



**PEER REVIEW REPORT  
ALBANIA**



**etf**  
SHARING EXPERTISE  
IN TRAINING

WORKING PAPER FINAL





## **VET REFORM POLICY PEER REVIEW ALBANIA**

**REPORT BY THE INTERNATIONAL PEER  
REVIEW TEAM**

**FEBRUARY 2003**

**Members of the Albanian review team were:**

- ❖ Mr. Jaroslav Kalous (Czech Republic),
- ❖ Mrs Frances Tsakonas (Greece),
- ❖ Mr Giorgio Allulli (Italy),
- ❖ Mr Anton Gojani (Kosovo)
- ❖ Mr Sreten Skuletic (Montenegro),
- ❖ Mr. Francesco Panzica (European Training Foundation).

This project was commissioned by the European Training Foundation. The contents, opinions and recommendations delivered in the report are those of the peer group alone and do not commit the European Union or its agencies in any way.

# CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FROM THE MINISTER OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCES</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>LIST OF ACRONYMS</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>11</b>
LEGAL FRAMEWORK	11
CURRICULUM REFORM	12
TEACHER TRAINING	13
LABOUR MARKET AND SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP	13
FINANCING	13
<b>1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>15</b>
1.1 Background	15
1.2 Overall context for VET reforms	15
1.3 Purpose of the Peer Review	16
1.4 Structure of the Peer Review report	16
1.5 The Albanian Peer Review team	16
<b>2. LEGISLATION</b>	<b>17</b>
2.1 The present situation	17
2.2 The team's findings and conclusions	17
2.3 Recommendations	18
<b>3. CURRICULUM REFORM</b>	<b>19</b>
3.1 The present situation	19
3.2 The team's findings and conclusions	19
3.3 Recommendations	21
<b>4 TEACHER TRAINING</b>	<b>23</b>
4.1 Present situation	23
4.2 The team's findings and conclusions	23
4.3 Recommendations	24
<b>5. LABOUR MARKET AND SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP</b>	<b>27</b>
5.1 Current situation	27
5.2 The team's findings and conclusions	27

5.3	Recommendations	28
<b>6.</b>	<b>FINANCING</b>	<b>29</b>
6.1	Current situation	29
6.2	The team's findings and conclusions	30
6.3	Recommendations	31
<b>ANNEX 1</b>		<b>33</b>
<b>ANNEX II</b>		<b>35</b>
<b>ANNEX III</b>		<b>39</b>

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT FROM THE MINISTER OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCES**

The VET Reform Policy Peer review is prepared by the expert group of the Peer Review process, organised by the European Training Foundation (ETF). This process was proposed by the ETF in 2002 and it has been accepted by the Ministry of Education and Sciences, as a tool which will assist in the right decision making regarding VET reform in the future.

The report includes a careful analysis of the processes and reformed policies undertaken during previous years in the field of VET. In the end of this analysis the authors gave valuable recommendations, which will help the work of the VET institutions in the future.

The discussion of this report will take the most important place in the Second National VET Conference and for sure it will serve the VET authorities, social partners and other international institutions, as a valuable tool for clarification of the current problems and challenges facing the VET system in Albania and also for the perspective development.

The fact that this analysis is done from an independent group of experts, in co-operation with Albanian experts, makes it more acceptable and useful for the future.

On the occasion of the Second VET Conference, I wish to re-formulate the thanks of the Ministry of Education and Sciences to the European Training Foundation, for its continuing support to VET in Albania, for the care showed in implementing the new VET law and VET Council which very soon will begin to function.

On this occasion I wish to address a special felicitation to the Vocational Education and Training Observatory staff in Albania, which with its work is a clear indicator of the continuing qualification of the Albanian experts, providing an evermore important contribution to the development of VET in our country.

Mr.Luan Memushi

Minister of Education and Sciences

of Republic of Albania





## LIST OF ACRONYMS

AEDP	Albanian Education Development Project
CARDS	Community Assistance for Reconstruction, Development and Stabilisation
CEE	Central and East Europe
CIVET	Centre for Information, Vocational Education and Training
CoM	Council of Ministers
EC	European Commission
ETF	European Training Foundation
EU	European Union
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GPRS	Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
IPR	Institute for Pedagogical Research
LEA	Local Education Authorities
MoES	Ministry of Education and Sciences
MoLSA	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
MTEF	Medium-Term Expenditure Framework
NES	National Employment Service
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PARSH	Project for Adult Education in Albania
PHARE	Partnership Programme aiming to "advance the transition process in Central and Eastern Europe through providing support for initiatives that encourage local economic development and institutional strengthening"
RDA	Regional Development Agency
SAA	Stabilisation and Association Agreement
SEE	South- Eastern Europe

SEED	Southeast Europe Enterprise Development
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
TEMPUS	Trans-European co-operation scheme focusing on the development of higher education systems in the Partner Countries
VET	Vocational Education and Training
WB	World Bank
WTO	World Trade Organisation

## FOREWORD

In 2002 the European Training Foundation launched a new Peer Review Programme in south-east European countries that are preparing or already running European Union funded CARDS<sup>1</sup> projects in the field of VET. The programme is a follow-up to the thematic reviews of education policy carried out by the OECD throughout the years 2000 and 2001 and is funded from the European Training Foundation's own budget. In 2002 peer reviews were carried out in Albania, Croatia, Serbia and Montenegro, and the Kosovo<sup>2</sup>, while peer reviews in other countries will follow in 2003 and thereafter.

The focus of this peer review programme is to evaluate recent progress in VET policy development and to propose activities that could be undertaken to help bring the reform process forward. The Foundation's peer reviews aim at both policy advice and capacity building in the region. They are organised in such a way that they would:

- contribute to an exchange of policy experience and enhance learning processes among national stakeholders;
- contribute to develop policy analysis capacities in the countries of the region;
- promote, in an effective way, regional co-operation between actors involved in similar activities;
- contribute to the CARDS programming and implementation cycle.

The present (and possible future) peer review cycles of the European Training Foundation contain five phases:

- a specific review topic is agreed with the country in question;
- national background material is prepared by both the host country and the country manager of the European Training

Foundation, which includes the drafting of a briefing paper;

- a peer review team is set up and pays a visit to the country;
- a public review report is formulated and circulated.

In addition, the European Training Foundation organises specific staff development activities as a follow-up to the national reviews, as well as regional dissemination events to share experience between experts from different south-east European countries and learn from each other.

Where relevant, the peer reviews of the European Training Foundation put a clear focus on assessing where the country stands in terms of meeting its requirements from the Stabilisation and Association Agreement and preparing for accession to the European Union. Experts from European Union member states are included in the review teams to compare countries against EU good practice in terms of *outcomes (what has to be done)*; and experts from candidate countries are included to share their experience in terms of suitable *reform processes (how should it be done)*.

The aim of the final reports is to give policy advice and to identify short and mid-term actions rather than providing a complete, academic analysis of the VET system and grand reform proposals. The reports contain substantiated and operational conclusions and recommendations which should allow policy-makers in the country in question to design follow-up activities.

---

<sup>1</sup> CARDS is the European Union's assistance programme to south-east European countries.

<sup>2</sup> Under international administration in line with UNSCR 1244 of 10 June 1999

The Foundation does not see the peer reviews as a one-off event but rather as a permanent cycle during which the Foundation would provide inputs into the VET reform processes in the given countries. It is, hence, planned to arrange for subsequent review missions with external peers after periods of two to three years.

