VET Education Policies and Practices for Social Inclusion and Social Cohesion in *Turkey*

Research Workshop February 18-20, 2013, Turin

**Başak Yavçan, PhD**

*Assistant Professor of Political Science at TOBB University of Economics and Technology*
1. Methodology of the country case study – overview

2. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

3. Findings from local level research in schools/localities
   - Selection and tracking (RT2)
   - Drop-out (RT3)
   - Patterns of education, apprenticeship systems and social inclusion (RT4)
   - Transition from education to work (RT5)

4. Comparative analysis of relation between vocational education, social inclusion and social cohesion across 3 case study schools/localities

5. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels
1. Methodology of the country case study – overview

2. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

3. Findings from local level research in schools/localities
   - Selection and tracking (RT2)
   - Drop-out (RT3)
   - Patterns of education, apprenticeship systems and social inclusion (RT4)
   - Transition from education to work (RT5)

4. Comparative analysis of relation between vocational education, social inclusion and social cohesion across 3 case study schools/localities

5. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels
Methodology of the country case study

Ankara: 2 VET Schools
Istanbul: 1 VET School
Distance between the two cities 454 km
Methodology of the country case study

• 3 schools

  1. Girls’ Vocational School, Ankara
     • Well performing school
     • Variety of depts. ranging from design to food processing
     • Well integrated with the industry and internationally

  2. Industrial Vocational School, Ankara
     • Medium performing school
     • Medium integration with the industry and internationally

  3. Boys’ Industrial Vocational School, Istanbul
     • Well performing school
     • Very well integrated with the industry and internationally
       (approximately 20 projects being coordinated at the moment)
Methodology of the country case study

Why Istanbul?
1) Many think tanks and big industries dealing w/VAT are located in Istanbul
2) There is a large variety of businesses actively engaged with VAT
Methodology of the country case study

• National Advisory Board consisting of
  – Ministry of Education representatives
  – School Principles
  – Chamber of commerce representative
  – External researcher working on the topic
  – Research team
• Held 2 meetings, 3rd scheduled for Feb 21st
• Reviewed major issues to be focused on
• Reviewed questionnaires
• Reviewed/advised on contact points
• Help recruit teachers, students, drop-outs
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. LEVEL (national)</th>
<th>2. LEVEL (local)</th>
<th>3. LEVEL (sub-local)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MoNE</td>
<td>Provincial National Education Director</td>
<td>Alumni Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Mr. Yaşar</td>
<td>1) Ankara, Mr. Fikret</td>
<td>1) Kartal Vocational High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Mrs. Özlem</td>
<td>2) Istanbul, Mr. Erol</td>
<td>2) Küçükyalı Vocational High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Politicians</td>
<td>Provincial Employment Offices Vocational High Schools</td>
<td>The Center of Vocational Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Justice and Development Party (AKP)</td>
<td>4) Istanbul, Mr. Erol</td>
<td>3) Director, Mr. Tamer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Peace and Democracy Party (BDP)</td>
<td>5) Istanbul, Mr. Selçuk</td>
<td>4) Director, Mr. Turgay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Republican People's Party (CHP)</td>
<td>6) Ankara, Mrs. Oya</td>
<td>The Chamber of Craftsmen anddrop-outs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Nationalist Movement Party (MHP)</td>
<td>Trade Union</td>
<td>Director, Mr. Yunus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Union of Chambers (TOBB)</td>
<td>Deputy Secretary General, Mr. Selçuk</td>
<td>Interns' Workplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Vice Specialist, Mr. Saygin</td>
<td>Deputy Secretary General, Ankara</td>
<td>Hairdresser, Mr. Özgür</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) Specialist</td>
<td>Industry Union</td>
<td>Prosthodontist, Mr. İlhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Reform Initiative (ERG)</td>
<td>6) ISO Specialist, Mr. Hakan</td>
<td>Ottomotive sector, Mr. Metin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) Coordinator, Batuhan</td>
<td>7) ASO Deputy Secretary General, İstanbul</td>
<td>7) Industrialist, Mr. Nusret</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Policy Research Fnd.</td>
<td>9) ISO Specialist, Mr. Hakan</td>
<td>8) Otomotive sector, Mr. Metin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9) Koç Holding</td>
<td>10) Provincial Director (IST), Mr. Muammar</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10) Researcher, Mrs. İdil</td>
<td>11) Semih Teacher</td>
<td>11) İsmail Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist, Mrs. Burcu</td>
<td>12) Provincial Director (ANK)</td>
<td>12) Ilkşengül Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkish Industry and Business Association</td>
<td>13) Fatma Teacher</td>
<td>13) İsmail Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11) Specialist, Mrs. Ebru</td>
<td>Ostim The Center of Education Counseling</td>
<td>Şenol Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13) Vice Specialist, Mr. Eser</td>
<td>14) Deputy Director, Mr. Gökhani</td>
<td>14) Şenol Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15) Teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td>15) Şenol Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16) Headworker</td>
<td></td>
<td>16) Fatma Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17) Intern</td>
<td></td>
<td>17) Şenol Teacher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Methodology of the country case study

