
Conference Turin, 18-19 February, 2013

Maja Ristovska/Nikica Mojsoska
Blazevski/Ema Kostovska
1. Methodology of the country case study – overview

Participative Action Research
• NAB (chaired by Deputy Minister of MOE, 5 high decision makers from MOE and VET center)
• LABs on case study locations – School governance bodies (chaired by school director, 2 members from school, 2 members from business community; 2 members from municipality)
• Case studies in three VET schools, regionally dispersed (Skopje region; Polog region; Pelagonia region); ethnically diverse (Skopje school; 60/40 Macedonia vs Albanian; Tetovo 80/20 Alb vs Mac; Prilep-100 Mac
1. Methodology of the country case study – overview - cont

• Face-to-face interviews:

on national level 13 persons – 5 MOE; 2 SEI; 3 MOLSP; 1 academic; 1 NGO; 1 VET – pending VET counsel; EA; Roma NGO

• on local level - 43 persons
## 1. Methodology of the country case study – overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Skopje (mechanical and traffic school)</th>
<th>Prilep (electro-technical)</th>
<th>Tetovo (medical school)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School management</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head masters from diff studying profiles</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School psych/pedag/Chief of prac. Stud</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local businesses/LAEml</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth org/Council of parents</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>1/1</td>
<td>1/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Methodology of the country case study – overview - cont

- **Students/Teacher Questionnaires**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skopje ASUC</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prilep R.R.Ricko</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tetovo Nikola Stejn</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>320</strong></td>
<td><strong>97</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. **Methodology of the country case study – overview - cont**

Focus groups: pending activity
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Expenditure on education: increasing trend
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Unemployment rate; 31.6%, declining trend in 5 year period (from 35.2 -31.6); by education level: greatest share among ISCED 0-2; increasing trend of ISCED 5-6
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Youth unemployment rate: 52.2%, decreasing trend, except for ISCED 5-6

Employment rate is 43.9%; ISCED 5-6 greatest employment rate but slight declining trend
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Poverty rate: 30.4%, highest for persons without and primary education; decline trend from 2010 except for persons with secondary education.
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Death rate by education level: 9.5, highest among persons with preprimary, primary and lower secondary education.
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Education attainment: Share of population aged 25-64; decreasing trend for lower and upper sec education and increasing trend for tertiary education
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

**Early school leaving rate: 13.5**
2. Education/Social inclusion/Social Cohesion indicators

Enrolment rate in Vocational education:

Top 5 studying programs:
3. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion

1. VET strategy – attempt to give vision of the VET developments

• aimed at addressing the future development of the VET system such as policy design, systematic organization of the VET system (occupational areas, profiles, network of school, curricula), the challenge of meeting the needs of the multiple clients (pupils, parents, business sector, society) and in delivery of programs.

• still, strategy does not give an answer to all open questions, it rather sets goals to be achieved and potential instruments to be used.

It,
• neither prescribes the optimal way to link between the demanded skills with the supplied skills of the graduates nor
• the optimal level of decentralization of curricula to local self government.
3. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion

The Ministry would have to further work on
• establishing the linkages between the VET strategy and other sector strategies
• policies on school to work transition
• inter-relationships between the government and business
• review and or revision of the financial policy of the education system and distribution of the public resources to VET

2. Promotion of vocational schools, however at a same time with increased focus on university education

• the Government has prioritised the VET education especially the technical profiles mainly as part of its efforts to increase the number of graduates from technology and math studies.

• Another important aspect is the promotion of the VET is followed at the same time by increased focus and promotion on university education in parallel (several education reforms have been introduced from easing the enrolment on university education).
In the forthcoming period focus must put on

• reforms and promotion on 3 year VET (only 6% of students enrol in 3 year VET, is not reformed on larger scale and the curricula is dating from the period of ex-Yugoslavia only two profiles reformed)

• reforms and promotion on 2 year VET
3. Decentralisation, how to improve the education governance in decentralization environment?