All peer review documents - *Executive Summary, Briefing Note and Peer Review report* – will be made available through the European Training Foundation's website:  
<http://www.etf.eu.int>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Following agreement in the Stability Pact, the European Training Foundation has proposed to organise peer reviews on vocational education and training (VET) reform policy in the five countries of South East Europe that in January 2002 did not have a VET Reform project under the EU CARDS programme (Albania, Croatia, and the Yugoslav Republics of Serbia, Montenegro and Kosovo). The ETF Peer Reviews seek to assist the ongoing reforms in the region of South-Eastern Europe (SEE).

The key objectives for the peer reviews are to

- Provide an external assessment of VET reform policy initiatives to national policy makers.
- Improve mutual knowledge and understanding of VET systems, issues and developments in West Balkan countries.
- Promote regional networking, exchange of experience and co-operation among VET experts, stakeholders and policymakers.
- Increase awareness and facilitate transfer of VET reform experience from EU member states and candidate countries.
- Contribute to the CARDS programming cycle.
- Intensify co-operation between ETF and national authorities/experts from the region.

Albania started a reform of its vocational education and training (VET) system in 1993 but the process has lost momentum due to financial problems, social unrest during the years 1996 - 97 and the Kosovo crisis.

The overall context for VET reform at present is characterised by the adoption by Parliament of a framework law for Vocational

Education and Training (March 29, 2002) which however still needs to become operational through by-laws and regulations. The latter will largely depend on a clear strategic reform policy which is still to be developed. Simultaneously, the VET system in Albania is characterised by the presence of a multitude of different, largely donor-led development and innovation projects, which need to be made coherent and consistent within a national VET policy framework. However, for the financing of the VET system, both in terms of major running costs and of ongoing pilot reform projects, the Albanian authorities remain largely dependent on the international donor community.

The Peer Review in Albania, undertaken at the end of 2002, thus took place at the right moment in which further policy advice can indeed assist national authorities in deciding on the most appropriate actions to undertake to make progress in VET reform.

The report is structured around the 6 key issues that have been agreed with the Albanian authorities as being of immediate policy concern: Legislation, curriculum reform, teacher training, social partnership, post-secondary education and financing.

## LEGAL FRAMEWORK

The Albanian Parliament approved on 29 March 2002 a framework law for Vocational Education and Training. The scope of this law is to support the development of a common system of VET in the country, based on the co-operation of all actors in the VET sector, including social partners. It is oriented to employment and offers equal opportunities to all in a perspective of Life Long Learning.

The overall philosophy and contents of the new law, which however, needs still to be made operational, impress the team.

However, the team is very much concerned about the low status and attractiveness of vocational education in Albania. The team is also concerned about the absence of sufficient support capacities for VET reform and development and the low priority that the government is giving to developing such capacities which will be critical for a successful reform of VET.

Considerable efforts will have to be undertaken in order to mobilise the human and social capital that is needed to make the new legislation really work. (Human capital is defined as the knowledge, abilities and competencies of individuals whereas social capital relates to aspects of social life, such as trust, partnership and cohesiveness that enable people to work, live and create synergies together.) Human capital needed for VET reforms is available and needs to be further developed but without sufficient *social capital*, implementation of any reform is impossible.

To improve the management of the reform of the VET sector, efforts should be directed to building the sector's capacities:

- To plan, set priorities, budget, and assess the fiscal implications of the reform.
- In the process of planning, to set priorities and design programs that improve service delivery in collaboration with stakeholders.
- To monitor implementation of the reform and adjust policies on the basis of systematic feedback.

**Recommendation 1 - Develop a sense of ownership of and commitment to the reforms among those who must sustain them.**

**Recommendation 2 - Increase the amount of public interest and participation in the VET system**

**Recommendation 3 - Enhance the strategic leadership capacity of the MoES and MoLSA and their support institutions.**

## CURRICULUM REFORM

The curriculum concept in force in Albania is a very narrow one and only includes a documentation of mandatory subject contents. The curriculum structure and contents are represented only by time-tables, subject programs and text-books and lack other important curriculum elements such as qualification profiles, curriculum guides, instructional guides and/or teacher manuals. There is still a sharp division between academic, vocational theory and vocational practice parts with standard ratios between academic, vocational theory and vocational practice parts (not adjusted to the particularities of each profession/specialty). Curricula are still largely based on the previous and outdated occupational structure; only refer to reduced number of vertical levels (only two levels) which are not well corresponding with the reality of the present occupational stratification. They also offer low possibilities for horizontal and vertical mobility.

In general, the curriculum is still seen as a single product prepared at the *central level* and not as a permanent process with involvement of *lower levels* and is largely decided on the basis of educational considerations with little or no basis in an analysis of occupational requirements. There is no effective feed back mechanism concerning the relevancy and effectiveness of the curriculum, which is due to the absence of employer's involvement and presence of weak curriculum development infrastructures. The post-secondary level needs to be filled urgently as this is the level where most new (middle management and technician) positions will be created within enterprises. Experience also shows that SMEs and independent entrepreneurial activities (in tourism and agro-food) need qualifications at post-secondary level.

**Recommendation 4 – Establish closer communications and better co-operation during the whole process of curriculum reform and development between the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Labour, as well as between representatives of the VET sector and social partners.**

**Recommendation 5 – Develop initiatives to close the post- secondary education gap in VET**

## TEACHER TRAINING

The picture is not very optimistic. The current system of teacher training in Albania does not really assist in preparing teachers (neither those who want to become nor those who already work as teachers) and headmasters in doing the things that they will be supposed to do if the new legislation would be fully operational and in force.

Insufficient attention is being given to the issue of teacher training. As noted in earlier paragraphs the team has been surprised to note how little effort is undertaken to make better and co-ordinated use of the several pilot projects for creating both a coherent national teacher training policy concept and for developing the human and social capital to make such a policy sustainable. The efforts of the Institute for Pedagogical Research to promote developments in vocational trainer training are operating within a policy vacuum. Neither social partners, nor Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs have been engaged into a dialogue for the modernisation of training of vocational trainers.

**Recommendation 6 – Develop urgently a concept for pre- and in-service VET teacher training as an integrated element of the overall VET reform.**

**Recommendation 7 – Start a process of integration of adult training and vocational education systems in the context of Albania’s preparations for Lifelong Learning provision.**

## LABOUR MARKET AND SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP

The new law on vocational education and training in the Republic of Albania creates the legal platform for the development of a labour market relevant VET system.

A systematic involvement of social partners would help to face the problem of integration of VET with labour market needs in a very “natural” and smooth way, and would permit to maximise the use of existing scarce resources: practical training for youth and adults could make use of enterprise workshops.

Schools and training centres could be given more autonomy, in order to make them use the resources in a more flexible way, exploiting the possibilities they have at local level, but securing that unhealthy commercial competition does not take place. The schools and the centres should become *training agencies*, able to selling a variety of services to young and adult people, as well to enterprises. The process of increased autonomy should give the schools and training centres also more flexibility in designing (parts of) the curricula, which should be adapted, inside a national frame, to the local needs.

**Recommendation 8 - Strengthen institutionally social partnership in VET through the involvement of employers and union representatives in VET at all levels.**

## FINANCING

The Albanian Government has set itself some challenging perspectives in VET and it is unlikely that it will be able to finance its plans solely from its own budget and international donor contributions. Therefore, the MOES would like to see further private sector development of: (a) technical/vocational secondary education (since although the goal of the MOES is to increase secondary VET participation from its current 17 percent participation to 30 percent, the State does not have the financial resources to do so); and (b) post-secondary technical/vocational and professional training institutions (for continuing training, specialisation and retraining).

However, incentives will need to be available if the private sector is to impact the VET sector more substantially than at present.

All – but there are not that many - private education and training institutions in Albania are self-financing – that is, their costs are met mainly through tuition and in some cases, donations from parents, the community or Albanians living abroad. The Albanian Government does not contribute to the financing of private education or training, neither nationally nor locally (and nor does it intend to).

