CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT FOR VOCATIONAL TEACHERS AND TRAINERS IN TURKEY

CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT FOR VOCATIONAL TEACHERS AND TRAINERS IN TURKEY

PREPARED BY AHMET BESIM DURGUN FOR THE ETF

March 2016

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Contents

See the ANNEXES on the ETF's Continuing Professional Development Platform: **goo.gl/R6lif4**

Annex A. Selection of CPD providing organisations for VET teachers and trainers

Annex B. Selection of key players and their roles In CPD

Annex C. Literature review

Annex D. Survey results

1. RATIONALE

Professional development for teachers and trainers is widely recognised as a vital tool for educational reform. Research demonstrates that professional development can improve the quality of teaching and learning in a sustainable manner, increasing the effectiveness of education and training and adding value for learners, teachers and employers. The importance of continuing professional development (CPD) for VET teachers is not in question. Turkey has, for many years, developed extensive policies to address this issue and current policies are being implemented.

However, improving the quality and quantity of CPD is not easy. To assist policy makers it is vital that policy making, implementation and impact should be reviewed and understood – so that feedback and policy learning occurs.

Therefore, this study is concerned about:

■ setting out current policy objectives with respect to improving CPD for VET teachers and trainers;

■ describing the provision of CPD for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey and the way in which teachers' needs are assessed and particular programmes are assigned to teachers;

■ understanding how the arrangements for CPD fit with other parts of the VET system;

■ evaluating how well current arrangements are working; and

■ making recommendations about how current policies can be implemented and how the provision and allocation of CPD can be improved.

It is intended that this study will bring forward evidence to inform discussion, that it will inform thinking and action at many levels of decision making and that it will stimulate new enquiries and new proposals.

2. METHODOLOGY

In order to provide the basis for policy development and dialogue and to inform the development of demonstration projects a mapping of demand and provision of CPD for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey was carried out. This action involved designing a framework against which to: map provision and demand for CPD; describe provision and demand; analyse provision and demand; and; assess the match between the two. The research was part of a larger regional exercise, which seeks to map and compare provision of CPD for VET teachers across South Eastern Europe and Turkey.

A meeting of stakeholders from across the region took place in Belgrade in March 2015. This provided an opportunity to articulate current policy priorities in the seven participating countries and to review the research methodology and the research tools.

The methodology included **desk work** to review and record documents and published research relating to current CPD for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey (literature review); and **field work** (stakeholder interviews and survey) that involved face-to-face **interviews** with 11 key stakeholders in Turkey participating in the action; and a **survey** of 2 174 teachers in the seven selected provinces.

Due to project limitations on geographical coverage, time and resources, the mapping focused only on CPD for teachers and trainers involved in upper secondary formal VET.

2.1 Interviews

Stakeholder selection was concluded after consultation with MoNE senior officials, ETF country desk, and review of relevant literature. The list of stakeholders included the responsible ministry, the central agency responsible for provision of CPD for VET teachers, principals of VET school or training providers, professional associations and trade unions, institutions providing CPD (e.g. university), employers' representatives and institutions providing training for company-based trainers. The representatives of the following stakeholders were interviewed during July and August 2015.

STAKEHOLDER INTERVIEWS

No	Organisation	Type	Interviews
1	MoNE and relevant line units, Ankara	Ministry	6
2	Hatice Hikmet Oğultürk MTAL, MoNE	Public VET school	1
3	Incirli MTAL, MoNE, Ankara	Public VET school	1
4	Otom. Endüst. İhracat. Bir. MTAL, MoNE, Ankara	Public VET school	1
5	Türk-Eğitim-Sen, Ankara	Teachers' Union	1
6	TEKEV, Ankara	VET Teachers' Foundation	1
7	Gazi University Technical Education Faculty, Ankara	Teacher Training Institution	1
8	TISK, Ankara	Employers' Association	1
9	Hidromek, Ankara	Company-based Training Provider	1
10	Bursa Coşkunöz Vakfı, Bursa	Company-based Training Provider	1
11	Council of Higher Education, Ankara	Higher Education Authority	2

2.2 Literature review

The literature review focused on the last 10 years, identifying and briefly summarising key policy documents in relation to CPD for VET teachers and trainers, descriptions and evaluations of relevant projects, and research focusing on CPD for VET teachers and trainers. Each of the literature items was presented, where available, with a hyperlink to access the online resource, the related keywords, the type of document and a summary of the resource in reference to CPD for VET teachers and trainers.

2.3 Survey

The survey was carried out online. The sample was taken from VET teachers and trainers from all formal upper secondary VET institutions in a total of seven randomly selected provinces out of 81: one from each of the seven geographical regions was the selected target group. In response, 2 174 VET teachers out of 12 753 from 813 MoNE institutions in Ankara, Antalya, Erzurum, Gaziantep, Istanbul, Izmir and Zonguldak accessed and completed the online survey between 25 June and 13 July 2015.

SCHOOLS INCLUDED WITHIN SAMPLE IN ONLINE SURVEY

Province	Number of VET schools
Ankara	157
Antalya	77
Erzurum	44
Gaziantep	57
İstanbul	316
İzmir	131
Zonguldak	31
Total	**813**

Despite the scale and complexity of the survey and its timing, close to the summer holidays and the holy month of Ramadan, the overall response rate was relatively high: 16.7%. This result was achieved because of the strong commitment of Turkish institutions and teachers to this project.

In the survey carried out with the online participation of 2 174 VET teachers from all VET high schools in seven provinces of Turkey, 46% of teachers surveyed were female; 54% were male. Roughly 18% of VET teachers who took part in the survey were younger than 30 years old, 71% were between 30 and 50, and 11% were over 50. Some 84% were teachers, 11% coordinators of practice and 3.5% principals.

Actual sample

The survey achieved the participation of 2 174 VET teachers, principals and practical instructors, however, the data in the table below describes the actual sample based on valid responses.

Province	Number of teachers	Percentage of sample
Istanbul	733	37.4
İzmir	342	17.4
Ankara	450	22.9
Antalya	184	9.4
Zonguldak	53	2.7
Erzurum	67	3.4
Gaziantep	133	6.8
Total	**1 962**	**100**

The following data provide insight into the composition of the VET teacher workforce. Some 25% of participants have been working as teachers for less than five years; 28% between 6 to 15 years; and 47% have been teachers for more than 16 years.

Among those participants, 45% stated that they have worked in their current school for less than three years; 32% said four to ten years; and 23% stated that they have been in their current school for more than 11 years.

Some 23% of teachers had no prior experience in the trade or profession or industry corresponding to their vocational subject, 32% had one to three years of prior experience and more than 45% had more than three years of business experience.

According to the survey, a typical VET teacher in Turkey:

■ is on average 39 years old;

■ has a bachelor's or an equivalent degree;

■ is formally qualified as teacher;

■ has completed an initial educational or training programme that prepares one to be a teacher or instructor;

■ has been teaching for more than 16 years;

■ has been working full-time on a permanent basis in his/her current school for four to ten years;

■ has at least three years of prior industry/business experience corresponding to their vocational subject.

3. POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Continuing professional development of VET teachers and trainers in Turkey has long been a focus for development and a specific reference in key strategic and policy documents such as MoNE Strategy Plan 2010–2014, VET Strategy Document and Action Plan of Turkey 2014–2018, and the draft Teacher Strategy document. Some reference to CPD was given in policy and strategy documents such as National Lifelong Learning Strategy (2014–2018), 10th Development Plan (2014–2018), Vision 2023, and Skills Vision 2020.

Policy and strategy documents are complemented with yearly Teacher Needs Analysis and In-Service Training Plans of MoNE, as well as projects and protocols such as Skills '10, Vocational Skills Development Project (MESGEP), Entrepreneurship Development Protocol, Intel 'Education in the Future' project, and 'No Limit to Teach(ers)' project.

3.1 Policy and strategy documents

MoNE Strategy Plan 2010–2014[1], published on a five-year basis, espouses the use of generic competences for all teachers developed under the 'Strengthening Basic Education in Turkey' (SBEP) project. It considers policy development for teacher training, in-service training and selection, performance evaluation and career progress of all teachers. It refers to supporting teachers from the in-service training stage to participation in training provided by private institutions and continuing education centres of the universities as well as recognizing certificates obtained from attending such courses by MoNE.

VET Strategy document and Action Plan of Turkey 2014–2018[2] refers to central and local planning and implementation of in-service training of TVET managers and teachers. VET TT CPD is also carried out within the scope of national and international projects as well as through cooperative protocols. This document specifies the following priority problem areas with regard to the teaching profession: (i) an inadequate induction training process reducing the professional and institutional commitment of teachers; (ii) the lack of a relationship between in-service training, career development and teacher competences; (iii) the lack of an integrated approach, going beyond bureaucratic formalities in existing CPD practice; and (iv) the lack of effective and efficient mechanisms to ensure personal and professional development of TVET teachers in cooperation with industry.

The **Action Plan** suggests a restructuring of the in-service training model. Provision is proposed as face-to face or through distance learning by accredited enterprises and higher education institutions in accordance with national and local needs analyses. Accordingly, government incentives for enterprises will be made available to provide training for workshop and laboratory teachers and trainers.

Similar problem areas are indicated in the **draft Teacher Strategy document**[3] under the second result 'to improve and maintain professional and institutional commitment of teachers' which is divided into two objectives: 'promoting continuing personal and professional development of teachers starting from the candidacy process' and 'improving career development and reward system'.

The **draft Teacher Strategy document** calls for the modernisation of professional development methods.

---

[1] http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/Str_yon_planlama_V2/MEBStratejikPlan.pdf
[2] www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2014/06/20140608-7-1.pdf
[3] This is a draft document to be finalised later by DG TTD, MoNE.

Mentoring is proposed as a teacher skill in the generic teacher competences. Experiential and action learning methodologies should be used to develop mentoring capability. In this connection, the following are planned: (i) restructuring of the candidacy process; (ii) restructuring of methods, principles and techniques to be used during induction and candidacy training; and (iii) consideration of teaching service in private educational institutions.

The **draft Teacher Strategy document** calls for a balanced approach that takes into account the competences and needs of teachers and MoNE's strategic priorities. In ensuring this balance, the strategy recommends institutionalising a needs assessment, monitoring, orientation and evaluation system at the operational level (province/sub-province) to develop models for provision. Training within the scope of CPD will be credit-rated and will be included in an evaluation during the career progression system. To ensure this, the following are planned: (i) development of a system of professional development and evaluation based on teacher competences; (ii) development of an integrated system for the professional development of teachers, taking into account the operational levels; (iii) reorganisation and promotion of school-based professional development (SBPD) model; (iv) determining a minimum duration for in-service training; (v) cooperating with training providers; and (vi) cooperating with unions for the professional development of their members.

