



# TORINO PROCESS 2016-17

# PALESTINE

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Executive summary of the Torino Process 2016–17 Palestine report.

Find the **full report on ETF Connections: Torino Process Platform Library** at:

<https://connections.etf.europa.eu/communities/service/html/communitystart?communityUuid=79f686f5-87e0-4f04-90e1-a1fa53900ca2>

The contents of this paper are the sole responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the ETF of the EU institutions.

@ European Training Foundation, 2017

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

## Acronyms

<b>CVET</b>	Continuing vocational education and training
<b>GIZ</b>	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (German Agency for International Cooperation)
<b>LET</b>	Local employment and TVET
<b>LMIS</b>	Labour market information system
<b>NGO</b>	Non-governmental organisation
<b>NQF</b>	National qualifications framework
<b>TVET</b>	Technical and vocational education and training
<b>UNRWA</b>	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestinian Refugees in the Near East

# TORINO PROCESS 2016–17

## PALESTINE<sup>1</sup>

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

#### 1. Introduction

The Torino Process 2016–17 round in Palestine was carried out following a self-assessment modality. This shows the country's commitment to and interest in the Torino Process, and more generally, the issue of monitoring technical and vocational education and training (TVET) reform. The report was produced by the Monitoring and Evaluation Technical Working Group as part of its mandate to establish a holistic monitoring and evaluation policy for the TVET system.

The Torino Process plays a very important role in determining the degree of ownership and accountability of TVET stakeholders vis-a-vis the various reform processes currently being implemented. A systemic overhaul of TVET is currently underway in Palestine and the employment sector and key stakeholders are stretched in terms of staff, competences and resources due to the many initiatives that have been launched. It is crucial to identify whether and where reforms are going too far or too fast for national stakeholders to remain in a leading or co-leading role. The Torino Process also offers an opportunity to assess the degree to which TVET actors are autonomously managing some of the new policies and processes and the extent to which there is real ownership of the donor-supported reforms that are being introduced. This element of sustainability is crucial: national stakeholders need to continue engaging in the self-assessment exercises that form part of future Torino Process rounds as this could provide very valuable information to all national and international partners engaged in TVET reform.

Ideally, the Torino Process 2016–17 round should become the first round of a new Palestinian-owned monitoring exercise, which up until now did not exist. The scale, frequency and complexity of this exercise could be reviewed and adapted to the local context, but adherence to the key principles of the Torino Process (holistic, ownership-based, participatory and evidence-based) will remain as quality standards.

Overall, Palestine is making a huge effort to reform and expand its TVET sector. The complexity of the national context and the limited resources available remain fixed constraints but many successes have been achieved in recent years thanks to three key elements.

- The main pillars of the TVET strategy are agreed by all key stakeholders and have remained the same since 2010. In addition, the recent establishment of the Higher Council for TVET has provided an official governance framework.

---

<sup>1</sup> This designation shall not be construed as recognition of the State of Palestine and is without prejudice to the individual positions of the EU Member States on this issue.

- Despite some difficulties in setting up a single overarching governance structure for the sector, the key TVET stakeholders (Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Labour and Federation of Chambers of Commerce) have worked closely together to develop new policies for the TVET sector. These three main stakeholders, together with other non-state actors (including the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA) and the TVET League) have always communicated and cooperated through direct channels. This cooperation has been strengthened and has become even more effective with the establishment of an informal TVET management structure, aimed at coordinating the interventions of the main donors (German development agency GIZ and Belgian Development Agency (BTC)). Three layers of coordination are involved (policy, technical and operational). Operational coordination is structured in theme-based technical working groups where all key stakeholders are represented. This is an informal structure that should be replicated more formally in the context of the Development Centre under the auspices of the Higher Council for TVET.
- National actors and international partners have established a strong coordination platform, which has allowed for the integration of the various initiatives in a single reform framework.

## 2. Main findings

### Vision and progress

The socioeconomic environment in Palestine suffers from the political and economic restrictions imposed on Palestinians by the Israeli occupation. The conflict in Gaza has significantly affected economic development. The fact that Palestine does not control most of the land is also a key factor in the lack of economic development.

