry, however, was short-lived: after the elections in 2002 it was downgraded to a Secretariat of State, although it remained under the leadership of a female Secretary. For the gender mainstreaming policy of this ministry/secretariat see Ministry of Family Affairs, Solidarity and Social Work (2003). In the elections of September 2002 a quota system was introduced to ensure that at least 10% of the new deputies would be women. As a result, now 35 of the 325 members of the lower house of parliament are women.

Also, the new king supported women's rights. In his speech of 11 October 2002, His Majesty King Mohammed VI said: 'We aspire to have Moroccan women benefit from fair and equitable treatment in all areas of national life.' Both official policies and practices express a strong political will to ameliorate the rights of women. The king's positive stance towards doing justice to Moroccan women, combined with the new political participation of women, as well as the activism of civil society groups, impacted on the lobby to reform the *Moudawana*, or Personal Status Code. That such a reform was much needed was shown in the studies of Charrad (1993) and Mir-Hosseini (1993), both of whom discussed gender inequality in the law. A coalition of women's NGOs and human

rights NGOs, called *La Coalition d'appui au changement de la Moudawana*, strongly and successfully advocated such a reform. On 25 January 2004, the parliament of Morocco accepted the revised *Moudawana*. Among other things, it brought about improvements in the legal rights of women to divorce and gain custody over children, it raised the marriage age for both men and women to 18 years, and it established that women could no longer be forced into an arranged marriage. Men's rights to divorce and polygyny were curtailed by making them subject to court approval or the first wife's permission.

The government followed this legislation up with a large awareness campaign to convey the message of gender equality to the wider public. Although these issues might not seem directly relevant for the reader interested in mainstreaming in education and employment, and although some feminists found the reform still too limited because it left polygyny and unequal inheritance rights intact, the legal reform is of huge symbolic importance for Moroccan women. Gaining greater gender equality in the legal domain means that it can also be gained in other domains.

Education and training

- Despite large problems in education, there are few studies on gender and education in Morocco.
- Women's illiteracy has been a priority target since 1990, but progress is slow.
- New global monitoring report 2005 rates Morocco as lagging behind in gender equality and education compared to other countries in the region.

A high level of adult illiteracy, especially for women, prevails in Morocco. Although education is obligatory for children between 6 and 15, many children do not go to school, and a gap of 20% still has to be bridged before girls reach a total enrolment in primary school for their age group. The situation of education therefore begs for a considerable improvement. Despite this situation, however, very few studies on education in Morocco exist, except for Wagner (1993), who does pay attention to differences in education at different levels between men and women, and Agnaou (2004) on literacy programmes.

After the World Conference on Education for All, held in 1990 in Thailand, the Moroccan government, NGOs and voluntary associations made women's literacy a priority target and put a great deal of effort into combating female illiteracy. This led to considerable change, but not enough. Ten years after that conference, illiteracy among Moroccan women still exceeds 60% at the national level and a daunting 80% in rural areas. Lavy and Spratt (1997) concluded from a large survey that Morocco had halved its illiteracy in the past three decades but that gender disparities had widened. Agnaou studied the adult literacy programmes which, because of the gender gap in education, mostly targeted and were used by women. She studied women's literacy needs in both practical and strategic terms and the causes of their illiteracy, but she also asked why the adult literacy programmes were so ineffective and showed a dropout rate of 72% (Agnaou, 2004, p. 1–4). She suggests that for the literacy projects to be more effective the prevailing gender inequality in culture and economy has to be taken into account. This means that support for women's participation has to be obtained from the family and the community, and that economic integration of the graduate beneficiaries has to be ensured. In this regard, many actions could be taken. For instance, to retain women in the classes, it would be advisable to create daycare centres, use the media to make families aware of the importance of female literacy, provide practical and relevant teaching to girls' and women's daily lives with an empowering focus, design practical education and training in marketable skills, and teach women how to earn money to improve their standard of living (Agnaou, 2004, p. 169–170).

In December 2005 the new global monitoring report on education was published (EFA, 2005). It suggests priorities for scaled-up programmes for youth and adults. At least for Morocco, the pace of progress towards universal primary

education and gender parity remains too slow. This source contains the Education for All Development Index, which ranks countries according to their progress towards the six EFA goals set at the World Education Forum in Dakar in 2000. Morocco is categorised among the countries with a low Education Development Index. The high level of illiteracy among adult women and the deficit of education have implications for development issues such as employment, fertility, and family health. It is the outcome of the long-term inability of the Moroccan government to set up and enforce an educational system that reaches both boys and girls, in towns and in the countryside. Among the already low-rated Arab countries, Morocco stands out (together with Yemen and Mauritania) as lagging furthest behind.

Women's employment

- Female participation in the labour market is not high but is better than in other Arab countries.
- There is high sectoral segregation, with women mostly found in the food and textile industries.
- There are blatant inequalities in recruitment, wages and entitlements, and legal restrictions for women in employment.
- Female migration for work is on the rise.

The Middle East and North African (MENA) region stands out in general for its low rate of women's participation in the economy (Moghadam, 1995, 1998, 2002). In Morocco, women's participation in the labour market is not high but is better than that in some other Arab countries. Female unemployment, although high, is similarly less gender-skewed. In Morocco, an average of 35% of the women of working age is employed. Cairoli (1999) describes how garment manufacturing flourished particularly since 1980, offering work in the mid 1990s to 25% of the manufacturing labour force, most of them young, unmarried girls. Following negotiations with the IMF and the World Bank, Morocco launched a series of stabilisation and structural adjustment programmes in 1983. One result was the increase in low-capital, labour-intensive export industries, such as the canned food and garment manufacturing industries. This led to the large-scale incorporation of females, in particular girls, into these industries (Cairoli, 1999, 2006).

In its Concluding Observations on Morocco, the CEDAW Committee (CEDAW, 1997, p. 2), emphasised that 'blatant inequalities could be observed in women's recruitment, wages and leave entitlements, as well in legal restrictions on women's, but not men's, employment, which reflected stereotypical attitudes regarding appropriate work for women'. Most of such inequalities still remain. ASRO/UNIFEM (2004, p. 174) reports gender gaps in wages in the manufacturing sector. Women's earned income as a percentage of total earned income is a low 27.8% (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 175, 223). But the gender gap in wages in Morocco is smaller than that in other regions. In Morocco the ratio of women's wages to men's wages is 0.86 compared to 0.73 for the MENA region in general and 0.77 for the industrialised countries (World Bank, 2004, p. 102).

Many women depend on the remittances sent home by male migrants, although these are currently negatively affected by cutbacks in the employment of foreign workers in the absorbing countries. De Haas (2003, p. 355–363) describes the case of an oasis community where large-scale male migration improved the material situation but also increased the conflicts between women and their in-laws (who often receive the remittances). In combination, these processes led to atomisation of family life, with extended families breaking up into nuclear units, resulting in an increase in the decision-making power for those women who could head their own nuclear household. Whereas migration used to be male-dominated, we now see a change towards a feminisation of migration, with more and more women going abroad to find work elsewhere (Salih, 2001).

REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON THE ASSESSMENT OF DONOR INTERVENTIONS AND EXAMPLES OF BEST PRACTICE

National and international donors

- Domestic donors concentrate on the rights of women.
- The involvement of international donors is extensive.
- Progress is being made on the collection of sex-disaggregated data.

Several domestic NGOs are working at improving gender equality. This year several NGOs are collaborating to spread information about the changes in the rights of women in the Moroccan *Moudawana*. For instance Femme Action, an NGO that works to spread women's literacy, also distributes a pamphlet explaining the new laws to women (Elsaesser, 2005).

Among the international agencies and donors that may influence Moroccan policies and development practices on gender-related issues are the IMF, the ILO, the United States through USAID, the World Bank, the Peace Corps (women's health and microfinance), UNIFEM, the EU (Delegation of the European Commission), various European countries such Germany (GTZ, including a project on the integration of women in development), and a variety of funds, e.g. Helen Keller International (literacy and income-generating projects for women).

The Beijing Platform for Action, adopted in 1995 at the Fourth World Conference on Women, requested governments to 'generate and disseminate sex-disaggregated data and information for planning and evaluation' (UN, 2005, p. 6). Worldwide, very little progress was made in the official reporting of sex-disaggregated data, but Morocco was a favourable exception. It was one of the few countries that progressed from infrequent to frequent reporting of the population by sex and age (p. 15). Morocco conducted a population census in the 2000 decade, had a civil registration system with at least 90% coverage, and reported population, births and deaths by sex and age (of the mother in the case of births) for five years or more between 1995 and 2003 (p. 39). Having sex-disaggregated data of this kind is an essential tool for gender mainstreaming processes. It is also the basis for the UNDP's Human Development Report on Morocco.

In 1999 Morocco received official development assistance (ODA) of US$678 million, amounting to 1.9% of the country's GDP (www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/cty_f_JOR.html also see this site for more data on flows of aid).

Donor involvement in gender mainstreaming in education

- There are no (independent) evaluation studies of donor activities on gender and education.
- USAID identified economic and social constraints for improving gender equality in education.
- USAID suggested several good practices: girl-sensitive teaching methodologies, adapting curriculum, sensitising parents, scholarships, upgrading teacher quality, inviting critical suggestions from consumers.
- Islamic educational initiatives need to be monitored in terms of their gender equality impacts.

No in-depth studies have been carried out assessing the effect of donor involvement with a particular focus on education and gender in Morocco. There are, however, several studies that discuss gender and education in one way or another.

Most information can be found in the report *Morocco, National Report Beijing +10* (Morocco, 2003). This report gives an overview of the attention given to women's issues in Morocco, but makes clear that it is a recent concern. It states (p. 2) that since 1995:

> women have been recognized as a potential source to be channelled. For the first time in the history of Morocco, there is political mobilisation around women's issues, raising awareness for a more realistic understanding of economic and social realities in the Kingdom, establishing equality between

> men and women in the public arena and within the family as a prerequisite for democracy. Participation by women has become a major concern in sustainable development policies.

Morocco is still far from gender equity, but large steps have been made and a remarkable change in policy processes can be noted. As an indication of social progress, the report states that the net rate of school attendance of six year-old girls rose from 17.9% in 1990 to 85.4% in 2003, that it did so more rapidly than that of boys, and that the expenditure allocated to education now represents one-fifth of the state budget and 5% of GDP (p. 3, 8). Education and training is a critical area of intervention. The report lists the policies and actions taken in this field, which include the integration of the gender approach as a planning tool in programmes against illiteracy and activities promoting school enrolment; the establishment of a functional literacy programme for rural women; the review and revision of the contents of 120 school textbooks from a gender equality perspective; offering courses on gender equality at the tertiary level, and the institutionalisation of the gender approach through a three-year training programme for journalists (p. 7–8; see also Belarbi, 1987). A number of other initiatives are only vaguely formulated, with no clear and concrete goals, for instance 'In order to reinforce the impact of the actions in favour of women, measures have been undertaken for encouragement, coordination and evaluation' (p. 8). Moreover, the only assessment given of these initiatives was to mention the effect of the increase in school enrolment. We do not learn what has been proven to work or not to work, and whether the effect was due to gender mainstreaming activities or to the extension of education in general.

A second relevant study in this respect is the *Gender Assessment for USAID/Morocco* (USAID, 2003), which has a section on workforce development and education (p. 15–18). USAID has learned from its five years of experience in activities to increase girls' enrolment in primary schools that girls are more likely than boys either to drop out or to be pulled out of school by their families if what they learn is not pertinent or relevant or does not fit accepted social gender structures. Although no analysis is given of the impact or results of USAID's activity, the report does give a description of the upcoming plans, as well as some advice on which constraints have to be reckoned with in designing and implementing development activities in this field. Funding levels permitting, USAID plans to extend its educational activities and to invest in increasing girls' enrolment in middle school education (grades 7–9). The report mentions the following economic and social constraints (USAID, 2003, p. 16):

> Both boys and girls are constrained from attending post-primary schools because of the direct costs of schooling (transportation, books, etc.). Sending children to school has direct and indirect costs for families and sending girls to school, in particular, has very large indirect costs. Additionally, the value of education for rural girls is not evident to parents. Since most post primary-level institutions of learning […] are located in urban or peri-urban areas, sending girls to school is both an expensive endeavour and one which makes parents uncomfortable. Even if schools have dormitories to house girls, safety issues are a definite and legitimate consideration for parents. Social and traditional practices also diminish the incentive for parents to send their daughters so far away from them where they may conduct themselves 'inappropriately'. Another constraint that may affect girls' enrolment in school – a constraint that can be aggravated by the economic effects of the FTA – may be an indirect result of increased economic opportunities, particularly in rural areas where parents are already hesitant to keep their daughters in school in the upper levels of primary. Increased wage opportunities can have an adverse impact on girls' education. Girls may leave school early in order to enter the workforce. Conversely, if wage opportunities attract women into the labour force, then girls may leave school in order to take over their mothers' responsibilities in the home.

Building on this analysis of economic and social constraints, USAID suggests some good practices to overcome them. To improve the relevance of education, teaching and learning methodologies that are child-sensitive, and especially girl-sensitive, should be developed and applied. In agricultural vocational training centres, 'curricula must move from theoretical to practical and region-specific skills transfer'. Parents should be sensitised to the importance of continued education for their daughters, and living arrangements of girls at school should be safe and supportive. As an incentive for girls' education, scholarships to girls for vocational training could be provided (USAID, 2003, p. 16–17). The report does not question, however, why agricultural training centres should be based in urban areas, necessitating a boarding system for students, which is particularly problematic for girls. It would be better to increase the number of training centres in rural areas and thus bring vocational schools closer to the students. For sparsely populated areas, 'travelling schools' might be an idea. Nor does the report question the problematic relation between common people and the state, which may affect their attitude towards education. According to Fatima Mernissi (personal communication), people's low esteem for education is related to their low esteem for the state and state officials, including teachers. People's voices of opposition have found expression in the Moroccan *Tel Quel* magazine (*Le Maroc tel qu'il est*), which published special issues on 'violence in school' (22–29 November 2003) and 'know your rights and defend yourself against the administration' (17–23 May 2003). Several 'good practices' could be derived from this, for instance upgrading the quality of the teaching staff (crucial for boosting success in the educational field) or inviting and fruitfully using consumers' critique of the schooling system in order to bring about positive change.

An earlier study for USAID was *Elaborating a gender strategy for USAID/Morocco* (Flynn, Curtin and Martin 1999). It made recommendations for improving gender integration in special and strategic objectives of USAID. Especially of interest are the gender recommendations for managing gender (p. 29–32). Here a brief guide to integrating gender in monitoring and evaluation is reproduced, which can be of significant interest for practical gender mainstreaming activities in the future.

The voluminous study by the World Bank, *Gender and development in the Middle East and North Africa. Women in the public sphere* (2004) contains a general chapter on closing the gender gap in education. It compliments the MENA countries on the impressive progress they have shown over the past decade in education, but worries that this has not been matched by a similar progress in women's participation in the labour market (World Bank, 2004, p. 5–6, 25–43, 55–89). An earlier World Bank study, *Education in the Middle East and North Africa: A strategy towards learning for development* (1999), was even less optimistic, but fulfilled an important function in signalling the education problems in the area. It paid only scant attention to gender equity, but did mention Morocco as one of the countries, together with Yemen and Egypt, where many girls still do not enrol in school and where school dropout is more significant for girls than boys. It provides much background information on education in the region in general, but no specific gender mainstreaming projects were assessed.

Salinger and colleagues (2003), in their assessment of the development of the Moroccan workforce, also included a section analysing Morocco's education and training systems. Gender, however, was not systematically integrated, which is a missed opportunity.

A website on development organisations in Morocco lists two NGOs that work towards improving education. Neither of them makes working towards gender equality in education an explicit goal, but their work can nevertheless have a gendered effect. These are ALESCO (Organisation spécialisée de la Ligue arabe pour l'éducation, la culture et la science) and ISESCO (Organisation islamique pour l'education, les sciences et la culture). Among their aims is not only a full Arabisation of education but also the

consolidation of Islamic culture, including its 'unchanging ideals' (www.tanmia.ma:/article.php3?id_article=81). It would be advisable to follow and study the work of these organisations in order to see whether the values and high ideals interpreted by these organisations as Islamic include the full participation of women in schooling and work.

The ILO report *Gender equality and decent work. Good practices at the workplace* (2004) lists a number of good practices, including those of preparing women by education and training for participation in the economy. Morocco was not included, but advice could be derived from it for the Moroccan situation. The same can be said for the annotated bibliography by Hulton and Furlong (2001, p. 51–56) on gender equality in education, as it gives some references related to examples of good practice and lessons learned in relation to education. It is an informative paper with useful references to literature and websites. Under the heading 'Government and donor approaches to mainstreaming gender in education', Hulton and Furlong critically review a number of studies that are very relevant to the question of mainstreaming gender in education. In particular, Leach (2000), who discusses the gender implications of development agency policies on education and training, and Wazir (2000), who assesses NGO strategies on education in terms of gender, could be of interest despite the fact that they do not deal directly with Morocco.

Donor involvement in gender mainstreaming in the labour market

- The are no major studies assessing donor involvement with gender mainstreaming in the labour market.
- Structural adjustment programme expanded sectors of the labour market where women's presence is greater.
- Family traditions and low female presence in political and economic decision-making hinder the economic development of women.
- The gender sensitivity of macroeconomic policies is limited.
- Calls for targeted policies and more equal legislation are still prominent.
- Microfinance programmes need strengthening and gender mainstreaming.