Due to the lack of training capacities in these fields and the great requirements for capital investments and more expensive equipment and learning materials, there is a great mismatch between demand (i.e. training needs) and supply (i.e. training courses offered). There is no quality assurance

system nor are other sectors beyond the most popular being covered.

**Recommendation 9 – Develop an active policy stance towards private sector involvement in education and training designed to: (a) create a streamlined and more enabling regulatory framework conducive to private sector development; (b) improve the targeting of Government spending; and (c) establish a strong and effective regulatory framework for monitoring performance and raising standards.**

**Recommendation 10- Give a high priority to using financial resources more efficiently and effectively.**



# 1 INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 Background

Albania started a reform of its vocational education and training (VET) system in 1993 but the process has lost momentum due to financial problems, social unrest during the years 1996 - 97 and the Kosovo crisis. Over the last four years however Albania has made significant progress in all economic and social fields. The stabilisation of the political situation and significant interventions in strengthening public administration, fighting organised crime and terrorism, the adoption of adequate sectoral policies (Industry and SMEs, Agriculture, environment, infrastructure) have all been highly appreciated by the international community.

As a result, Albania has been accepted as member by the WTO in September 2000 and is also active member of the Council of Europe and OSCE. The above improvements are also the basis for the recommendation made in 2001 by the European Commission for opening of the negotiations for a EU/Albania Stabilisation and Association Agreement.

The European Commission has since 1991 provided considerable financial support to Albania. The total amount spent till 2000 amounts to 1.02 billion Euro. The majority of this assistance was provided through the PHARE programme (63%) supporting Albania's reform process. The remainder was dedicated to address humanitarian and emergency needs.

In 2001, the new CARDS programme provided funds in the amount of 37.5 million Euro. In the meantime a multi-annual support programme was launched on the basis of a Country Strategy Paper for the years 2002-2006. For the coming three years (2002-2004) the programme envisages 143.9 million Euro of assistance. Out of the latter amount, ten million are devoted to support education and VET reform.

## 1.2 Overall context for VET reforms

The overall context for VET reform at present is characterised by the adoption by Parliament of a framework law for Vocational Education and Training (March 29, 2002) which however still needs to become operational through by-laws and regulations. The latter will largely depend on a clear strategic reform policy which is still to be developed. Simultaneously, the VET system in Albania is characterised by the presence of a multitude of different, largely donor-led development and innovation projects, which need to be made coherent and consistent within a national VET policy framework. However, for the financing of the VET system, both in terms of major running costs and of ongoing pilot reform projects, the Albanian authorities remain largely dependent on the international donor community.

The current EC Cards programme will assist the Ministries of Education and of Labour in the elaboration and adoption of a medium/long term strategy for the reform of secondary vocational education and continuing vocational education. A complementary project will cover the implementation of this strategy through pilot actions.

Bearing in mind this framework, ETF has launched since 2001 a series of preparatory measures with a view of preparing the Albanian VET community. These measures include: 1) an institution building training activity involving 12 Albanian stakeholders (September-October 2001); 2) support to the preparation by Albanian experts of a white paper of VET reform; 3) a workshop held in Tirana on 18-19 March 2002 to discuss the proposals from the white paper; 4) a training needs analysis for VET teachers and instructors; 5) a draft proposal on a new modular in-service training programme for

teachers and instructors prepared by an international expert.

In the meantime, the Ministry of Education has appointed a Working Group, supported by the World Bank, with the task to draft a strategy for the overall education sector. In parallel, also the Ministry of Labour is developing its own strategy concerning the reform of VET centres reinforcing links with the labour market in a perspective of Life Long Learning. A large number of bilateral donor projects is in place since many years as well, supporting individual schools or training centres, curriculum reform projects and teacher training activities.

### 1.3 Purpose of the Peer Review

The Peer Review undertaken at the end of 2002 at the initiative of the ETF thus took place at the right moment in which further policy advice can indeed assist national authorities in deciding on the most appropriate actions to undertake to make progress in VET reform. The peer review team does neither come up with long term strategic policy recommendations nor with a blue print of a modern Albanian VET system for the future. The purpose of the review and the team's report is to be of immediate support to VET reform policy development and implementation. It builds on the outcomes and recommendations of the recent OECD Education Policy Review.

## 1.4 Structure of the Peer Review report

The executive summary of this report contains a succinct presentation of background, findings and recommendations. The main report is structured around the 6 key issues that have been agreed with the Albanian authorities as being of immediate policy concern: Legislation, curriculum reform, teacher training, social partnership, post-secondary education and financing. These issues will be briefly presented together with the peer review team's conclusions and recommendations. The team's recommendations are focused on policy measures that could be taken in the short run and that would aim at keeping the reform process going and in the right direction. At the end of the report, the core conclusions and recommendations are briefly summarised.

## 1.5 The Albanian Peer Review team

The report has been prepared on the basis of the findings of a Peer Review undertaken by Mr Jaroslav Kalous (General rapporteur, Czech Republic), Mrs Frances Tsakonas (Greece), Mr Giorgio Allulli (Italy), Mr Anton Gojani (Kosovo) and Mr Sreten Skuletic (Montenegro). The team was lead by Mr. Francesco Panzica (ETF Country manager for Albania). The ETF National Observatory in Albania has assisted the team with the preparation of background documentation and has organised the review visits. The visits to Albania took place between September 29 and October 5, 2002 and detailed information about the team members and the programme of visits can be found in Annex 1.

## 2. LEGISLATION

### 2.1 The present situation

The Albanian Parliament approved on 29 March 2002 a framework law for Vocational Education and Training. The scope of this law is to support the development of a common system of VET in the country, based on the co-operation of all actors in the VET sector, including social partners. It is oriented to employment and offers equal opportunities to all in a perspective of Life Long Learning.

The law defines the competences of public institutions involved but also foresees the establishment of a VET National Council, an Advisory Body made of 14 members representing the main public stakeholders (9) plus civil society (5). It defines the different types of VET as follows:

- Secondary VET, beginning after the compulsory cycle and lasting 3 years (first level) plus 2 (second level). Only the accomplishment of the second level gives the possibility to continue at the University;
- Secondary Technical Schools lasting 5 years after the compulsory cycle;
- VET courses lasting less than three years
- Other training courses to be defined according to the law.

It also allows VET schools to undertake income earning activities.

### 2.2 The team's findings and conclusions

Educational reform is a complex mixture of changing laws, policies, structures, cultures, materials, behaviours and beliefs. The team is impressed by the overall philosophy and contents of the new law, which however, needs still to be made operational. Currently an estimated 20 by-laws are under preparation. In addition, however, many other details will need to be elaborated such as the structure and contents of the

curriculum, how to secure that curricula are adapted to the needs of the labour market, the effective contribution of enterprises and a workable financing system. Legislation needs to be part of an accepted overall policy framework. By itself it cannot create agreement about policy directions nor will it automatically install the capacities in society to realise the potentials that it offers. Often, legislation – even if based on the best intentions of law makers – remain paper tigers if not combined with initiatives aimed at acceptance and active participation by stakeholders.

However, the team is very much concerned about the low status and attractiveness of vocational education in Albania. The team is also concerned about the absence of sufficient support capacities for VET reform and development and the low priority that the government is giving to developing such capacities which will be critical for a successful reform of VET.

Increased awareness of the importance of vocational education and training for the social and economic future of the country (such as is recognised by governments and citizens of EU member states) will be imperative to secure that the government provides the necessary resources to the sector but also to mobilise the capacities needed to make a potentially promising framework law work in practice. This challenge goes clearly beyond the preparation of detailed by-laws. Most of all, this will require clear leadership of the respective Ministries, systematic participation of all stakeholders in developing appropriate implementation strategies and the availability of a strong and professional support infrastructure for VET reform measures.