Several studies found that the decentralization did not bring the expected benefits in improvements in education governance as well as in terms of greater links between the curricula and the local labor market needs and demand of workers because

- there is no clear division of the responsibilities between central and local self government

- even though there is a clear legal ground for greater involvement of the LSG in analyzing the local labor market and give suggestions for development of new curricula and programs, for enrolment quotas still the LSG lack capacity for doing so and the VET education or the education sector overall is not priority for them.
3. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion

Focus in this regard must be further on paid on

- revision of the current model of responsibilities (overlapping of responsibilities over national bodies (VET, BDE and Adult Education Centre and State Examination Centre) followed by proper transfer and clear division of the responsibilities school - municipality- VET and other national agencies

- revision of financing over the VET schools (especially with the introduction of the reformed 3 year VET that would request additional investments for qualifying teachers, equipment and establishing links with the industry)

- capacity building of the national and municipal level

- reforming the profiles and opening up of curricula (20% of the curricula to be drafted with the local business) and

- posing greater policy making power to schools
3. Policy process at national level for VET, social inclusion and social cohesion

4. Focus on integration and multi-culturalism (language of instruction)

- Strategy for integrated education – enforcement in faster pace contribution to internal cohesion and avoiding separation among ethnic lines in schools through

  - joint curricula and extra curricula activities;
  - language acquisition;
  - increasing the mutual knowledge of each other’s language among students and adults thus raising the level of communication between persons belonging to different communities
  - Training of teachers in second language methodologies especially on languages of the ethnic communities and vice versa
  - adjusting textbooks on history, geography, tolerance education and intercultural understanding
4. Findings from local level research in schools/localities

Local level findings:

**Analysis of the administrative data** (Enrolment trends/Student performance/Drop out/School budgets)

Enrolment trends across schools in a two year period:

- Skopje ASUC – 67% enrolled in the first cycle, remain stable for 2012/2013
- Prilep Ricko – 70% enrolled in the first cycle, decreased to 58.8% this year
- Tetovo Stejn - 91% enrolled in the first cycle, increased to 100% this year

Average student performance (on a scale 1-5):
- Skopje ASUC – 2.7
- Prilep Ricko - 3.1
- Tetovo Stejn - 3.1

decreasing while approaching to upper grades.
4. Findings from local level research in schools/localities

Drop out rate:

Skopje ASUC: 3.6
Prilep Ricko: 3.9
Tetovo Stejn: 0.6

well organized system in place, mandatory secondary education

School financial situation:

Total school budgets:
Skopje: app.2 million EURs; 2.030 Eurs per student
Prilep: app.600 thousand Eurs; 625 Eurs per student
Tetovo: app.1,9 million EURs; 816 Eurs per student
4. Findings from local level research in schools/localities

Share of income from own business of total school budget
Skopje ASUC: 130%
Prilep Ricko: 3,3%
Tetovo Stejn: 4.4%

Revenues from central budget:

80% of the central budget funds goes on salaries, 20% in contractual services including heating and electricity. No investments in infrastructure in a 3 year period (2010,2011,2012).

Revenues from own resources:
Prilep and Tetovo 100% on contractual services excluding the costs for heating and electricity, improvement of school environment,.... In case of ASUC 50% are used for salaries for the staff that is working in the school businesses and other 50% in major infrastructure projects, equipment, improvements in school environment ...
4. Findings from local level research in schools/localities

• **Selection**: nationally set criteria-enrolment in secondary school is based on grades in primary education; different approached across schools
• **Tracking**: national- and school-level systems in place; parental classes
• **Apprenticeship system**: there a lack of national debate on apprenticeship system; on local level none from the interviews have think of such system; strongly focused on internship
• **Curricula**: Reforms in the curricula: only in 4-year VET; In general, lack of textbooks for VET schools (further exacerbated for ethnic minorities)
• **Internship**: weak connection with the real business; there is no state strategy but the internship is left on good relations of the director with the business community
• **Transition to work**: increased trend towards enrolment into HE institutions; difficult school-to-work transition
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

Preliminary analysis on students questionnaire

Reasons for school choice

These 3 parameters remain most important is equal between man and women and parental education and employment status.
- no specific hypothesis testing on these issues that would confirm our findings.
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

2. Reason for choice of school in preference to other school

![Bar chart showing reasons for school choice]

The average scores is near to 4 (very important) for each of the proposed reasons and are very close so we cannot say more at this time without further analysis between groups and within groups.
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

3. Experience in school:

The average score of 3.6 for how much do you learn from courses, states that students on average learn much from courses in their schools. Students also believe that what they have learned at school will help them in their future job. This is supported by average score of 4.05 in this question.
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

4. School motivation and environment:

Here greater effect can be said to have the importance of doing well in school over the improvements needed. The mean average score for the first issue is above 4, whereas the mean average score for the latter is below 4.
5. School ratings:

- Among the 4 examined categories, it appears that friendliness of other student’s scores highest among all, however this hypothesis needs further confirmation.