Morocco, like many other Arab countries, has been obliged to adopt a structural adjustment programme under the IMF and the World Bank. Integral parts of such an adjustment programme are to liberalise trade, privatise state enterprises, and balance the budget. Morocco belongs to the intensive reformers 'who managed to adapt export promotion strategies, private sector developments, export-led growth, tariff reductions, exchange rate liberalisation, fiscal and debt reduction, and tax reforms' (ASRO/UNIFEM 2004: 211). Privatisation in the economy usually means that the public sector, where many women are employed, is reduced. Restructuring programmes are therefore not gender-neutral. Studies have shown that women are hit harder by these programmes than men in terms of poverty, unemployment, school dropout rate and care obligations (Thomas, 2000, p. 36; Benaria, 1995, p. 1845; ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 211–212, Karshenas and Moghadam, 2001; Moghadam, 2005). In Morocco, public-sector employment as a percentage of women's jobs is less than 6%, and, because of structural adjustment, the shrinking public sector therefore does not have much impact on women's employment. A positive effect of the structural adjustment programme was that in Morocco the expansion of manufacturing exports was notably in the textile and ready-made garments industry, thus increasing the employment chances of women in this sector (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 213, 219). However, this sector also carries the risk of unfavourable working conditions and quick global shifts in location of these industries in this highly competitive market. Moreover, doing factory work connotes a low status for women in Morocco as it is seen as dishonourable.

Another unstable sector is the informal economy. More than 40% of the Moroccan women in the labour force work in the informal economy (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 220). This high percentage is an indication of the malfunctioning of the

formal labour market. It is a characteristic of the informal economy that it is hidden from view. It includes, among others, domestic servants who are not only financially but often also sexually exploited, street vendors, beggars, and prostitutes. This sector is clearly understudied. There are no extensive reports on the policies, practices or effectiveness of efforts to improve the situation of women in the informal labour market. This does not necessarily mean that nothing is being done. For instance, with help of the Stockholm Agenda for Action, organisations are now working to sensitise the government and people in general about commercial sexual exploitation, especially that of children. A plan of action is being constructed and some specific actions were taken against human trafficking and prostitution, such as the recent police action against child prostitution in Marrakech (see www.ecpat.net under Morocco, and http://gvnet.com/childprostitution/Morocco.htm). The only suggestion that can be made here is that studies on the informal labour market need to be done before policies can be made and their effects measured.

No major studies exist assessing gender mainstreaming in the labour market, or donors' involvement with such mainstreaming. The ASRO/UNIFEM (2004) study on the progress of Arab women, quoted above, is an interesting resource of key statistics and other information on Arab women in general, and gives insight into which promises are unfulfilled and which strategies and programmes of action are currently under way. But it gives only a few examples of such programmes in Morocco and does not assess their effect. One example is the establishment of the Social Fund for Development by the Moroccan government, which aims to strengthen social cohesion by protecting the family and combating the feminisation of poverty. It included support for small income-generation projects for women, such as sewing workshops in Tangiers and Casablanca, and a women's vocational training centre in Marrakech that gave basic education and literacy classes (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 160). However, much needed as they are, such small-scale projects are just a drop in the ocean and hardly contribute to structural gender mainstreaming.

The ASRO/UNIFEM study does mention a number of constraints that should be dealt with when aiming for gender equality. As elsewhere in the Arab world, family traditions may preclude women from working certain schedules or in certain occupations or locations, regardless of job opportunities, level of schooling and economic need. Moreover, women are insufficiently represented at the economic and political decision-making level, as a result of which their impact on making labour policies and practices gender-sensitive is quite limited. Women are also largely absent at decision-making levels in trade unions and employers' organisations. Following the assessment of social policies in the Arab world by Abdel Bassit Abdel Mo'ty, the report states: 'Most social policy schemes in the Arab world are services, not policies, and are not tied to specific targets or outcomes. They are oriented toward the passive recipient not the active participant'(ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 167–168). This may explain why it is so difficult to find material that shows results on policy impact or provides tools for gender mainstreaming processes. Women were targeted as passive recipients of social services until only a few years ago, and are only now, and on a very small scale, becoming active participants in policy development.

A major assessment of Morocco's workforce development carried out at the request of USAID (Salinger et al., 2003) gives sex-disaggregated economic activity and unemployment rates, and mentions the relatively large employment of women in the industrial sector (42.4% is female), but fails to give a profound gender analysis. Marphatia and Afilal (2002) report on two gender training workshops concerning gender and sustainable development which aimed to reinforce knowledge of gender concepts and strengthen abilities to integrate the concepts into programmes, projects and policies. A second aim was that the people trained could pass on their knowledge to others.

Another source is *Morocco. National Report Beijing +10* (Morocco, 2003), which promises to describe the policies and strategic objectives in favour of economic participation of women. It states, however, that 'the Moroccan government was unable to confirm the commitments made during the Beijing Conference like other States, for two essential reasons: the lack of necessary resources and the limited gender sensitivity of macroeconomic policies in the elaboration of development programmes' (p. 9). A number of projects are listed, concerning capacity building among women entrepreneurs, the inclusion of women in the Youth Credit programme, and income-generating programmes for women in rural areas. Moreover, new legislation provided women with the equal right to employment and commercial activity. But when assessing these policies, for instance the policy to combat poverty, the report states: 'the government does not sufficiently take into account the socio-professional needs of women'(Morocco, 2003, p. 15). Although the economic activity of women increased slightly in both urban and rural areas, several factors that have a negative impact on women's employment are mentioned. These include a high level of under- and unemployment, the precarious professional status of unpaid domestic workers, lack of resources and infrastructure, low investment in women's skills, lack of access to credit, high interest rates, and low level of education (p. 16). The section on employment ends with a list of suggestions. The Moroccan government is called upon to enlist the support of the business community to (p. 19–20):

- provide specific measures of encouragement to promote women entrepreneurs;
- develop a fund to support women's initiatives in difficult regions;
- redefine the roles of economic leadership in the communities and professional associations;
- strengthen the representation of women in economic matters;
- diversify professional training;
- organise income-generating activities;
- modernise and structure agricultural economic activities for women in rural areas.

For all these activities, policies and practices should be delineated. Other suggestions as to what kind of corrective measures can be undertaken to increase the gender sensitivity of macroeconomic policies are not given in this source, and therefore go beyond the scope of this paper, which aims to give an inventory of the existing reports. But a first glimpse of what is needed can be derived from the theoretical article by Hoskyns and Rai (2005), who argue that the role of the household, that is, the various elements of social reproduction, should be more profoundly incorporated into political economy, theory and policy.

Projects for developing women's economic participation often take the form of offering credit for micro- and small enterprises. Microfinance programmes in Morocco, all working through NGOs, are sponsored by USAID, UNDP, the Hassan II Fund, the European Commission, the Spanish foundation CODESPA, the North Agency, and the Italian government (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 267). There is not yet a study assessing these microfinance programmes in Morocco, but some sources do mention Morocco occasionally. One of these is the study by Brandsma and Chaouali, *Making microfinance work in the Middle East and North Africa* (2001). Compared to other Middle Eastern and North African countries, in Morocco the outstanding loan portfolio (US$994,000) is low compared to the potential for microfinance. Less than 1.5% of potential demand is covered. With this amount 7,385 borrowers are reached, with an average outstanding loan balance of US$135. Of the beneficiaries, 40% are from rural areas and 73% are women. Individuals cannot borrow money, only groups. Microcredit is provided by four NGOs (Al-Amana, Association Marocaine de Solidarité et de Développement, Fondation pour le Développement Local et le Partenariat, Fondation Zakoura) (Brandsma and Chaouali, 2001, p. 15). These figures indicate that women profit more than men from these microfinancing projects. The Al Amana programme targets exclusively the poorest women in groups (Brandsma and Chaouali, 2001, p. 18); but in order to ensure future sustainability,

improvements are necessary in outreach and operational cost recovery. As donor and government funding is unreliable in the long run, microlending must be made profitable for private banks and available resources need to be used more efficiently (p. 16). One bank in Morocco is expected to start microfinance operations in the near future. Brandsma and Chaouali mention a number of problems that hamper sustainability in general, and follow this up with a list of best practices in general, but they do not suggest best practices in gender mainstreaming. They only suggest that 'donors wishing to target women should fund programmes that target women exclusively', but do not specify why. If women tend to drop out out mixed microfinance programmes this means that these programmes are insufficiently mainstreamed.

The ASRO/UNIFEM report (2004) evaluates the 'solidarity-group lending technique', applied by microfinance programmes that target Moroccan women, as a practice that ensures the highest possible repayment rate of a loan, since group members are jointly liable for each other's loans (p. 242). The loans and the enterprises that can be built with them are, however, very small and marginal, ranging only from US$10 to US$100, and it is questionable whether they have a significant effect in empowering women or alleviating poverty. This report assesses that 'many programmes have not been sufficient to empower women economically in the Arab countries due to various shortcomings in their implementation. Since the majority of poor-women beneficiaries […] are eligible for small loans of a size that hardly enable business growth. Accordingly, women's status among their families and their surroundings doesn't improve, and their bargaining power continues to be weak' (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 243). Nor can the effect of these programmes be shown in the poverty figures. The percentage of people living under the poverty line of US$2 a day increased from 13.9% in 1990–91 to 19% in 1998–99, according to national censuses in Morocco (p. 242). Another critique was that hardly any of the technical needed to develop stronger and more sustainable enterprises training was provided (p. 244). It is therefore important to develop measures to avoid a feminisation of indebtedness.

UNIFEM and UNDP supported the Moroccan Ministry in Charge of Women's Condition, Family and Child Protection by putting in place initiatives for mainstreaming gender concerns in development planning and programming in order to reduce gender disparities. An important initiative towards gender equality, described by the World Bank as a 'silent revolution' because it circumvented much of the ideological resistance to gender equality, was the preparation of gender-sensitive national budgets and the evaluation of budgetary allocations and expenditures, and the mainstreaming of gender in the next national development plan (ASRO/UNIFEM, 2004, p. 247). From this Moroccan example a best practice can be formulated, consisting of strengthening national capacities to mainstream gender concerns into the national budget and to evaluate budgetary allocations and expenditures with a gender lens.

Last but not least, the World Bank report *Gender and development in the Middle East and North Africa: Women in the public sphere* (2004) contains a long chapter on women in the economy in the MENA countries, including Morocco. It repeats the message that in the whole region, little progress has been made in women's participation in the labour market. General information on women's position in the economy is given, as well as an overview of the constraints on women's work and a list of suggestions for improvements (World Bank, 2004, p. 5–6, 55–89). But the World Bank's own role is not assessed.

Additional information needed

- Assessment of gender mainstreaming policies and practices as linked to the need for more equal legislation and more targeted activities towards women.
- Ongoing provision of sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data on education and employment.

- Assessment of gender impact of emerging Islamisation in education.
- More information on the possibilities of strengthening civil society as partners in gender mainstreaming.

The above account shows that in-depth assessments of the gender mainstreaming policies and practices of both government, NGOs and international donors in Morocco are missing. Major steps have been taken, but more information is needed about their effect in order to assess their sustainability. More particularly, there is a need to assess gender mainstreaming in connection with other strategies for gender equality, such as equality in legislation and targeted activities.

Also, the collection of sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data on education and employment should be extended in order to be able to make a more profound gender analysis. Akkari (2004, p. 152) noted that educational research is particularly limited in the Middle East and North Africa and is not integrated into international research networks. According to him, 'Recent reports from the SERI (Southern Educational Research Initiative) have reviewed educational research activities in all Third World regions except the Middle East and North Africa (SERI, 1996)'. More data gathering, comparison and analysis of education are therefore needed.

Some authors have studied re-Islamisation processes in Morocco (Hessini, 1995; Carøe Christiansen, 1999; Kapchan, 1996), but it would be relevant to know, for instance, the impact of this turn towards Islam on the developments in education and employment, or on gender mainstreaming policies. Female employment raises a number of questions. For instance, does the heavy dependence on textile industry carry dangers for the sustainability of women's economic participation? What effect does employment have for women's status?

More information on the involvement of civil society or the public debate on gender mainstreaming is also urgently needed. Apart from the book of Chatty and colleagues (1997) on women's networks in the Arab world and Sadiqi's (2000) short paper on Moroccan feminism, very little has been written about the organisational level of Moroccan women and the strength and variety of the women's movement. In order to support the government in taking the suggested steps proposed in the report *Morocco. National Report Beijing +10* (2003, p. 19–20) plans of action should be designed, activities set up and evaluations made.

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF STUDIES ON GENDER EQUALITY ISSUES

Agnaou, F., *Gender, literacy, and empowerment in Morocco*, Routledge, New York, 2004.

Akkari, A., Education in the Middle East and North Africa. The current situation and future challenges, *International Education Journal* 5 (2), 2004, p. 144–153.

ASRO/UNIFEM [Arab States Regional Office, United Nations Development Fund for Women], *Progress of Arab women* (English and Arabic), United Nations Development Fund for Women, Arab States Regional Office, Amman, September, 2004. http://www.arabwomenconnect.org/hdocs/mainform.asp?p=lib/LibListandlang=andscat=59

Belarbi, A., La représentation de la femme à travers les livres scolaires. In Zryouil, Fatima Zohra, et al. (eds), *Portraits de femmes*, Éditions Le Fennec, Casablanca, 1987, p. 47–68.

Belarbi, A. (ed.), *Corps au féminin*, : Éditions Le Fennec, Casablanca, 1991a.

Belarbi, A., *Le salaire de Madame,* Éditions Le Fennec, Casablanca, 1991b.

Benaria, L., Towards a greater integration of gender in economics, *World Development* 23 (11), 1995, p. 1839–1850.

Brandsma, J. and Chaouali, R., *Making microfinance work in the Middle East and North Africa*, World Bank, Washington DC, 2001. www.gdrc.org/icm/country/wana/wb-mfworks.pdf

Buitelaar, M., *Fasting and feasting in Morocco. Women's participation in Ramadan*. Berg, London, 1993.

Cairoli, L., Garment factory workers in the city of Fez, *The Middle East Journal* 53, 1, Winter, 1999. http://209.196.144.55/articles/cairoli.html

Cairoli, L., Girl but not woman: Garment factory workers in Fez, Morocco. In Moghadam, V.M. (ed.), *Empowering women: Participation, rights, and women's movements in the Middle East, North Africa, and South Asia*, Syracuse University Press, Syracuse, 2006.

Carøe Christiansen, C., Self and social process in women's Islamic activism, Unpublished dissertation, University of Copenhagen, 1999.

CEDAW, *Concluding observations: Morocco*, January 1997. http://sim.law.uu.nl/SIM/CaseLaw/uncom.nsf/0/fa67c6be5f2993aac125663c00343acb?OpenDocument

CERED [Centre d'Étude et de Recherches Démographiques], *Femme et condition féminine au Maroc, Direction de la Statistique*, Rabat, 1992.

Charrad, M., *States and women's rights: A comparison of Tunisia, Algeria and Morocco*, University of California Press, Berkeley, 1993.

Chatty, D. and Rabo, A. (eds), *Formal and informal women's groups in the Middle East*, Berg, New York, 1997.

Davis, S. S. and Youmouri, R., *Women and water management: A gender study.* Souss-Massa Integrated Water Management Project (WIWM), Development Alternatives, Inc , Agadir, 2002.

Davis, S. S., *Patience and power. Women's lives in a Moroccan village*, Schenkman, Cambridge MA, 1983.

De Haas, H., *Migration and development in southern Morocco. The disparate socio-economic impacts of out-migration on the Todgha Oasis Valley*, unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Radboud University Nijmegen, 2003.

EFA, *Education for All. Global monitoring report – 2006. Literacy for life*, December 2005. http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.phpURL_ID=43283andURL_DO=DO_TOPICandURL_SECTION=201.html

Elsaesser, C., Women in Morocco struggle to expand their rights. *Times Record*, January 2005.

Fernea, E. W., *A street in Marrakech*, Waverland Press, Prospect Heights, 1988.

Flynn, D., Curtin, M. and Martin, P., *Elaborating a gender strategy for USAID/Morocco*, WIDTech, Washington DC, 1999.

Galal, S., Women and development in the Maghreb countries. In Khoury, Nabil, and Moghadam, Valentine M., *Gender and development in the Arab world. Women's economic participation: patterns and politics* Zed Books, London, 1995, p. 49–70.

Hadraoui, T. and Monkachi, M., *Études féminines. Repertoire et bibliographie. Le Fennec, UNU/WIDER*, Casablanca, 1991.

Hessini, L., Wearing the veil in contemporary Morocco: Choice and identity. In Göcek, Fatma Müge, and Balaghi, Shiva (eds), *Reconstructing gender in the Middle East. Tradition, identity and power*, Columbia University Press, New York, 1995, p. 40–56.

Hoskyns, C. and Rai, S. M., Gendering international political economy. CSGR Working Paper 170/05, May 2005. www.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/csgr/research/workingpapers/2005

Howard-Merriam, K., Women's political participation in Morocco's development: How much and for whom?, *The Maghreb Review* 9 (1–2), 1984, p. 12–25.

Hulton, L. and Furlong, D., *Gender equality in education. A select annotated bibliography,* BRIDGE (development – gender), Brighton, 2001.

ILO, *Gender equality and decent work: Good practices at the workplace,* ILO, Bureau for Gender Equality, Geneva, 2004. www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/genderresources.details?p_lang=enandp_category=NEWandp_resource_id=398 or, more specifically, http://www.ilo.org/dyn/gender/docs/RES/398/F1448380228/Good%20practices%20at%20the%20workplace%20-%20text.pdf

Kapchan, D., *Gender on the market: Moroccan women and the revoicing of tradition.* University of Philadelphia Press, Philadelphia, 1996.

Karshenas, M. and Moghadam, V. M., Female labour force participation and economic adjustment in the MENA region, In Cinar, M. (ed.), *The economics of women and work in the Middle East and North Africa*, JAI Press, New York, 2001, p. 51–74.

Lavy, V. and Spratt, J., Patterns of incidence and change in Moroccan literacy. *Comparative Education Review* 41 (2), 1997, p. 120–141.

Leach, F., Gender implications of development agency policies on education and training. *International Journal of Educational Development* 20, 2000, p. 333–347.

Maher, V., Kin, clients and accomplices: Relationships among women in Morocco. In Barker, D. and Allen, S. (eds), *Sexual divisions and society: Process and change,* Tavistock, London, 1978, p. 52–75.