The **draft Teacher Strategy document** also examines ways of improving career progression and the reward system for teachers. Providing career opportunities and a competency based career development plan would contribute to both personal and organisational motivation and performance. However, an evaluation and reward system based on competences using multiple performance criteria is essential in this regard. To ensure this, firstly, the strategic action for restructuring the career system and secondly, the strategic actions for awareness training for training managers and inspectors, as well as establishing ethical codes, are planned.

The **Law 652** defines the main duties of **DG Teacher Training and Development**, the MoNE unit in charge of all CPD activities for managers, teachers, trainers and staff. DG's activities are funded by the central budget. There are 1 868 000 teachers (general subjects and VET) in total. It is difficult to provide CPD to all teachers within a year with the available budget. However, in principle, each teacher is guaranteed at least one CPD activity every two years.

The **National Education Council**, where all stakeholders in the education sector are represented, meets to consider educational policy. Recommendations for national education policies emerge from the Council, which then feed into national policies, strategies and action plans.

3.2 Yearly training needs analysis and in-service training plans

Training needs analysis is initiated yearly through teachers and trainers' personal application via a web portal, which is followed by the school principal, provincial directorate and central approval. Below is a set of findings based on yearly training needs analyses and In-service Training Plans of MoNE.

■ According to **Teachers' Skills Needs Assessment General Results 2012**[4] conducted during June–July 2012 with the participation of 57 358 teachers and managers, which set the basis for the **In-Service Training Plan 2013**[5], CPD needs identified from highest to lowest were educational technology and learning materials development, classroom management, guidance and psychological counselling, special needs education, developmental psychology, learning/teaching theories and methodologies, assessment, and curriculum development. Foreign language education, IT and personal development were other areas of training needs. Accordingly, in-service training courses in leadership and entrepreneurship were provided for

---

[4] http://oyegm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2014_10/27111509_2012ylndadzenlenenhtiyabelirlemeaketigenelsonular.pdf
[5] http://hedb.meb.gov.tr/net/_Plan/2013_plan.zip

teachers and managers of TVET institutions. A total of 91 training events (generally 2–10 days long) for 6 205 participants, 30 810 participant-days in total, were delivered during 2013[6].

■ As per **Teachers' Skills Needs Assessment General Results 2013**[7] conducted during July–September 2013 with the participation of 37 451 teachers and managers, which set the basis for the **In-Service Training Plan 2014**[8], CPD needs from highest to lowest were classroom management, educational technology and learning materials development, assessment, curriculum development, developmental psychology, learning/teaching theories and methodologies, guidance and psychological counselling, and special needs education. Foreign language education, IT, personal development were other areas of training needs. Accordingly, in-service training courses in education management were provided for managers of TVET institutions. A total of 212 training events (generally 2–10 days long) for 6 815 participants, 33 915 participant-days in total were delivered during 2014[9].

■ According to **Teachers' Skills Needs Assessment General Results 2014**[10] conducted during April–June 2014 with the participation of 46 572 teachers and managers, which set the basis for the **In-Service Training Plan 2015**[11], CPD needs from highest to lowest were educational technology and learning materials development, guidance and psychological counselling, classroom management, special needs education, developmental psychology, learning/teaching theories and methodologies, assessment, curriculum development. Foreign language education, IT, personal development were other areas of training needs. Accordingly, in-service training courses in leadership and entrepreneurship, and education management were planned for teachers and managers of TVET institutions. A total of 498 training events (generally 5–10 days long) for 14 875 participants, 76 380 participant-days in total were planned during 2015[12].

3.3   Projects and protocols

Co-designed by the **Ministry of Labour and Social Security** together with government agencies, local communities, social partners and the private business sector, the **Skills '10 (UMEM Beceri '10)** project was launched in 2010 with an initial budget of TRY 119 270 553 (Turkish liras; approximately EUR 40 million). The aim was to reduce the emerging skills mismatches as companies were experiencing skills shortages while about 2.7 million people in Turkey were unemployed at that time (Eurostat, 2010). The programme consisted of research on the most demanded occupations and hence identification of training needs; modernisation of the education and training infrastructure and update of training delivery capacity to match the demands; and provision of guidance, skills development, internships and placement to jobseekers. Within the scope of this project, as a result of the labour market analysis carried out by TOBB Industry and Technology University in 19 industrialized provinces in Turkey, teachers were trained through university-industry partnerships[13].

Vocational Skills Development Project (MESGEP) under MoNE investment programme of 2011–2013 implemented within the scope of social inclusion of disadvantaged groups, focused, among other things, on improving the quality standards of TVET teachers and managers.

Through the **Entrepreneurship Development Protocol** signed between MoNE, Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology (MoSIT) and The Scientific and Technical Research Council of Turkey

---

[6] Only programmes extended at the request of DG TVET and DG Lifelong Learning are included.

[7] http://oyegm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2014_10/27111509_2013ylndadzenlenenhtiyabelirlemeanketigenelsonular.pdf

[8] http://oyegm.meb.gov.tr/dosyalar/planlar/2014_plan.xlsx

[9] Only programmes extended at the request of DG TVET and DG Lifelong Learning are included.

[10] http://oyegm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2014_10/27111509_2014ylndadzenlenenhtiyabelirlemeanketigenelsonular.pdf

[11] http://oyegm.meb.gov.tr/dosyalar/planlar/2015/2015_plan.xlsx

[12] Only programmes extended at the request of DG TVET and DG Lifelong Learning are included.

[13] www.beceri.org.tr

(TUBITAK), to improve the quality of TVET and to promote social awareness about innovation 15 000 managers and teachers have been trained on teaching, leadership and entrepreneurship during 2013–15.

Intel 'Education in the Future' project focuses on increasing computer **literacy for** 120 000 teachers, 20 000 students and 36 000 parents in Istanbul in three years (2013–15).

Teachers Academy Foundation (TAF) launched the project 'No limit to teach(ers)' which covers three main modules: communication skills; classroom management; and measurement and evaluation. The goal of the project is to provide in-service training to 100 000 teachers by 2014. Approximately 4 644 teachers from various regions of the country have been trained so far.

3.4   Conclusion

Turkey is committed, with political vision and with national policy and strategies, to improving CPD for VET teachers and trainers through both national and international resources, national and international projects, and national and local protocols. However, the challenges of geography, demography and finance remain: there are around 3 600 VET schools, over 175 000 teachers, around 3 million VET students, in 81 provinces with varying degrees of economic and social development.

Core provision for VET teachers and trainers through the In-Service Training Plans of MoNE has more than doubled over the last three years, however, less than 1% of teachers' total work force (1 868 000) has participated in these programmes each year. This provision is supplemented by a variety of short-term projects, which sometimes involve partnerships between international, state, private and third sectors. Some 62 protocols have been signed with the social partners and the private sector nationwide. Schools sign protocols with the private sector locally as well. Through recent state subsidies and programmes for the private sector, establishment of VET institutions in the organized industrial zones and initiatives of quality improvement of VET through school-enterprise cooperation and dialogue have gained momentum. However, there is a risk that CPD provision for VET teachers becomes fragmented and that there is a lack of communication and learning between different elements of provision.

Among the main policy and strategy documents such as MoNE Strategy Plan, VET Strategy Document and Action Plan, the draft Teacher Strategy document sets specific goals and priorities in relation to the professional development of teachers. The document proposes an approach balancing the needs of teachers with MoNE's strategic priorities. A competency-based and integrated system for needs assessment, monitoring, orientation and evaluation is recommended at the provincial/sub-provincial level, with further promotion of the school-based professional development model. A competency-based career progression and reward system is also emphasised. One should note here that this is still work in progress, which needs finalisation and implementation.

In speaking about competences as a basis for CPD, one should note that generic teacher competences have already been developed and put in use by MoNE through the Regulation on Appointment and Transfer of Teachers. However, VET teacher competences need further attention. While two VET teacher competences have been identified as pilot in the 'Improving the Quality of Vocational Education in Turkey' (IQVET) project, namely Electrics-Electronics and Public Relations, competences for all VET fields need to be identified.

Main issues	Recommendations
Teachers' professional needs to be balanced with MoNE's strategic priorities	Address professional development needs comprehensively at multiple levels, mobilizing internal and external resources at the institutional, provincial/sub-provincial and central levels, so for example, professional needs relating to national priorities may be the focus of centralised provision, whilst needs relating to schools or individual teachers can be addressed at other levels. Provision should make coordinated use of dedicated budgets at national and provincial/sub-provincial levels as well as special projects and protocols.
Draft Teacher Strategy document to be finalised and action plans to be implemented	Stakeholders should be engaged to develop consensus for finalization and implementation of draft Teacher Strategy document. Draft Teacher Strategy document should be finalised and action plans implemented. Identify internal and external resources to support implementation of the Teacher Strategy document
School-based professional development model to be promoted	The model developed during the School-Based Professional Development (SBEP) project should be reviewed. Support and guidelines to support implementation of School-Based Professional Development should be provided.
CPD information system to be developed	An integrated CPD information system should be developed making it possible to record and analyse CPD demand and provision at all levels.
Competency-based CPD system to be strengthened	VET teacher competences for all VET programmes need to be identified and used to shape CPD.
VET teacher training faculties turned into technological faculties, and this duly cut off the supply of new VET teachers with VET-relevant knowledge, skills and competences. VET teachers lack practical skills	Teachers could be required to participate in 50–60 hours of CPD relevant to their specific needs. A centre of excellence for initial and further training of VET teachers could be established.
CPD in business enterprises to be increased	Industry could be encouraged by the state to promote teachers' apprenticeship in the industry. Incentives for the industry could be provided by the state. The Global Apprenticeship Network could be utilized to facilitate VET teachers' participation in CPD.

4. ORGANISATIONS AND INSTITUTIONS

4.1 A selection of key players in CPD for VET teachers and trainers

Governing institutions

Ministry of National Education (MoNE)

The Ministry of National Education (MoNE) has overall responsibility for all aspects of CPD for VET teachers. With all its relevant line units, including the Directorate General of TVET (DG TVET), Directorate General of Teacher Training and Development (DG TTD), and training institutions, MoNE is actively involved in the design, provision, commissioning, regulation, quality development, needs assessment and funding of CPD for VET teachers and trainers.

MoNE Directorate General of Vocational and Technical Education (DG TVET)

MoNE's Directorate General TVET is responsible for setting and implementing policies related to VET schools and training institutions and strategies strengthening the linkage between education and employment.

MoNE, DG of TVET, Department of Education Policies

MoNE DG TVET's department is responsible for developing strategies, policies, and legislation related to vocational and technical education, promoting VET and access for VET, carrying out studies on research, planning and development of VET, managing the special revenue funds subject to Article 32 of the Law No 3308.