For the age of students it is noticeable that all four categories score lower with older students than with younger. That can be due to higher expectations at beginning of high school education, or other factors. Further hypotheses have to be constructed and tested in order to confirm such findings.
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

6. Extra curricula activities

- No difference among schools, in each case location students have been involved in sport activities more than any other extra curricula activities
- No gender difference
- Age difference, older students tend to get involved in voluntary work and paid job more than younger students
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

7. Plans for future

54% plan to look for paid work after high school. 
32% plan to continue with their education, 
5.8% will look after their family, (gender diff; 66% of males responded that they would take care of the family at home. 
4.1% will work in their family business, 
while 4.1% plan on emigrating.

There is no difference in answers between males and females except for looking after the family at home where 66% males plan to take care of their family at home which is biased for some reason need further check and the emigration where 80% of the respondents that say that would emigrate are males. The emigration answers differ also among school and most of the respondents come from Prilep which is the region with highest emigration trends.
5. Comparative analysis of relation between VET, SI and SC across 3 case study schools/localities

7. Expected help in finding a job

- most of the students believe that a public employment agency would be of greater help than careers center in schools or teachers.

- Mean scores drop between groups of students divided by age. That is student at the end of their education have lower mean scores than students at beginning of their education. Female students score higher than male students on all questions.
6. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels (national, local, donors, NGOs)

Very preliminary recommendations: need to rethink the findings and draw more specific recommendations

- rethink the strategy, to provide not just the aims and instruments to be used but also measures that would give the answers to open questions.
- Introduction of new studying programs that would correlate with the government’s long term strategy for attracting foreign investments, as well as for economic regional development.
- Reconsider the possibility for limiting the openings of the same studying programs in neighboring schools.
- Review and/or revision of the financial policy of the education system and distribution of the public resources to the VET especially in the view of reforming the 2 and 3 years programs that would require further and continues investments in equipment and infrastructure.
- Stronger promotion of 2 and 3 years VET studying programs.
6. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels (national, local, donors, NGOs)

- Opening the curricula, and/or decentralization of the optimal weight of curricula to local level. The involvement of the local business sector to propose the topics to be covered in the curricula or skills to be gained would strengthen the business ownerships of the VET processes and increase the confidence level in the students proper labor market skills.

- Establishing strategic interrelationships between the business sector and the government especially in the field of practical work of the students. Establishing the linkages of the VET strategy with other sector strategies (strategy for regional economic development, Strategy for poverty reduction and social inclusion, Youth strategy, Youth employment strategy, Social Protection strategy ....)
6. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels (national, local, donors, NGOs)

- Strengthening the business role of the VET schools in addition to the education one. This would give the schools the possibility to raise the income, provide them with some financial independence, increase the knowledge about the market demands in the specific sector that would have triple side effect, more money for school, teachers would update the knowledge in the specific subjects and students would have the possibility to do internships within the school but in real businesses. Remove the cross sector legislative limitations for school business openings. Set financial framework for usage of these funds. % of income to be used in improvement of infrastructure, % for teacher training, % for research and development … (need further investigation on best practices)

- Revision of the current model of responsibilities (overlapping of responsibilities over national bodies (VET, BDE and Adult Education Centre and State Examination Centre) followed by proper transfer and clear division of the responsibilities school - municipality- VET and other national agencies.)
6. Action proposals for schools and policy recommendations at different levels (national, local, donors, NGOs)

- Strengthening the capacities of the State Education Inspectorate and Municipal education inspectorates.

- Enforcement of the strategy of integrated education in a faster pace.

- Teacher training for work with specific groups of students and greater allocation of the funds for teacher training.