Maher, V., *Women and property in Morocco. Their changing relation to the process of social stratification in the Middle Atlas*, Cambridge University Press, New York, 1974.

Marphatia, A. and Afilal, R., *Gender and sustainable development. USAID Morocco,: Report of two gender training workshops,* WIDTech, Washington DC, 2002. http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting_programs/wid/pubs/morocco_0602.pdf

Mernissi, F., *Beyond the veil. Male–female dynamics in a modern Muslim society*, Wiley, London, 1975.

Mernissi, F., Le proletariat féminin au Maroc. *Annuaire de l'Afrique du Nord* 19, 1980, p. 345–356.

Mernissi, F.,. Women and the impact of capitalist development in Morocco (2 parts). *Feminist Issues* 2 (2), 1982, p. 69–104 and 3 (1), p. 61–112.

Mernissi, F. (ed.), *Femme et pouvoirs*. *Éditions Le Fennec*, Casablanca, 1990.

Messick, B., Subordinate discourse: Women, weaving and gender relations in North Africa. *American Ethnologist* 14 (2), 1987, p. 210–225.

Miller, C. and Razavi, S., *Gender mainstreaming: A Study of efforts by the UNDP, the World Bank and the ILO to institutionalize gender issues*, Occasional Paper 4, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) , Geneva, 1995.

Ministry of Family Affairs, Solidarity and Social Work, *Gender mainstreaming in policies and programs at the national level: Case study of Morocco*, United Nations (UN). Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (ESCWA), 2003. http://www.siyanda.org/search/summary.cfm?NN=1623andST=SSandKeywords=MoroccoandSubject=0anddonor=0andlangu=EandStartRow=1andRef=Adv

Ministry of Health, *Santé en chiffres, 2001*, Ministry of Health, Rabat, 2001.

Ministry of National Education, *Statistiques scolaires. Bilan de la rentrée scolaire 2001–2002,* Ministry of National Education, Rabat, 2002.

Mir-Hosseini, Z., *Marriage on trial: A study of Islamic family law*, I.B. Tauris, London, 1993.

Moghadam, V. M., A political economy of women's employment in the Arab region. In Khoury, N. and Moghadam, V.M. (eds), *Gender and national development*, Zed Books, London, 1995, p. 6–34.

Moghadam, V. M., *Women, work and economic reform in the Middle East and North Africa*, Lynne Rienner, Boulder, 1998.

Moghadam, V. M., *Women's livelihood and entitlements in the Middle East. What difference has the neoliberal policy turn made?* Draft report, UNRISD, Geneva, 2005.

Moulay R'chid, A., *La femme et la loi au Maroc*, Éditions Le Fennec Casablanca, 1991.

Morocco, National Report Beijing +10, Morocco, 2003. www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/Review/responses/MOROCCO-English.pdf

Naamane-Guessous, S., *Au-delà de toute pudeur*, Éditions EDDIF, Casablanca, 1992.

Rausch, M., *Bodies, boundaries and spirit possession. Moroccan women and the revision of tradition.* Transcript, Bielefeld, 2000.

Royaume du Maroc, Commission Spéciale Education–Formation, *Charte nationale de l'education et formation*, Rabat, 1999.

Royaume du Maroc, Secrétariat d'État Chargé de la Protection Sociale, de la Famille et de l'Enfance, *Femme Marocaine en chiffres, Ministère de la Santé*, Rabat, 1999.

Sadiqi, F., Aspects of Moroccan feminism. In Sadiqi, F., et al. (eds). *Feminist movements: Origins and orientations*, Publications de la Faculté des Lettres, Dahr El Mehraz, Fez, 2000, p. 195–214.

Salahdine, M., Les employées de maison à Fes, In Mernissi, F. (ed.), *Portraits de femme*, Éditions Le Fennec, Casablanca, 1988, p. 107–124.

Salih, R., Moroccan migrant women: Transnationalism, nation-states and gender, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 27 (4), 2001, p. 655–671.

Salinger, L., Aring, M., Belghazi, S. and Bouzri, N., *Morocco workforce development assessment*, Education Development Center, Newton, MA, 2003. http://www.gwit.us/Products/Morocco%20Workforce%20Development%20Assessment%20_revised%205-13_.pdf

SERI (ed.), *Educational research in the South: An initial review*, International Institute for Educational Planning, Paris, 1996.

Stimler, S., The state, reproduction, and mothering in Protectorate Morocco, Paper presented at MESA 2000, Orlando FL, 2000.

Thomas, C., Global governance, development and human security: The challenge of poverty and equality. Pluto, Chippenham/ Eastbourne, 2000.

UNDP, *Human Development Report. Governance and acceleration of human development*, Morocco, UNDP, 2003. http://hdr.undp.org/reports/detail_reports.cfm?view=625

United Nations, *Royaume du Maroc*, Bilan Commun de Pays, Rabat, 2001.

UN Statistics Division, *Statistics and indicators on women and men*, March 2005. http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/products/indwm/

UN Statistics Division, *Special Report of the world's women 2005: Progress in statistics. Focusing on sex-disaggregated statistics on population, births and deaths*, United Nations Statistics Division, Commission on the Status of Women, New York, March 2005. http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/products/indwm

USAID, *Gender assessment for USAID/Morocco*, May 2003. www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting_programs/wid/pubs/ga_morocco_fullreport.pdf also www.usaid.gov/ma/morocco_gender_assessment_report_061803.pdf

Wagner, D. A., *Literacy, culture, and development. Becoming literate in Morocco*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1993.

Wazir, R., Making a difference: NGO strategies revisited. In Wazir, Rekha (ed.), *The gender gap in basic education: NGOs as change agents,* Sage, New Delhi, 2000.

World Bank, *Education in the Middle East and North Africa: A strategy towards learning for development*, World Bank, Washington DC, 1999. http://www-wds.worldbank.org/servlet/WDS_IBank_Servlet?pcont=details andeid=000094946_01010905322286

World Bank, *Gender and development in the Middle East and North Africa. Women in the public sphere*, World Bank, Washington DC, 2004.

Other websites relevant to gender mainstreaming:

www.siyanda.org/search/qlinx-countryfocus.cfm?code=Morocco for access to key gender resources.

www.siyanda.org/exps/results.cfm?CouOfExp=Morocco to network with, or find, consultants in Morocco.

www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/cty_f_MAR.html ratings for Morocco on human and gender-related development.

www.undp.org/hdr2001/indicator/indic_155_1_1.html Gender-related Development Index.

www.pogar.org/countries/links.asp?cid=12 andthid=8 Web links on gender in Morocco.

www.worldbank.org/gender/opera/lolinks.htm#E Gender and Development site of World Bank.

TURKEY

Feride Acar

NATIONAL CONTEXT

Social and economic context and gender profile

- Turkey is eager to join the EU and is working on the acquis.
- There is a significant women's movement and women's organisations.
- Progress is being made in data collection.
- There is large overall inequality along urban–rural, east–west and class lines.
- The impact of the financial crisis in 2001 is still visible.

There is no uniformity across Turkish society with regard to gender equality and women's conditions. Striking contradictions and wide variations between lifestyles and interpersonal relationships can be observed among different groups. Among the educated, urban, professional sectors, women's status and their capacity to enjoy their rights would compare very favourably with those of their counterparts in any Western or industrial society. On the other hand, among the rural, little-educated populations of northern, eastern and south-eastern Turkey or among the recent rural migrants that populate much of Turkish cities, women's enjoyment of their human rights are severely curtailed.

Turkey recognised women's full citizenship rights as early as the 1920s and 30s, as part of the country's Westernisation effort under the leadership of M.K. Ataturk. In these reforms, well-entrenched religious norms and traditions of private life and personal status such as polygamy, unequal inheritance, marriage and divorce provisions based on the Islamic Sharia were formally abolished, making Turkey the only country with a Muslim population that has eliminated the Sharia from its legal system. Early state policy also supported and encouraged women's entry to education and to professional fields of all kinds.

As a consequence of these reforms, women in Turkey have been present in large numbers and proportions in prestigious professions such as law, medicine and academia (as well as the teaching profession in general) for many years. For almost four decades, 25% of lawyers, 30% of doctors, and 35% of academics have been women, and women have been functioning unchallenged in all spheres of life, ranging from the professions to commerce and the so-called unconventional areas of science, technology and engineering. In addition, critical areas of new development, such as the media sector (journalism), banking and finance, are heavily feminised today in both public and private sectors. The overall labour force participation rate of women is, however, very low (26%) in the country, and with continuing rural–urban migration the rate has been consistently falling for over four decades. The labour force participation rate of women is comparable to Western European figures only among university-educated women (68%).

While most laws in the Turkish Republic have reflected international standards of the period in which they were first promulgated, until recently there has been political reluctance to amend and/or update legislation in accordance with the pace of changing values and perceptions of gender equality in the Western world. In this context, Turkey's EU integration efforts have given new impetus to reform in this area and have helped to drag the gender equality agenda into the limelight once again. These efforts have helped accelerate the legal changes long demanded by a small but very vibrant and visible urban women's movement. Benefiting from the socio-political climate created by the country's EU integration efforts, the women's movement has been a particularly effective force in recent years in pushing for changes in the law and monitoring the contents of such changes in order to ensure compatibility with EU directives and universal (CEDAW-based) standards of women's human rights.

Turkish legislation and legal institutions have focused on 'recognising' rather than 'promoting' women's human rights. As a result, in many parts of the country to date, there have been wide discrepancies between women's equality with men in the eyes of the law and in everyday life. There is a clear need to put in place a 'comprehensive', 'systematic' and 'sustainable gender policy that emphasises the implementation of existing legislation as well as its improvement (CEDAW Committee, Concluding Comments on Turkey, January 2005).

High female illiteracy rates (25%), low educational achievement, a low urban female labour force participation rate (16%), a very low proportion of women representatives in national and local politics (4.6% and 1% respectively), and a prevalence of violence against women stand out as some of the main problem areas related to gender in contemporary Turkish society.

The prevalence of strong patriarchal structures and the persistence of gender-discriminatory cultural values, often in contradiction with the country's laws, are particularly relevant in the economically less developed regions and closed communities. The significant differences that exist between women's status, de jure and de facto, in different regions of the country and in rural and urban populations make the country almost a microcosm of the global realities affecting women.

Women's education has been a Janus-headed phenomenon in Turkey for a long time. On the one hand, owing to the cumulative effects of a strong political will and a supportive ideological climate, women's entry into all levels and types of education has been a consistent national priority since the establishment of the Turkish Republic in 1923. On the other hand, scarce economic resources together with a strong patriarchal culture reflected in gender-discriminatory traditions and practices – such as son preference, early marriage, gender-based seclusion and segregation reinforced by Islamic beliefs – have acted as barriers to women's education.

Factors such as persistent regional disparities in sociocultural and economic

conditions and very high rural–urban migration rates in the last four decades have further complicated the situation. Thus, despite significant improvements over time, gender equality in education has not been achieved and women continue to lag behind men by almost all indicators.

Also, the content and effectiveness of policies and measures concerning women's education have varied over time. Although much lip-service has been given to the 'principles of national education', differing priorities and/or commitments of successive governments to the goals of Westernisation and modernisation, as well as an overall lack of gender awareness and gender sensitivity on the part of policymakers, have contributed to inconsistencies in policies, slow implementation, and a general reluctance to recognise and prioritise 'special measures' to respond effectively to gendered needs in education.

With respect to women's employment, the picture is similarly complicated[18]. The estimated labour force participation rate for women in Turkey is 24.7%, according to the Household Labour Force Survey of October 2005 (http://www.die.gov.tr/ENGLISH/SONIST/ISGUCU/k_250106.xls). This rate is 19.8% for urban and 32.6% for rural areas. Not only are these obviously low rates by international standards, but studies also show that they are the result of a steady decline that has been going on for over fifty years.

Substantial changes in agriculture, resulting in rural–urban migration and the withdrawal of women from traditional agricultural activities in which they formerly engaged are generally seen as the forces behind this decline (Ecevit, 2003). A number of studies have pointed out this decline and the strikingly low rates of labour force participation and have analysed the consequences (World Bank, 1993; Özbay, 1991, 1994; Özar, 1994; Ecevit, 1998, 2000; Tansel, 2001). Such studies have shown that the transformation in the labour market resulted in different trends for women and men. While men were largely able to compensate for the fall in agricultural employment by taking up non-agricultural activities, 'women had to leave the market "voluntarily"' (Özar, 1994, p. 28) on account of their inability to switch their occupations from rural to urban ones (Özbay, 1994, p. 8). Many women became 'housewives' and even in cases where there was an increase in migrant women's labour force participation it was mostly in jobs in the informal sector (İlkkaracan, 1998; Ecevit et al., 1999).

Thus, the employment rates of women are also very low. These are 22% in total, 16.3% for urban areas and 31.1% for rural areas, according to the October 2005 figures of DPT (the State Planning Organisation) from the Household Labour Force Survey mentioned above. These figures indicate extremely low levels of women's engagement in economic activity and thus point clearly to a primary area where intervention is needed.

Analysts have also drawn attention to the fact that 'despite the slowing rate of migration and a female population that has lived in cities long enough to be integrated into the labour market, female labour force participation rates continue to decline', (Ecevit, 2003). In this context, it is claimed that the trend demands further analysis in order to see whether shifts in agriculture are the only factor.

Also, while most studies explain the decline in the female labour force participation in Turkey in terms of the sociodemographic characteristics of women's labour, including their opportunities for human capital acquisition, the gender division of labour and the relationship between women and their families and society at large (Kasnakoğlu and Dayıoğlu, 1996; Tunalı, 1997; Özar and Şenesen, 1998; İlkkaracan, 1998; Bulutay and Dumanlı, 2000; Dedeoğlu, 2000), there are those who focus on the changes in the economic structure and employment-generating capacities of various economic sectors to explain the phenomenon and point to

18 The analysis presented in this report on the labour force participation of women is largely based on Y. Ecevit, Women's labour and social security, a paper presented at a workshop of the World Bank and the Government of Turkey, entitled *Bridging the gender gap in Turkey: A milestone towards faster socioeconomic development*, Ankara, 30 September 2003.

relevant sites for intervention (Ecevit, 1995; Ansal, 1996; Ecevit, 1998; Demirel, 1999; Özar, 2000; Ecevit et al., 2000).

Gender equality issues

- There have been recent improvements in gender equality legislation (e.g. Civil Code, Penal Code), but their impact is still unclear.
- Women's issues are a priority in 2006 Country Programme.
- There is a strong 'Girls, let's go to school!!' campaign.

Policies promoting gender equality and women's empowerment

The bulk of efforts to promote gender equality and women's empowerment in Turkey in recent years pertains to amendments in the legal framework. These are outlined below. Additionally, the improvements in the education system, particularly with the increase of compulsory basic education to eight years and efforts by both the state and civil society to utilise this opportunity to enhance girls' school attendance, have been significant. The detailed analysis of the reform and efforts to support it are analysed further in the present report. There has also been a significant increase in Turkish society's awareness of manifestations of gender discrimination and the violation of women's human rights, such as violence against women, particularly domestic violence and honour crimes. This awareness has been supported by a noticeable increase in critical media attention to these phenomena, as exemplified by the recent campaign to end domestic violence co-sponsored by the country's largest daily newspaper, *Hürriyet*.

Changes in the legal framework

The reforms of the early Republican era eliminated segregation and differential treatment of women to a large extent from the legal framework, clearing the way for comprehensive changes in the position of women. The adoption of the Civil Code from Switzerland in 1926 constituted an important break with tradition and religious norms. This was a unique legal reform with tremendous implications for the social fabric and the life patterns of many Turkish women. However, in time that law also proved to be insufficient in the face of new standards and achievements in gender equality issues in the world. Thus, starting in the early 1980s, law commissions were formed to prepare proposals for amendments to the existing laws. The drafting and adoption of a new Civil Code became a *cause célèbre* for the women's movement in Turkey throughout the ensuing years; and a high level of civil society activism, sustained over a long period, finally resulted in a new Turkish Civil Code in December 2001. The new Civil Code is a ground-breaking piece of legislation that is expected to have a significant impact on the achievement of gender equality in Turkey in the long term.

Conceptually, the new law has taken two critical steps towards gender equality. First, it directly addresses discrimination based on marital or family status and shifts from the idea of 'protection' that characterised the previous legislation. In accordance with international instruments, the new code takes 'equality between the spouses' as its foundation. Second, the Civil Code has opened the way to recognising women's unpaid labour in the family as having an economic value that should attract some material reward, at least in the case of divorce.

The Civil Code abolished the 'head of the family' concept, equalised the status of husband and wife, abolished all the provisions (such as those relating to family residence, the right to have the last word in children-related decisions, etc.) emanating from the 'head of the family' notion, abolished the 'limited legal capacity' of married women, and brought into force a new matrimonial property regime whereby property acquired during marriage is equally divided between spouses upon divorce. It also raised the minimum age of marriage to 17 and equalised it for women and men – a very important step in Turkey, where early marriage continues to be a problem.

Similarly, the Penal Code which came into force in June 2005 has benefited from

highly effective pressure-group activism on the part of women's NGOs and, despite a few remaining inadequacies, is generally well supported by the women's movement.

The Penal Code also constitutes a paradigm shift in Turkish legislation with regard to gender equality and women's human rights in line with contemporary international standards. The Code recognises a woman's right to be the sole controller of her body. It classifies sexual crimes as being against the individual and not against 'public morality' or 'community order'. It also contains provisions that improve the protection of women's human rights, including in the family. In this regard, the Code recognises marital rape and domestic violence as crimes and aims to protect women's bodily integrity fully. In it 'custom killings' (the law still does not use the term 'honour killings') are considered aggravated murders and are to be heavily punished, with no reduction of sentence allowed for such crimes. The Code criminalises genital examination (i.e. virginity control) carried out without the public prosecutor's consent and as part of an investigation. However, it is also true that several provisions of the Penal Code, despite bringing clear improvement to the former situation, still fall short of the demands of the women's movement as well as the standards of international conventions.