MoNE DG TVET, Department of Social Partners and Projects

MoNE DG TVET's department is responsible for planning and implementing project activities: monitoring and evaluation of research and projects carried out by various institutions in the field of vocational education; developing and carrying out educational projects in cooperation with national and international institutions and social bodies; ensuring the participation of the representatives of chambers and the business world in the processes of vocational and technical education; developing cooperation with the Vocational Qualifications Authority; and cooperating with the related public institutions, sectors and NGOs in the field of vocational and technical education.

MoNE DG TVET, Department of Monitoring and Evaluation

This department monitors: curricula implementation, studies of the related international institutions to improve vocational and technical education and the processes related to use of teaching and learning materials. It also carries out studies related to students' academic and life-long achievement.

MoNE DG TVET Department of Quality Improvement

This department is responsible for accreditation of TVET institutions, supporting self-evaluation process in schools, validating and certifying quality development and improvement plans of schools drafted as a result of the self-evaluation process. It carries out on-site validation of evidence presented as a part of the monitoring and evaluation process and provides relevant guidance for schools accordingly. It identifies training needs of teachers, managers and other staff and carries out relevant in-service training activities and shares best practices in relation to VET quality improvement. It organises annual reporting on quality as well as serving as the National Reference Point on these issues.

MoNE Directorate General of Teacher Training and Development (DG TTD)

DG TTD is in charge of setting policies related to identifying and developing teacher qualifications and competences. It provides or commissions pre-service and in-service training for ministry teachers and training staff working in private education institutions when requested. DG TTD develops new courses and organizes seminars, symposiums, conferences and activities as well as carrying out research and surveys related to teacher training. DG TTD cooperates with other public institutions and organisations, universities and NGOs to organise joint activities.

MoNE DG TTD, Department of Support for Professional Development and Monitoring

This department is responsible for developing orientation and candidacy training for newly appointed teachers. It develops and delivers training programmes for teachers' in-service training; monitors international developments related to in-service training of teachers. It measures the outcomes of training programmes taking remedial actions when appropriate.

MoNE DG TTD, Department of Teacher Qualifications and Quality Development

This department is responsible for identifying and developing teacher qualifications and competences. This involves: working to improve teachers' levels of work and performance in line with teacher competences; identifying and developing teacher competences in line with established policies; working on professional career promotion and rewarding of teachers; establishing competency based certification for teachers.

Council of Higher Education

The Council of Higher Education is another key player in terms of CPD demand and provision. It is an autonomous public body in charge of regulating all higher education and guiding higher education institutions through duties and responsibilities set forth under Law No 2547.

Clients

MoNE Hatice Hikmet Oğultürk Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School

VET High School established in 1977 with current enrolment of 517 formal and 160 open education students. The school is led by a principal, a senior deputy principal, and five deputy principals, with 80 teachers. Programmes extended currently include food and beverage services, child development and education, graphics and photography, C&IT, garment production, handicraft, beauty and hair care.

MoNE İncirli Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School

VET High School established in 1987 with current enrolment of 1 780 students. The school is led by a principal, a senior deputy principal, a technical deputy principal, a coordinating deputy principal, and four deputy principals, with 120 teachers. Programmes extended currently include furniture and interior design, electronic and electrical technology, C&IT, mechanical technology, metal technology, and automotive technology

MoNE Union of Automotive Industry Exporters Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School

VET High School established by the Union of Automotive Industry Exporters in 2010 according to the protocol signed between the Union and MoNE, with current enrolment of 516 students. The school is led by a principal, a senior deputy principal, and four deputy principals, with 62 teachers. Programmes offered currently include electronic and electrical technology, C&IT, industrial automation, automotive technology, mechanical technology, and metal technology.

Social partners

Confederation of Turkish Employers' Associations, TISK

Some 22 employer associations are confederated under TISK with the following aims: (i) ensuring harmonious relations among themselves; (ii) encouraging and maintaining good human relations between employers and workers; (iii) taking necessary steps to adapt working conditions to the country's economic development trends; (iv) supporting employer associations regarding collective bargains and agreements; and (v) developing employer positions on subjects relating to labour life and shedding light on public policies. It also supports research on related issues and organises training events.

Turkish Union of Public Servants in Education, Training and Science Services, Türk-Eğitim-Sen

Founded in 1992, with more than 500 000 members and organised in 110 branches, Türk-Eğitim-Sen is a teachers union with the highest constituency in the public education sector.

Technical Education Foundation, TEKEV

Founded in 1987, TEKEV is a foundation to improve the technical education quality of Turkey by supporting VET teachers and students. The foundation implements grant projects to improve qualifications of VET teachers, and offer scholarship programmes to VET students.

Public and private providers

Gazi University Technical Education Faculty

Gazi University Technical Education Faculty is the leading teacher education university faculty in Turkey with eight VET teacher-training programmes. Due to a change in policy, regular teaching activities in the faculty will cease in 2015/16.

Bursa Coşkunöz Education Foundation

Coşkunöz Education Foundation holds a 'Public Benefit Foundation' status, and receives its revenues from profit shares of Coşkunöz Holding companies and grants, and nearly all revenue is spent on technical training. The foundation provides training to technical instructors employed by the Ministry of National Education and continues to work consistently to meet vocational technical training requirements of the private, public sectors and the community. The 'Vocational Training Programme' is the first and most important project of CEV. Hundreds of students have graduated from this programme since 1988 and most of them were employed in various industrial enterprises, according to their technical abilities.

Hidromek

Established in 1978, Hidromek, Inc. is a leading manufacturer of construction machinery, located in Ankara. The company has a training centre and organises regular CPD activities for their employees. The company has more than 20 'master teachers' acting as trainers.

Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey Turkish Institute of Management Sciences, TÜSSİDE

Turkish Institute of Management Sciences (TÜSSIDE) was established in 1980 as a result of collaboration agreement between Ministry of National Education and Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK) in order to perform training, consulting, research and publication in the area of administrative sciences. Having its own team of experts, facility designed with the focus on education, and 35 years of field experience, TÜSSIDE has run more than 500 large-scale projects and provided training to more than 300 000 middle and high rank administrators in public sector. In addition, TÜSSIDE signed agreements of collaboration with universities in order to improve its proficiency in the areas of its expertise.

International donors

The European Union, World Bank, British Council and JICA are among the international donors actively involved in improving the quality and quantity of CPD for VET teachers and trainers. Additionally, there are bilateral agreements with countries such as the UK and China.

VET teachers and trainers participated in CPD activities within the scope of the METGE Project, the SVET Project, the Secondary Education Project, HRD-VET Project and the IQVET Project in areas such as skills needs analysis, labour market analysis, occupational standards development, training needs analysis, outcome based-curriculum development, learning materials development, outcome based assessment, learner-centred methodology, assessment, entrepreneurship, leadership, change management, project cycle management and business management.

Industrial automation training is currently on going within some of the JICA projects. Groups of teachers have also participated in study visits to Japan. A number of teachers were sent for training for two-month, three-month or one-year periods in some EU funded projects. Some 260 teachers will be sent to Germany and Italy for a one-month training via the Lifelong Skills Programme of the National Agency. They will receive one week training in schools and spend the rest of the period in industrial companies. Currently, 262 teachers are enrolled in the Erasmus Plus and IPA projects.

In order to improve effectiveness and efficiency of projects funded by national or international donors, namely, doing the right things versus doing the things in the right manner, they should be designed and implemented in accordance with the key national and international policies. Stakeholder involvement from the design to development and implementation, as well as review of the projects is also essential to ensure the sustainability of these projects.

4.2   Conclusion

MoNE is the key player in CPD for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey: being the main employer of VET teachers and trainers and the main commissioner of CPD. In addition to its main role in initial teacher training the Council of Higher Education through universities is also a leading provider of CPD for VET teachers and trainers. Furthermore, MoNE strongly encourages and regulates additional provision of CPD for teachers through other means, for example, through protocols with training organisations, companies and donors.

CPD opportunities for teachers provided by the main national and international stakeholders are various: ranging from pedagogical to human resource management, and strictly technical and vocational subjects at EQF levels 5, 6, 7 and 8. Public and private training institutes such as TÜSSİDE, TODAIE, Coşkunöz Education Foundation, Hidromek and Festo Didactic, major industrial companies, such as Ford, Oyak-Renault, Arçelik, TOFAŞ-Fiat, Mercedes-Benz, Hyundai, Toyota, Vestel and BSH, as well as universities, NGOs and other third sector organisations make short cycle and long cycle formal and non-formal training courses available. Additionally, online resources, such as EdX, Coursera, the Khan Academy and Turkcell Akademi are available.

Opportunities for practical training in the industry, which usually exist where school-industry linkages are strong, are most welcome by the teachers and trainers.

There is diverse public and private sector provision of various kinds of CPD for VET teachers and capacity has expanded in response to policy and to funding. Overall, however, current providers do not meet the CPD needs of VET teachers across Turkey. Linkage of VET institutions with higher professional training institutions and universities may be an area for improvement, as international trend of VET knowledge-skills-competences triad is on the increase, and this becomes more and more academically oriented as technology progresses. Though universities provide CPD for VET teachers through the continuing education centres and faculties in areas requiring specific academic and high

technical skills, cooperation between secondary VET institutions and post-secondary-non tertiary VET institutions and universities may be improved through involvement in projects in university Technotowns (Teknokent) and Organized Industrial Zones (OIZ-OSB).

Main issues	Recommendations
Knowledge about CPD provision and capacity to plan and shape CPD at the institutional/school level is not adequate and provision is not systematic.	A system for evidence-based management of CPD provision at the institutional/school level should be in place.
Linkage of VET institutions with higher education institutions/universities to be strengthened.	VET schools and teachers need to be encouraged to familiarize themselves with and get involved in research and development projects and activities led by universities in the organized industrial zones and techno towns.
Capacity for different kinds of CPD provision is distributed between different providers.	Cooperation and knowledge sharing between different CPD providers and users should be supported for improvement and value for money.
Economic, geographic and demographic differences exist.	Regional VET Plans could be developed, considering the regional differences, as well as strengths, weaknesses, and opportunities available within each region. 12 NUTS statistical regions could be utilized for this purpose.
Parents encourage their children for further education through direct vertical transfers from secondary VET to post-secondary/non-tertiary VET (MYOs) rather than placement/employment in the industry.	Open Higher Vocational Schools (MYOs) could be established to allow opportunities for secondary VET graduates to work and study simultaneously.
CPD opportunities to be made publicly available.	Diiferent CPD opportunities including e-learning and MOOC could be publicised for VET teachers by MoNE in a portal. Universities such as Anadolu University could be encouraged to get involved in MOOC for VET teachers.