The team has met during its visits to the country many able professionals and stakeholders who understand the importance of a modern and well functioning VET system for the future of the country and who are ready to play a decisive role in the reform of the VET system. It strongly believes that better use could and should be made of available human and social capital in the country.

## 2.3 Recommendations

Considerable efforts will have to be undertaken in order to mobilise the human and social capital that is needed to make the new legislation really work. (Human capital is defined as the knowledge, abilities and competencies of individuals whereas social capital relates to aspects of social life, such as trust, partnership and cohesiveness that enable people to work, live and create synergies together.) Human capital needed for VET reforms is available and needs to be further developed but without sufficient *social capital*, implementation of any reform is impossible.

To improve the management of the reform of the VET sector, efforts should be directed to building the sector's capacities:

- To plan, set priorities, budget, and assess the fiscal implications of the reform.
- In the process of planning, to set priorities and design programs that improve service delivery in collaboration with stakeholders.
- To monitor implementation of the reform and adjust policies on the basis of systematic feedback.

The team would like to put forward the following recommendations:

### **Recommendation 1 - Develop a sense of ownership of and commitment to the reforms among those who must sustain them.**

- Pay close attention to the readiness of the people for innovation and assist key change facilitators and target groups to become psychologically able to accept the risks and inevitable stresses of abandoning the status quo.
- Invest at an early stage in training key leaders both within projects and the target system and institutions in order to make organisations more receptive to and able to manage reforms.

### **Recommendation 2 - Increase the amount of public interest and participation in the VET system**

Three immediate initiatives could be the following:

- Give public support to the VET Council, consult it on a systematic basis and so give it high prestige in society.
- Undertake a serious inventory of the needs for vocational education and training of the economy and involve enterprises and other social partners in this process.
- Use the ETF National Observatory to provide administrative and expert support to the VET Council, such as in preparing annual VET reform progress reports.

### **Recommendation 3 - Enhance the strategic leadership capacity of the MOES and MOLSA and their support institutions.**

Immediate initiatives could be the following:

- Further build on the attempts to transform the culture of the central authorities from its former bureaucratic controlling role to greater strategic leadership, inter-departmental collaboration, teamwork and a desire for continuous improvement.
- Appoint civil servants in the Ministries departments and staff in supporting institutions on the basis of their professional competencies.
- Review the recommendations contained in the OECD National Education Policy Review Report and plan to prepare a follow-up response to OECD after two years as is the practice in OECD member countries.
- Give support institutions more scope for initiative, decision-making, innovation and focus their assessment on performance as opposed to merely implementing ministerial directives.
- Use the recent adopted reorganisation of the Ministry of Education for reinforcing the priority of VET within a more powerful Secondary Education Department

### 3. CURRICULUM REFORM

#### 3.1 The present situation

During the communist regime, the VET system was highly centralised and the curricula for a wide range of professions and specialties were centrally developed. They were very detailed and the school or teacher autonomy for adaptation was very limited. For every vocational qualification, the Ministry of Education and Science (MoES) defined the "time-table" (list of subjects), then the Institute of Pedagogical Studies was charged to develop detailed programmes for every subject (syllabi) and the School Book Publishing House was charged to prepare the respective textbooks (every subject – one textbook). The curriculum was "subject-based", with a clear distinction, in programming and delivery, between general subjects, theoretical vocational subjects and practical subjects. As regards the adult training curriculum, there were no significant differences with those from vocational schools for youth.

The introduction of a new structure for vocational education (from 4 years, into 3 and 5 years courses) that started in 1992 has led to reviewing and developing of hundreds of school programmes (syllabi). In general, however, there were no significant changes and improvements in the VET curriculum procedure and products until 1998. The only curricular changes were related to the ratio between theory and practice (from 15-20%, to 25-33% practice, with some exceptions for pilot schools supported by donors).

In some of the more than 10 pilot schools supported by donor projects, there are sporadic initiatives to introduce new curricular concepts (curriculum elements and procedures). A new modular curriculum (with Phare support and based on the Scottish model) was introduced in two agriculture schools (1998-2000). During 1998-2001, with the support of Swiss and German projects, a new curriculum concept (national frame plus school-based

curriculum) was introduced in two vocational schools (in six vocational profiles). But all these initiatives are still on a pilot scale and there is no official recognition of the new models to be introduced on a large scale. Most donor initiated pilot projects therefore are terminated upon departure of the international staff and piloted innovations remain unsustainable.

In the adult training area, the old infrastructure disappeared and a new one has gradually emerged, composed of a weak public sector and a spontaneous and pragmatist private one. The team has noticed that in the public training sector (Vocational Training Centres-VTCs), no national curriculum concept has developed so far. Individual training centres and instructors develop (sometimes translate from foreign sources) their own course programmes and procedures. Most of these are donor lead or influenced and the same is the case for the private training centres.

#### 3.3. The team's findings and conclusions

The team's assessment of the current curriculum situation does not differ much from what others may already have noticed. The curriculum concept in force in Albania is a very narrow one and only includes a documentation of mandatory subject contents. The curriculum structure and contents are represented only by time-tables, subject programs and text-books and lack other important curriculum elements such as qualification profiles, curriculum guides, instructional guides and/or teacher manuals. There is still a sharp division between academic, vocational theory and vocational practice parts with standard ratios between academic, vocational theory and vocational practice parts (not adjusted to the particularities of each profession/specialty). Curricula are still largely based on the previous and outdated occupational structure; only refer to reduced number of

vertical levels (only two levels) which are not well corresponding with the reality of the present occupational stratification. They also offer low possibilities for horizontal and vertical mobility.

In general, the curriculum is still seen as a single product prepared at the *central level* and not as a permanent process with involvement of *lower levels* and is largely decided on the basis of educational considerations with little or no basis in an analysis of occupational requirements. There is no effective feed back mechanism concerning the relevancy and effectiveness of the curriculum, which is due to the absence of employer's involvement and presence of weak curriculum development infrastructures. The latter are also not very familiar with modern curriculum development and delivery concepts.

In the year 2000, *Germany* had a total of 350 publicly maintained or officially recognised institutions of higher education, which are of the following types:

- Universities and equivalent institutions of higher education;
- Colleges of art and music
- Fachhochschulen
- *Berufsakademien* (professional academies): they combine academic training with practical professional training in the workplace, within the *dual system* concept. Courses offered at the *Berufsakademien* include, in particular, business, technology and social services.

The students at the *Berufsakademien* complete parallel training with a company in trade and industry, with comparable establishments in other sectors - particularly in the case of the liberal professions - or at institutions maintained by social services. During the training, periods of study at the study institution alternate with periods of on-the-job training in the training establishments. The companies bear the costs of on-the-job training and pay the students a wage, which is also received during the theoretical part of the training at the study institution.

Training at the *Berufsakademie* is generally divided up into two years of basic studies followed by one year of advanced studies. Each semester is divided up into on-the-job training and a theoretical part of the course at the study institution that lasts between ten and twelve weeks. No provision is made for semester holidays within the study plans, but students receive an annual holiday entitlement of approximately four weeks on account of their training contract. Students who successfully complete their *Diploma* examination are awarded a qualification for entry into a profession

In Albania the post-secondary non University level is limited to the Nursery and pre-school teachers sectors. As for the first training sector there is a Nursery High School in Tirana and specific courses organised by the District Universities (ELBASAN, GJIROKASTËR, KORÇË, SHKODËR, VLORË). Training courses for pre-school teachers are organised only in the before mentioned District Universities.