Education and training

- Gender inequality in education is high, with paradoxical exceptions (academia).
- Strong gender stereotyping persists in school curricula, especially in religious schools.
- Illiteracy is still a problem, including in cities.
- Some gender mainstreaming occurs in Conditional Cash Transfer.
- Vocational training linked to employment opportunities is lacking.

The education system

Formal education in Turkey comprises preschool, primary, secondary and higher education institutions. Informal education covers all education and training activities outside of formal education. Education at all levels is provided free of charge in state schools and universities. In addition, private schools at all levels and universities, which are opened by individuals and private foundations with the approval of the Ministry of National Education (MoNE) or the Higher Education Council respectively, operate in the country.

Preschool education is aimed at children under the mandatory school entry age (6 years old) and includes independent kindergartens, nursery schools and preparatory classes for basic education.

Primary education (grades 1–8), which is free and compulsory, is geared towards the development of basic skills and prepares children for secondary education according to their capabilities. Primary education is mandatory for children aged 6–14 and is coeducational (http://www.meb.gov.tr/Stats/ist2001/Bolum1s1.htm).

Secondary education, on the other hand, lasts for three years, covers general as well as vocational and technical education institutions, and is coeducational in public schools. Schools at this level are called lycées. Secondary schools that provide enhanced religious training in addition to regular academic curricula (called Imam-Hatip Lycées) are categorised as vocational technical schools.

Higher education comprises post-secondary education and is provided through two- or four-year courses in institutions called 'higher schools' and 'universities' respectively.

Literacy

Although there has been a significant increase in both overall literacy and women's literacy over the years in Turkey, illiteracy, particularly in the adult population, has not all together disappeared from the list of concerns. Currently, the rate of adult literacy is 85.5% and that of young people (aged 15–24) is 96.6%.

Adult literacy levels are different for women and men: 77.2% of women and 93.7% of men are literate, indicating to a considerable rate of female adult illiteracy. While illiterate women are mostly in the upper age bands, there is still a difference in the literacy rates between sexes among young people too. Among 15–24 year-olds, where literacy had reached 96.6% by 2003, the literacy rate is 98.4% for males and 94.8% for females (MDGR, 2005)[19]. Past experience also shows that the decline in adult women's illiteracy rates is not fast.

Illiteracy increases systematically for both sexes as one moves from younger to older age groups, from urban to rural population, and from the western to eastern regions of Turkey. National data also show that age, rural or urban residence and geographical location variables all impact upon women's literacy more than on that of men: older age, rural residence or an eastern location account for more female illiteracy than male. Consequently, older, rural women in the eastern and south-eastern regions of the country are most likely to be illiterate.

Primary education

Schooling ratios by level of education, according to 2003 data (MDGR, 2005), are 91.95% for primary education (93.57% for males and 90.21% for females), 46.47% for secondary education (50.24% for males and 42.41% for females), and 13.09% for higher education (14.18% for males and 11.95% for females). These figures indicate that full schooling has yet to be achieved for either sex. The figures also show that girls' enrolment is lower than that of boys at all levels of education. Although the girls' access to primary education improved much faster than that of boys throughout the 1990s, leading to the achievement of near-universal enrolment rates for both sexes at this level, gender-based disparity remained in access to primary education. Studies have shown that gender, age, parents' education, household income and geographical location were the determinants of educational attainment at primary and secondary levels in Turkey (Tansel, 1997).

In fact, in the 1990s, the ratios of boys and girls of the appropriate age category who were actually enrolled in primary education declined for both sexes (Acar, 2003). However, boys' schooling ratios still remained higher than girls'.

In 1997, compulsory primary education was extended from five to eight years in duration and classified as Compulsory Basic Education. This was a long-awaited major reform of the education system in Turkey, and it was also expected to have a significant impact in gender terms. It was expected that the average duration of education would increase among women and that adolescent girls would be kept in the education system longer, thereby preventing their early marriage and pregnancy and offering them greater opportunities and freedom to make life choices of their own. Indeed, a significant increase in the enrolment rates of both boys and girls at the higher levels of basic education (6th, 7th and 8th grades) was observed between 1997 and 2001, compared to the 1990–96 period. The net enrolment ratio increased by 11% for girls, 6% for boys, and 9% in total following the reform. The inclusion in Compulsory Basic Education of what had been lower secondary school (grades 6–8) also helped narrow the gap between enrolment rates of the sexes (MDGR, 2005).

Similarly to the pattern observed in literacy, women's access to primary education in Turkey also reflects differences with respect to rural–urban location and geographical region. It increases as one goes from the rural to the urban areas and from the east and south-east to the western regions. Furthermore, in the more economically deprived and less developed settings (i.e. rural areas, eastern and south-eastern regions), girls' school enrolment and women's education levels are the lowest; for instance, girls' primary school enrolment rates are 78.7% as opposed to 92.4% of boys at the same level in the eastern and south-eastern regions. The general enrolment rate for these regions is 85.6% (http://www.gap.gov.tr/English/egitim.html).

19 Statistics for 2003 are provisional.

While the above facts have generally justified the special focus of education projects for women on the eastern, south-eastern, and rural areas of the country, recent studies have also indicated that non-enrolment of girls in the low-income residential districts of the metropolitan centres in Turkey is also a significant problem. This situation has generally been attributed to the high rates of migration and population displacement, and in the 1990s to the closing of many primary schools in the eastern and south-eastern regions for security reasons as a consequence of terrorist insurgence and armed conflict. Nonetheless, it means that significant numbers of urban women as well as disproportionate numbers of women in the east and south-east have been left out of the education system (Acar, 2003).

While economic and sociocultural factors play a greater role in female non-enrolment in Turkey in general, 'cost of schooling' appears to be the main factor in female non-enrolment in urban areas, and 'family obligations' and 'family values' come to the forefront in rural settings (http://www.turkishembassy.com/II/TurkeyDevGoals2005/goal2.html). As a part of the national development perspective, closing the gap between the eastern and western regions as well as between men and women has long been a priority of the Turkish state. As a result, the most disadvantaged group, women in the east, was targeted by many state and civil society projects.

Data provided by the Directorate on the Status of Women (KSGM)[20] (KSGM, 2002, p. 26) indicated that while 76.5% of girl children from households of the lowest socioeconomic status attended school, the corresponding rate for boys from such households was 85.6%. In the highest socio-economic status category, 96.4% of both sexes were found to be attending school. It is clear that as one goes down the socio-economic ladder, women's chances of having access to education and staying in school decline. It is important in this context that assistance policies and measures implemented to support and encourage education (such as providing books and school supplies to students) should not only be increased in kind but should also have a gender perspective. This is particularly relevant for monetary and other support that can be provided to families to promote school enrolment and reduce drop-out. Close monitoring of the basic education system, to assess how such supports (as cash handouts or free books and stationery) are distributed on a gender basis, is necessary as a first step.

Another study (Tunalı, 1996) investigated the relationship between schooling and child labour in Turkey with a view to determining the rural–urban, regional and gender-based variations in this relationship. Evidence from this research points shows that 'working' children are unlikely to continue their education and often drop out of school. It was found that work at earlier ages (sometimes as early as 6 years old) in rural areas interferes with children's access to education, and girls are clearly disadvantaged in this respect as well. While the gender-based division of labour leads to boys being directed more to market work and girls to housework, both types of work function as prompters of school dropout.

The parents' educational level, particularly that of the mother, emerges as another critical variable in determining the children's chances of access to education. Children's likelihood of staying in school increases with the educational attainment of both parents, particularly beyond primary and middle school (Tunalı, 1996).

Other research has also indicated that training programmes for mothers, conducted as part of an early enrichment project aiming to enhance the ability of children from low-income, low-education family backgrounds to benefit from schooling, produced positive results for the development of the child's capabilities. They also empowered women in family and community contexts, thus having long-term

20 Previously Directorate General on the Status and Problems of Women (DGSPW) (Kadının Sorunları ve Statüsü Genel Müdürlüğü). The name of the Directorate General was changed to 'Directorate General on the Status of Women' with the very belated enactment, on 6 November 2004, of the law on the organisation and responsibilities of the Directorate.

implications for socio-economic development through the enhancement of gender equality (Kağıtçıbaşı et al., 2001).

Secondary education

The two main strands of secondary education are 'general–academic' and 'vocational–technical' education. Since the 1997/98 school year secondary education has begun at 9th grade and is carried out in three-year lycées. Education is not compulsory at this level and, like primary education, it can be carried out in public or private schools. Secondary education in 'general' lycées constitutes the backbone of academic training leading to university entrance, and has the largest contingent of students enrolled.

The gender distribution of students in secondary education exhibits noticeable differences on the basis of the type of education. While female students' enrolment rate in secondary education has been increasing over time, noticeable differences continue to exist between the general–academic and the vocational–technical strands. In 1999/2000, the shares of female enrolment were 45.2% in general–academic lycées and 37.5% in technical–vocational lycées.

To put it differently, while a gender balance has not been achieved in either type of secondary education, female enrolment fares better in general lycées than elsewhere. This fact has positive implications for girl students' potential to pursue higher education and, in fact, partly explains the relatively high percentages of women among university students in Turkey. Yet it also points to one of the prominent bottlenecks in female secondary education. The lower participation of girls in vocational–technical education can be expected to have a negative impact on the wage-earning capacities of women, since studies indicate that vocational high-school education yields higher wages as compared to general high-school education when neither is followed by higher education. Similarly, unemployment rates among vocational high-school graduates are lower than those of academic high-school graduates (Tansel and Güngör, 2000).

It is also significant that within the 'general–academic' vein of secondary education, the enrolment of female students is highest in fine arts lycées (70.7%) and lowest in science lycées (30.6%) (Tan, 2000, p. 46).

'Technical–vocational' education also reflects gender-based differentiation owing largely to the structure of this type of education in Turkey. The very names of these schools ('Boys' Technical Education' and 'Girls' Technical Education') continue to denote clearly gender-specific specialisms based on stereotypes and cultural biases. It has been possible since 1975 to admit students of the opposite sex to what are still called girls' and/or boys' vocational lycées, but this measure has had a minimal impact on breaking down gender barriers in occupation. While some observers have interpreted this as an indication of the change in society's perception of the gender-defined nature of occupations regardless of the strong signal sent by the continuing gender-based structure of the technical and vocational education system (Tan, 2000, p. 47), in 2003 – more than 25 years after the policy of admitting students of the other sex into these schools has been in operation – 87.3% of students in girls' technical education lycées and only 10.3% of those in boys' technical education lycées were found to be female (Acar, 2003). The need to move away from gender-typing of occupations and particularly to disassociate female vocational education from training to become a 'homemaker' is urgent.

Gender-based differentiation in technical–vocational education is also observable in schools classified under this umbrella which do not have sex-specified names. Among these, 'vocational lycées for health occupations' (nursing, paramedical occupation, etc.) are overwhelmingly female-dominated (86.9%), and the percentage of girl students in 'special education lycées' is the lowest (28.4%). It is noticeable that in vocational lycées that train for occupations in the commerce and tourism sectors girl students constitute nearly half (48.5%) of all those enrolled (Tan, 2000, p. 47).

During much of the 1990s women's participation in technical–vocational education in Turkey appeared to have increased at a rate far surpassing their increase in general lycées. From 1993/94 to 1996/97, these rates of increase were 4.0% for general lycées and 29.9% for technical–vocational education. Much of this increase however, was owing to the girl students' rapidly increasing rates in religious education.

Religious education, which is classified under technical–vocational education in Turkey, had, over the years, come to show an unusual concentration of girls, with female students in Imam-Hatip Lycées constituting 50.3% of all students (Acar, 2003). This percentage was found to be very significant because religious secondary education thus appeared as the only level and type of education in Turkey where female participation rates have surpassed that of males. In fact, some studies found that in the years preceding the Eight-Year Compulsory Basic Education reform, informal negative 'quotas' for girls were being implemented in religious schools in order to ensure that these schools remain as two-sex institutions (Acar and Ayata, 2002, p. 94). It is also documented that while the proportion of religious education in vocational–technical education had increased over the period preceding the reform, the proportion of boys in vocational–technical education going into religious schools had dropped, resulting in higher proportions of girls in this type of education (Tan, 2000, p. 98).

In this context it is also interesting that, after the implementation of the Eight-Year Compulsory Education reform, while overall enrolment in the Imam Hatip Lycées recorded a 30% decline and male students' enrolments fell by 41.1%, girls' enrolment declined only by 14.2% (Tan, 2000, p. 49), indicating to a continuing gender-based preference for religious education. In view of the fact that religious secondary education in reality offers no real income-generating possibilities for women, girl students' preference for, or channelling into, such 'vocational' schools remains a concern for female education in Turkey.

Higher education

Admission to higher education in Turkey is on the basis of a nationally competitive examination in which women applicants' success rate has in the recent years equalled and even surpassed that of men. Available data show that while the percentage of women who were successful in the entrance exam has been rising over time, the number of women admitted to higher education has not caught up with that of men. In terms of enrolment in higher education, currently 41.8% of students in higher education are female. Enrolment data reflect a consistent increase in women's share over the recent years, except in 2000/01, when the university entrance examination's structure was changed.

Gender inequality in terms of enrolment in higher education institutions is more pronounced in the provincial universities, where the share of female students (37.7%) compares unfavourably with that in universities in the major metropolitan areas (42.4%) (Tan, 2000, p. 63). National education statistics also indicate that the presence of female students in two-year higher education institutions (39.2%) is less than their presence in four-year institutions (42.4%) (MoNE, 2000, p. 211; MoNE, 2002, p. 244).

In terms of gender inequality, all these figures may be read as suggesting that women's participation in higher education in Turkey is less problematic than in other levels of education. On the other side of the coin, however, statistics also show that the enrolment ratio of women in higher education is only 15.2%, whereas this ratio is 26.5% for men. These figures show not only that higher education is a rare commodity in Turkey but also that access to such education by women is very unequal. Very few people have higher education, and two out of three of those who do are men.

However, the data given above also show that for women who can get through the obstacle-ridden course of basic and secondary education, access to higher education is comparatively less

problematic. In fact, it testifies to the presence of social, structural and institutional mechanisms that function to keep girls out of the education system, discriminate seriously against females in lower and medium levels of education, yet offer a remarkably 'equal' medium of existence to those who have successfully surmounted the earlier hurdles. This situation is reflected in the fact that since the establishment of the Republic, women's presence in higher education has increased at a rate 2.5 times higher than that of their presence in elementary education (Tan, 2000, p. 50).

Higher education for women is also very positively related to female labour force participation in the Turkish context. The labour force participation rate of women with higher education has been found to be 69.2% (KSGM, 2001, p. 79), while the corresponding rates are 39.4% for technical–vocational lycée graduates and 30.8% for general lycée graduates.

With respect to women's participation in different disciplines in higher education, data since the early years of the Republic have shown that women students are present in all disciplines, including those that are conventionally perceived as 'masculine', such as 'technical sciences'. However, women have been more strongly represented in conventionally 'feminine' disciplines all along (Acar, 1994, p. 162–163). Technical sciences (engineering) and agriculture have the lowest participation rates of women. Over the years, the percentages of women students have increased or stayed stable in all areas except technical sciences (engineering), agriculture and forestry. Currently, women's presence is highest in languages and literature, arts, and health disciplines (including nursing), and they have almost caught up with men in mathematics and basic sciences, applied social sciences (including teacher training/education) and social sciences (DGSPW, 2001, p. 60).

These facts also indicate that while women may constitute impressive percentages, bordering on parity, of the students in some unconventional disciplines, sex-stereotyping in fields and professions as well as women's greater association with the 'low pay / low prestige' fields remain realities of higher education in Turkey.

Women's employment

- There is a dual labour market: formal and informal.
- The Turkish paradox is one of continuing urbanisation together with decline in women's participation in labour market.
- Structural policies have a strong impact on women's employment.
- Social partners are active in data collection.
- The main issue taken up is entrepreneurship.
- Projects are scattered.

As only a quarter of women in Turkey participate in the labour market, their massive withdrawal from economic life has been evaluated as 'an alarming indication' of a condition that has far-reaching negative implications not only for women's empowerment and gender equality but also for the economy and society in general (Ecevit, 2003). Integrating a gender perspective into the design and implementation of all macroeconomic and social policies is imperative in order to reverse this current trend.

Despite the overall reduction in the rural labour force in Turkey, 50% of women workers (compared to 28% of men) are still working in agriculture; 14.8% and 35.1% of women workers are employed in industry and the services sector, respectively (compared to 19.8% in industry and 46.6% in services for men). The persistence of such a high share of agriculture in female employment, despite a large movement of rural populations to the cities, has been explained by the fact that most urban women are housewives, whereas nearly all rural women also work outside the home in agriculture. However, most women workers in the agricultural sector (74%) are 'unpaid family workers' (DPT, 2006).

Some studies in the late 1990s indicated that the rate of the decline in women's

labour force participation had slowed down and an upturn could be expected with high economic growth, increased levels of education and the likely impact of declining fertility rates among urban women (Tansel, 2001; Tunalı, 1997); but this has not happened.

Although agriculture continues to be the largest sector in terms of employment in general and especially for women, its predominance has declined significantly in the last four decades. Employment in the services sector has grown rather rapidly. Since 2000, services became the largest sector employing men and the second largest employing women in Turkey. Today, the highest percentage share of women's labour force distribution in the cities belongs to the services sector (63%); it is followed by industry (24.7%) and agriculture (11.5%). Although the distribution of the urban male labour force in cities is similar for the services sector (59.7%), its ratio increases to 27.9% for industry and remains only 3.9% for agricultural tasks (DPT, 2006).

In the last ten years, the share of women working in the urban services sector has risen consistently. However, compared to many developing countries, in Turkey the increase in women's employment in the manufacturing sector (which employs only 13.51% of working women) has been small (DIE, 2004b).