Key Palestinian actors in the TVET and employment sectors have defined clear strategies for the development of the two sectors. Political instability has affected governance of TVET and the employment and labour market. It has also had an impact on the attempts made to define new forms of integrated governance. However, in terms of strategic orientation, the vision has remained coherent since 2010. Recently adopted strategic documents, such as the National Strategic Comprehensive Programme for Employment in Palestine (2015–2020) and the National Strategy for Adult Learning (approved in 2016), complement the existing strategic axis. The National Strategic Comprehensive Programme for Employment was developed on the basis of a partnership with all key stakeholders. One of the three objectives of the programme focuses on strengthening the TVET sector and is in line with the TVET strategy. In particular, it focuses on improving the image of TVET, establishing apprenticeship programmes and facilitating the transition from school to work through better career guidance services. The National Strategy for Adult Education is an overarching document that extends beyond the TVET sector but uses the developments achieved in the context of TVET reform as founding pillars. In fact, the strategy uses the national qualifications framework, which is currently being developed, as the reference policy framework for integrating adult non-formal training.

The reactivation of the Higher Council for TVET is the latest attempt to agree a high-level governance model. This follows an attempt to establish a National Agency for TVET (NAVET), which was not approved by the cabinet. A Development Centre is being implemented under the auspices of the Higher Council for TVET. Its mandate is to define new policies within the framework of TVET reform. This body will work as the secretariat for the Higher Council for TVET. In addition to performing an operational role, it will also play a key role in providing policy advice. Discussions about a TVET law are ongoing. The TVET law would be the appropriate tool to formalise the new governance framework and would also provide an anchor for the new core processes (e.g. curriculum development, quality assurance) developed in the context of TVET reform.

Overall, the involvement of non-state actors in defining a vision for the TVET sector is important. The Federation of Chambers of Commerce is the most important organisation representing the Palestinian private sector. It is one of the most active players in the area of TVET reform. It is also taking a proactive approach to playing a greater role in the sector by establishing a TVET unit in each chamber. However, the same type of commitment is harder to find in sectoral organisations and even more so among individual employers. When involved at individual level, these often demand tangible incentives.

Overall, national and international actors have decided to reform the most important processes in the TVET sector (curriculum development, quality assurance, teacher training), despite the uncertainties surrounding the overall TVET governance model. This should allow the TVET sector to become more effective and more relevant to the labour market. It has also paved the way for making good progress in many different areas in the TVET sector, despite the unstable governance. The creation of an informal TVET management structure by establishing separate technical working groups for the different processes is a step in the right direction.

Steady progress is being made in the reform of the TVET sector. Several achievements have been made at all levels and policy reforms are designed and approved in a participatory way. Given the small scale of the TVET sector and the limited financial and human resources available, this success is particularly praiseworthy. However, the limited capacities of the sector are also the main challenge to the successful implementation of TVET reform. National stakeholders have not yet developed the competences to run some of the core processes autonomously and sometimes lack a precise overview of the various developments. Key information is still managed in the context of international programmes, and national actors sometimes have difficulty in moving from a participatory role to a leading function.

Several international partners working in the TVET sector have a huge presence there, especially when compared to the limited human resources currently working for the key stakeholders. In some cases, this has led to positive developments such as the decision made by the Federation of Chambers of Commerce to hire a new person in charge of human resources development issues for each regional chamber. In other cases, the accumulation of activities has stretched the capacities of national stakeholders, affecting their ability to actively contribute to the reform process or causing delays in the implementation of standard activities within their organisation.

Many reforms are initiated with the support of international partners, which also cover a significant share of the costs. However, when TVET stakeholders introduce new processes and regulations, they do not always carefully identify the costs (human and financial) that will be incurred. In some cases, new processes require more operational costs (e.g. the new curriculum development envisages different steps with workshops and meetings); in other cases, reforms require the recruitment of additional staff (e.g. staff for the new Development Centre or to replace ministerial staff transferred to the centre). In a few cases, the reforms could actually generate resources (e.g. by allowing TVET providers to deliver services to the labour market and keep the income). In all these situations, it is important that these costs are quantified as soon as possible. Having a precise idea about the financial implications would allow for better planning and more sustainable reforms.