- Interviews with individuals from 1st, 2nd, and 3rd level
  
  **13 interviews from the first level:**
  - 2 interviews with Ministry of National education
  - 3 interviews with national interest groups
  - 4 interviews with MPs
  - 3 interviews with think tanks/NGOs

  **12 interviews from the second level:**
  - Local branches of Ministry of National Education, Employment Agency, Local level unions – teachers’, craftsmen and artisans, trade and industry, Members of Province Employment and Vocational Education Boards, governor of organized industry site,

  **About 30 interviews from the third level:**
  - Apprenticeship schools, alumni organizations, teachers in various branches as well as guidance and counseling 3 partner schools (2 in Ankara, 1 in Istanbul), students with high achievement (recipient of scholarships), dropouts, interns currently working in industry, partner businesses, school family unions
Methodology of the country case study

• Interviews with individuals from 1\textsuperscript{st}, 2\textsuperscript{nd}, and 3\textsuperscript{rd} level
Methodology of the country case study

• Focus groups
  – Conducted with groups of drop outs varying in numbers from 5-10.

• Surveys
  – Currently being conducted with
    • About 90 teachers (30 per school)
    • About 300 students (100 per school)
Policy process at national level for VET

- Main National Actors
  - Government
  - Ministry of National Education (centralized)
  - Ministry of Employment
  - Business
  - NGOs

- Main Local Actors
  - National Branches of Govt. Institutions
  - Province Employment and Vocational Education Boards
  - Schools
  - Business
• **Point of Consensus:**

  Of those over 50 interviewees,
  
  – Only 2 would send their kid to a vocational school
  
  – About 7 would send their kid to a vocational school if the conditions improve/right conditions
  
  – The rest would try to convince their kid to follow the academic track
ORGANISATION OF MONE

Minister

The Council of Higher Education
Private Office
Board of Education

Deputy Undersecretary
DG for Teacher Training and Improvement
DG for Human Resources
DG for EU & Foreign Relations

Deputy Undersecretary
DG for Basic Education
DG for Secondary Education
DG for Special Education and Guidance Services

Deputy Undersecretary
DG for Private Education Institutions
DG for Support Services
Group Directorate for Construction and Estate

Deputy Undersecretary
DG for Innovation and Educational Technologies
Department of Strategy Development
Group Directorate for Data Processing
Legal Consultancy

Deputy Undersecretary
DG for Vocational and Technical Education
DG for Religious Education
DG for Lifelong Learning

Provincial Organization
Provincial Directorates of National Education
County Directorates of National Education
Institutional and Institutional and

Educational Representatives Abroad
Educational Attaches and Counsellors

Department of Guidance and Supervision
Ministerial Consultancy
Press and Public Relations Consultancy
Department of Internal Supervision
VET SCHOOL TYPES

- Anatolian Vocational High Schools
- Technical High Schools
- Anatolian Technical High Schools
- Open Vocational and Technical Education
- Vocational Training Centers
- Public Training Centers
- Multi-Programme High School
- Industrial Vocational High Schools
Mapping VET Education Policies and Practices for Social Inclusion and Social Cohesion: the role of VET in promoting employment, equity, social cohesion and active citizenship in Western Balkans, Turkey (WBT) and Israel
Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

• Vision and Goals:
  – Providing more jobs to the youth
  – Increasing the reputation of the VET
  – Increasing the quality of the VET

• Strategies:
  – Involving the business
    Debate: More involvement vs. restricted involvement
  – Increasing the quality of VET
    Debate: VET in high school vs. at work in conjunction with VET centers (also more vs. less internship)
  – Better guidance
    Debate: Increase vs decrease the age to start VET, how to detect the skills at an early age, before or after selecting into VET
  – Where to make policy?
    Debate: More vs less decentralization
Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

Some examples to the beforementioned:

• Centralization and the role of the government.
  “Small political parties in parliament can just give advices to develop policies, final decision depend on the government.” (Müldkiye, BDP)