The University post secondary include 4-6 years courses for a degree and 3 years courses issuing a diploma. These short term courses are in the field of Agriculture, Electronics and Professional Nursery.

Finally, current curriculum development efforts are limited to the types of education programmes as defined so far at secondary level of education. There remains a gap – as is the case in many other transition countries – between secondary vocational and higher level, in particular below university level. The post-secondary level needs to be filled urgently as this is the level where most new (middle management and technician) positions will be created within enterprises. Experience also shows that SMEs and independent entrepreneurial activities (in tourism and agro-food) need qualifications at post-secondary level.

However, the team has also seen the promising results of some ongoing donor projects which are much closer to modern curriculum development and delivery concepts. These projects remain isolated, unsustainable and are not – yet - used to base a national curriculum reform on. Nor are the capacities and experiences from

these pilot projects made available to develop a professional local curriculum development capacity.

### 3.3 Recommendations

The team is fully aware of the fact that introducing a new curriculum philosophy and a new concept of VET curriculum is a long-term strategy, and can only be implemented gradually. However, it is convinced that better use could and should be made of current pilot projects and more attention should be devoted to using these projects for the development of a local curriculum development strategy and capacity.

It would recommend the following:

**Recommendation 4 – Establish closer communications and better co-operation during the whole process of curriculum reform and development between the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Labour, as well as between representatives of the VET sector and social partners.**

In the short term this could be achieved by

- Securing that principles of and progress in curriculum development are placed as a recurrent agenda point for meetings of the VET Council.
- Serious evaluations are undertaken of the ongoing pilots on the two-phase curriculum model in vocational education as well as on the modular structure in adult training and results are discussed in the VET Council.

- The establishment of a National VET Centre as the main body responsible for research and development activities and for managing the VET curriculum development process at the national level. Expertise currently available in various pilot projects should be made available to the centre.
- Organising co-ordination and co-operation between national and international VET curriculum reform initiatives, including country wide dissemination events to be co-organised by the VET Centre.
- Establishing so called curriculum development expertise networks among teachers and others currently involved in various donor-sponsored pilot curriculum projects.

**Recommendation 5 – Develop initiatives to close the post- secondary education gap in VET**

Immediate measures could include the following:

- Undertake an international comparative review of VET at post secondary level.
- Develop legislation to enable higher non-academic education in areas of direct relevance for the Albanian economy.
- Use TEMPUS projects strategically to develop tertiary non-academic education programmes
- Develop twinning with EU tertiary education institutions.





## 4 TEACHER TRAINING

### 4.1 Present situation

The current pre-service teacher training system is over-producing graduate teachers. But only for the schools; there is no institutional responsibility for the training of adult trainers. The University of Tirana and the various regional universities formally prepare students for the teaching profession. But university students are mainly provided with scientific knowledge in particular subject fields and there is no special training to prepare for the teaching profession. Generally, there is very limited emphasis on acquiring a good understanding of modern formative 'learning' methodologies and of developing experience through practice. The limited availability of modern teaching equipment (computers, the Internet, updated textbooks, photocopiers etc.) should be seen as a major constraint for the application of new teaching methodologies. No accreditation requirements exist to deliver courses. Only an attendance certificate is provided to teachers. No special professional development opportunities exist for principals and inspectors.

In-service teacher training is currently organised by the MOES and the Institute for Pedagogical Research (IPR) at the national level, and by the Local Education Authorities (LEAs) and the school directorate at school level. Foreign non-governmental organisations and foundations, like the Albanian Education Development Project (AEDP), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) and Swisscontact also contribute to vocational teacher/instructor training activities in the pilot schools participating in their projects.

The Ministry of Education recently launched a programme at district level using school inspectors as in-service trainers. This programme largely failed due to lack of plans and structure for its implementation in many regions and due to the lack of a systematic approach to issues of quality,

training needs, monitoring and evaluation. The inspectors did also not have the training and experience necessary to carry out these tasks.

### 4.2 The team's findings and conclusions

From its discussions during the country visit, the team has acquired a reasonable good understanding of the present teacher training situation in Albania. The picture is not very optimistic. The current system of teacher training in Albania does not really assist in preparing teachers (neither those who want to become nor those who already work as teachers) and headmasters in doing the things that they will be supposed to do if the new legislation would be fully operational and in force.

In-service training has several functions ranging from the personal development of individuals to collective projects aimed at improvements in the working practices of all teachers in one school.

The way in-service teacher training is organised varies from one country to another. It may be of short duration (from one day to one week), in which case it is frequently organised during school hours. Where it is of longer duration (several weeks or even months), it normally takes place outside working hours and may take the form of courses leading to qualifications or even professional promotion.

In most countries, participation in in-service training is not compulsory. But in some countries law obliges all teachers to ensure that they constantly update their knowledge and the content of their teaching.

In many cases, teachers are allowed to enrol freely in the training of their choice. Sometimes they do so on the advice of an inspector and/or the school head. In general, training themes are proposed by

organisations belonging to the Ministry of Education or by teachers' associations and/or the training courses are organised in response to specific demands from school teaching staff.

In certain countries, participation in a training seminar may result in extra qualifications or attendance at courses recognised and encouraged by competent authorities at different levels (national and local) leads to a salary increase.

An appropriately skilled team of teachers and school managers is a prerequisite for the successful implementation of any education reform policy. New legislation and the surrounding policy discussions foresee teachers and headmasters to become involved in things that so far they have never been involved in. This will not work if they are not well prepared: teachers need further training for delivery of the new curricula; teachers and school managers need to be supported in developing the skills necessary to set up and maintain networks with local employers and other stakeholders, including parents. In addition, in order to participate fully in the ongoing reform process, teachers should be trained to take a more active role – and more responsibility in decisions about pedagogic methodological approaches and training materials.

But, however important it is to assist teachers and headmasters in taking up their new tasks and responsibilities, the more important it is to prepare new teachers properly. A good and flexible pre-service teacher training system is the more effective way to have qualified graduates from the teacher training departments of universities rather than retraining employed teachers through in-service training.

Insufficient attention is being given to the issue of teacher training. As noted in earlier paragraphs the team has been surprised to note how little effort is undertaken to make better and co-ordinated use of the several pilot projects for creating both a coherent national teacher training policy concept and for developing the human and social capital to make such a policy sustainable. The efforts of the Institute for Pedagogical Research to promote developments in

vocational trainer training are operating within a policy vacuum. Neither social partners, nor Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs have been engaged into a dialogue for the modernisation of training of vocational trainers.

## 4.3 Recommendations

The White paper has missed a unique opportunity to raise the issue of teacher training.

### **Recommendation 6 – Develop urgently a concept for pre- and in-service VET teacher training as an integrated element of the overall VET reform.**

Immediate actions could be

- The establishment of a Working Group within the National VET Council to prepare a policy note on pre- and in-service VET teacher training. The note should cover teachers educating young people and trainers of adults.
- Make an inventory of all externally supported vocational training initiatives in order to identify good practice, knowledge and skills related to training of vocational teachers.
- Develop on the basis of the inventory a clearly defined pool of experts and materials, for the teacher training working group to evaluate as a reference for policy proposals and also to create a transfer mechanism to the wider VET community, which has not benefited from exposure to better teacher training practice.
- Mobilise donor support for the development and implementation of a teacher training policy programme.
- Improve contacts between schools and universities and encourage exchange of information, experience and even staff in an immediate drive to better train future teachers.
- Arrange that university students preparing for the teacher profession can go to local schools to observe

experienced teachers and practice teaching under their guidance.