### Effectiveness and efficiency in addressing labour market demand

The main factors influencing the national economy and the demand for skills are the significant role of the informal sector; the structure of the economy, which is dominated by micro and small enterprises; the limited control over the national land and natural resources; and the mobility restrictions and administrative burdens linked to the Israeli occupation.

Since the establishment of the Palestinian Authority, economic growth has fluctuated widely due to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the limitations caused by the Israeli occupation. For this reason, it is impossible to define a trend. In times of peace, the Palestinian economy grows and some social indicators improve. For example, from 2014 to 2015, the social burden ratio fell from 1.89 to 1.62, the employment rate increased from 35.1% to 35.7% and the unemployment rate decreased from 26.9% to 25.9%. However, in the current conditions, the Palestinian economy is not in a position to absorb the labour force entering the market every year. Until recently, the public sector absorbed a sufficient proportion of the young workforce to maintain a certain degree of social stability, but the recent fiscal crisis has resulted in a change of policy, forcing the government to freeze hiring in the public sector.

The only way to generate enough jobs for young Palestinians and improve economic growth is to exploit the potential of the private sector. While some factors depend on political negotiations (e.g. access to land), other factors could be addressed by Palestinian policy makers (creating an enabling business environment, ensuring that more technicians and skilled workers enter the labour market).

Low female participation in the labour market is one of the main reasons for the low activity rate, low employment rate and high social burden indicator. Ad hoc policies to activate women in the labour market could have a positive impact on socioeconomic indicators. Supporting part-time contracts and strengthening social support measures so that women are not restricted by caring for children or elderly relatives are examples of policy measures that could make women more active in the labour market. The introduction of a minimum wage in 2015 will probably help to attract women to the labour market.

Historically speaking, the lack of relevance of TVET qualifications to the labour market has been the main weakness of the TVET system. At the same time, this has been recognised as one of the priority areas to be tackled by TVET reform. Several reforms are currently being implemented in this area. The process of establishing the Palestinian Occupations Classification started a few years ago and is still ongoing. A revised curriculum development process, which systematically involves employers in defining the competences needed for a given occupation (to date this has been limited to 36 occupations), was approved in 2015. These are medium- to long-term reforms, as the number of qualifications to be reviewed across all sectors is substantial. It has already been observed, however, that graduates with these competence-based qualifications have a higher employment rate. The next stage will be to ensure that national stakeholders are able to continue implementing the process of reforming curriculum development outside the framework of international projects. This should be a priority, as international support for TVET reform will not continue indefinitely and the sustainability of the new core processes is key to the entire reform process.

Palestine does not have a systemic approach for identifying and anticipating skills needs. In recent years, however, it has established a series of institutions, systems and processes that could generate a high volume of information and extensive analysis capacities. The Local Employment and TVET (LET) councils, together with the recently established units within the regional Chambers of Commerce, should provide a good insight into developments at local level. All 16 employment offices have been transformed into 'one-stop shops' and a Labour Market Information System (LMIS) was set up in 2013 to monitor labour demand and supply and to allow an easier job-matching process. All these developments have a strong element of institutional and financial sustainability (the funds used to support them come from national resources rather than projects), which must be considered a significant achievement, as they create a very fertile ground for sound skills identification and skills anticipation policies. Some of these institutional developments and tools still need time to become effective and, in some cases, it is not clear how ready the national stakeholders are to run these systems autonomously.

Entrepreneurship is important in Palestine, as one of the few opportunities for employment is self-employment. Several initiatives by national and international donors provide funds and guidance to potential entrepreneurs. In the first quarter of 2015, the LET councils were active in calling for proposals (see section B of the full Torino Process report for further details). In an effort to include entrepreneurial learning in the TVET sector, elements of entrepreneurship are integrated into the learning units in all new curricula. In addition, the International Labour Organisation's 'Know About Business' model has become an integral part of all TVET programmes.

## External efficiency in addressing social and inclusion demand

Palestine is characterised by a specific political situation, which has important implications for sociodemographic and social aspects of Palestinian society. Limited access to the land in more than 60% of the country (area C<sup>2</sup>), restrictions on movement and construction and challenges in providing educational services to certain areas are the main factors exacerbating existing social problems, creating new social challenges and preventing the resolution of problems in both cases.