• Lack of government policies about higher education.
  “Decisions given by 16 years old students about their careers are insufficient.” (Batuhan, ERG)

• Problem of training qualified personnel (Burcu, KOÇ)
  “Educational quality of the vocational highschools is not sufficient. the internship and scholarship opportunities are not efficient to create qualified staff.”
Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

- Positive developments
  - 4+4+4 system
  - A centralized tracking system called e-okul that is able to follow schools and students in their success rates, if they transfer to another institution etc.
  - Increased number of national and international cooperations involving VET and business
  - Improvements in the equipment of VET schools
Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion and links between them

• Vulnerable groups
  – Persons with low socio-economic status: Hard time with selection and maintaining studies
  – Persons with special need: Special quotas yet hard time maintaining studies and internships
  – Those w.o/ a family: Hard time with guidance and maintaining studies
  – Women at selection and maintaining studies: Social gender role based education system (Mülkiye, BDP) Dropouts due to marriage (Policy makers, School principles)

How about other groups? Roma? Kurds?
Mapping VET Education Policies and Practices for Social Inclusion and Social Cohesion: the role of VET in promoting employment, equity, social cohesion and active citizenship in Western Balkans, Turkey (WBT) and Israel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Education of The Parent</th>
<th>Science High School</th>
<th>Anatolian High School</th>
<th>Anatolian Voc. High School</th>
<th>General High School</th>
<th>Vocational High School</th>
<th>Multi-Program High School</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preschool</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0,9</td>
<td>2,8</td>
<td>4,6</td>
<td>2,5</td>
<td>7,3</td>
<td>4,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary School</td>
<td>2,9</td>
<td>17,7</td>
<td>27,7</td>
<td>29,7</td>
<td>40,3</td>
<td>46,5</td>
<td>32,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School</td>
<td>2,9</td>
<td>9,1</td>
<td>14,7</td>
<td>20,1</td>
<td>26,3</td>
<td>21,8</td>
<td>20,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School</td>
<td>20,0</td>
<td>35,7</td>
<td>28,9</td>
<td>28,6</td>
<td>23,5</td>
<td>18,2</td>
<td>26,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational High School</td>
<td>5,7</td>
<td>8,0</td>
<td>10,7</td>
<td>5,1</td>
<td>3,9</td>
<td>4,4</td>
<td>5,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University</td>
<td>68,6</td>
<td>28,5</td>
<td>15,3</td>
<td>11,8</td>
<td>3,6</td>
<td>1,8</td>
<td>10,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ERG, 2012
Mapping VET Education Policies and Practices for Social Inclusion and Social Cohesion: the role of VET in promoting employment, equity, social cohesion and active citizenship in Western Balkans, Turkey (WBT) and Israel

Overview

Drop-out Rates Depending on Genders and Different Types of School, 2009-2010

Source: ERG
Selection and Tracking

• Theoretically, schools should accept all applicants (Ozlem, MoNE)
• It depends on the quality of the school (Lale, School-family union)
• There is no way we can accept every applicant. We rank them based on grades and accept from the list until our quota is full (school directors)
• Choosing school based on students’ grade point average not their abilities. Students' abilities and interests are not taken into consideration. (Muammer, işkur)
• Selection should be according to students' ability and capability but it isn’t a policy of Turkey. (Oya, ASO and Baki MoNE)
• VET is the last chance for the student (Küçükyalı, IT teacher.)
Selection and Tracking

- Closeness of the school to home (Lale, Okul-aile birliği)
- Learn about working life and develop his self-confidence (Lale, Okul-aile birliği)
- Importance career oppourtunities (Küçükyalı, IT teacher öğrt.)
- Intensive demand creates crowded classrooms. (Küçükyalı, rehberlik öğrt.)
Drop Outs - Source of the Issue

- 9th class have the highest drop outs rates (all local and national actors)
- Family Problems (literature Adem Cilek, İşletmeci ilhan)
- Economic hardships (need to support family)
- Social networks (From focus groups and guidance teachers)
- Lack of interest in learning (teachers in various schools)
Drop Outs - Strategies

• Some discussion in the ministry sponsored guidance booklets but no serious centralized policy. Assumption that they will go to open high school.

• Efforts of prevention by schools as educators are aware most students regret the decision afterwards.

• Some schools have strong mechanisms for prevention if the high risk student becomes visible. But for the invisible...
  Example: “I didn’t tell any teachers about my intentions. If I had known of all the implications of drop out, I would have continued.”