The low level of urban women's participation in industry relative to services is seen as a result of high demand for women's labour in the latter sector. Analysts also think it points to a similar potential for the future that is in line with the situation in many countries (Ecevit, 2003). In the services sector, particularly with respect to jobs that are considered 'suitable for women', urban women have had a steadily increasing presence over the years and were reported as constituting 34% of employees in finance, insurance, real estate and business services and 31% of those in community, social and personal services in 2000 (Ecevit, 2003). However, more recent data indicate a noticeable drop in these figures, with women currently comprising 24.5% of employees in the former and 26.5% of those in the latter sub-sectors of services, calculated from the data given by DIE (2004b). Taking into account the impact of the 2001 financial crisis in Turkey, particularly on heavily feminised sectors such as banking, where in the preceding years women had come to constitute almost 40% of the employees, this drop needs to be analysed from a gender perspective.

With regard to women's occupational status, once again rural and urban settings differ significantly. The drop in the share of 'unpaid family workers' is especially noticeable in this context, since 78.3% of women in the urban labour force are employed as regular and casual employees, 11.4% are self-employed or employers, and only 10.3% of women are 'unpaid family workers' (DPT, 2006).

Informal employment has been growing in Turkey for the last two decades and is particularly relevant to urban women's participation in the labour force. In addition to the structural features and institutional deficiencies of the economy which have led employers to resort to cheap labour in a competitive market, the prevailing high unemployment rates and increasing demand for jobs from lower-income families and groups in the cities have meant that many people sought and found employment in the informal sector, where lack of social security benefits and lower wages are the rule. Studies reveal that many women have been taking part in the informal economy, not only as domestic workers and baby-sitters but also by doing home-based work such as piece-work knitting and sewing, and as unregistered workers in various sectors such as clothing, textiles, packaging and food production (see, inter alia, White, 1996; Ecevit et al., 1999; Kalaycıoğlu and Rittersberger-Tilic, 2001). While men's informal employment in Turkey is known to constitute a high proportion of all male employment in the country, women's informal employment has been increasing over the years and needs to be addressed in order not to aggravate existing occupational segregation.

Labour law

Turkey, as a country eager to join the European Union, is engaging in adopting the Community *acquis*. Gender equality as promoted by the Community has therefore been at the forefront of the process of law-making, particularly in the employment area, and a new Labour Act was adopted on 22 May 2003. Below is a synoptic review of this piece of current legislation as it pertains to women and gender equality[21].

Equal treatment for men and women

Article 5 of the Labour Act explicitly states that no discrimination may be made on the basis of sex in work relations, in either the public or the private sector. While this provision constitutes a critical improvement over the old legislation in terms of equal treatment for men and women, experts are of the opinion that this provision still needs further amendment in order to be fully in compliance with Directive 2002/73/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Council Directive 76/207/EEC. It is argued that access to all types and levels of 'vocational guidance, vocational training, advanced vocational training and retraining, including practical work experience' have to be added to the article.

Also, according to Article 5 of the Labour Act, the principle of equal treatment means that there shall be no discrimination whatsoever on grounds of sex, either directly or indirectly by reference to sex or pregnancy, in the conclusion, content, implementation and termination of labour contracts. The article does not however, define direct or indirect discrimination. Although the existing equal treatment principle may be interpreted liberally to cover all forms of gender-based discrimination, including indirect discrimination, and to allow for 'temporary special measures' in favour of the underrepresented sex, it is clear that a provision stating this explicitly would be more effective.

Other shortcomings of Article 5, when viewed under Art. 141 TEC and Directives 2002/73/EC and 2000/78/EC, have been designated as follows:

- failure to specify prohibition of discrimination on the basis of age, disability and sexual orientation;
- failure to provide a more effective level of protection, associations, organisations, and other legal entities should also be empowered to engage in proceedings;
- failure to specify that an employee defending or giving evidence on behalf of a person suffering discrimination should be entitled to the same protection;
- failure to promote dialogue between social partners to address different forms of discrimination based on sex in the workplace and to combat them;
- failure to establish a body or bodies for the promotion, analysis, monitoring or support of equal treatment. Human rights bodies at district and township levels in Turkey or the Directorate General of Women's Status may be charged with such competences.

As regards the burden of proof in cases of discrimination based on sex, Article 5 of the Labour Act draws on Community Directive 97/80/EC. As a general rule, it is incumbent on the worker to prove that there has been a breach of the principle of equal treatment. But, when there is a prima facie case of discrimination, i.e., where evidence of apparent discrimination has been produced by the worker, it shall be for the respondent to prove that there has been no breach of the principle of equal treatment.

Pregnancy

The Labour Act envisages a maternity leave period of 16 weeks (Art. 74). The eight-week antenatal rest period may be reduced to three weeks at the request of the woman worker and with the approval of the doctor. In such a case, the remaining

21 This section of the report is largely based on a comparative analysis by N. Süral of the Turkish Labour Act *vis-a-vis* EU Directives. The author is grateful to Professor Süral for her permission to reflect her work liberally in this report. A comprehensive version of Süral's analyisis can be found in Süral, N., Legal framework for gender equality at work, paper presented at Women's Employment Summit, İstanbul, 10–11 Februray 2006.

period is to be added to the eight-week postnatal rest period. These antenatal and postnatal rest periods may be increased on presentation of a medical report on the basis of the woman worker's health conditions and the specificities of the work to be performed. If there is a multiple pregnancy, two more weeks are to be added to the antenatal leave. The labour contract is suspended during maternity leave. The worker, if she so requests, is eligible for an unpaid leave of six months following the postnatal period. ILO Convention no. 183, the Revised Social Charter of the Council of Europe, and Council Directive 92/85/EEC have all extended the maternity leave to 14 weeks. Under Article 8/2 of the Council Directive, the maternity leave must include compulsory maternity leave of at least two weeks allocated before and/or after confinement in accordance with national legislation and/or practice. In Turkey, the total duration of maternity leave is both longer than these requirements and compulsory.

Whether the length of maternity leave and the legal obligation of the employer to grant a six-month unpaid leave are 'protective' is an issue that needs to be further evaluated in the Turkish context in view of the literature on 'protective measures' that make female labour more costly for the employers, thus augmenting preferences for male labour.

A further issue that has caused concern is that the Labour Act provides for no leave in case of adopting a child.

Pregnant workers are entitled to time off without loss of pay in order to attend antenatal examinations. If it is deemed necessary by a medical report, the pregnant worker concerned will be moved to a lighter job without reduction in pay. Women workers will be allowed 1.5 hours a day to breastfeed their children below one year of age. It will be for the woman worker to decide about the time and divisibility of this nursing period, which will constitute part of her hours of work.

Maternity insurance provides a payment to women workers for the whole duration of maternity leave. This amounts to the two-thirds of the worker's daily remuneration (Social Insurance Act, Art. 49).

Childcare

Workplaces employing between 100 and 150 women workers are to establish nursing rooms, while those employing more than 150 women workers have to establish day nurseries consisting of a nursing room and a crèche.

The fact that not the total number of workers but the number of women workers in the workplace is considered points to the social norm that dictates that women are held mainly responsible for childcare. This provision has been severely criticised by the women's movement, therefore, not only as inadequate with respect to the response it provides to the existing needs of working women but also as contributing to the perpetuation of patriarchal, gender-discriminatory social norms.

As a general rule, the children of working women shall benefit from nursing rooms and day nurseries without any fee or deduction from their mothers' wages. The children of working men benefit if the mother has died or if parental authority has been given to the father by a court decision. It is also demanded that those employers under the legal obligation of establishing day nurseries shall also establish preschool classes that comply with the programmes of the Ministry of Education. The establishment and functioning of such facilities are entirely at the expense of the employers.

Parental leave

Council Directive 96/34/EC as amended and extended by Council Directive 97/75/EC grants men and women workers an individual right to parental leave on the grounds of the birth or adoption of a child to enable them to take care of that child, for at least three months, until a given age up to eight years, to be defined by the Member States and/or management and labour. In Turkey, a paid parental leave scheme does not exist at present.

The Resolution of the European Council and Ministers for Employment and Social Policy of 29 June 2000 on the balanced participation of women and men in family and working life leaves it to the member states to decide whether or not to grant paternity leave. While paternity leave does not exist in Turkey, the social partners may agree upon a paternity leave and/or parental leave through collective labour agreements.

Dismissal

The Labour Act restricts the right of an employer to dismiss a pregnant female worker employed under a labour contract of fixed or indefinite duration. Under this Act, sex, marital status, family responsibilities, absence from work during maternity leave, pregnancy and confinement shall not constitute valid reasons for the termination of employment. A fixed-term contract cannot be terminated before the expiry of the specified period without a justified ground clearly indicated in the Labour Act. Dismissal on the basis of pregnancy does not constitute a justified ground. If a woman worker employed under an indefinite contract is dismissed owing to her pregnancy, such a dismissal will be considered to be abusive and the employer will be required to pay special compensation (the so-called bad-faith compensation) amounting to three months' gross pay. The women worker will also be entitled to severance compensation if she has completed at least one year of employment at the workplace concerned. The worker, however, remains free to terminate the contract and give notice. The employer is entitled to terminate the labour contract, be it fixed or indefinite period, in the case a woman worker who fails to report to work for reasons of health for more than six weeks beyond the prescribed notice periods varying from two to eight weeks following her confinement leave of sixteen weeks. In such a case termination is deemed to depend on a justified ground; however, the woman worker will be entitled to severance pay if she has completed at least one year of employment at the workplace concerned.

Workers who consider themselves wronged by the employer's failure to apply to them the principle of equal treatment guaranteed under Article 5 of the Labour Act may pursue their claims and demand compensation amounting to four months' basic wages apart from the other rights and claims provided by the law.

Equal pay

In Turkey, effect was given to the equal pay principle in legislation by the application of Article 26 of the previous Labour Act. Article 5 of the new Labour Act lays down the principle of 'equal pay for equal work or work of equal value'. There are no exclusions from the equal pay principle based, for example, on the size of a company, reasons linked to the health and safety of workers, national security, religion, or benefits under statutory social security schemes.

Prohibited work

While the previous Labour Act prohibited the employment of females, irrespective of their age, in industrial work during the night (with the exception of work the nature of which required the employment of women), the new Labour Act lifted this prohibition (Art. 73). However, there are still provisions prohibiting women's access to certain jobs (coal mines, underground quarries, embanking, digging and excavation of soil) and dangerous work (Labour Act, Art. 72).

Since, in general, 'protective' provisions designed to ensure that women are not exposed to hazardous physical or moral conditions in the workplace have the unintended effect of restricting women's job opportunities, repeal of such provisions (with the exception of maternity protection) often plays a significant role in changing attitudes towards 'suitable women's work'. A periodic review of protective legislation is also required by Article 11/3 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). A special commission to carry out such a periodic review has not been formed so far in Turkey.

Sexual harassment in the workplace

Sexual harassment constitutes discrimination on the grounds of sex when unwanted conduct takes place with the purpose or effect of violating the dignity of a person and creating an intimidating, hostile, degrading, humiliating and offensive environment. This definition is given by Council Directive 2000/78/EC and Directive 2002/73/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council.

The expression 'sexual harassment' was not used in the previous Labour Act; such conduct was interpreted within the context of 'immoral behaviour or misconduct'. The present Labour Act refers to sexual harassment as a basis for justified contract termination and compensation entitlements. Sexual harassment constitutes a valid reason to terminate the labour contract. A worker who has been sexually harassed by an employer, a fellow worker or anyone else in the workplace may instantly terminate his/her labour contract (Art. 24/II/b, d). Similarly, an employer may instantly lay off a worker who has sexually harassed him/her, any member of his/her family or a fellow worker (Art. 25/II/b–c). Harassment also needs to be regulated in Turkish law in the context of access to employment and vocational training, as stated in the Directive 2002/73/EC.

Social security legislation

As a general rule, the principle of equal treatment exists in the field of state and occupational social security systems. Contributions to and entitlements from social security schemes are the same for men and women and gender-neutral terminology is used. Medical care, sickness benefit, maternity benefit, invalidity benefit, old-age benefit, survivors' benefit, employment injury benefit and unemployment benefit are the branches of social security provided for by the legislation.

The ages for retirement for women and men workers are 58 and 60 respectively. The determination of pension ages is exempted from the relevant Community directives and left to the discretion of national governments. However, the equalisation of pension ages is provided for by Council Directive 86/378/EEC.

In the case of survivors' benefits, the social security legislation replaced widow's pensions with a pension for the surviving spouse in March 1985. However, preferential treatment still exists with regard to an orphans' insurance scheme with the idea of protecting the female children. A male child who has not reached the prescribed age (18, for a secondary education student 20, for a university student 25) is entitled to a pension in case of the death of either parent. There is no such prescribed age for the female child and she will receive survivors' benefits as long as she does not get married or take employment. This contradicts Council Directive 79/7/EEC.

Labour market flexibility and atypical work

New provisions on flexibility and atypical modes of employment largely draw on Council Directive 93/104/EC as amended by Directive 2000/34/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directive 97/81/EC as amended by Council Directive 98/23/EC, and Council Directive 99/70/EC.

In Turkey, the development of atypical modes of work can be expected to facilitate women's entry into the workforce. Many women are unable to conform to the traditional model of full-time employment, and contractual segregation occurs in which men are more likely to have permanent full-time contracts and women to have part-time or temporary contracts. Legal provisions to prevent indirect discrimination against women (when the category of part-timers is exclusively or predominantly composed of women) as a result of less favourable treatment of part-timers is critical for ensuring women's equality with men in employment. Therefore, discrimination against part-timers, earlier prevented only by the decisions of the Court of Appeals, is now prohibited explicitly by the Labour Act (Art. 5. 13). This is considered a progressive, if not entirely satisfactory, step.

DONOR INTERVENTIONS AND EXAMPLES OF BEST PRACTICE

National and international donors

The main donors to projects supporting women's education in Turkey have been the World Bank and the European Union. In general, the European Union's actions have been more gender-sensitive, while the World Bank's emphasis has been on an overall structural improvement of the education system and has tended to be directed towards basic education as a whole.

Whereas projects, programmes and campaigns supported by UNICEF, UNDP, and UNFPA at the later stage have given priority to women in education and vocational training. In general, donors have targeted the eastern and the south-eastern regions most, as these areas and women there had priority for development purposes. National donor presence has significantly increased in the sphere of education, on the other hand, in the aftermath of the Eight-Year Compulsory Basic Education reform. Donations to improve the infrastructure of schools, dormitories, etc., in general, as well as to facilitate female school attendance specifically, reached unprecedented levels in many ways. A review of the most substantial of such projects, campaigns and initiatives is provided in the following section.

Donors' involvement in education

To support the Eight-Year Compulsory Basic Education reform further, the Turkish government requested large-scale support from the World Bank in November 1997. The Bank's Board approved the first of two Adaptable Program Loans (APLs) of US$300 million each, on 25 June, 1998, to support the implementation of the Basic Education Program (project ID P009089). After four years of implementation of the first APL, in July 2002 the Bank's Board approved a second APL of US$300 million to continue to support the Basic Education Program. This second phase of the programme is referred to as the Second Basic Education Project (project ID P059872) (APL #2). The project targets regions and groups with the lowest school attendance and educational performance in basic education – in particular, girls in eastern and south-eastern Anatolia, and children from poor slum (*gecekondu*) households in the cities. Provincial education administrations also benefit from support to strengthen the capacity to diagnose, implement and manage programmes to meet their needs.

The **Basic Education Programme** of the World Bank and the Turkish government aims to reach 100% enrolment. The policies to achieve this goal include efforts to increase the number of school buildings, expanding the bussing system, increasing the boarding capacities in basic education boarding schools, supplying educational necessities to poor students, and providing equipment and materials for schools. During the first phase of this project (1998–2002), approximately 1,650 schools in rural areas were repaired and the capacity of some of them was increased. Computers were purchased for nearly 26,000 schools in rural areas, computer classes were established in 2,800 schools, educational materials were distributed and in service training was provided to teachers (MDGR, 2005).

The second phase of the project (2002–06) also focused on improving the infrastructure of schools in rural and slum areas, establishing information and communication technologies (ICT), and providing materials for special needs education and in-service training for teachers. While the World Bank projects were in principle designed with concern for gender equality as an underlying objective, they incorporated no priority for women and no positive discrimination or affirmative action measures. In this sense, it can be said that although these projects are carried out without bias to either sex, clearly their gender mainstreaming dimension is not sufficient.

Among other projects implemented by the Ministry of National Education is the **Support to Basic Education Programme** (publication reference: EuropeAid/ 121189/C/S/TR), implemented with the help of the European Union. With a budget

of €100 million, the Ministry's basic education strategy is to improve access to and retention in education of school-age children while improving the quality of education. The programme also provides direct support to a number of provinces and urban areas to empower those directly responsible for the delivery of basic and nonformal education with the aim of making quantifiable improvements in the teaching and learning processes (http://www.deltur.cec.eu.int/english/e-mali-bilateral-1.html). This programme's contract was signed in 2000 and implementation began in 2002. It is a five-year project and its target is to improve the participation of particularly girls and women in both formal and non-formal education.

Bussing is a subject of the Eight-Year Compulsory Basic Education reform. It was initiated prior to this reform in order to provide access to better-quality education and to ensure equal opportunity for students who had been attending multigrade schools and those living in small settlements and sparsely populated areas or areas where there are no schools. In this system, students are transported daily by bus to the nearest central schools. With the extension of compulsory education, bussing also became a necessity for students in grades 6–8, especially in rural settlements. Of the 654,000 students (6.3% of all students) who benefited from this transportation system during the 2002/03 academic year, 307,000 were girls (MDGR, 2005). These students are entitled to free bussing, free lunch, free textbooks, and free uniforms. Despite the absence of a specific gender priority in the project, it has been functioning clearly as a promoter of formal education.