.

5. VOLUME, MODE AND CHARACTER OF CPD PROVISION

CPD provision for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey operates at three levels: central, provincial and local. Provision may be in-house, commissioned or outsourced, funded by (a) school's own resources such as revolving funds; (b) MoNE's central budget; and (c) national or international donors through projects and/or protocols.

Figures on CPD provision at the central level, for all teachers, can be seen in yearly in-service training plans of MoNE. Accordingly, while In-Service Training Plan for 2014 demonstrates that 212 training events (2–10 days long) for a total of 6 815 teachers were planned in education management, the number of training days and participants as well as programmes has more than doubled in the Plan for 2015: namely 498 training events (generally 5–10 days long) for a total of 14 875 participants has been planned in areas such as leadership and entrepreneurship, education management, and practical assessment and questioning techniques.

The teacher survey provides data on the number of hours of CPD that teachers experienced during the course of the 12 months prior to the survey (June 2015). This includes all CPD whether it is centrally or locally provided. The length of provision was put under three categories in the survey: from zero to less than two hours; two to less than 30 hours; and 30+ hours.

Roughly about 1 100 out of 2 174 teachers had access to CPD within the last 12 months. More precisely, about 42% of teachers participated in organized CPD out of school; and 47%, in school-based CPD. Topics of CPD included pedagogy, curriculum, student evaluation and assessment practices, ICT skills for teaching, student behaviour and classroom management, teaching students with special needs, new technologies in the workplace and student career guidance and counselling.

Some 29% of respondents have conducted observation visits to other schools over the last 12 months. Teachers in Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep have participated around the average; whereas those in Zonguldak, and Erzurum have participated less than the average.

Some 49% of teachers have participated in observation visits or in-service training courses that took place in business premises over the last 12 months. Teachers in Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep have participated around the average; whereas those in Zonguldak, and Erzurum have participated less than the average.

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES (DURING THE LAST 12 MONTHS)

Topic	Number of participants and %	Total number of responses
Knowledge and understanding in my subject field (s)	1 240	1 976
	63%	
Pedagogical competences in teaching my subject field(s), including giving feedback to learners	1 256	1 949
	64%	
Knowledge of the curriculum	1 116	1 963
	57%	
Student evaluation and assessment practices	1 178	1 952
	60%	
ICT (information and communication technology) skills for teaching	1 291	1 965
	66%	
Student behaviour and classroom management	1 241	1 942
	64%	
Approaches to individualised learning	1 154	1 943
	59%	
Teaching students with special needs	1 029	1 927
	53%	
Teaching cross-curricular skills (e.g. problem solving, learning-to-learn	1 003	1 907
	53%	
Approaches to developing cross- occupational competences for future work (e.g. enterprise skills)	1 042	1 891
	55%	
New technologies in the workplace	1 122	1 909
	59%	
Student career guidance and counselling	1 011	1 888
	54%	
Updating my professional knowledge and skills in relation to current practice in the workplace	1 029	1 890
	54%	

About 36% of teachers have reported that CPD they undertook over the last 12 months had a focus on their vocational specialism. Teachers in Istanbul, Ankara, and Izmir have participated above the average, whereas those in Antalya, Gaziantep, Zonguldak, and Erzurum have participated less than the average.

If we consider the duration and mode of CPD, we find that the most common was events lasting three days or more (18.5%). Interviews with stakeholders and official data confirm that training events lasting five days are regarded as the 'normal' mode of provision for CPD for VET teachers. This kind of event is commonly organised during vacations in the form of a residential programme. It is common for such events to be located in MoNE's in-service training centres in resort areas and for teachers to be accompanied by their families. Around 12% of teachers reported that shorter events of less than one day or one to two days were often organised. It was uncommon for teachers to experience CPD in the form of sustained learning over a longer period of time (only 4.5% said this was often the case). However, research suggests that this is a particularly effective form of CPD.

When one considers the CPD activities VET teachers took part in during the last 12 months, 75% of participants are involved with a group of colleagues from their school; 68% have had opportunities for active learning methods (not only listening to a lecturer); 70% have been engaged in collaborative learning activities or research with other teachers; and 73% undertook CPD in new technologies, including IT. However, this survey finding implies that 25% of teachers did not experience any of the above modes at all; and more than 40 % only experienced such modes sometimes.

We observe some difference between provinces in terms of place and type of CPD provision. Approximately, 47% of total teachers have attended conferences or seminars (where teachers and/or researchers present their research results and discuss educational issues) over the last 12 months. Teachers in Istanbul (more than 49%), Ankara (51%), Izmir (more than 50%) and Erzurum (52%) have participated more than the average (47%); and those in Zonguldak (less than 24%), and Gaziantep (less than 38%) less than the average.

In terms of hours of observation visits or in-service training courses that took place in business premises, the trend seems to be similar: teachers in Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep are above or near the average (49%); whereas teachers in Erzurum and Zonguldak participated below the average, 45% and 33% respectively.

In terms of hours of observation visits to other schools, teachers in Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep participated above or near the average (29%); whereas teachers in Erzurum and Zonguldak participated below the average, 23% and 16% respectively.

5.1   Conclusion

The volume of central provision has more than doubled over the last three years. This provision has been focused on leadership, management and entrepreneurship and usually took the form of an extended block of five days during the vacation. However, the provision has not met the volume or the range of needs estimated in the official Needs Analysis. According to the training needs analysis 2012, 57 358 teachers and managers identified their CPD needs in educational technology and learning materials development, classroom management, guidance and psychological counselling, special needs education, developmental psychology, learning/teaching theories and methodologies, assessment, and curriculum development. In fact in-service training courses in leadership and entrepreneurship were provided for 6 205 participants during 2013. A similar mismatch can be observed in 2013 and 2014 (see table below).

Whilst there is evidence of extensive provision of CPD to VET teachers, in addition to core central provision, through short-term projects (public, third sector and donor) there is no record of the overall annual volume and composition of provision of CPD for VET teachers at national or provincial level nor of the overall trend in provision.

TRAINING NEEDS ANALYSIS AND CPD PROVISION MISMATCH AT THE CENTRAL LEVEL

Year	Number of teachers declaring needs	Areas of training needs stated	In-service training planned numbers	Focus of training
2012	57 358	Educational technology and learning materials development	–	–
2013	37 451	Classroom management	6 205	Leadership and entrepreneurship
2014	46 572	Guidance and psychological counselling Special needs education Developmental psychology Learning/teaching theories and methodologies Assessment Curriculum development	6 815	Education management
2015	–	–	14 875	Leadership and entrepreneurship Education management

According to the teacher survey carried out for this research around 42% of VET teachers received some CPD in the last 12 months whilst just 19% received more than 30 hours. Teachers were more likely to receive some school-based CPD (47% received some) but only 10% received more than 30 hours of this kind of CPD. The volume of CPD delivered in business premises in Turkey, was relatively high – 30% of VET teachers benefited from more than 30 hours whilst a further 19% had at least two hours.

Broadly speaking, the survey data demonstrates differences between provinces in terms of CPD provision: the five largest metropolitan provinces enjoy more CPD opportunities than the other two provinces. Survey findings suggest that teachers in industrialized and/or developed areas such as Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep benefited from CPD delivered in business premises more than the provinces of Erzurum and Zonguldak. The same holds true for teachers' attendance to conferences and seminars, as well as observation visits to other schools.

The survey sample suggests that the average age of teachers is between 30 and 50 years. Teachers in this age group were more likely to participate in CPD in the form of conferences and seminars than in other modes. CPD in business premises was the most common mode for under 30 and over 50 age groups. One should note here that teachers younger than 30 had the least CPD opportunities in almost all modes listed in the survey: 57% had not attended conferences and seminars; 76% had no observation visits to other schools; and 56% had no CPD in business premises.

The volume of CPD provision has increased more than two fold over the last three years and has been supplemented by a range of provision, particularly through projects and through partnerships involving companies. However, total provision is insufficient to meet professional development needs. Core centrally funded provision focuses upon national strategic priorities and does not address the broader variety of identified training needs of VET teachers and VET schools. Centrally provided CPD events usually take the form of residential programmes during vacations, which include a social dimension. CPD opportunities are affected by geography and by the age and experience of teachers.

5.2   Recommendations

Main issues	Recommendations
Excess demand for CPD at the central level	Further internal and external resources at the local, provincial and central levels need to be identified to address this need. Mechanisms should be put in place to meet these needs at appropriate levels.
Central CPD provision does not correspond well to teachers' stated needs	Explore whether improved matching can be achieved by making better use of data on needs and exploring opportunities for convergent provision, e.g. addressing multiple needs.
Broader discussion is needed to develop shared understanding of CPD needs for VET teachers	VET teacher competences need to be identified, which will serve as framework to provide for VET-specific needs of teachers.
More CPD provision is required to meet the needs of VET teachers	Explore diverse modes of provision in order to meet diversity of needs and address issues of value for money and impact. In-house dissemination by teachers participating CPD could be encouraged. CPD activity could be planned during the two-week blocks during closing and opening of the school year: CPD activity could be held during the two-week block in June and in-house dissemination could be planned/ enforced during two-week block in September.

6. DESIGN, CAPABILITY AND QUALITY OF CPD PROVISION AND PROGRAMMES

In Turkey the responsibilities for design, delivery and quality assurance of CPD for VET teachers differ for provision at central, institutional and project level. Central provision is intended to be based on the training needs analysis carried out online. However, over the last few years design had been shaped by national strategic priorities.

The providers and/or the lead trainers/master trainers design the programme according to the format and template provided by MoNE for in-service training programme, which include the title, learning objectives, duration, target group, specific guidelines for delivery and implementation, content (a training plan illustrating topics and duration in hours), training methodology, and assessment. The provision at the level of vocational schools varies: it may be in the form of college, department or subject (zümre) of teachers meeting for teachers in a specific vocational field, or a formally designed training led by a fellow teacher or an expert from the industry. Both forms are designed either in the form of a meeting agenda or a training plan. Provision at the project level is designed on the basis of relevant project results and outcomes and generally follow typical terms of reference and usually a modular training programme.

DESIGN, VENUE, QUALITY ASSURANCE AND LEVEL OF ORGANIZED CPD PROVISION FOR VET TEACHERS AND TRAINERS

	Central and provincial CPD	School-based CPD	Project-based CPD
Design	By trainers and experts in close cooperation with MoNE Department requesting the CPD in accordance with the guidelines provided by DG TTD	By teachers or trainers in cooperation with the Principal or relevant school department or subject (zümre) in accordance with needs provided by the school department	Project component in cooperation with the project beneficiary in accordance with the project's terms of reference
Provision	Professional trainers and experts, or MoNE field experts and teachers	Professional trainers and experts, and MoNE field experts and teachers	Contracted experts or trainers
Venue	Schools, hotels, MoNE, university or business premises	Schools or business premises	MoNE premises and schools or hotels
Quality assurance	Regular feedback collected after delivery: mainly administrative	Occasional feedback collected after delivery	Regular feedback collected after delivery: administrative and content related

DG TTD has developed the generic teacher competences and two vocational competences for VET teachers. Some 26 vocational competences are in development. So far only the generic teacher competences have been put in use[14]. Along with the school-based professional model, DG TTD intends to utilize those vocational competences for selection, performance evaluation and career progress for VET teachers, as well as a basis for CPD.