**Recommendation 7 – Start a process of integration of adult training and vocational education systems in the context of Albania’s preparations for Lifelong Learning provision.**

Immediate measures could be:

- Establish a Working Group in the National VET Council to prepare a Policy Note on the integration of Vocational Education for youth and Vocational Training for adults.
- Map and assess public and private capacities and facilities for joint provision of vocational education and vocational training.
- Secure that legislation and policies of different ministries do not create obstacles for integration of initial VET and further training.
- This work should also develop consensus among national authorities and social partners around a vision as to how trainees (public and private sector) will be certified (standards, quality concerns included).



## 5. LABOUR MARKET AND SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP

### 5.1 Current situation

The economic context for Albanian VET is difficult. There is a very high rate of unemployment, while the black economy and irregular jobs are quite spread, as the White Paper and many other national and international reports underline. People coming out from school, even with a diploma, have many difficulties to find a job especially in the formal economy. Status and attractiveness of vocational schools is not high. Moreover, the democratic system of social partnership and social dialogue is quite new and has only developed over the past 10 years and not as smoothly as in some other transition countries.

However, progress has been made. Economic indicators show that the Albanian economy is growing; the recent approval of the new law on VET is a necessary initial step to build up a new system of vocational education with relevance for students and enterprises; the National Employment Service can become an useful instrument not only to develop the labour market but also to strengthen the relationship between VET and the enterprises needs; social dialogue is developing and the number of tripartite representative institutions is growing; the development of new frame curricula can sign the way toward a more decentralised, open and democratic concept of curriculum design. There are some good experiences both in public and in private schools and centres which could now be disseminated. And as a result, donors' attitudes towards VET reform seem positive, realistic and pragmatic.

### 5.2 The team's findings and conclusions

The aim of every VET system is to prepare young and adult people to enter the labour market and to find and stay employment in a

satisfactory way for both the individual and for society in general. To obtain this result, as modern economies show, it is absolutely essential to build up a very strong relationship between the VET system and the labour market. The new law on vocational education and training in the Republic of Albania creates the legal platform for the development of a labour market relevant VET system. The law creates the conditions for building a comprehensive system of vocational education and training in Albania, covering both the professional and the general aspects of VET, targeting young people as well as adults in the perspective of lifelong learning, using the resources managed by the Ministry of Labour and by the Ministry of Education.

A systematic involvement of social partners would help to face the problem of integration of VET with labour market needs in a very "natural" and smooth way, and would permit to maximise the use of existing scarce resources: practical training for youth and adults could make use of enterprise workshops.

During its discussions with social partners and representatives of VET schools and training centres, the team has learned that there already exist many forms of good co-operation and many more ideas as how to improve this at the local level. Existing initiatives needs formalisation, public support and a firm legal basis. In particular there appears to be great concern for an efficient use of scarce capacities, including the worry that separate institutions would develop for youth education and adult training.

Schools and training centres could be given more autonomy, in order to make them use the resources in a more flexible way, exploiting the possibilities they have at local level, but securing that unhealthy commercial competition does not take place. The schools and the centres should become *training agencies*, able to selling a variety of services to young and adult people, as well

to enterprises. The process of increased autonomy should give the schools and training centres also more flexibility in designing (parts of) the curricula, which should be adapted, inside a national frame, to the local needs.

However, as mentioned earlier, damaging commercial competition should be avoided and schools should remain aware of their principal mission, which is to provide high quality education and training. The authorities may consider undertaking an education and training mapping exercise, identifying available VET capacities in the country and using this inventory to develop a policy for efficient use of VET capacities.

In Europe there are many different ways of organising apprenticeship or other similar types of on-the-job training, in relation to the different national contexts and to different employers and young people needs. Variations exist in

- the length of the contract (it may vary from one year to three years)
- the numbers of hours spent on formal training
- the reduction of the training worker's salary compared to the qualified worker
- the measure of social contribution
- the incentives for the employer who permanently recruit the worker at the end of the on-the- job training period.

## 5.3 Recommendations

The principle recommendation under this heading is

**Recommendation 8 - Strengthen institutionally social partnership in VET through the involvement of employers and union representatives in VET at all levels.**

The involvement of social partners should and could be assured at every level:

- At central level, through the VET National Council, as stated in the VET law, and through technical working groups (with the contribution of experts designated by social partners).
- At school and training centre level, through the establishment, in each vocational school and training centre, of a Governing Board with the participation of the social partners.
- Through the analysis of the needs of the local labour market (using the information provided by the local Employment Service or even using questionnaires prepared by the school staff and administrated by the pupils themselves).
- Through the analysis of the results of the training activity on pupils performances (number of pupils employed and unemployed after leaving the school; coherence between the job and the training received; pupil's satisfaction about the training received; employer's satisfaction with the trainees; etc.).
- Through the involvement of other local employers into the school activities (opening the enterprise to the pupils for periods of work experience, sending qualified workers to make lessons to the pupils etc.).
- Through the involvement in curricula development at school level (assuming that schools will have more autonomy in developing their curricula inside the provision of national frame curricula).
- Through the involvement in examination and certification of students and trainees.

National authorities may also initiate

- A mapping on VET capacities and facilities in order to develop a policy of optimal use, integrating VET for youth and adults.
- A (regular) survey on labour market needs and expected VET provision.
- A closer co-operation between and MoLSA to co-ordinate VET and active labour market policies.

## 6. FINANCING

### 6.1 Current situation

According to Article 29 of the 2002 VET Law, “public VET is supported financially by the State Budget, by the local government budget, VET national and international programs, contributions of the employers’ and employees’ associations, donors’ contribution, sponsoring and other sources allowed by law (legal sources)”.

The Law further defines (Article 30) that VET public institutions may perform “economic activities in fields that are related with the implementation of the teaching program, in accordance with the legal clauses”. In other words, VET public institutions are permitted by law to raise funds through entrepreneurial activity relevant to their field/s of activity and in compliance with the legal provisions. However, although the Law states that “the use of the income benefited from these activities is made in accordance with the legal clauses” (Article 30), such legal clauses are not stipulated in the current Law and will need to be defined through the by-laws.

Albania’s economic situation has important implications for the education and training system. At present, severely constrained public finances cannot simultaneously operate the education and training system and address all the urgent and widespread school rehabilitation, construction and reform needs. The current stock of skills and knowledge of the labour force (and the schooling system that helped shape it) still reflect Albania’s economic and political past and its extreme isolation from the outside world. Aside from the emerging service sector and privatized agricultural activity, Albania’s future industry and occupational profiles are generally unclear, making it difficult for the Government and individuals to make informed investment decisions about work-related education and training. In this context, Albania is working to keep intact the delivery of high-quality general education - the foundation of a well-

prepared and flexible labour force – but as has become clear from the earlier sections of this report, will need to realign technical and higher education to the country’s new economic environment.

The *Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy* (GPRS), will help the Government improve the effectiveness of its policies as well as contribute to Albania’s aspiration to move towards a Stabilization and Association Agreement (SAA) with the EU by raising the level of development for the entire country and closing the gap between Albania and other European countries. The GPRS is closely linked with the *Medium-Term Expenditure Framework* (MTEF)<sup>3</sup> so as to ensure that GPRS policy objectives are translated into appropriate public expenditure decisions. The Ministries of Education, Health, Labour and Social Affairs, Public Works, Transport, Agriculture and Public Order are involved in this process, although civil society participation has been encouraged, along with dialogue with the private sector. One of the strategic priorities identified for the 2002-2004 MTEF is to increase the share of GDP allocated to spending on health and education (including VET).<sup>4</sup> As such, health, education, and social security and welfare are expected to account for 63% of total recurrent spending over the period with the share of health and education increasing from 25% in 2001 to 29% in 2004.<sup>5</sup>

According to the MTEF (2002-2004), the Government intends to give greater priority to the education sector in the allocation of public financing, recognizing that Albania’s future economic prosperity depends on the skills of its population. It is therefore proposed that: (a) recurrent spending is to

---

<sup>3</sup> The MTEF is one of the principal instruments for operationalizing the Government’s GPRS.