• Schools try to detect the high risk from attendance rates and undisciplined behavior yet they lack resources esp. guidance. Good example: Kucukyali matching teachers
Apprenticeship System and Social Inclusion

- Useful in adapting the student to the job if done properly. Examples: “They should be taught the job not told to bring tea.” (Principles) “Companies want to exploit cheap labor.” (mülkiye, bdp and several teachers)

- Quality of education in school is poor. Examples: “It is sometimes hard to trust the students with these expensive machines” (Several firms, Business associations) “This is because of a lack of equipment in schools” (Oya, aso) Problem of efficient usage of the machines. (Fikret, Ankara il M.E.)

- Teachers are very active in finding them, which also helps them to adapt their skills.
Transition from education to work

• Obsession with high education, delaying transition to work.
  Examples: “All of those we provided scholarships, ended up going to higher education. Does that make the program a success or a failure?” (Koc, Burcu) “My foreman during internship told me that I was ready for work and that I shouldn’t waste time with higher education. Yet, I still went for a 2 year higher education institution, where I haven’t learned all that much and started working at the same company upon graduation. I still think being a university graduate increases my status in life.”

• Because of the poor quality of formal education of basic sciences in the VET system, students end up having to work instead of further education (Batuhan, ERG)

• On apprenticeship vs. VET.
  Example: “I don’t hire someone who is not a graduate of a VET high school. They may not be up to date with all equipment but they know how to use basic tools, protect the material, have the right work ethic.” (firm rep. automotive industry)
Transition from education to work

- Job placement: Some fields fare better than others depending on the local context.
  Examples: “All vocational high school graduates can find job easily.” (ISO, ITO, işletmeci Nusret Istanbul)
  “Some fields attract a lot of students even though there isn’t much demand for those jobs at the level of a high school graduate such as IT jobs. Some jobs such as welding or motor have a lot of employment potential yet students do not find these jobs “cool”.” (School teachers and principles, policy makers)
  “Low rate of employment in the informatics department because student's goal is enrolling university. (bilişim öğrt, küçükyalı)”

- Job placement: Not enough incentive for firms by the government or lack of information regarding the existing incentives.
  Examples: “Not enough incentives for the companies to hire vocational school graduate (Industrialists association)”
On Teachers

• Policies of education should be moderated.

"Teacher's power is not enough in the education system. Student should have change their department even they are at 10th class. If they have failed courses, they can take that course without fail the class.“ (bilişim hocası)

• Teachers should get more on the job training.
On the system characteristics

- Simplification and rebuilding of the system.

"First of all, in vocational training, process should be re-build and simplified. For example, Vocational High School, Technical High School and Anatolian Technical High School which are educating students for the same field but have different schedules should be simplified and structured like Vocational High School and Academic Vocational High Schools (Anatolian Vocational)" (Istil milli eğit, Erol)
On Autonomy of Localities

- The local authority should be in charge for education because of the inequal opportunity and different conditions.
  
  “There is substructure problem. For instance, the graduated student is an IT specialist but where this child will be employed? The thing we advocate is that local actors should take responsibility over education.” (mülkiye, bdp; Fikret MoNA Ankara branch, school principles, industrialists)

- Increasing the power of school directors
  “And, vocational school’s director should be more powerful, so the local determines their needs and finds how much there must be material, teaching staff or courses” (principles, national policy makers)
  “School directors should take initiative in the policies they adapt, the money they raise for those, and the cooperation protocols they sign with the employers.” (industrialists)
  “Schools should be able to select their own teachers. Why am I supposed to work with a mediocre teacher when I can have the best?” (Principles)
On Guidance

• More government incentives for vocational schools.
  “We can have 3 counselors, But because vocational schools are harsh with higher disciplinary cases, nobody stays. They leave after a couple months.” (Counselor, Kucukyali)

• Students need proper guidance before and after selecting into vocational education. They need one on one guidance and role models.
  "What the students need is to find role model who was in the same boat before. Also, these people should be coaching for the students“ (Burcu, KOÇ)

• “Schools should create campus life in schools but it is difficult because of financial difficulty”
  (fatma hoca, rehberlik)
On Students making their decision

- Debate: Choices of students about their career should be delayed vs. taken to earlier ages.
  “Students should make their choices not in young ages” (batuhan, erg)
  “Students should make their choices in older ages” (several industrialists, teachers)

- Regardless of age of the student at the time of the decision to get vocational training, transfer opportunities should be expanded and this is contingent upon a solid basic sciences education.