Boarding schools were also opened in sparsely populated areas to provide primary education services to the school-age children from villages and small rural settlements where there are no schools, as well as students from poor families. Currently, 279,800 students attend 538 boarding schools, marking an increase of 3.5 times over the figures fir 1997 (78,000 students in 153 schools) (MDGR, 2005). In 2002, 139,639 students were in boarding schools, of whom 28.3% were girls (http://www.meb.gov.tr/Stats/Apk2002/501.htm).

Alongside education in schools, non-formal education opportunities for adults have also been related to the Eight Year Compulsory Basic Education reform. In particular, the **open primary school** (MDGR 2005) has been introduced concurrently with the reform, to provide educational opportunities on a distance learning basis to citizens who were unable to attend primary school or to go on to lower secondary school for various reasons. The distance learning system enables all persons who wish to continue their education to complete eight years of primary school. UNICEF Turkey, together with the ILO, UNDP and UNFPA, initiated a project in five provinces – Erzurum, Van (Muradiye), Yozgat, Ankara and Bolu (Düzce) – setting up eight Open Primary Learning Centres for Girls and ten support units in primary schools for girls attending open primary education. The centres were equipped with computers, overhead projectors, video players and television sets for the girls to enhance their learning. So far more than 1,000 girls have been enrolled (Otaran et al., 2003).

As mentioned before, economic factors are the main reasons for the non-enrolment of both boys and girls. A programme called **Conditional Cash Transfer** was implemented in 2004, to support the families of poor students attending primary and secondary schools on a monthly basis. The number of families benefiting from this aid system had reached nearly 934,000 by March 2005 (MDGR, 2005). The beneficiary families must meet certain conditions, such as having regular health examinations and vaccinations performed for their children and sending school-age children to school regularly. These conditions are specified as a result of the studies carried out by the implementing social assistance institution in cooperation with the state institutions assigned to provide education and health services. The cash transfer, on specified conditions, is allocated to the mothers. The most important idea behind this programme is to strengthen the status of women in both the

family and society and improve their self-confidence. The idea is that mothers will provide their children with all their needs if they feel socially valued (http://www.sydtf.gov.tr/ENGLISH/snt.html#tr).

In recent years public campaigns to support education by both the state and civil society organisations have sprung up at an unprecedented rate in the country. Following up to the Eight Year Compulsory Basic Education reform, several of these have become familiar concepts and have drawn tremendous public support. Bearing slogans such as *'Girls, let's go to school!!', 'Modern Turkey's modern girls', 'I have a daughter in Anatolia, she will study and be a teacher', 'Daddy, send me to school', 'Child-friendly schools'* and *'100% support to education'*, these campaigns contain a strong gender element.

The most widespread of these is the **Girls, let's go to school!!** campaign**.** Led by the MoNE and UNICEF, this massive intersectoral campaign mobilised organisations, agencies and individuals in a drive to increase enrolment rates for girls and achieve gender parity in primary education in Turkey. In order to achieve this target, **Girls, let's go to school!!** focuses on the 53 provinces with the lowest enrolment rates for girls. During its first year, the campaign focused on the 10 south-eastern provinces with the lowest enrolment rates for girls. The campaign was then enlarged to 33 provinces in 2004 and to 53 in 2005. In the 2003/04 education year, the increase in the number of girl students was 1% for other provinces but 5.8% in the 10 provinces in which the campaign was conducted (http://www.unicef.org/turkey/pr/ge6.html).

With the cooperation of UNICEF and the MoNE, the **Child-Friendly Schools** campaign began targeting the primary education age group in 10 provinces in 2003. This programme aimed to improve the quality of education and increase the learning achievements of students in pilot schools, to ensure greater participation of students and parents in decisions affecting the management of schools, to render schools more attractive for children and their parents, and to reduce the dropout rate by the end of 2005. The **100% Support to Education** campaign is another government-sponsored activity launched to attract additional resources to education. Under the campaign, all donations and investments made in the field of education are fully tax-deductible. These campaigns also have a gender focus. Their goals are to eliminate the enrolment gap between boys and girls, and to ensure gender equality in primary school enrolment, through the provision of quality basic education.

In addition these four campaigns were carried out by the well-known civil society organisation, the Association for the Protection of Contemporary Life in Turkey. A gender focus is central to all these campaigns.

Alongside these projects, both the private and public sectors provide vocational training programmes aimed at increasing school enrolments, decreasing dropout rates and reducing the gender gap in education. The **Multi-purpose Community Centers** (ÇATOMs) have functioned as significant pioneers in training oriented towards education and employment for eastern and south-eastern women; they were established in the context of the **South-eastern Anatolia Project** (GAP). Also, informal education and vocational trainings were carried out in the context of the **Baku–Tbilisi–Ceyhan Pipeline Community Investment Programme** led by British Petroleum (BP), which targets women and girls as well as school-age and pre-school children, unemployed people and uneducated people.

Donor involvement in employment

The main donors in the field of women's employment in Turkey in recent years have been the World Bank**,** the European Union and the UNDP. Whereas their early assistance was concentrated on the projects related with the establishment of national data collection and storage, information production systems and research, recently their contribution in development projects and efforts which may be taken as active labour market policies have become more significant.

Also, particularly in the regions where unemployment and poverty pose a grave problem and patriarchal culture is more repressive to women, development projects and programmes have begun increasingly to include a gender component. In other parts of the country, donor interventions tend to support vocational training, business management training, and intensified job seeking and counselling services in line with an active labour market policies strategy.

In this context the policy recommendations of the Directorate General on the Status of Women (KSGM) regarding issues concerning the employment and education of women, formulated in 1999, set five targets:

1. Take precautions and adopt measures to ensure gender equality throughout planned policies, with the aim of encouraging women's employment and improving workplace conditions, structures governing promotion in the workplace, and the enjoyment of social and economic rights in general.
2. Actively promote women's participation in business life.
3. Increase, diversify, and localise the institutions providing service to women.
4. Ensure that job security and social security is provided to women working in agriculture and their contribution is recognised in the gross national product.
5. Set up labour organisations for all working women, and reorganise the existing organisations and unions so that they act more effectively and women are better represented in them[22].

Underneath each target KSGM identified the relevant actions and the institutions to take responsibility in the coordination and implementation processes. Although this document did not produce the intended effect in Turkey's resultant Eighth Five-Year Development Plan (2001–05), the recommendations were reflected in the subsequent 2006 Country Programme prepared by the state planning organisation DPT.

In the 2006 Country Programme (DPT 2005), the establishment of an effective labour market and labour analysis system is targeted. As a corollary, designing a more effective vocational training system is identified as a policy priority. Women are counted among the primary target groups whose needs are to be prioritised. Entrepreneurship training is emphasised, again with women among the target groups of such training. In line with the decision to give a more central place to active labour market policies, women are taken as a priority group that should acquire job experience through employment. In connection with the anticipated measures to prevent social exclusion and to alleviate severe poverty stemming from unemployment as a result of structural change in agriculture, the need to support income-generating activities among the poor is emphasised. KSGM is named as the coordinating institution in the 2006 Country Programme, reflecting the importance attributed to the inclusion of women in these policies.

Most importantly, the 2006 Country Programme defined women's issues as a priority. The priority was defined somewhat broadly, reflecting the need to consider women's issues in an integrated manner. The programme stated that 'women's effective participation in economic life will be ensured and the measures to eradicate their disadvantaged position especially in education will be taken. Especially the efforts aiming to prevent violence against women will be increased.' To that end, it is recommended that flexible types of work be designed and the mechanisms enabling women to engage in such work be developed. In order to alleviate women's domestic burden, the programme designates the need to increase the number of care centres for the elderly as well as daycare centres and crèches for children.

The following part of this report contains a review of policies and projects directed at both the conventional and active labour markets in Turkey in the last five years.

22 Translated from unpublished policy recommendations of KSGM, 1999.

Gender policies and projects: Conventional labour markets

National data collection and sex-disaggregated employment statistics

In the first part of the 1990s, the lack of sex-disaggregated data on labour market activity, the paucity of systematic research in the area, and the absence of a central institution to create policies on women's employment characterised the Turkish context. In response, establishing a collection system for sex-disaggregated data at national and local levels was defined as an initial priority. KSGM was mandated with the responsibility to coordinate the national data collection efforts as well with the production and publishing of reports/researches on the topic. In addition to the State Institute of Statistics (DIE), state organisations working in the employment sphere such as KOSGEB (Small and Medium Industry Development Administration) and İŞKUR (Turkish Employment Agency), together with trade unions and chambers of commerce and industry, were involved in these data collection efforts.

The first comprehensive project undertaken by the KSGM towards the enhancement of gender equality was the **Women's Employment Promotion Project (1994–2000)**. The project was a subcomponent of the **Employment and Education Project** funded jointly by the World Bank and the Turkish government, and had a budget consisting of a World Bank credit of US$983,000 and a Turkish government contribution of US$461,000. The primary aim of the project was to collect data and enhance knowledge production in order to provide women with better job opportunities in all sectors and occupations, including those in which male labour traditionally predominated. Within the scope of the project, many research studies were commissioned and carried out by independent academics and/or various government agencies. A complete list of these studies is provided at the end of this chapter. A documentation and information centre was opened in the Directorate General, and gender training material was created for the use of government agencies throughout the country (Atauz et al., 1999). A more recent study by Filiz Kardam and Gülay Toksöz provides a comparison between findings of research conducted under this World Bank Project and women's labour market condition in 2005 and identifies a trend for deterioration in many indicators (Kardam and Toksöz, 2004).

Expansion of the data and analytical base to grassroots organisations

A second major project carried out by the national directorate for women's affairs (KSGM) was the **Integration in Development Project** of the **National Programme for the Empowerment of Women**. This project was carried out in collaboration with UNDP during the period 1993–2003, with a total budget of US$1.4 million.

While one of the primary objectives of this project was to enhance the institutional capacity of the Directorate General, it also contained a civil society support element directed towards capacity building of women's NGOs. The setting up of a gender-disaggregated database in collaboration with the DIE was supported by funding from this UNDP project, too. To complement the data and provide analysis on various gender issues, 16 specific research projects were carried out. A complete list of these is provided at the end of this chapter. Civil servants and institutions working on women's issues were targeted in gender training seminars. Small-scale projects that aimed to enhance women's access to income-generating activities in rural areas were also supported. Training designed to guide women on how to use their rights and to improve legal literacy was organised along with seminars specifically addressing problems women face in employment and in trade unions. A very important component of this UNDP project directed funds to the creation of academic gender and women's studies programmes and research centres in universities. Two of the major academic centres in the country, the Middle East Technical University Gender and Women's Studies Graduate Programme and the Ankara University

Research Center on Women's Problems were direct outputs of this project.

UNDP provided funds for an extension of the **Integration in Development Project** in 2005. A budget of US$30,000 was allocated to activities to follow up consideration of Turkey's CEDAW report in January 2005.

In 1999, the Confederation of Turkish Employers' Unions (TİSK), in collaboration with the Ministry of Labour and Social Security, embarked on a project entitled **Socioeconomic Analysis of Turkish Women's Labour**. In the context of this project TİSK collected data on the female labour force in Turkey, drawing upon the figures derived from research done on big affiliate workplaces in which collective bargaining terms were applied. The results were disseminated through a nationwide series of seminars on the women's labour force in Turkey. The organisation has conducted many field studies on women's employment issues, some of them in collaboration with universities (http://projeler.tisk.org.tr/kip.asp). The project has produced two main outputs as the publications of two national panels[23].

In 2005, the Confederation of Turkish Labour Unions (Türk-Iş), one of the major labour union confederations in Turkey, also took steps to organise women's bureaux in its member organisations and convened a **Women's Labour Platform** in association with the ILO and UNPFA. This platform brought together representatives from state institutions, chambers of commerce and industry, and other labour-related organisations and academics. It called for the creation of basic mechanisms to enable the implementation of laws and regulations in order effectively to remove the problems women face in their working lives (http://www.turkis.org.tr/bolum.php?kat=121). Soon after its establishment the Platform conducted a series of workshops to summarise issues and policy recommendations for women's work in Turkey. The final reports of these workshops on women workers' problems and demands regarding education, health, working conditions and union activity were published as *Women's Labour Platform Commission Reports*[24] by Türk-Iş.

Gender projects: Active labour markets

In line with the European Employment Strategy (http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/employment_strategy/index_en.htm), Turkey has accelerated its efforts to provide more space for active labour market policies, as has been declared in the 2006 Country Programme. Since women are regarded as important among the long-term unemployed they are beginning to be increasingly included in the target groups of these policies.

EU programmes

The European Union negotiation process has been an important driving force for gender equality reforms in Turkey. The impact of some Community programmes on women's employment is particularly relevant.

The European Union's Community Programme on **Equal Opportunities for Men and Women** (http://europa.eu.int/scadplus/leg/en/s02310.htm) aims to ensure adoption of the Community strategy for gender equality and supports activities contributing to this objective in the fields of economic life, equal participation and representation, social rights, civil life, gender roles and stereotypes. Projects that would develop the regulative, institutional and procedural harmony of the EU and Turkish gender policies are accepted and funded by the programme which is coordinated nationally by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security. Though the original deadline for funding through this project had expired at the end of 2005 for Turkey, it has recently been extended to 31 December 2006. Some other labour market programmes of the EU also contain a gender dimension in their objectives and/or definition of their

23 Panels on Women's Labour in Developing Industrial Centres I–II, Ankara: 25 October 2000, TİSK Publication No. 205; Symposium on Employment, Women's Labour and New Labour Law, Muğla: 5 December 2005, TİSK Publication No. 242.

24 Kadın Emeği Platformu Komisyon Raporları, Türk-İş, Ankara, 2005.

eligibility criteria. Among these is the **Active Labour Market Programmes** project (http://www.iskurabprojesi.org/lang/eng/indexeng_1.aspx), under which the Ministry of Labour and Social Security and İŞKUR are implementing separate projects.

The **South-eastern Anatolia Project** (GAP), which was initiated in the 1970s to administer major irrigation and infrastructure restructuring in the region and turned into an integrated regional development programme in the 1980s, also concentrated on ways of developing women's participation in economic life in this region (http://www.gap.gov.tr/gap_eng.php?sayfa=English/Ggbilgi/gnedir.html). Because of its development agency role in the region, the GAP administration acts as an executive authority in the local and regional projects. Thus, besides collecting data, developing analysis and exploring strategies and policies to increase women's employment, the GAP administration has set up and operated **Multi-purpose Community Centers** (ÇATOMs), which are organised by and for local women themselves. Their aim is to develop the means and organisation to increase women's literacy and income-generating activities. In line with their mission of integrating women into development, ÇATOMs try to introduce women to market activities through vocational training, business development training, support and consultancy services. Their activities in the realm of women's employment are reported regularly.

The EC Delegation in Turkey, in collaboration with the UNDP, has also initiated the **South-eastern Anatolia Entrepreneurship Support Centers** (GIDEMs). These centres provide support for those wanting to start businesses and as well as providing help to existing entrepreneurs in the region. Women entrepreneurs form one of their priority target groups in the project. See (http://www.gidem.org/_Gidem/website/gozlem.aspx?sayfaNo=117) in Turkish.

In addition, there are numerous NGO projects throughout Turkey, funded by EU and other sources, that provide support to women entrepreneurs through local micro-level funding and/or capacity building as well as vocational training to women for income-generating skills.

Development projects

Regional development programmes targeting south-eastern and eastern Anatolia – where unemployment rates are higher and economic growth rate consistently lags behind the national economic development rate – have generally included a component for the development of women's employment or income-generating activities. The UNDP-led **LEAP** project (Linking Eastern Anatolia to Progress) is a recent example (http://www.undp.org.tr/LEAP.asp). It includes the development of women's employment among its targets. This project was designed in the context of the poverty reduction strategy of UNDP with a budget of US$ 2.96 million for the period January 2001 – May 2006. As a part of this project, the **Baku–Tbilisi–Ceyhan Pipeline Project** consortium, led by British Petroleum, has been implementing a social investment project with a strong gender dimension, including support to women's entrepreneurship and vocational training projects (http://www.btcinvestment.com/ciphome.asp?LANG=1).

Entrepreneurship support projects

Entrepreneurship is the category of economic activity in the context of which women's employment issues have been taken up most frequently in Turkey in the last two decades. In the face of continued efforts to increase women's waged employment – without much visible success – entrepreneurship is the alternative most often adduced as a solution to achieving women's inclusion in the labour market. Increasing civil society-based initiatives for gender equality in development have also been influential in projects promoting women's participation in the labour force through entrepreneurship. The increasing inclusion of civil society in women-focused development and employment projects has shifted the direction of employment policies towards entrepreneurship rather than

waged employment. This shift was also necessitated because the promotion of entrepreneurship was considered a viable solution for the bottleneck in women's employment in the conditions of high unemployment in the country.

KSGM's **Small Entrepreneurship Project** was funded by the Japanese Grant Fund and implemented in the period 1995–96 as a first women's entrepreneurship project. It provided a picture of the existing supply–demand structure and the legal, institutional and practical barriers and mechanisms prevailing in women's entrepreneurship, and identified policies to be pursued. The project reviewed bank credit schemes, demand- and supply-side factors operating in women's business development processes, and the capacity of civil society organisations and their future roles as mediators in financial and consultancy service provision to women entrepreneurs.

KOSGEB (Small and Medium Industry Development Administration), although an organisation that restricts its activities to the manufacturing sector and existing enterprises, thereby leaving women's enterprises largely out of its jurisdiction, has also recently approved plans to use its 'business incubator' projects to support women's microenterprises. The organisation is expected to enlarge its area of concern to include service enterprises and establish a women's entrepreneurship bureau soon.