<sup>4</sup> Medium-Term Expenditure Framework 2002-2004. Ministry of Finance. Republic of Albania. June 2001.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid.

increase from 2.7% of GDP in 2001 to 3.1% of GDP in 2004 and that investment spending average 0.8% of GDP over 2002-2004; (b) wage-bill allocations increase by “high” rather of 12% annually; (c) non-wage recurrent expenditure increase by over 20% annually; and (d) priority be given to funding of secondary education. In order for the above to be implemented however, it is recommended that: (i) the MOES be reorganised so that policy and budget formulation capacities be strengthened; (b) payroll and wage bill restructuring be undertaken in accordance with guidelines of the Department of Public Administration; (c) education services management and financing be decentralized; (d) demand-based criteria for the allocation of resources be introduced; and (e) external financing to support the investment programme be sought.

In fact, the Albanian Government received over \$100 million from donor countries in 1998-99 for education investments and assistance, with the share of foreign aid to the education budget rising from about 3 percent in 1995 to about 8 percent in 1997-98. However, lack of co-ordination of donor contributions has greatly affected the efficiency of such funds.

Currently, the main donor contributions to VET reform include: (a) the EU CARDS program worth ..... Euro; (b) the Italian Government with approximately 1 billion Euro ear-marked for redeployment of redundant public employees; (c) the German Government through its on-going funding to the MoES and MoLSA; and (d) the Greek Government’s development assistance of 50 million Euro to the Albanian Government (of which support to education and vocational training is a target area).

## 6.2 The team’s findings and conclusions

The Albanian Government has set itself some challenging perspectives in VET and it is unlikely that it will be able to finance its plans solely from its own budget and international donor contributions. Therefore, the MoES would like to see further private

sector development of: (a) technical/vocational secondary education (since although the goal of the MoES is to increase secondary VET participation from its current 17 percent participation to 30 percent, the State does not have the financial resources to do so); and (b) post-secondary technical/vocational and professional training institutions (for continuing training, specialisation and retraining).

However, incentives will need to be available if the private sector is to impact the VET sector more substantially than at present. All – but there are not that many - private education and training institutions in Albania are self-financing – that is, their costs are met mainly through tuition and in some cases, donations from parents, the community or Albanians living abroad. The Albanian Government does not contribute to the financing of private education or training, neither nationally nor locally (and nor does it intend to).

The private training system manifests a greater flexibility in training provision but yet with clearly a limited capacity, as regards number of people trained and range of skills it delivers. According to a study conducted by a private firm (CIVET) with the financial support of GTZ, with 51 most important Training Centres in Tirana (private, public, NGO) half of the private training centres are financed by foreign donor agencies and institutions. Private training centres (for business studies, computers, etc.) are multiplying rapidly especially in Tirana as the market demand is very high and the capacity of the existing centres is very low, in terms of the number of people trained and range of skills delivered. Most courses offered are in management, although banking/finance and accounting seem to be popular, followed by secretarial skills and office management. However, due to the lack of training capacities in these fields and the great requirements for capital investments and more expensive equipment and learning materials, there is a great mismatch between demand (i.e. training needs) and supply (i.e. training courses offered). There is no quality assurance system nor are other sectors beyond the most popular being covered.



## 6.3 Recommendations

Albania's future economic prosperity depends on the skills of its population. The establishment of a modern VET system therefore, that will not only serve the needs of Albania, but will also be consistent with European (and international) standards, is vital.

The Government needs to recognize therefore, that a strong private sector is necessary if it is to meet its educational and broader social and economic objectives.

**Recommendation 9 – Develop an active policy stance towards private sector involvement in education and training designed to: (a) create a streamlined and more enabling regulatory framework conducive to private sector development; (b) improve the targeting of Government spending; and (c) establish a strong and effective regulatory framework for monitoring performance and raising standards.**

Immediate measures could include to

- Undertake a comparative review of private sector involvement in education and training in EU member states.
- Undertake a comparative review of various funding mechanisms and financing formulas for VET applied in

member states (per capita funding, vouchers, etc.).

- Undertake a comparative review of quality assurance practices in VET in EU member states.
- Initiate a policy debate on these issues inside the National VET Council.

Apart from seeking additional financial involvement from the side of the private sector, Albanian authorities are also recommended to make a more efficient use of existing expenditures.

**Recommendation 10- Give a high priority to using financial resources more efficiently and effectively.**

Immediate measures could include to:

- Remedy current wastage in the VET system by a fundamental reform of the finance system to achieve cost-effective allocation of financial and human resources.
- Use both the Tempus and VET support programmes within CARDS 2002-2006 for the financial support to the reform of the VET system.
- Co-ordinate and build bridges between different donor sponsored projects, in particular striving for continuity of purpose and making maximum use of the 'critical mass' of human and social capital developed through time.



## ANNEX 1

### Work Schedule

<b>29.09.2002</b>	
18:00	Briefing meeting – Presentation of VET System in Albania
<b>30.09.2002</b>	
09:00	Ministry of Labour – VET Department
11:00-11:30	Ministry of Finance
12:00	Visit to Economic School Tirana
14:00	Visit to VET Centre Nr. 1
18:00	Debriefing session
<b>01.10.2002</b>	
09:00	Institute of Pedagogical Studies
11:30-13:00	Round table on Teachers' Training
15:00	Visit to VET School
19:00	Debriefing session
<b>02.10.2002</b>	
10:30	EC Delegation
11:00	World Bank
14:00	Round table on Donors' co-operation
16:30	Round table with text books and didactical material producers
18:00	Debriefing session
<b>03.10.2002</b>	
09:00	Ministry of Education
10:00	Round Table with Social Partners
14:00	Round Table with Training Providers
18:00	Debriefing session

**04.10.2002**

09:30 Ministry of Labour  
11:00 National Employment Services  
17:00 Teamwork session: findings and problems. Next steps