---

[14] MoNE, Regulation on Appointment and Transfer of Teachers, *Official Gazette*, No 29329, 17 April 2015

MoNE, as the main provider and commissioner of CPD for VET teachers and trainers, follow Law 5018 on Fiscal Administration and Control, allocates the resources for CPD from the general budget, which is drafted in accordance with performance criteria set forth in the strategy and action plans, each spending unit.

Annex B[15] shows how the system functions are allocated to some of the key institutions involved in CPD The table below shows how the system functions are allocated to some of the key institutions involved in different kinds of CPD.

Additional national and international resources are available through projects, protocols and bilateral agreements with private, public and third sector institutions and organisations, such as the European Commission, the World Bank and development agencies. Design and quality assurance are defined within the confines of each project, protocol, or agreement. Such resources generally reflect and are aligned with Turkey's national and international policy and strategic priorities laid out in key policy elements such as 10th Development Plan (2014–2018), Vision 2023, and Skills Vision 2020, Government Plans, and EU-Accession process, National Lifelong Learning Strategy (2014–2018), MoNE Strategy Plans, and VET Strategy Document and Action Plan.

There are regular training needs analyses carried out online on a yearly basis with the participation of more than 35 000 individual teachers, which set the grounds for in-service training plan of the following year. Due to limited resources, only a selection of teachers can participate. In-service training programmes are usually delivered during summer mainly so as not to interfere with teacher's engagement during the school year. Programmes are delivered in several MoNE premises along the coast to encourage attendance, as well as keep the costs low. Lately, in-service training programmes have been carried out in third-party locations such as hotels and universities, which lead to higher costs. With scarce resources, efficiency of such provision is rather challenging: fewer teachers are able to participate due to higher costs. However, in order to ensure fair allocation of resources, there is a principle loosely followed by the DG TTD for teachers to ensure participation of at least one in-service training opportunity every other year.

Demand for in-service technical training in the industry is fairly high among VET teachers, certainly pointing out the need for familiarizing oneself in the new and changing technologies.

The connection between the training needs analysis and planned VET CPD provision has been a major challenge for the last few years: MoNE's institutional strategic priorities of in-service training have overtaken the design rather than allowing the training needs analysis to shape it. The quality of centrally provided training programmes is monitored through ex post evaluation. However, this focuses on administrative rather than content or impact evaluation, thus limiting the potential for improving the content quality and impact. Each participant is provided with a certificate of completion, which until recently had been considered as a tool for career progress and salary promotion. This practice has lately been abandoned in compliance with a judicial order, which has caused dismay among teachers.

The quality assurance of CPD activities carried out within the scope of projects, protocols and agreements is usually more content related. Ex post evaluation of CPD activities within the framework of EU-funded VET reform projects, such as the SVET Project, the HRD-VET Project and the IQVET Project, to name a few, have all involved content related feedback and reflection of these in the prospective activities.

---

[15] goo.gl/R6lif4

The survey of teachers provides evidence of how teachers judged the impact of various kinds of CPD (see table below).

	No training on this topic	Training had no positive impact	Small positive impact	Moderate positive impact	Large positive impact	Don't know	Responses
Knowledge and understanding in my subject field (s)	736 37.2%	85 4.3%	222 11.2%	400 20.2%	340 17.2%	193 9.8%	1,976
Pedagogical competences in teaching my subject field(s), including giving feedback to learners	693 35.6%	83 4.3%	233 12.0%	434 22.3%	306 15.7%	200 10.3%	1,949
Knowledge of the curriculum	847 43.1%	98 5.0%	228 11.6%	355 18.1%	257 13.1%	178 9.1%	1,963
Student evaluation and assessment practices	774 39.7%	95 4.9%	249 12.8%	381 19.5%	281 14.4%	172 8.8%	1,952
ICT (information and communication technology) skills for teaching	674 34.3%	112 5.7%	256 13.0%	413 21.0%	353 18.0%	157 8.0%	1,965
Student behaviour and classroom management	701 36.1%	95 4.9%	224 11.5%	427 22.0%	329 16.9%	166 8.5%	1,942
Approaches to individualised learning	789 40.6%	88 4.5%	228 11.7%	374 19.2%	283 14.6%	181 9.3%	1,943
Teaching students with special needs	898 46.6%	75 3.9%	221 11.5%	307 15.9%	223 11.6%	203 10.5%	1,927
Teaching cross-curricular skills (e.g. problem solving, learning-to-learn	904 47.4%	89 4.7%	184 9.6%	314 16.5%	225 11.8%	191 10.0%	1,907
Approaches to developing cross-occupational competencies for future work (e.g. enterprise skills)	849 44.9%	73 3.9%	211 11.2%	308 16.3%	260 13.7%	190 10.0%	1,891
New technologies in the workplace	787 41.2%	83 4.3%	214 11.2%	331 17.3%	322 16.9%	172 9.0%	1,909
Student career guidance and counselling	877 46.5%	89 4.7%	184 9.7%	318 16.8%	230 12.2%	190 10.1%	1,888
Updating my professional knowledge and skills in relation to current practice in the workplace.	861 45.6%	70 3.7%	193 10.2%	312 16.5%	273 14.4%	181 9.6%	1,890

Around 35% to 50% of the total respondents reported that their CPD participation had a positive impact on their teaching. More than 12% of all respondents reported a large positive impact across all kinds of CPD. If we consider only those teachers that participated in CPD we can say that for most forms of CPD around 30% report no or low impact, about 35% report medium impact, while around 30% report high impact. This confirms that most of the CPD provided is valued by teachers, however, it does imply differential impact upon teachers. This may be because the quality of the CPD they receive differs or it may relate to the issue of how well the CPD they receive is matched to their needs.

Conclusion

Design, delivery and quality assurance of CPD for VET teachers differ for provision at central, school and project levels.

From the range of CPD in which teachers report participation, it appears as though overall there is already considerable capacity in Turkey to design CPD, which meets the needs of teachers. These programmes result from a variety of provision at central and local levels and through projects. Delivery and design include contributions and partnerships involving universities, businesses, specialist training companies, VET teachers and international partners.

There are systems for quality assurance and design in operation for different kinds of provision. However, we do not have evidence to judge how well these processes work. However, it does appear to be the case that quality assurance and evaluation are more demanding in the case of project driven CPD than in the core centrally provided CPD. It also appears to be the case that the design of centrally driven CPD is shaped more by government priorities than by inputs from teachers, schools and other stakeholders.

According to teachers the impact of CPD on teaching has been moderate to high for around 60% of participating teachers. Around 30% of participating VET teachers report that impact was high, whilst for another 30% impact was low or zero.

Main issues	Recommendations
Designers of CPD programmes focus on particular competences which do not always match needs.	Explore whether CPD can be designed to address multiple or integrated teaching competences.
Accreditation for different CPD providers and programmes follows diverse procedures and it is not clear how consistent and effective these processes are.	Accreditation of CPD providers and programmes should be reviewed.
Timing of CPD programmes is not always conducive to learning and may intercept a school year when teachers are busy with teaching and administrative responsibilities.	Teachers involved in CPD programmes may be relieved from their administrative and teaching responsibilities for the duration of the programme, with a backup plan.
Impact analysis of CPD programmes usually does not take place and evaluation may be limited. Baseline and ex post evaluation rarely practiced, if ever…	CPD programmes to include an appropriate form of evaluation (e.g. impact analysis) Master CPD trainers could be selected based on a specific set of criteria and their performances could be evaluated accordingly. Learners' evaluation of teacher could be encouraged.
Centrally provided CPD usually takes the form of extended residential programmes.	The effectiveness of different modes of CPD should be explored. Two-week blocks of CPD provision could be considered. The time spent during CPD activity could be considered as additional teaching hours (ek ders) and compensated accordingly.

7. SCHOOL-BASED PROVISION

School-based CPD for VET teachers and trainers includes induction and general and/or administrative introduction of newly appointed teachers and mentoring and in-service training in an array of topics related to both generic and vocational teacher competences for teachers.

A new **mentoring and performance evaluation system** has been introduced in April 2015 to be in operation during the 2015/16 school year, principles of which are laid out in MoNE Regulation on Appointment and Transfer of Teachers published in the Official Gazette of 17 April 2015, No 29329. The regulation stipulates that performance of newly appointed teachers will be evaluated by the school principal and the mentoring teacher, once in the first term of appointment and twice in the following term, namely three times in total during their candidacy. The performance evaluation of teachers is based on a performance evaluation form to be filled by the assessors in line with 10 professional criteria and 50 indicators related to generic teacher competences: educational planning, arranging learning environments, using communication skills effectively, motivating students in line with learning outcomes, using environmental facilities to support learning, managing time, using educational methods and techniques efficiently, assessing teaching and learning process, adapting and contributing to school's educational policies and demonstrating behaviours and attitudes required for the teaching profession. The mentor (or Advisor) observes the candidate teacher's work in connection to professional criteria (generic teacher competences) providing guidance to the candidate during performance evaluation process and reporting to the school principal in fulfilling such duties.

According to the survey, 69% of respondents reported that they took part in an induction programme in their first employment as teachers; 51% stated that they participated in informal induction activities that are not part of an induction programme; and 66% said that they have taken part in a general and/or administrative introduction to the school.

Around 8% of respondents, i.e. 166 teachers, have a year or less teaching experience requiring a mentor to be assigned by regulation. 16% of 1 900 teachers reported that they had an assigned mentor

Some 390 out of 1 900 teachers have served as an assigned mentor for teachers for a month or longer. 80% of such teachers reported that they have received training to support their work as a mentor of teachers.

School-based CPD appears to be the most widespread form of CPD in Turkey: 47% out of a total of 2 174 teachers reported that they have participated in in-house organized CPD during the last 12 months; 37% stated that they had 2 to 30 hours of in-house CPD, and 10% had more than 30 hours.

In addition to CPD, the survey provides insight into the extent to which teachers work collaboratively. Some 51% of teachers stated that they took part in planned discussions with other teachers in their school relating to their teaching within the last month; 48% have had planned discussions with managers or with pedagogic advisors relating to their teaching; and 53% have had informal discussions with other teachers or with managers or pedagogic advisors relating to their teaching. This data suggests that there is considerable potential to increase the extent to which VET teachers work collaboratively.