KAGIDER (Association of Woman Entrepreneurs) is the biggest national businesswomen's organisation. It has taken part in many projects that aim to provide support to women entrepreneurship. Details of these are given in its website, http://www.kagider.org/tr. Some of these projects are:

- *Women Entrepreneurs' Business Development Centre (KAGIMER) Incubators Project:* Using the EU Active Labour Market Programme, KAGIDER opened a women's business development centre with the support of İŞKUR. The goal of the centre is to serve as an incubator to consolidate the technical, technological and business bases of small and microenterprises. The centre has provided entrepreneurship training to 60 women out of 1,400 applicants, and selected five business projects out of 32 for women entrepreneurs to open their businesses in the KAGIMER office.
- *Bridging Women to Women Project:* The objective of is the project is described by *KAGIDER* as building productive, cooperative ties between the Yeditepe University Fashion Design Department students, KAGIDER members, and women in the south-eastern province of Mardin, in order to enhance women's employment and entrepreneurship there. In the project, Yeditepe University students create original and marketable product designs using traditional handicraft patterns and models of Mardin, compile all these designs in a catalogue and publish it for the use of small women producers. Another module of the project envisages providing local women with design and training support to help them acquire the necessary skills to create authentic models specific to the area.
- *Water Drop Project:* The Water Drop project is funded by the European Union and sponsored by several public and private sector domestic organisations.[25] It aims to train and support women's entrepreneurship in human resources consultancy and personal training. KAGIDER has announced that 50 women candidates will be selected to establish their own companies and will be encouraged to give consultancy and training services in seven provinces.
- *The Project for the Encouragement of Girl Students towards Entrepreneurship in South-east Anatolia:* KAGIDER has implemented a project in cooperation with the GAP Business Development Centers and the UNDP, based on providing 18 girl students with apprenticeship opportunities in

25 For the list of organisations, see: http://www.kagider.org/tr_/content.asp?CID={BA7024E3-7DE0-40DC-A729-58C73F7C3011}andpCID=andCCID={BA7024E3-7DE0-40DC-A729-58C73F7C3011}

KAGIDER enterprises. The project started in 2004 and was completed in the summer of 2005.

The Turkish Confederation of Tradesmen and Artisans (TESK) has also implemented a women's entrepreneurship project with the help of European Commission funding. The project, entitled **Supporting Women Entrepreneurs**, was carried out between 2002 and 2004 and was completed in June 2004. As of that date, 1,630 women had been given business start-up training, and 359 of them had become self-employed. Five Training and Consultancy Centers were established after the completion of the project in five different provinces – Ankara, Bursa, Denizli, Mersin and Çorum – to provide services to women entrepreneurs (WES, 2004, p. 29).

Some concluding observations

The most important point to note about the active labour market policy projects applied in Turkey is their scattered character. Because there is not a comprehensive labour market information system or labour analysis drawing upon such an information system, the efforts to boost women's employment through vocational training and microenterprise development that characterise so many projects do not constitute a programmatic and coordinated strategy. A considerable lack of expertise and frequent duplications have become noticeable, especially when local, small-scale business development efforts which have often resulted in non-sustainable, short-lived women's cooperatives and others are considered. Thus, experts have indicated a need for the establishment of a centre which would access the data of the national labour market information system and try to match market demand with the female labour supply through coordination and assistance. The diversified efforts of various agents in the field (women's NGOs, international agencies, state institutions, etc.) would benefit from such a development in terms of increased efficiency and effectiveness. This kind of an institutionalisation would allow more effective use of resource flows directed towards supporting women's employment, as well as enabling long-term planning and a programmatic approach to the issue. Moreover, monitoring and evaluation of the projects and identification of 'best practices' and tools may be possible in such an institutional structure (http://www.turkis.org.tr/icerik/avparkadin.doc).

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In recent years, Turkey's negotiations towards EU membership, and to some extent other efforts by Turkey to take part in international regimes by meeting policy targets set out in international conventions such as CEDAW and ILO conventions, have led to systematic review and revision of existing laws and their implementation. This awareness has also helped create a climate for public debate on gender equality issues.

A national women's movement, which has gained significant expertise during the last twenty years, has been able to utilise this conjunctural social and political interest in gender issues as an effective tool for successfully pursuing legal and policy reforms aimed at gender equality. This is best reflected in the impact this movement has had on the amendment of the Civil and Penal Codes in 2001 and 2004 respectively and the Labour Act in 2003.

It is, nonetheless, too early to say anything definitive about the implementation or the impact of most of these legal reforms. Unless policies and specific measures that ensure enjoyment of the rights guaranteed in the laws are put in place and implemented effectively, particularly in priority areas such as education and labour force participation, one cannot expect de facto change to be timely and satisfactory.

The following are recommendations for specific policies and measures in the areas of education and employment, based on the analyses presented in this report.

Recommendations: Gender mainstreaming in education

With respect to **gender mainstreaming in education**, a comprehensive analysis of the national education system from a gender perspective is a basic prerequisite. Policies and specific measures based on such analysis need to be designed and implemented for all levels of education.

Enrolment and dropout in basic education

Schooling of all school-age girls needs to be ensured through special measures that promote their enrolment and discourage their dropping out. Parents and families, particularly in rural areas, in the east and south-east and in urban migrant communities, need to be targeted for such measures. In this context, the design and implementation of culture-modifying policies directed towards securing families' cooperation in sending girl children to school should be prioritised. Specific incentives to secure such cooperation need to be creatively designed with the needs and preferences of different groups and communities in mind. The continuation and strengthening of polices that prioritise girls in low socioeconomic groups is strongly recommended.

Ongoing monetary and other school aid programmes to families should be closely monitored to see how support is distributed with regard to gender equity. Further new measures specifically targeting families with school-age daughters need to be implemented. In addition to gender-prioritised financial support to poor families with school-age daughters, public campaigns and media appeals to alter parents' traditional attitudes and encourage them to send girls to school need to be stepped up, with a specific focus on rural areas and the eastern and south-eastern regions. In the last few years, publicising the success stories and role models that have emerged from local communities, in order to reward individuals and provide realistic and 'close to home' examples to others, has constituted a best practice example, as did the mass media campaigns and the much-increased NGO advocacy and private sector support for the universal enrolment of girls in primary education. This civil society momentum should be sustained and fully tapped.

Comprehensive research is in order to assess the full gender-differentiated impact of eight-year compulsory basic education on school enrolment and dropout rates at all levels of primary education, in order to identify bottlenecks and develop specific measures to ensure girls' universal completion of basic education throughout the country.

Efforts to encourage girls' enrolment at regional boarding schools in the east and south-east should be stepped up. Meeting this objective hinges on active cooperation between ministries, local authorities, NGOs, and community leaders.

Adult female literacy

Specific, targeted policies and measures to eradicate illiteracy among the adult female population are needed. Younger and middle-aged illiterate women, illiterate women in urban migrant communities, and illiterate rural women in the south-east and east need to be prioritised by the state with needs-based, specific policies designed and implemented for each group. Local community support for adult female literacy needs to be mobilised in all cases by securing the cooperation of local authorities and community leaders. The experience of NGO projects incorporating literacy and rights training into courses and programmes for income-generating activities should be carefully evaluated.

Vocational–technical education

The content of programmes offered in vocational–technical education should be altered so as to stop providing blatantly gender-stereotyped education for girls and boys. In this context, the sex-defined names of schools should be changed. Measures and policies are needed to accelerate curriculum change in girls' vocational–technical schools from subjects reinforcing the 'homemaker' role to those providing marketable skills. The incorporation of new technologies into the curricula of girls' vocational–technical

education should be prioritised in order to address the gender disparity in access to nontraditional fields that offer better occupational possibilities.

Alternatives to religious education, which reinforces stereotypical gender roles and offers very little in terms of income-generating skills to women, need to be developed in order to increase girls' choices and life chances.

Teachers

The recruitment of women teachers particularly in the eastern, south-eastern and Black Sea regions is important, both as a means to providing role models for girls and for creating school environments that are more compatible with the demands of traditionally-minded parents. Increasing the number of female teachers in rural and less developed areas can also be a factor contributing to women-friendly schools in which parent–school relationships would be conducted more through mothers. Gender-based quotas and other temporary special measures such as numerical targets, timeframes and incentive schemes should be developed and utilised to ensure more female teachers in these areas.

Training modules and programmes in gender sensitivity and women's human rights should be developed and incorporated into the in-service training of all teaching professionals. Appropriate material should be incorporated into the curricula of courses and programmes of education faculties.

Educational materials

The Ministry of National Education should, as a matter of urgency, have qualified gender studies experts undertake a comprehensive review of all educational material, from a gender perspective, using the guidelines of the BPfA, in order to cleanse textbooks and educational material of gender-discriminatory references, gender-biased messages (verbal or pictorial) and approaches that make women invisible.

Higher education

Measures and incentives to increase the proportion of women students in higher education, particularly in technical sciences and other disciplines where they are underrepresented, should be put in place to combat the existing gender imbalance. Measures such as quotas in favour of the underrepresented sex in admissions to university programmes; scholarship and stipend schemes; dormitory and other accommodation schemes exclusively for women; and special schemes to ensure women students' higher rates of entry into provincial universities should be considered.

Employment and promotion criteria for academic personnel in the universities should be reviewed from a gender perspective with a view to ensuring women's proportional representation in all fields and ranks of academia. To this end, programmes and measures to promote the presence of female academic staff in technical disciplines and administrative positions need to be put in effect, particularly in provincial universities.

Non-formal education

Non-formal education needs to be integrated better with formal education so as to enable women who have not completed formal education to use nonformal education services to make up missing credits and deficiencies. Creative solutions that combine work with education to increase the enrolment of girls in formal education, particularly in poor urban areas should be developed. Until universal enrolment in compulsory education is achieved, an education policy compatible with the reality of child labour (at home and at the market) in poor areas should make use of the potential of non-formal education.

Public non-formal education should be restructured to equip women with marketable skills as well as personal capabilities to improve their quality of life. Literacy training should be incorporated into such courses rather than standing alone.

Recommendations: Gender mainstreaming in employment

With respect to **gender mainstreaming in employment**, the following are some policy suggestions and recommendations for further action.

Macro-level policies

Observers of Turkey have consistently pointed to the very low and steadily declining overall labour force participation rates of women as a very salient and persistent problem. While they have also indicated that this decline can partly be explained by demographics (i.e. high proportion of young females in the population), social change (i.e. rural–urban migration), and cultural factors (i.e. the high premium placed on women's caring responsibilities), economic reasons keeping women's labour force participation rate low, particularly in urban settings, are also obvious (Ecevit, 2003). If this situation is to be remedied, a gender-aware and gender-sensitive outlook in necessary in the design and implementation of macro-level policies such as poverty reduction, disinflation, fiscal sustainability, labour adjustment and other policies entailed in the undergoing structural reforms in Turkey. Integration of the gender dimension in the design and implementation of these macroeconomic policies should be the starting point for any serious and credible efforts towards a gender mainstreaming policy in education and employment in Turkey. As such policies and reforms are influenced – and indeed at times required – by international and regional bodies such as the World Bank, the IMF, and the EU, insistence on the integration of women into the workforce should be a routine objective of international standards guiding macroeconomic policies, in the same way as this objective is incorporated into the international political and human rights standards that guide national laws and measure their implementation.

In the case of Turkey, the radical transformation of political and legal standards in the effort to integrate the country into the EU makes this a particularly opportune moment for intervention. Such reform needs to be complemented with a women-friendly and gender-sensitive outlook in macroeconomic issues such as trade policy, taxation reform, and – most saliently – restructuring the country's social security system in order to address the low and declining rate of female participation in the economy effectively.

Employment opportunities

Better understanding of the causes limiting the demand for women's labour as well as factors that prevent women from gaining employment is needed. Research efforts should focus on the changes in economic policies and mechanisms that inhibit women's participation in the labour market, with a view to eliminating them by specific measures and policies. In this context, the increasing informalisation of a great many activities and increasing marginalisation of the working population need to be studied from a gender perspective in order to develop sector-specific strategies and policies.

Segregated labour markets

There is also need for further research into the gender segregation of the labour market, as reflected by the current pattern of women's participation mainly in labour-intensive manufacturing industries and in lower-skilled and unskilled jobs in services. This will help to identify specific sectors and occupations where gender segregation leads to indirect discrimination against women in terms of (inter alia) wages, working conditions and social security benefits.

While the strong overall link between educational attainment and employment of women calls for measures to increase women's education with an emphasis on industrial training, technical and business training, and entrepreneurial skills, the specific relationships between different types of education and vocational training and women's employability in different sectors, occupations and levels need to be studied in depth. Increased education and training for women in non-traditional areas is also needed.

Legislation and enforcement

While experts agree that, despite a few remaining discriminatory provisions, the legal framework in Turkey (including the Labour Code) has been sufficiently revised and reformed to be compatible with international standards, additional legislation to enforce international conventions (e.g. CEDAW and relevant ILO Conventions) should be adopted. In this context, the enactment of specific legislation (in the form of a Gender Equality Act) providing for affirmative action and equal opportunity policies, with accompanying mechanisms such as an ombud's office with powers to settle disputes, is needed.

In general, poor enforcement and implementation of existing laws, including those that regulate the labour market, is the main bottleneck in Turkey. This applies particularly to the elimination of gender-based discrimination, since recognition of such discrimination is itself problematic.

There is also a need to review and re-evaluate the existing protective legislation with a view to ensuring that it does not function to limit women's employment opportunities and/or their access to nontraditional jobs. In this context, it is important to assess and evaluate the impact on the employment opportunities of women, particularly in the private sector, of the new labour law provision increasing the duration of paid maternity leave to 16 weeks.

Turkish society's overall conception of 'maternity as a social function' – i.e. as the joint responsibility of both parents and of society – needs to be enhanced. Measures such as parental leave should be introduced and implemented to that end.

Since social security coverage is particularly low among women, owing to their disproportionately high representation among 'unpaid family workers' and in the informal sector, there is a clear need to address this issue as a case of indirect discrimination against women and respond accordingly through targeted policies and measures. Social insurance policies that extend coverage to part-time and informal economy workers and homeworkers should be enacted.

Childcare support

Comprehensive policies regarding childcare are also needed so as to facilitate the reconciliation of family and work responsibilities for both women and men. It is recommended that the establishment of public, affordable childcare services by both national and local governments should be stepped up to encourage women to seek employment outside the home.

As almost all the relevant studies indicate, 'having primary responsibility for domestic chores and the care of children reduces women's ability to participate fully in the labour market', it is recommended that 'policies should encourage employers to help workers to meet their family obligations, among others, through the provision of workplace crèches and sponsored daycare programs' (Ecevit, 2003). It is specifically recommended that existing regulations be altered to ensure that the children of both male and female employees in a workplace are taken into account when setting the standard for employers' responsibility to provide a crèche or daycare centre at the workplace.

Microenterprise

Qualitative in-depth research and quantitative surveys are needed to identify the needs of women's SMEs. Since most existing research is focused on urban SMEs, information on rural women's needs in this context is necessary.

The small, local, community-based nature of most women's SMEs in Turkey and their concentration in retail, textile and personal services sectors define their inability to reach larger national and global markets, impairing their long-term survival and chances of prospering. It is necessary to increase their chances of access to and linkage with such markets through policies and projects that help diversify their lines of business, develop their marketing skills and networking capacities, and build their ICT competence.

In this context, there is a clear need to re-evaluate existing training programmes from a gender perspective. Training programmes need to be designed to reverse the current reinforcement of traditional skills and segregation in the formal and informal labour markets. There is a need to gear programmes towards the development of skills for sustainable activities that would help women's SMEs integrate their products and services into wider markets.

Existing research also suggests that membership requirements to national organisations such as TESK and collateral requirements when applying for credit seriously disadvantage women's SMEs. It is therefore recommended that policies and projects providing guidance, training and credit support to women entrepreneurs be developed and reinforced.

RESEARCH PROJECTS COMMISSIONED OR CONDUCTED BY KGSM

Women's Employment Promotion Project (World Bank Project), 1994–2000

1. Eyüboğlu, A., Özar, Ş. and Tanrıöver, H. T., Kentlerde Kadınların İş Yaşamına Katılım Sorunlarının Sosyo-Ekonomik ve Kültürel Boyutları (*Socioeconomic and cultural aspects of women's problems in participating in working life in urban areas*), KSGM, Ankara, 2000.
2. Demirel, A., et.al., Çalışmaya Hazır İşgücü Olarak Kentli Kadın ve Değişimi (*Urban women as a labour force and recent profile changes*), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.
3. Pulhan, E. and Özar, Ş., İstihdamı İçin Yeni Perspektifler ve Kadın İşgücüne Muhtemel Talep (*New perspectives for women's employment and probable demand for women's labour*), KSGM, Ankara, 2000.
4. Kozaklı T., Üşür, S., et al., İşçi Sendikaları ve Siyasal Partilerde Kurumsal Gelenek ve Zihniyet Örüntülerinin Kadın İstihdamına Etkileri (*Labour unions and political parties: A study of the effects of institutional traditions and cultural structures*). Report, KSGM, Ankara, 1998.
5. Tanrıöver, H. and Eyüpoğlu, A., Popüler Kültür Ürünlerinde Kadın İstihdamını Etkileyebilecek Öğeler (*Reproduction of sexism through cultural practices: Favuorable and unfavourable elements in popular culture with respect to their effects on women's employment*), KSGM, Ankara, 2000.
6. Akhun, İ., Kavak, Y. and Senemoğlu, N., İİBK İşgücü Yetiştirme ve Mesleki Rehabilitasyon Hizmetlerinin Kadın istihdamına Katkısı Açısından Değerlendirmesi Araştırması (*Review of the Turkish Employment Institution's vocational trainings in terms of their contribution to women's employment*). Unpublished research report, Yayınlanmamış Araştırma Raporu, Ankara, 1996.
7. Akhun, İ., Kavak, Y. and Senemoğlu, N., İşgücü Yetiştirme Kurslarının Kadın İstihdamına Katkısı (*Review of formal and informal vocational trainings of the Turkish Republic's Ministry of Education in terms of their contribution to the guidance and placement of women in working life*), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.
8. Abay, C., Saner, G. and Atış, E., İzmir Yöresinde Kırsal Kadına Yönelik Eğitimin İstihdama Etkisi (*Effects of women's education services in İzmir region on women's rural employment*), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.
9. Review of training programmes of the Turkish Republic Ministry for Agriculture and Rural Affairs and the World Bank in terms of their contribution to women's employment in rural areas.
10. Konfeksiyon Üretiminde Kadın İstihdamının Biçimlenişi (*The shaping of women's employment in the confection sector*), Unpublished.
11. Koray, M., Gıda İşkolunda Çalışan Kadınların Koşulları ve Geleceği (*Conditions and prospects of women working in the foods sector*), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.
12. Hizmet Sektöründe Kadın: Ev Hizmetlerinde Çalışan Kadınlar (*Women in the services sector: Women working in home services*), Unpublished.
13. Tulun, A. M., Mardin, N. B., et al., Sağlık Sektöründe Kadın (*Women in the health sector: Discrimination on the basis of sex*), KSGM, Ankara, 2000.
14. Acar, F., Ayata, A. and Varoğlu, D., Cinsiyete Dayalı Ayrımcılık: Türkiye'de Eğitim Sektörü Örneği (*Discrimination on the basis of sex and attitudes towards women: Case study of the*

Turkish education sector), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.
15. Çalışma Yaşamında Cinsiyete Dayalı Ayrımcılık ve İşverenlerin Kadın Çalışanlara Tutumu, Büro ve Mağaza Çalışanlarına Derinlemesine Bakış (*Gender discrimination at the workplace and attitudes towards women workers: In-depth study of office and store work*), Unpublished.
16. Eyüboğlu, D., Z. Kuteş, et al., Bankacılık Sektöründe Cinsiyete Dayalı Ayrımcılık (*Gender discrimination in work life: a case study in the Turkish banking sector*), KSGM, Ankara, 2000.