People living in Area C villages can be identified as a marginalised group as they have limited access to technical and vocational training. The situation of traditionally marginalised groups, such as people with disabilities, is made even worse in these areas by the obstacles to mobility caused by roadblocks and security controls. Many actions have been tried at a pilot level to bring vocational education to these areas by means of mobile training units, and some of these have proved to be quite successful. However, these are ad hoc initiatives and are not part of a systemic plan by the national authorities and, as such, they lack sustainability in the long term.

The Ministry of Social Development delivers training to marginalised groups through its own training centres. They are currently involved in TVET reform as one of the targeted stakeholders. Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) constitute another key actor dealing with marginalised groups in all sensitive areas (Gaza, Area C). Some of these are aggregated in associations or networks (e.g. the TVET League) and cooperate increasingly with the public TVET stakeholders. However, others are still working on the boundaries of the system and have not established regular contact with the key stakeholders involved in TVET reform.

Refugees are the biggest marginalised group in the country. The UNRWA is responsible for managing the camps. It is also responsible for providing technical and vocational training through the Khalandia Vocational Training Institute and the College of Educational Sciences. Despite being centralised in one location, the Khalandia Training Centre makes all possible efforts to reach all refugee camps by hosting students on its premises and reaching out through mobile training units. Nevertheless, the main limitations are still the insufficient number of training opportunities available; the fact that supply does not match demand; the absence of female vocational training centres; and the absence of a bridging system that could help graduates from the Khalandia Training Centre to join other formal educational sub-sectors.

Women can be considered a marginalised group throughout the whole country, with even poorer prospects than other marginalised groups. Their activity rate is very low (women do not usually look for a job unless they have a degree), and travel limitations (for social and political reasons) prevent a large proportion of them from even accessing training. Overall, the technical and vocational offering for women is limited to the training centres run by the Ministry of Social Development, the Ministry of

---

<sup>2</sup> Area C is an administrative division of the West Bank, set out in the Oslo II Accord. It constitutes about 61% of the West Bank territory and it is administered by the Israeli Civil Administration. The Palestinian authorities have no authority over it.

Labour and the UNRWA. Gender segregation forces authorities to create ad hoc programmes and open new training centres for women and this is often not at the top of the political agenda.

As is the case in most of the neighbouring Arab countries, TVET is seen as a second choice by students. The goal of reaching higher education pushes students in the general education stream despite the limited opportunities that the labour market offers to many graduates. The political situation in Palestine makes higher education even more tempting as students consider migration to be one of the few viable life opportunities and a university degree seems to facilitate this opportunity. The TVET sector is fully engaged in changing the social perception of TVET and increasing its attractiveness to students. It is difficult to showcase results as this is a long-term trend and the sector's ability to increase its absorption capacity in the short term is also limited. The TVET sector is moving in two different directions. The first direction aims at providing results in the medium term. It includes the creation of pathways for accessing higher education from secondary technical education and the review and strengthening of the career guidance mechanisms in place. The second direction should have a higher impact in the longer term. It focuses on improving the quality and relevance of TVET education in order to be able to showcase clear evidence demonstrating the value of technical education (e.g. employment rate, salaries and career opportunities for TVET graduates). To be able to do this, two elements are necessary: a functioning system of tracer studies at national level and the active involvement of employers in the promotion of the TVET sector.

Overall, the role of TVET as an instrument for social inclusion should become stronger in the coming years given the major investment that is being made to reform the sector. It is very likely that we will see an expansion of the TVET system and more opportunities given to TVET students. The TVET sector is currently too small to address the social inclusion of vulnerable groups and the scale of the problem is too big to see a significant positive impact.

### Internal efficiency

TVET stakeholders are now aware that the resources of TVET providers are not being used efficiently. TVET providers offer few if any additional services for companies or people outside the traditional educational offerings. TVET schools are usually closed in the afternoons. The Centres of Competence represent a good example of how TVET providers could develop into lifelong learning centres. These centres are centres of excellence providing all levels of technical and vocational education in a given sector. They were established as a result of a partnership between GIZ, the Swiss Development Cooperation and key Palestinian stakeholders. No specific policy action has been taken to increase school autonomy since the last round of the Torino Process in 2014. However, continuing vocational education and training (CVET), which was not traditionally perceived as a top priority in Palestine, has become one of the key areas of interest for Palestinian stakeholders and many initiatives are taking place as a result of donor support. The approval of the new Adult Education Strategy (2016) should help to support the creation of a real lifelong learning system with a strong CVET component.