The Department of Quality Improvement established within the DG TVET in 2014 has a mandate to accredit, monitor and evaluate the quality of TVET institutions. Identifying training needs of TVET teachers, manager and staff at the school level is among the mandates of this department. While this department monitors the self-evaluation process in TVET institutions, the Presidency of Guidance and

Inspection supports internal evaluation. During the implementation phase of 'Improving the Quality of VET in Turkey' (IQVET) project, a 'Toolkit for Self-Evaluation' of schools has been developed and made available for 60 pilot institutions implementing the self-evaluation pilot. The kit specifies activities or enablers for schools, among which are staffing, partnership and resources, and staff outcomes all of which have CPD implications. Department of Quality Improvement ensures tailoring and promoting this kit for the use of all VET schools in Turkey. There is currently no evidence available yet as to how self-evaluation is linked to CPD planning and provision.

Partnerships, protocols and projects play an important role in CPD provision. There are more than 60 national and international protocols, six national projects, seven international projects, more than 2 000 school projects, and 179 school protocols under the auspices of the DG TVET, some of which involve an element of CPD for VET teachers. VET CPD greatly benefits from these resources. Simply through school protocols with the industry, 425 teachers participated in CPD until June 2015 this year. According to the survey, almost 30% of Turkish VET teachers benefited from more than 30 hours of CPD on business premises over the last 12 months.

Conclusion

School-based VET CPD for teachers is a key element in the overall CPD provision, complementing the central provision. The survey suggests that perhaps 50% of CPD for VET teachers in Turkey is school-based.

Interviews suggest that VET school principals try to meet training needs of their staff by exploiting CPD opportunities at all levels: school, local, province and national.

New requirements for mentoring have been introduced recently. The survey suggests that VET teachers are receiving mentoring and mentors are receiving training. However, there is lack of evidence as to how well this is working in practice.

About half of VET teachers are working collaboratively.

With the challenge of scarce resources for more than 175 000 VET teachers, MoNE welcomes all initiatives on the part of the industry and schools to develop projects, partnerships and protocols to support improving the quality of VET provision in Turkey. A large number of national, international and school projects and protocols are a testament that all key players in VET are proactive in addressing arising needs.

Main issues	Recommendations
Central provision does not meet the needs of all VET teachers. Residential training is relatively expensive.	School-based provision expanded to help meet training needs and tailored to local needs.
53% of VET teachers had no in-school CPD in the last 12 months.	School-based training needs analysis can be conducted to identify the needs. CPD can be provided in-house or commissioned or negotiated with provincial/local authorities and partners.
Lack of evidence on how self-evaluation is linked to CPD planning and provision.	Schools' self-evaluation process may be used as an opportunity for quality improvement and impact evaluation of CPD provision. Priority areas may be identified and resourced.
Mentoring available only for newly appointed teachers.	Mentoring could be a mode of professional development not only during initial appointment but also during the course of teaching service.

8.   PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT NEEDS

Training needs analysis for teachers and trainers is initiated yearly through teachers and trainers' personal application for CPD via web portal. Applications are analysed and assessed centrally by the MoNE unit responsible for the CPD activity. Approval of CPD for each teacher is confirmed by relevant MoNE unit. For VET teachers, this is either by the DG TVET or DG Lifelong Learning.

Though the DG TTD has developed a school-based professional development (SBPD-OTMG) model and relevant tools, the challenge to implement this model on a wider basis remains. Schools hold departmental (zümre) meetings at the beginning of each school year. This is also a venue for discussing CPD for teachers. School-based CPD provision is usually discussed, identified and planned during the departmental meetings.

The survey supports this: in a question on whose responsibility it was to identify professional needs and to find suitable training, 74% of survey participants reported that it was their own responsibility. 36% stated that it was done with the help of their school (employer). Only 41% recounted that there was a well-defined process for assessing their training needs and then providing suitable training, for example, through an annual professional development plan.

DG TTD has developed 10 generic teacher competences during the SBEP Project and two vocational competences for VET teachers during the IQVET Project. Some 26 vocational competences are still in development. Along with the school-based professional model, DG TTD intends to utilize those vocational competences for selection, performance evaluation and career progress for VET teachers, as well as a basis for CPD.

Though DG TTD carries out yearly training needs analyses in coordination with all MoNE line units, MoNE's strategic priorities have taken the upper hand for the last three years. There is clearly a mismatch between individual teachers' needs and central provision. Proactive steps apparent in projects, protocols or bilateral agreements made at the central, provincial and institutional levels help to address this gap. School-based CPD and CPD on business premises make an important contribution to the volume and diversity of provision.

The table below provides evidence of needs across a range of CPD domains. The first column provides the percentage of Turkish VET teachers that expressed a need for training in a particular domain. These are high figures reflecting teachers' ongoing training needs. The third column records the percentage of those VET teachers who received no training at all who stated a need for this particular kind of training: these teachers training needs were not addressed at all[16].

Approximately 45% of respondents received scheduled time for activities, which took place during regular working hours. Some 16.6% received supplements to their salary and 17% received non-monetary support e.g. study leave.

---

[16] The total responses (N) vary by item because not all individuals answered all questions.

VET TEACHERS DECLARED TRAINING NEEDS AND TRAINING NEEDS AS PERCENTAGE OF TEACHERS NOT RECEIVING SPECIFIED TYPES OF TRAINING

	% of respondents with declared need	Number of valid cases	% of respondents with declared need who have not participated in desired training in last 12 months	Number of valid cases
Knowledge and understanding in my subject field	75.5	2 099	36.2	1 502
Pedagogical competences in teaching my subject field	65.4	2 106	32.9	1 279
Knowledge of the curriculum	62.4	2 100	39.8	1 224
Student evaluation and assessment practices	61.2	2 097	37.4	1 199
ICT skills for teaching	68.8	2 103	32.9	1 345
Student behaviour and classroom management	62		34.9	1 212
Approaches to individualised learning	75.2	2 098	39.7	1 453
Teaching students with special needs	79.8	2 088	45.8	1 519
Approaches to developing cross-occupational competences for future work	78.6	2 044	44.0	1 468
New technologies in the workplace	83.3	2 064	41.6	1 573
Student career guidance and counselling	81.1	2 053	46.2	1 508
Updating my professional knowledge and skills in relation to current practice in the workplace	74.6	2 055	45.1	1 394

Conclusion

There is a centralized systematic approach to identify teachers' CPD needs in MoNE: a yearly training needs analysis is carried out online via teachers' individual applications. The TTD approves applications and assigns programmes. It is reported that, as a rule of thumb, the TTD seeks to ensure that each teacher participates in one CPD activity every other year. The TTD considers whether an applicant had training the previous year and whether they request CPD relating to a key priority, such as new technologies. Needs assessment at school level is still in development and it is not clear to what extent Principals are able to obtain CPD for their staff to meet the needs that they identify.

The survey suggests that if we consider aggregate provision and total need there is a deficit for each category of CPD of at least one third[17].

Main issues	Recommendations
Implementation of school-based professional development (SBPD-OTMG) model is not compulsory.	Explore what factors are holding back implementation of school-based professional development model and provide support and guidance as appropriate.
The professional development needs of VET individual teachers are not addressed in a long-term manner.	Explore ways in which the professional development needs and aspirations of individual teachers can be communicated and reviewed so that these needs can inform provision. Consider how such a process can help to integrate provision at multiple levels.
VET-specific professional development needs are not identified on a systematic basis.	Make use of the identified VET teacher competences (when completed) to assist the diagnosis of needs and the design of CPD.
There is a lack of teacher motivation and energy among VET teachers due to long working hours (currently 47 hours a week).	Realistic teaching and administrative workload could be assigned.

---

[17] This is the deficit which is not addressed at all rather than the 'full' need which was expressed by around two thirds of teachers for each type of CPD.

9. TEACHER FEEDBACK AND REVIEW

Teachers receive feedback from their colleagues such as the school principal or school manager, their assigned mentor or fellow teachers, on the one hand, and from external bodies or individuals such as school inspectors.

The survey presents the following facts:

	External individuals or bodies	School principal or school managers	Assigned mentor	Other teachers	I have never received this feedback in this school	Responses
Feedback following direct observation of your classroom teaching	203 9.9%	969 47.4%	145 7.1%	372 18.2%	678 33.1%	2,046
Feedback from student surveys about your teaching	115 5.7%	517 25.7%	112 5.6%	290 14.4%	1,109 55.1%	2,011
Feedback following an assessment of your content knowledge	150 7.5%	579 28.8%	140 7.0%	419 20.8%	942 46.8%	2,011
Feedback following an analysis of your students' test scores	114 5.6%	1,131 56.0%	107 5.3%	327 16.2%	539 26.7%	2,018
Feedback following self- assessment of your work (e.g. you present of a portfolio of your planning work)	118 5.9%	762 38.0%	109 5.4%	310 15.5%	879 43.9%	2,004
Feedback following surveys or discussions with parents or guardians	165 8.2%	528 26.4%	102 5.1%	255 12.7%	1,100 54.9%	2,002

Some 67% of teachers received feedback following direct observation of classroom teaching; 45% received feedback from student surveys; 53% had feedback following an assessment of content knowledge; 73% received feedback following an analysis of students' test scores; and 56% had feedback following self-assessment of one's work. Finally, 45% of teachers received feedback following surveys or discussions with parents or guardians. The main source of feedback is the school principal.

The table below illustrates the extent to which teacher feedback has led to a positive change in various aspects.

The impact of feedback from highest to lowest, seems to be on teachers' confidence, motivation, job satisfaction, public recognition, teaching practices, changing job responsibilities, knowledge and understanding of the subject field(s), use of student assessment, classroom management practices, and so on. For about 47% of VET teachers, feedback helped to shape CPD.