Integration in Development Project, National Programme for the Empowerment of Women (UNDP Project), 1993–2003

1. İzmir Rehabilitation Center Project: implemented by Women's Human Rights Project (Kadının İnsan Hakları Projesi) (İstanbul) in İzmir, from September 1999.
2. Skills Training and handicrafts marketing for women earthquake victims: implemented by Republican Women's Association (Cumhuriyetçi Kadınlar Derneği) in Adapazarı Emirdağı region, from December 1999.
3. Parenting Families Project for the education of earthquake victim children: implemented by HABİTAT and Agenda 21 Youth organisation (Gündem 21 Gençlik Derneği), January 2000.
4. Research Project on the problems and expectations of immigrant women: implemented by Mersin University Research Center for Women's Problems, from May 2000.
5. Network for Help and Support for women earthquake victims: implemented by KADER (Kadın Adayları Destekleme Derneği, Association for Supporting Women Candidates) around the Kocaeli region, June 2000.
6. Değirmendere Women Support Center: set up January 2000, by World Academy for Local Administration and Democracy (Dünya Yerel Yönetim ve Demokrasi Akademisi) in Kocaeli/Değirmendere.
7. Project on violence against women: implemented by Ankara Bar, from January 2001.
8. Batman Emergency Support Center for Social Change: implemented January–June 2001 by Anakültür Scientific and Cultural Researches Publishing and Production Cooperative (Anakültür Bilimsel ve Kültürel Araştırmalar Yayın ve Üretim Kooperatifi) and Blue Pen Social Solidarity Organisation (Mavi Kalem Sosyal Yardımlaşma ve Dayanışma Derneği).
9. Training Project for Local Administrative Officials: implemented February–June 2001 by World Academy for Local Administration and Democracy (Dünya Yerel Yönetim ve Demokrasi Akademisi).
10. Publication of three documents covering the problems faced by Turkish blind women in social and daily life: implemented by the Turkish Federation for the Blind (Körler Federasyonu) and resulting in the publication of a book entitled *Blind women in Turkey: Problems, expectations and recommendations*.
11. Preliminary research for Archive Project: an archive of articles in the field of gender relations was compiled for the METU (Middle East Technical University) Women's Studies Department, May 2001.
12. Preparation of guide to the Family Property Law Provision of the Draft Civil Law: a book by Prof. Dr Ahmet Kılışoğlu was prepared to raise public attention and acknowledgement of this issue, April 2001.
13. Training project on scenario-writing techniques: organised by Uçan Süpürge (Flying Broom) for 20 participants, 7–9 May 2001.
14. Publication of stories of women in the early Turkish Republic period, 2001.
15. Book of comparative research on the regulations of the European Union concerning working women and Turkey: prepared by Doç Dr Burhan Süral of METU and delivered to relevant institutions and individuals.
16. Women's leadership project: implemented by Mother and Child Training Association (Anne ve Çocuk Eğitimi Vakfı), October 2001.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

The following list details recent and currently available English-language studies on gender issues in education and employment in Turkey.

Education

Acar, F., Women in Academic Science Careers in Turkey. In Stolte-Heiskanen, V. (ed.), *Women in science: Token women or gender equality?* Berg, Oxford, 1991.

Acar, F., Higher education in Turkey: A gold bracelet for women. In Lie, S.S., Malik, L. and Harris, D. (eds), *The gender gap in higher education 1994*, Kogan Page, London, 1994.

Acar, F. and Ayata, A., Discipline, success and stability: The reproduction of gender and class in Turkish secondary education. In Kandiyoti, D., and Saktanber, A. (eds), *Fragments of culture: The everyday of modern Turkey*, I.B. Tauris, London, 2002.

Acar, F., Women's education. Paper presented at the workshop of World Bank and Government of Turkey, *Bridging the gender gap in Turkey: A milestone towards faster socioeconomic development*. Ankara, 30 September 2003.

Achieve universal primary education, literacy rate of 15–24 year-olds, challenges. http://www.turkishembassy.com/II/TurkeyDevGoals2005/goal2.html

Atauz, A., Kardam, F., Saktanber, A. and Yalın, H.İ., Toplumsal Cinsiyet Eğitimi El Kitabı, KSGM, Ankara, 1999.

DIE [State Institute of Statistics], *Statistics of National Education – Formal Education*, SIS, Ankara, 1998.

DIE, *Turkey Statistics Yearbook*, SIS, Ankara, 2000.

DIE, *Turkey Statistics Yearbook*, SIS, Ankara, 2004a, p. 75.

DIE, Chapter 10, Labour. In *Türkıye İstatıstık Yilliği, 2004, Turkey's Statistical Yearbook 2004*, 2004b, p. 143–162. http://www.die.gov.tr/yillik/10_Calisma.pdf

General Directorate on the Status and Problems of Women, *The Status of women in Turkey (Turkish National Report to the Fourth World Conference on Women*), GDSPW-Bizim Büro Basımevi, Ankara, 1994.

Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies, *Turkish Demographic and Health Survey*, Ankara, 1998.

Kağıtçıbaşı, Ç., Sunar, D. and Bekman, S., Long-term effects of early intervention: Turkish low-income mothers and children. *Applied Developmental Psychology* 22, 2001, p. 333–361.

MDGR [Millennium Development Goals Report], *Millennium Development Goals Report: Turkey,* October, 2005.

MoNE [Ministry of National Education], *National education numerical data*, MEB, Ankara, 2000.

MoNE, *National education numerical data*, MEB, Ankara, 2002.

Otaran,N., Sayın, A, Güven, F., Gürkaynak, İ. and Atakaul, S., *A gender review in education, Turkey 2003*, UNICEF, 2003.

Student Selection and Placement Center, *Higher Education Statistics*, Meteksan, Ankara, 2002.

Support to Basic Education Programme, http://projeler.meb.gov.tr/tr/tedp.htm

Süral, N., Legal framework for gender equality at work. Paper presented at Women's Employment Summit, Istanbul, 10–11 February 2006.

Tunalı, İ., Education and work: Experiences of 6–14 year old children in Turkey. Koç University Working Papers, 1996.

Tansel, A., Determinants of school attainment of boys and girls in Turkey. *Economics of Education Review* 21, 1997, p. 455–472.

Tansel, A. and Güngör, A. D., 'Provincial inequalities in school enrolments in Turkey, 2000. www.erf.org.eg/uploadpath/paf/2003.pdf

Turkey Second Basic Education Project (APL #2). http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/COUNTRIES/ECAEXT/TURKEYEXTN/0,,contentMDK:20188252~pagePK:141137~piPK:141127~theSitePK:361712,00.html

Employment

Charmes, J., Size, trends and productivity of women's work in the informal sector and in old and new forms of informal employment: An outlook of recent empirical evidence. Paper presented at the International Association for Feminist Economics 2000 Conference, Istanbul, 15–17 August, 2000.

Cindoğlu, D., Women's microenterprise activity. Paper presented at workshop of World Bank and Government of Turkey, *Bridging the gender gap in Turkey: A milestone towards faster socioeconomic development*. Ankara, 30 September 2003.

Çağatay, N. and Özler Ş., Feminization of the labour force: The effects of long-term development and structural adjustment. *World Development* 23 (11), 1995.

Demirel, A., et.al., Çalışmaya Hazır İşgücü Olarak Kentli Kadın ve Değişimi (*Urban women as a labour force and recent profile changes*), KSGM, Ankara, 1999.

DPT [State Planning Organisation], *SME Strategy and Action Plan*. Ankara: DPT, January 2004. http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/esnaf/kobi/strateji.pdf

DPT, *2006 Country Programme*. DPT, Ankara, 2005. http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/program/2006.pdf

DPT, Household Labour Force Survey results, October 2005. Press release, Turkish Statistical Institute, 25 January 2006. http://www.die.gov.tr/ENGLISH/SONIST/ISGUCU/k_250106.xls

DPT and United Nations, *Millennium Development Goals Report: Turkey 2005*, Ankara, 2005. http://ekutup.dpt.gov.tr/kalkinma/binyil05/index.html

Ecevit, Y., Women's labour and social security. Paper presented at workshop of World Bank and Government of Turkey, *Bridging the gender gap in Turkey: A milestone towards faster socioeconomic development*. Ankara, 30 September 2003.

Ecevit, Y., Shop floor control: The ideological construction of Turkish women factory workers. In Redclift, N., and Sinclair, T. (eds), *Working women: International perspectives on labour and gender ideology*, Routledge, London, 1992.

Ecevit, Y., The status and changing forms of women's labour in the urban economy. In Tekeli, Ş. (ed.), *Women in Turkish society*, Zed Books, London, 1995.

Ecevit, Y., Hoşgör, A. and Tokluoğlu, C., Women in computer programming occupations in Turkey: How do they reconcile their work with their family? *Boğaziçi Journal: Review of Social, Economic and Administrative Studies* 16 (1), 2002.

Ecevit, Y., Kalaycıoğlu, S., Erman, T. and Tılıç-Rittersberger, H., Migrant women's participation in the labour force in urban Turkey'. In Özbay, F. (ed.), *Küresel Pazar Açısından Kadın Emeği ve İstihdamındaki Değişmeler*. Istanbul: Insan Kaynağını Geliştirme Vakfı ve KSGM, Ankara, 1999.

Esim, S., Solidarity in isolation: Urban self-employed women's economic organizations in Turkey. *Middle Eastern Studies Journal*, 36, 2000, p. 1.

Esim, S., Why earn less?: Gender based factors affecting the earning of self employed women in Turkey. Paper presented at the International Association for Feminist Economics 2000 Conference, Istanbul, 15–17 August 2000.

Günlük-Şenesen, G. and Özar, Ş., Gender-based occupational segregation in the Turkish banking sector. In Çınar, Mine (ed.), *The economics of women and work in the Middle East and North Africa*, vol. 4, *Research in Middle East economics,* JAI Press, 2001, p. 247–267.

Hisrich, R.D. and Öztürk, A.S., Women entrepreneurs in a developing country. *Journal of Management Development* 18 (2), 1999, p. 114–124.

ILO, *Women's entrepreneurship in Turkey: A country brief.* ILO, Geneva, 2005.

İlkkaracan, İ., Kentli Kadınlar ve Çalışma Yaşamı. In Berktay Hacımirzaoğlu, A. (ed.), 75 Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler. İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı (the History Foundation) Bilanço 98 Yayın Dizisi, 1998.

KAGIDER, Women's entrepreneurship in Turkey. Paper presented at OECD Ministrial Meeting, İstanbul, July 2005.

Kardam, F. and Toksöz, G., Gender-based discrimination at work in Turkey: A cross-sectoral overview. *Ankara University Political Sciences Faculty Journal* 59 (4), 2004.

Kasnakoğlu, Z. and Dayıoğlu, M., Education and earnings by gender in Turkey. METU Economic Research Center, Working Papers in Economics no. 96/10, 1996.

Kasnakoğlu, Z. and Dikbayır, G., Trends in women's employment in the Turkish manufacturing industry: 1983–93. Paper presented at the Fourth Annual Summer Conference of IAFFE (International Association of Feminist Economics), Tours, 5–6 July 1995.

KSGM, Supporting women-owned businesses in Turkey: A discussion of needs, problems, opportunities. Ankara: Development Alternatives Inc. and Strategic Research Foundation, 1996.

Özar, Ş., Barriers to women's micro and small enterprise success in Turkey. Draft research report. Center for Policy Studies, Central European University and Open Society Institute, 2002.

UNDP, *Country evaluation: Assessment of development results, Turkey*. UNDP, New York, 2004. http://www.undp.org.tr/pdf/ADR_Turkey.pdf

WES [European Network to Promote Women's Entrepreneurship], *Activities Report 2004*. May 2005. http://europa.eu.int/comm/enterprise/entrepreneurship/craft/craft-women/documents/wes-report-2004-en.pdf

5. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

5

The overall conclusions of this report point to an urgent need to strengthen the prerequisites for gender mainstreaming. With the exception of the European Union, there is a general lack of data on gender issues in education and employment. Therefore there is an ongoing need for sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data on education and employment.

It has also become clear that most initiatives on gender mainstreaming do not involve a clear articulation of how equality legislation – including the effective implementation and legislation and application of sanctions – and targeted activities for women can work together with gender mainstreaming in a comprehensive and complementary way. Therefore there is a need for comprehensive gender equality plans which link gender mainstreaming to equality legislation and targeted activities towards women, and which involve clear objectives and monitoring.

The few studies that evaluate gender mainstreaming independently stress that gender mainstreaming is often not used to address the gender impact of structural policies and ongoing trends such as privatisation and Islamisation. On the contrary, gender mainstreaming is still often found at the level of projects. This hinders the transformative potential of gender mainstreaming.

Similarly, evaluation studies show that gender mainstreaming often fails to include actors from civil society, such as the social partners or the feminist movements. In order to develop the strategy of gender mainstreaming adequately, there is a need to strengthen civil society organisations as partners.

In the field of education, most attention is given to the quantitative representation of boys and girls, women and men. There is less attention for the content of education, although there are some gender mainstreaming activities in this field. This could be developed further.

As regards attaining gender equality in countries such as Jordan, Morocco and Turkey, it has become clear that there is a

need to empower those actors in these societies that are striving to attain gender equality. More international pressure for gender equality in these countries, including the above-mentioned elements of comprehensiveness, structural approach and attention to empowerment, could accelerate the process of change towards gender equality.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ACC	Agricultural Credit Corporation
ADFM	Association Démocratique des Femmes du Maroc (Democratic Association of Women of Morocco)
AFEM	Association des Femmes d'Entreprises Marocaines (Association of Moroccan Women Enterprise Leaders)
APL	Adaptable Program Loan
ASRO/UNIFEM	Arab States Regional Office, UNIFEM
BPfA	Beijing Platform for Action
ÇATOM	Multi-Purpose Community Centre
CCA	Common Country Assessments
CEDAW	Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CGA	Country gender assessment
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
DEF	Development and Employment Fund
DfID	Department for International Development [UK]
DGSPW	Directorate General on the Status and Problems of Women (Kadının Sorunları ve Statüsü Genel Müdürlüğü)
DIE	State Institute of Statistics
DPT	State Planning Organisation
EC	European Commission
EES	European Employment Strategy
EGGE	Expert Group on Gender and Employment
EHPS	European Household Panel Survey
ETF	European Training Foundation
EU	European Union
FTA	Free trade agreement
GAD	Gender and development
GAP	Southeastern Anatolia Project (Güneydoğu Anadolu Projesi)
GDI	Gender-related Development Index

GDP	Gross domestic product
GFP	Gender focal point
GIDEM	South-eastern Anatolia Entrepreneurship Support Centre
GMIF	Gender Mainstreaming Implementation Framework
GNP	Gross national product
GoJ	Government of Jordan
HDI	Human Development Index
ICT	Information and communication technology/ies
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPEC	International Programme for the Elimination of Child Labour
IMF	International Monetary Fund
I-PRSP	Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
İŞKUR	Turkish Employment Agency
IT	Information technology/ies
ITC-ILO	International Training Centre of the ILO
JACP	Jordan Access to Credit Project
JD	Jordanian dinar
JFBPW	Jordanian Forum for Business and Professional Women
JNCW	Jordanian National Commission for Women
JNFW	Jordanian National Forum for Women
JOHUD	Jordanian Hashemite Fund for Human Development
JSA	Joint Staff Assessment
KAGIDER	Association of Women Entrepreneurs
KSGM	Directorate General on the Status of Women
KOSGEB	Small and Medium Industry Development Administration
LEAP	Linking Eastern Anatolia to Progress
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
METU	Middle East Technical University
MFI	Microfinance institution
MFW	Microfund for Women
MoNE	Ministry of National Education
NCFW	National Committee for Women
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
ODA	Official development assistance

PAIWD	Plan of Action for the Integration of Women in Development
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSD	private-sector development
ROSCAs	Rotating Savings and Credit Associations
SILC	Statistics on Income and Living Condition
SMEs	Small and microenterprises
TESK	Turkish Confederation of Tradesmen and Artisans
TİSK	Confederation of Turkish Employers' Unions
Türk-Iş	Confederation of Turkish Labour Unions
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGEI	United Nations Girls' Education Initiative
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNRISD	United Nations Research Institute for Social Development
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WB	World Bank
WID	Women in development
WIDTech	Women in Development Technical Assistance Project