**05.10.2002**

Departure

## **ANNEX II**

### **List of people met**

#### Ministry of Education and Science

Mr.Luan Memushi, Minister

Mr. Rexhep Hida, Director of Didactical Materials

Mr. Ruzhdi Recic, Inspector

#### Ministry of Finance

Mr.Luan Shahollari, Deputy Minister

Ms. Mimoza Dhembic, Budget Director

#### Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs

Ms.Valentina Leskaj, Minister of Labour

Mr. Neshat Zeneli, Head of the Secretariat and International Relations

Mr. Muharrem Xhelili, Director of VET Department

Mr. Stavri Lako, Specialist of VET Department

Ms. Genta Qose, Specialist of Employment Sector

#### National Employment Service

Mr.Genci Bushi, Deputy General Director

Mr. Neshat Zeneli, Head of External Relationships Department

Ms. Dafina Jupe, Head of VET Department

Mr.Edmond Alushi, Specialist in VET Department

Mr. Luftim Gazheli, Specialist in VET Department

Ms. Ejvis Shehi, Specialist

Mr. Ilir Karanxha, Specialist in Project Department

Ms. Etleva Gjellaj, Specialist in Statistics Department

Institute of Pedagogical Studies

Ms. Mariana Sinani, Deputy Director

Mr. Alqi Mustafai, Head of VET Department

Ms. Mirela Andoni, Specialist

Ms. Lindita Dhima, Specialist

Miss. Merita Panariti, Specialist

Economic School Tirana

Ms. Roza Cako, Director

Ms. Ira Rroko, Head of the Professional Subjects Department

Technical School - Shkoder, Tirana

Mr. Remigjo Lacaj, Director

Construction School "Karl Gega", Tirana

Mr. Genc Moshko, Director

Hoteleri-Tourism, Tirana

Mr. Astrit Bezati, Director

VET Center Nr.1, Tirana

Mr. Hasan Pema, Director

VET Center Nr.4, Tirana

Mr. Lulezim Camishi, Director

VET School "Beqir Cela", Durres

Mr. Bashkim Shkembi, Director

Regional Development Agency

Mr. Ilir Rembeci

INKUS School

Mr. Zija Zajmi

Job and Training Office Associated – "Don Bosko" Centre

Mr. Enri Bajramaj

WISDOM –Professional Foreign Language Centre

Ms. Zamira Begolli, Specialist

National VET Observatory

Mr.Edmond Hoxha

Mr. Stavri Lako

Ms.Elfiore Miho

EC Delegation

Mr. Guido de Fraye, First Counsellor

World Bank

Ms. Lorena Kostallari, Operations Officer

Ms. Irena Beqiraj, Financial Management Analyst

Ms. Shahridan Faiez

Open Society Foundation for Albania

Ms. Mimoza Gjika, Program Director

Ms. Edlira Kovaci, Administrative Manager

Kultur Kontakt

Ms. Gerlinde Tagini, Austrian Educational Co-ordinator

Ms. Elisabeth Augustin, Austrian Educational Co-ordinator

Embassy of Switzerland Co-operation Office

Ms. Corine Huser, Deputy Co-ordinator

Swisscontact

Mr. Martin Scottele, Project Manager

Institute for International Co-operation of the German Adult Education Association

Mr. Jochen Blanken, Project Co-ordinator

Civet 2000 -Centre for Information, Vocational Education and Training

Ms. Edlira Muedini, Managing Director

Council of Employers' Organisation

Mr. Bashkim Sala, Chairman

Ms. Ivis Nocka, Adviser

Ms. Genta Qosja, Specialist

Albanian Businessmen Organisation

Mr. Erion Gjergo, Jurist

Trade Union Federation of Education and Science

Mr. Xhafer Dobrusha, Head

Independent Trade Union of the Albanian Education

Mr. Bajram Kruja, Member

Publishing House of Textbooks

Ms. Teuta Mati, General Director

Ms. Valmira Dashi, Science editor for mathematics

Ms. Orjana Osmani, Science editor for literature

Miss. Albana Molishti, Science editor for geography

DIDACT ALBA

Mr. Xovasar Chakmakxhian, President

Mr. Diran Chakmakxhian, Managing Director



## **ANNEX III**

### **List of Documents**

#### Legal documents

Law No. 7952, dated 21.6.1995 On Pre-University Education System.

Law No. 8872, dated 29.3.2002 for VET in the Republic of Albania

Draft Decision for the National Committee of the VET

Draft Decision for the Organisation of the Public Institutions of the Vocational Education and Training , Financing and Administration of the Incomes

Draft Decision for the Consultancy and Orientation in the Vocational Education and Training

#### Strategic documents

MOES: White Paper on VET in the Republic of Albania. Tirana 2002.

MOL: Vocational Training Strategy. Tirana 2002.

MOF: Medium-Term Expenditure Framework 2002-2004. Tirana 2001.

EC: CARDS programme. Albania: Country Strategy Paper 2002-2006. EC 2001.

Rezultatet e seminarit dy ditor mbi realizimin e nje plani te perbashket pune per MASH dhe MPCS (Programi CARDS). Golem, maj 2002.

MOES: Midterm and Longterm Strategy on the Development of Albanian Pre- University Educational System, Tirana 2000. <http://www.see-educoop.net>

#### Specific background documents

Berryman, S. E.: Albania's Education Sector: Problems and Promise. The World Bank, Washington D.C. 2000.

Dethilleul, Y. and al.: Albania: Issues and Challenges in Education Governance. The World Bank, Washington D.C.2000.

Dudwick, N., Shahriari, H.: Education in Albania: Changing Attitudes and Expectations. The World Bank, Washington D.C. 2000.

ETF: Promotion of Cultures and Practices on Social Dialogue, Participation of Civil Society and Related Structures in Albania. Country Review. Tirana, June 2002.

HDPC: The Albanian Response to the Millennium Development Goals. Prepared for the United Nation System in Albania by the Human Development Promotion Center. Tirana, May 2002.

- Lamoureux, M. E.: Restructuring Alternatives for Albania's VET Subsector. The World Bank, Washington D.C. 1999.
- Mustafai, A, Konini, M,: Report on Needs Analysis of VET Teachers/Instructors in Albania. Tirana 2002.
- OECD: Thematic Review of National Policies for Education - Albania. OECD, Paris July 2002.
- Palomba, G., Vodopivec, M.: Financing, Efficiency, and Equity in Albanian Education. The World Bank, Washington, D.C. 2000.
- Panzica, F.: Labour Market - VET Assessment: Albania. ETF, Torino 2001.
- Qano, V.: Private Education in Albania <http://www.see-educoop.net>
- Report on the VET system in Albania. National Observatory Country Report. ETF, Torino 1999.
- Tsakonas, F.: Private Sector Development in Education in South East Europe - Country Report: Albania <http://www.see-educoop.net>
- WB: A qualitative assessment of poverty in 10 areas of Albania. The World Bank, Washington, D.C. 2001.
- WB: Financing Development in Albania. Tirana 2002.
- General background bibliography
- Brook, P. J., Smith, S. M. (Eds.): Contracting for Public Services: Output-based Aid and its Applications. The World Bank, Washington, D.C., 2001.
- ETF: A Cross Country Analysis of Curricular Reform in VET in CEE. ETF, Torino 1999.
- ETF: Key Indicators - VET in CEE. ETF, Torino 1998.
- ETF: Trans-national Analysis of VET in the countries of CEE. ETF, Torino 1999.
- Grooting, P., Kalous, J.: From Pilot Schools to Reform Strategy. Fragment, Prague 1997.
- Heyneman, S.: From the Party/state to Multi-Ethnic Democracy: Education and its Influence on Social Cohesion in Europe and Central Asia Region. Education Evaluation and Policy Analysis, Summer 2000.
- Heyneman, S.: Thoughts on Social Stabilization in the Formerly Centrally-Planned Economies. Prague, Civitas 1995.
- Kalous, J,: Why it can't be done...Social cohesion and other problems of the political capital of society. Working Paper elaborated as part of the project "Human resource development strategy for the Czech Republic" Prague, October 2000.
- Patrinos, H., Ariasingam, D. L.: Decentralization of Education: Demand-Side Financing. The World Bank, 1997.
- Ritzen, J., Easterly, W., Woolcock, M.: On "Good" Politicians and "Bad" Policies: Social Cohesion, Institutions, and Growth. World Bank Working Paper 2000.

Ritzen, J., Woolcock, M.: Social Cohesion, Public Policy, and Economic Growth: Implications for Countries in Transition. Address prepared for the ABCDE (Annual Bank Conference on Development Economics). Paris, June 2000.

Stiglitz, J.: Whither Reform. Ten Years of the Transition. Keynote Address, Annual Bank Conference on Development Economics, Washington, World Bank, April 28-30, 1999.

Tooley, J.: The Global Education Industry: Lessons from Private Education in Developing Countries. IEA and IFC, London, 1999.

Torres, G., Mathur, S.: The Third Wave of Privatization. Privatization of Social Sectors in Developing Countries. The World Bank, Washington, D.C., 1996.