	No positive change	A small change	A moderate change	A large change	Don't know	Responses
Your public recognition from the principal and/or your colleagues	214 11.7%	284 15.5%	683 37.3%	441 24.1%	209 11.4%	1,831
Your role in school development initiatives (e.g. curriculum development group, development of school objectives)	241 13.4%	357 19.8%	627 34.8%	229 12.7%	346 19.2%	1,800
Likelihood of your career advancement (e.g. promotion)	581 32.1%	278 15.4%	437 24.1%	269 14.9%	246 13.6%	1,811
The amount or type of professional development (in-service training) you undertake	342 19.0%	389 21.6%	596 33.1%	259 14.4%	216 12.0%	1,802
Your job responsibilities at this school	244 13.6%	306 17.0%	685 38.1%	401 22.3%	161 9.0%	1,797
Your confidence as a teacher	163 9.0%	252 14.0%	574 31.8%	685 37.9%	132 7.3%	1,806
Your salary and/or financial bonus	992 54.9%	231 12.8%	286 15.8%	154 8.5%	144 8.0%	1,807
Your classroom management practices	230 12.8%	387 21.6%	671 37.4%	360 20.1%	147 8.2%	1,795
Your knowledge and understanding of your main subject field(s)	255 14.2%	362 20.2%	625 34.9%	394 22.0%	157 8.8%	1,793
Your teaching practices	210 11.8%	361 20.3%	651 36.5%	427 24.0%	133 7.5%	1,782
Your methods for teaching students with special needs	320 18.1%	343 19.4%	535 30.3%	277 15.7%	290 16.4%	1,765
Your use of student assessments to improve student learning	226 12.6%	370 20.6%	692 38.6%	367 20.4%	140 7.8%	1,795
Your job satisfaction	342 18.9%	303 16.8%	589 32.6%	443 24.5%	129 7.1%	1,806
Your motivation	322 17.9%	301 16.8%	572 31.9%	487 27.1%	113 6.3%	1,795

Conclusion

Some 45% to 73% of teachers received some form of feedback from internal and external sources. That feedback had positive impact for around 37% to 84%: with 37% on salary and/or financial bonus as the lowest impact; and 84% on teacher's confidence as the highest. The survey suggests that feedback can be a mechanism for recognising and confirming VET teachers and to some extent to changing teaching practices. There are opportunities to make greater use of a wider variety of feedback sources with a focus on improving the quality of teaching and learning. Feedback could also be used to help to identify and plan CPD to a greater extent.

Main issues	Recommendations
Feedback to teachers offers an opportunity for identifying and communicating development need and evaluating impact of CPD.	Explore how greater use of different kinds of feedback might be supported and encouraged alongside improvements in CPD.

ETF Working together Learning for life

10. FUNDING

CPD for VET teachers and trainers is funded by numerous sources: from the general budget of MoNE to external sources created via projects, protocols or bilateral agreements at the local, national and international levels. Teachers contribute to a certain extent as well. In the past the EU has been a major funder of teacher training in Turkey and there are prospects, through IPA, that the EU will support teacher training for VET teachers and trainers through to 2020.

According to the survey, around 21% of teachers reported that they have covered some or all of the cost of CPD they have had within the last 12 months. 79% of teachers reported that all of the cost was met by their schools or the training providers. According to DG TTD estimates, the average cost of a 5-day 30-hour in-service training is around TRY 750–850, or around EUR 250.

In the In-Service Training Plan of MoNE for 2015, it is reported that about 500 training events (generally 4–5 days long) for a total of 15 000 participants has been planned for central provision for VET teachers and managers. This represents an investment of more than EUR 2 million per annum. It is clear from this research that there is also substantial provision of in-school CPD as well as provision through projects and protocols, including substantial provision in partnership with employers.

At this stage we are not able to report the total spending on CPD for VET teachers, nor able to break this down by level or type. We cannot therefore make comparisons between the costs of different kinds of CPD provision, examine trends in spending or explore value for money. Further, it has not been possible to explore whether the mechanisms for commissioning and managing CPD budgets are contributing to high quality, cost effective provision.

Conclusion

CPD for VET teachers and trainers is funded by numerous sources: from personal to external. Teachers report that their schools or the training providers mainly cover the cost of CPD. Although a fair amount of resources are allocated for CPD centrally, it only covers about 9% of the VET teachers' work force. Further analysis of funding data would assist efforts to improve the provision of CPD for VET teachers in Turkey.

Main issues	Recommendations
Funding systems impact upon the quantity and quality of provision	Further exploration of how CPD is funded

11. RECOGNITION AND INCENTIVISATION

A recognition and reward mechanism for CPD had been operational for teachers' participation and certification of in-service training activities until recently. This ceased after a lawsuit opened by a teacher's union. There are currently no formal requirements for CPD for teachers, except for the one introduced in MoNE Regulation on Appointment and Transfers of 17 April 2015, which is applicable for candidate teachers. DG TTD's work on identifying vocational and professional competences of VET teachers, complementing the Board of Education Decision No 80 on principles of appointment for teachers according to area of specialization, and the intention to use the competences in selection, candidacy, rewarding and career progress of VET teachers is a welcome move.

Participation in CPD is still rewarding and has positive impact on teaching for many teachers, as the survey suggests. More than 90% of teachers who participated in CPD activities within the last 12 months reported some positive impact. The impact of feedback received by teachers from their colleagues and external bodies and individuals may also be a driving force for improvement: building confidence, motivation, job satisfaction, public recognition, improvement in teaching knowledge, skills and understanding, changing job responsibilities in their school motivate teachers to take part in CPD.

Conclusion

There are currently no formal requirements for CPD for teachers, except for the one introduced in MoNE Regulation on Appointment and Transfers of 17 April 2015, which is applicable for candidate teachers, based on generic teacher competences. Once VET teacher competences have been identified, they may be used in decisions regarding planning and provision of CPD.

The survey suggests that teachers and trainers are still motivated to participate in CPD activities for various personal and professional goals. Introducing incentives may help teachers to participate in CPD activities and improve the quality of VET in Turkey.

Main issues	Recommendations
No formal requirement for CPD participation	Consideration to be given to ways of recognising CPD, for example, through certification. The teacher competences could provide a framework to inform certification.
Teachers encouraged to improve their knowledge and experience, and follow technological review and developments	A rewarding and career progress system to be established. A performance appraisal system considering employment of graduates as one among other performance criteria could be integrated. Senior officials such as the school principal and provincial director could be allowed to issue rewards for motivated teachers. This reward could be in terms of payments and employee's personal rights.

12. TRAINING OF COMPANY-BASED TRAINERS (AND TRAINERS IN TRAINING CENTRES)

Article 31 of Law No 3308 on Vocational Education and Training is in effect for company-based trainers, namely training masters (usta öğretici) in Turkey. The article states that those who have been awarded a master's certificate may be awarded a training master's certificate, on the condition that they successfully complete the 40 hour course provided by MoNE According to the same law. There must be a training master supervising student placement at the company if there are more than eight apprentices or students doing practical training in enterprises. The courses are provided by adult education centres. Courses are regularly inspected and the certificates are generally respected by employers.

Companies train their foremen, engineers and management staff in their respective training departments or centres, which are enforced to establish under Law 3308. There is no public institution to provide CPD for training masters. Enterprises provide this service themselves, and on their own initiative. Training masters get training in their respective fields and systems they use. There is no periodic training for training masters. If there is an innovation in the field, CPD becomes a requirement. Some employers expressed the view that further training and refresher courses for masters would be desirable.

In the company training centres, more professional trainers are appointed. Engineers train teachers and trainers if the course is about a technical subject. Additionally, staff development courses are extended in these centres. Training masters suggest training topics to their supervisors and a budget is allocated from the company resources for training.

No public funds are utilised. Some financial support is available through the implementation of the UMEM project. All expenses are covered by the company resources budget. No funding support exists.

There are no standard qualifications for training masters except for the existing occupational standards and the pedagogical requirement to become a training master.

During the interviews, the consulted employers state that a mentorship system for training masters is needed in companies. MoNE should train training masters periodically and participation must be mandatory.

Conclusion

Article 31 of Law No 3308 on Vocational Education and Training defines the role of company-based trainers, namely training masters (usta öğretici) in Turkey. Training masters are in charge of student placement in the workplace. They act as liaison between the company and the VET school, working closely with the coordinator teacher overseeing student placement.

There is no specific public institution providing CPD for training masters. Enterprises provide this service themselves with their own resources. No public funds are available for CPD for training masters. Some financial support is available through implementation of the UMEM project.

There are no standard qualifications for training masters except for the existing occupational standards and the pedagogical requirement to become a training master.

A mentorship system for training masters is needed in companies. MoNE should train master teachers periodically and participation must be mandatory.

Main issues	Recommendations
Further training needed for training masters in the companies	MoNE to offer refresher courses periodically, based on needs assessment. Financial implications (such as cost of master trainer's leave during the course) and topics to be covered in these courses could be identified and agreed by all stakeholders through social dialogue.
Mentoring needed for company trainers	Cooperation between MoNE, Council of Higher Education, and industry to develop and support a system of mentorship for training masters.

13. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Turkish VET and labour market systems are established to a certain extent, with strong industry and state engagement to align with globalizing competitive economies both through national and international resources. MoNE is the key player of both systems as well as CPD for VET teachers and trainers in Turkey. Core provision for CPD for all teachers and trainers through MoNE has more than doubled over the last three years, rising to an annual target in 2015 of 498 training events (generally 5–10 days long) for a total of 14 875 participants. However, this implies that less than 1% of teachers' total work force (1 868 000) has participated in these programmes each year. This core provision is supplemented by school-based CPD and by a variety of short-term projects, which sometimes involve partnerships between international, state, private and third sectors. Partnership and cooperation between education and the private sector has been encouraged and this includes substantial provision of CPD for teachers with or in businesses. This research reveals that, over the last 12 months, about 42% of VET teachers in Turkey participated in all kinds of organized CPD out of school and 47%, in school-based CPD. Topics of CPD included pedagogy, curriculum, student evaluation and assessment practices, ICT skills for teaching, student behaviour and classroom management, teaching students with special needs, new technologies in the workplace and student career guidance and counselling.

Core centrally funded provision focuses upon national strategic priorities (e.g. management, entrepreneurship) and does not address the broader variety of identified training needs of VET teachers and VET schools. The high demand for in-service training and the task of aligning the country's strategic and institutional goals, along with limited financial resources from MoNE's central budget, are formidable challenges. Currently, total provision is insufficient to meet professional development needs.

The draft Teacher Strategy document[18] sets specific goals and priorities in relation to professional development of teachers. The document proposes an approach balancing the needs of teachers with MoNE's strategic priorities. A competency-based and integrated system for needs assessment, monitoring, orientation and evaluation is recommended at the provincial/sub-provincial level, with expansion of a school-based professional development model. A competency-based career progression and reward system is also emphasized. One should note here that this document is still a work in progress, which needs finalization, resourcing and implementation.

Generic teacher competences have already been developed and put in use by MoNE through Regulation on Appointment and Transfer of Teachers. However, VET teacher competences for all VET fields need to be agreed and subsequently these competences should help shape CPD provision.

CPD opportunities for teachers provided by the main national and international stakeholders are various: ranging from pedagogical to human resource management and strictly technical and vocational subjects at EQF levels 5, 6, 7 and 8. Public and private training institutes, major industrial companies, as well as universities, NGOs and other third-sector organisations make short cycle and long cycle formal and non-formal training courses available. Additionally, online resources are available. Opportunities for practical training in industry, which usually exist where school-industry

---

[18] This is a draft document to be finalised later by DG TTD, MoNE.

linkages are widely available: 49% of Turkish VET teachers have participated in observation visits or in-service training courses that took place in business premises over the last 12 months.