The variable level of competences of TVET teachers and trainers constitutes a liability in the system. In particular, given the introduction of a competence-based model, there is a need to ensure that the new pedagogical approach is mastered by the majority of TVET teachers, and in theory by all new TVET teachers entering service. Teachers do not receive any pre-service training. In the case of in-service training, a human resources development unit has been established to match the needs of TVET actors (including teachers) with the available training programmes provided by national and international partners. Many teacher training activities have been ongoing for several years through a number of international initiatives. Some of the results of these initiatives have been institutionalised (e.g. a number of trainers of trainers have been hired by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and the Ministry of Labour to provide pedagogical support to teachers and trainers in the TVET sector). An additional problem for the TVET sector is the difficulty in hiring qualified teachers in

specific modern professions. Qualified professionals in these areas have no problem finding interesting jobs and are not interested in the benefits package offered to teachers.

In 2010, Palestine introduced a competence-based approach in TVET, which is closely linked to student-centred pedagogy. This approach is currently only adopted in schools and centres of competence that are targeted by international programmes. However, the number of institutions involved is relatively high compared to the total number of TVET providers. The scaling-up of the new methodologies to the rest of the TVET sector could be achieved in a reasonable time span.

Investment in the TVET infrastructure and the renewal of TVET providers is a priority, which is now being matched by the massive presence of donors in the TVET sector. This is helping in the rehabilitation of TVET providers. Workshops, laboratories and general equipment have been upgraded, giving an opportunity to these providers to deliver training in line with labour market requirements. As is the case with many aspects of reform, the sustainability of this upgrading process is closely linked to the improvement of the general political and fiscal crisis in the country. The development of work-based learning could provide a partial answer to this problem.

The introduction of a systemic offer of work-based learning is a great opportunity but also a major challenge given the specific labour market structure in Palestine. The TVET sector is currently piloting a vast number of donor-supported programmes. The lessons learned by these pilots should help to define a national policy for work-based learning. However, the fact that so many companies in Palestine are very small presents several challenges that must be addressed in order to make the system sustainable. A pilot initiative for establishing a dual system programme at higher education level has started at Al-Quds University.

Quality assurance is a pillar of TVET reform in Palestine and several developments have been made within the framework of the centres of competence. The medium-term plan is to scale up the achievements and methodologies implemented in these institutions to all other TVET providers. Palestinian standards for quality assurance for the centres of competence have been derived from several ISO standards and formally approved.

The reform of the TVET sector includes the establishment of a national qualifications framework (NQF). The relevant ministries have approved the concept of the NQF and new methodologies are in the process of being developed to reference existing and new qualifications to the national framework. Progress on this topic is inevitably slow given the complexity of the model, its systemic impact on the different TVET sub-sectors and the need to involve all educational actors (including general and higher education). Progress in the development and implementation of the NQF is necessarily linked to how embedded the competence-based model, which evolved through the curriculum development process, is in the TVET system. The NQF will have widespread implications for the integration of the different educational sub-sectors and only full acceptance of the new model will make these changes appear natural to the different stakeholders. The NQF structure has recently been used to pilot the consistency of qualifications in a given sector (fashion design) at NQF levels. Following this exercise, a methodology for referencing qualifications is being developed.

## Governance

Palestinian stakeholders have been trying to set up a clear and effective governance model for the TVET sector for a long time. After attempting to establish a TVET Agency, they tried to revitalise the Higher Council for TVET. While the TVET Agency would have resulted in a significant power shift in terms of responsibilities and authority in the sector, the Higher Council for TVET does not change the current responsibilities of the different stakeholders, but simply adds a layer of coordination.