From the range of CPD in which teachers report participation, it appears as though overall there is already considerable capacity in Turkey to design CPD, which meets the needs of teachers. These programmes result from a variety of provision at central and local levels and through projects. Delivery and design include contributions and partnerships involving universities, businesses, specialist training companies, VET teachers and international partners.

Whilst there is evidence of extensive provision of CPD to VET teachers through short-term projects (public, third sector and donor) there is no record of the overall annual volume and composition of provision of CPD for VET teachers at national or provincial level nor of the overall trend in provision. There is a risk that CPD provision for VET teachers becomes fragmented and that there is a lack of communication and learning between different elements of provision.

CPD opportunities are affected by geography and by the age and experience of teachers. Broadly speaking, the survey data demonstrates differences between provinces in terms of CPD provision: the five largest metropolitan provinces enjoy more CPD opportunities than the other two provinces. Survey findings suggest that teachers in industrialized and/or developed areas such as Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Antalya and Gaziantep benefited more from CPD delivered in business premises than those working in the provinces of Erzurum and Zonguldak. The same holds true for teachers' attendance of conferences and seminars, as well as observation visits to other schools. Teachers younger than 30 had the lowest participation in CPD.

Design, delivery and quality assurance of CPD for VET teachers differ for provision at central, school and project levels. There are systems for quality assurance and design in operation for different kinds of provision. However, we do not have evidence to judge how well these processes work. There is evidence that quality assurance and evaluation are more demanding in the case of project-driven CPD than in the core centrally provided CPD. It also clear that the focus of centrally driven CPD is shaped more by government priorities than by needs analysis arising from teachers, schools and other stakeholders.

According to teachers the impact of CPD on teaching has been moderate to high for around 60% of participating teachers. Around 30% of participating VET teachers report that impact was high, whilst for another 30% impact was low or zero.

School-based VET CPD for teachers is a key element in the overall CPD provision, complementing the central provision. The survey suggests that perhaps 50% of CPD for VET teachers in Turkey is school-based. Interviews suggest that VET school principals try to meet training needs of their staff by exploiting CPD opportunities at all levels: school, local, province and national.

New requirements for mentoring have been introduced recently. The survey suggests that VET teachers are receiving mentoring and mentors are receiving training. However, there is lack of evidence as to how well this is working in practice. About half of VET teachers are working collaboratively.

There is a centralized systematic approach to identify teachers' CPD need: the Teacher Training Division (TTD) of MoNE carries out a yearly training needs analysis via teachers' individual online applications. The TTD approves applications and assigns programmes. It is reported that, as a rule of thumb, the TTD seeks to ensure that each teacher participates in one CPD activity every other year. The TTD considers whether an applicant had training the previous year and whether they request CPD relating to a key priority, such as new technologies. Needs assessment at school level is still in development and it is not clear to what extent Principals are able to obtain CPD for their staff to meet

the needs that they identify. The survey suggests that if we consider aggregate provision and total need for CPD for VET teachers there is a mismatch for each category of CPD of at least one third[19].

Some 45% to 73% of teachers receive some form of feedback from internal and external sources. According to VET teachers, feedback has a positive impact: 84% report positive impact on confidence and 37% on salary. The survey suggests that feedback can be a mechanism for recognising and confirming VET teachers and to some extent to changing teaching practices. There are opportunities to make greater use of a wider variety of feedback sources with a focus on improving the quality of teaching and learning. Feedback could also be used to help to identify and plan CPD to a greater extent.

There are currently no formal requirements for CPD for teachers, except for the one introduced in MoNE Regulation on Appointment and Transfers of 17 April 2015, which is applicable for candidate teachers, based on generic teacher competences. Once VET teacher competences are identified, they may be used in decisions regarding planning and provision of CPD.

The survey suggests that many teachers and trainers are motivated to participate in CPD activities for various personal and professional goals. Demand for CPD exceeds availability although teachers identify some barriers, for example, timing and the relevance of the offer. Introducing incentives may help teachers to participate in CPD activities and improve the quality of VET in Turkey.

CPD for VET teachers and trainers is funded by numerous sources: from personal to external. Teachers report that their schools or the training providers mainly cover the cost of CPD. It was difficult within this research to determine how much was spent on CPD for VET teachers at central, provincial and institutional levels. Further analysis of funding data would assist efforts to improve the provision of CPD for all VET teachers in Turkey.

Article 31 of Law No 3308 on Vocational Education and Training defines the role of company-based trainers, namely training masters (usta öğretici) in Turkey. Training masters are in charge of student placement in the workplace. They act as liaison between the company and the VET school, working closely with the coordinator teacher overseeing student placement.

There is no specific public institution providing CPD (as opposed to initial training) for training masters. Enterprises provide this service themselves, and with their own resources. No public funds are available for CPD for training masters. Some financial support is available through implementation of the UMEM project.

There are no standard qualifications for training masters except for the existing occupational standards and the pedagogical requirement to become a training master.

Stakeholders in companies identified the need for a mentorship system for training masters. MoNE should provide ongoing training for masters and participation should be mandatory.

Recommendations

With regard to the CPD system, MoNE, provincial authorities, VET schools, CPD providers and other stakeholders and social partners should:

1. consider evidence and hold discussions to develop consensus for policies on CPD for VET teachers and trainers;

---

[19] The need is closer to two thirds if we consider all those expressing a training need in each field.

2. finalise the draft Teacher Strategy document and implement corresponding action plans;

3. identify internal and external resources to support the implementation of the Teacher Strategy document;

4. address professional development needs comprehensively at multiple levels, mobilizing internal and external resources at the institutional, provincial/sub-provincial and central levels, so for example, professional needs relating to national priorities may be the focus of centralised provision, whilst needs relating to schools or individual teachers can be addressed at other levels;

5. explore opportunities to identify and address professional development needs at provincial and local levels to ensure that training needs are well targeted and impact can be monitored;

6. develop coordinated financial planning for CPD including the use of dedicated budgets at national and provincial/sub-provincial levels as well as special projects and protocols;

7. develop (integrated) CPD information system(s) making it possible to record and analyse CPD demand, provision and feedback at institutional, central and individual teacher level;

8. strengthen coordination between private and public CPD providers and cooperation between CPD providers and their clients.

With respect to CPD provision, MoNE, CPD providers, VET schools and stakeholders should cooperate to:

9. share knowledge and practice in order to bring about quality improvement and value for money, and use self-assessment procedures and in-service training module of MEBBIS for this purpose;

10. agree and put in place a system for evidence-based management of CPD provision at the institutional/school level, and use self-assessment procedures and in-service training module of MEBBIS for this purpose;

11. identify how further internal and external resources, at the local, provincial and central levels, can be identified to address this need, ensure that Provincial Employment and VET Councils could be the venue to explore, identify and publicise CPD opportunities at the provincial levels;

12. explore and share the appropriateness, effectiveness and availability of diverse modes of provision of CPD in the Turkish context, e.g. coaching, e-learning, in order to meet diversity of needs and address issues of value for money and impact;

13. explore how CPD can be designed to address multiple or integrated teaching competences, e.g. methodological, vocational and transverse;

14. ensure that all CPD programmes include an appropriate form of evaluation (e.g. impact analysis, individual review);

15. encourage mentoring as a mode of professional development not only during initial employment but also during the course of teaching service;

16. explore what factors are holding back the implementation of school-based professional development and provide support and guidance by experts in the field with the help of third-sector organisations as appropriate;

17. carry out local and provincial and central needs analyses and explore whether needs identified at one level, e.g. at central level, might be met at another level, e.g. at school level;

18. identify specialised VET teacher competences on a regular basis and in sync with technological progress and make use of these definitions (when completed) to assist the diagnosis of needs and the design of CPD;

19. explore ways in which the professional development needs and aspirations of individual teachers can be identified, communicated and reviewed so that these needs can inform provision;

20. engage VET schools and teachers in research and development projects and activities led by universities in the organized industrial zones and techno towns;

21. select master CPD trainers based on a specific set of criteria and evaluate performance of the master trainers accordingly.

With respect to school-based needs identification and CPD, MoNE, CPD providers, VET schools and stakeholders should cooperate to:

22. review the model developed during the School-Based Professional Development (SBEP) Project in the light of experience, by the experts in the field;

23. support training needs assessment at school level;

24. support school-based planning and coordination of CPD, including both in-house provision and the commissioning or negotiation of provision with provincial/local authorities and partners, including other schools;

25. set up minimum standards for master trainers and service providers.

With respect to funding of CPD, MoNE, CPD providers, VET schools and stakeholders should cooperate to:

26. explore how CPD is funded with a view to understanding total spending on CPD, the cost of different kinds of provision, trends and the cost of different modes;

27. explore different mechanisms for commissioning CPD and managing CPD budgets from the point of view of financial efficiency;

28. explore how additional funding can be made available for use at appropriate levels of provision to meet CPD targets and how contributions might be obtained from employers, schools and other partners.

With respect to recognition and incentivization of CPD, MoNE, CPD providers, VET schools, social partners and other stakeholders should cooperate to:

29. make use of VET-specific defined teachers' competences (when completed) to recognise professional development;

30. encourage teachers to work and learn collaboratively, for example, by making further use of feedback and observation, e.g. peer review;

31. make more use of school self-evaluation as a tool to identify training needs, target resources and monitor the quality and impact of CPD;

32. explore ways to certify CPD nationally and/or internationally. The teachers' competences could provide a framework to inform the development of qualifications, e.g. modular post-graduate degrees;

33. find ways to relieve teachers undertaking CPD programmes of their administrative and teaching responsibilities for the duration of the programme.

With respect to industry-education partnership and cooperation, MoNE, CPD providers, the Council for Higher Education, VET schools, social partners and other stakeholders should cooperate to:

34. allow company-trainers to deliver VET in schools;

35. design, fund and provide periodic mandatory refresher courses for company-based training masters, based on needs assessment;

36. develop and support a system of mentorship for training masters;

37. provide support for company trainers to help them to provide training for students on placement, engage VET providers and chambers in this process;

38. encourage and support the training of VET teachers that are provided by or in partnership with business.

CONTACT US

Further information can be
found on the ETF website:
www.etf.europa.eu

For any additional information
please contact:

European Training Foundation
Communication Department
Villa Gualino
Viale Settimio Severo 65
I – 10133 Torino

E info@etf.europa.eu
F +39 011 630 2200
T +39 011 630 2222

Join the Continuing Professional
Development Platform here:
goo.gl/xcs9Dw