This process is happening very quickly and by-laws are currently being developed for the Higher Council for TVET and its Executive Board. There are also plans to establish a Development Centre, which should act as the technical arm of the Higher Council for TVET. It should provide consulting services, research, monitoring and evaluation. It should also develop the relevant tools and standards, as per the directives and policies of the Higher Council for TVET and its Executive Board.

The Higher Council for TVET was not very active in the past and hosted very few meetings. Similar councils in other countries in the region have also been very inactive. This attempt to set up the Higher Council for TVET in Palestine seems more likely to succeed given the strong commitment of all the key actors, who have demonstrated their willingness to cooperate and formulate common policies within the framework of several reform initiatives. It is crucial that the private sector feels that it has ownership of this body to reinforce the focus of the TVET sector on demand rather than supply.

Another reason for optimism regarding the reform of the governance system is that, historically, the main stakeholders have cooperated extremely well at operational level. The two main ministries in the sector (Ministry of Education and Higher Education and Ministry of Labour), together with the Federation of Chambers of Commerce and other non-state actors (e.g. UNRWA, TVET League), have always communicated and cooperated through direct channels. This cooperation has become more formal and even more effective with the establishment of an informal TVET management structure, aimed at coordinating the biggest donors' interventions. This structure included three layers of coordination (policy, technical and operational). Operational coordination is structured in theme-based technical working groups where all key stakeholders are represented. This is an informal structure and should be replicated in some way in the new formal governance model (Higher Council for TVET and the Development Centre).

The Federation of Chambers of Commerce has played a particularly significant role in shaping and implementing the TVET strategy. The federation is involved at all levels (strategic and operational) and is undergoing internal reform to obtain the necessary competences and allocate the necessary resources to play the advanced and active role allocated by the new key processes developed within the framework of TVET reform.

While the public stakeholders cooperate closely with each other, the NGOs involved in TVET also maintain a strong connection. They are established in associations (e.g. League of Vocational Education & Training Institutes) and meet on a regular basis. Previously, the missing link was the coordination between the ministries and the NGOs. However, a new trend is now emerging and NGO associations are more involved in TVET reform, for example by being involved in some of the technical working groups. A significant step in the right direction has been the involvement of the League of VET Institutes in the Higher Council for TVET.

In terms of coordinating partners at local level, the most important development has been the LET councils, which were established in 2014 and are still active. These bodies bring together TVET providers, public stakeholders and private sector representatives and are chaired by the governors. They have played a very important role in several internationally funded programmes by identifying the priorities of the local labour markets and helping to select the best projects to be funded. They meet regularly, even outside international initiatives, but their activism depends very much on the commitment of the governors and their sustainability in the long run should be closely monitored.

The autonomy of government TVET institutions is limited. With the exception of technical and community colleges, the regulations do not support the TVET providers in expanding their services. This means that it is impossible for TVET providers to make use of the funds they raise through the provision of additional services.

### 3. Recommendations for action

#### Vision and progress

- The establishment of the Development Centre is crucial to the effective steering of TVET reform. It would be advisable for the Development Centre to play a policy advisory role but also to perform an operational function. It should be provided with the necessary resources to take over the operational role currently played by the theme-based technical working groups.
- A TVET law should be developed. The law should take stock and provide formal authority to all new institutions and processes developed within the framework of TVET reform. The TVET law should provide formal accreditation for the role of the Higher Council for TVET and the Development Centre.
- The Federation of Chambers of Commerce should continue to encourage sectoral organisations and individual employers to commit to TVET reform and to become more engaged in TVET processes.
- The Development Centre should gradually finalise all revised core processes (e.g. curriculum development, quality assurance) so that the relevant national stakeholders can implement them and identify possible gaps in terms of competences or resources, which could put at risk the sustainability of some of the processes.
- National stakeholders should take a leadership role in trying to cost the new reforms, processes and responsibilities. Ideally, this should be done at the earliest possible stage, in order to have the time to review the reforms in line with the resources available.

#### External efficiency in addressing labour market demand

- Palestine should create an enabling business environment (facilitating the process of starting a business, getting credit, resolving controversies).
- Palestinian authorities should try to establish measures to activate female participation in the labour market. In the context of TVET education, the stakeholders could look into creating new qualifications that are more attractive to girls. They could also make additional efforts to bring vocational training to remote areas and villages. Alternatives to complete gender segregation (separating females and males in different classes and different specialisations) could be sought to increase the female participation rate in TVET and to ensure financial efficiency.
- Palestinian stakeholders should establish a core process to identify labour market needs. This process should exploit the competences and resources recently set up in the form of new units, institutions and tools. The current developments (new TVET units in regional Chambers of Commerce, LET councils, LMIS) represent an excellent starting point, but stakeholders should ensure that the responsibilities of the various actors are complementary and coordinated.
- In terms of reforming the curriculum development process, it is important that representatives of the world of work (employers and workers) take a leading role not only in defining the occupational profiles and required competences, but also in the assessment procedures.
- Once the assessment procedures have been revised in line with the competence-based approach, TVET stakeholders could take into consideration the possibility of establishing mechanisms to validate informal and non-formal learning.
- When developing the NQF, close cooperation should be ensured between the different sub-sectors in education.

- Palestinian authorities should consider applying strict quality criteria in referencing qualifications to the NQF. By referencing only competence-based TVET qualifications to the framework, the TVET sector would gain a lot of credibility with the labour market. A considerable proportion of qualifications have already been revised in a competence-based approach with the support of international programmes. This means that the process of reviewing all remaining qualifications can be realistically planned for the medium term.

### External efficiency in addressing social and inclusion demand

- Efforts to bring TVET training to marginalised areas and to facilitate the mobility of potential students from these areas should continue and possibly be reinforced.
- When implementing the NQF, close attention should be paid to the creation of pathways between training centres dealing with refugees (e.g. Khalandia Vocational Training Institute) and formal education. If pilots are to be launched in this context of including non-formal vocational training in the NQF, these vocational training centres could be considered as one of the first beneficiaries.
- The campaign to increase the attractiveness of TVET should be reinforced by publicising data on the employability of TVET graduates, their salaries and career opportunities as soon as this data becomes available with the establishment of a national monitoring and evaluation system. A very interesting indicator that could be monitored is the percentage of students with high grades who choose TVET education.

### Internal efficiency

- Solutions to increase the efficient use of TVET resources should be investigated. Increasing school autonomy in order to use the resources of TVET providers for income-generating activities and to encourage innovation would probably be the most effective mechanism. Reducing gender segregation in TVET schools could help to ensure cost efficiency too.
- A system for initial teacher/trainer training in the TVET sector, focused on competence-based education and student-centred learning, should be established.
- The current in-service teacher training model based on the human resources development unit should be developed in order to target an increased number of teachers and to help TVET providers who adopt competence-based qualifications without international support.
- Best practices in quality assurance that have been developed in the Centres of Competence should be exported to other TVET providers.
- The successful results of an extensive work-based learning pilot scheme should be used to draw up a national work-based learning policy.

### Governance

- The role of the Development Centre under the auspices of the Higher Council for TVET will become crucial in TVET reform. It is very important that by-laws under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and the Ministry of Labour are developed. It is important that this is done through a participatory process (which includes the private sector, civil society and international partners).
- In order to replicate the success of the technical working groups, the Development Centre should include the participation of a wide group of stakeholders representing the private sector and civil society.

- The recently established process of cooperation between the public TVET sector and the network of NGO training providers should continue and possibly be reinforced. Representatives of the private TVET providers could be part of the Development Centre.
- The role of the LET councils outside the context of international programmes should be reinforced. Their active participation in some of the core processes (e.g. anticipating labour market skills) should be formalised.





# MORE INFO

To find out more about the Torino Process, compile reports, and much more, visit the Torino Process dedicated website at:  
[www.torinoprocess.eu](http://www.torinoprocess.eu)

Torino Process blog: [blog.torinoprocess.eu](http://blog.torinoprocess.eu)

For information on ETF activities please visit:  
[www.etf.europa.eu](http://www.etf.europa.eu)

For any additional information please contact:

European Training Foundation  
Communication Department  
Villa Gualino  
Viale Settimio Severo 65  
I – 10133 Torino

**E** [info@etf.europa.eu](mailto:info@etf.europa.eu)  
**F** +39 011 630 2200  
**T** +39 011 630 2222