Interview
Meet Joost Korte, newly appointed Director-General for Employment, Social Affairs & Inclusion | 06

IN DEPTH
Torino Process: The fast-growing regional dimension | 14

COUNTRY FOCUS
Azerbaijan: Exploring skills for the future | 16

REGIONAL FOCUS
Enhancing EU engagement with the Western Balkans | 18
INSIDE

INTERVIEW
06 Meet Joost Korte, newly appointed Director-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion

NEWS&VIEWS
08 Moldova: Modernising qualifications
09 The European Qualifications Framework: A global catalyst for change
12 Evolving technologies and lifelong learning
13 Financing vocational education systems

IN DEPTH
14 Torino Process: The fast-growing regional dimension

COUNTRY FOCUS
16 Exploring skills for the future in Azerbaijan
17 A spotlight on young people and their transition to work

REGIONAL FOCUS
18 Enhancing EU engagement with the Western Balkans

THOUGHT LEADERS
20 Evolution evaluation: Talking with Susan D. Tamondong and Rafael Popper

CONTACT US
Further information can be found on the ETF’s website: www.etf.europa.eu
For any additional information, please contact:
Communication Department
European Training Foundation
ADDRESS Villa Gualino,
Viale Settimio Severo 65,
I – 10133 Turin, Italy
TELEPHONE +39 011 630 2222
FAX +39 011 630 2200
EMAIL info@etf.europa.eu
To receive a copy of Live&Learn please email info@etf.europa.eu

The European Training Foundation is an EU agency that helps transition and developing countries to harness the potential of their human capital through the reform of education, training and labour market systems in the context of the EU’s external relations policy. We are based in Turin, Italy, and have been operational since 1994.

Print ISSN 1725-9479 TA-AF-18-002-EN-C
PDF ISSN 2443-7433 TA-AF-18-002-EN-N
© European Training Foundation, 2018
Cover photograph: Ard Jongma
Please recycle this magazine when you finish with it.
The world is on the move – and so are people. Migration towards the European Union (EU) and its neighbouring countries is one of the factors reshaping the societies we live in and affecting our concepts of work. Whatever our journey, we all move with one valuable currency in our backpack: our skills.

Slava is a skilled lift engineer who moved to Finland from Belarus in search of a new life. Through a work placement and language training, Slava proved his qualities to the point that his employer would now like to keep him permanently. Marva is a young mother who faced a long journey from Syria to Ukraine. By training to be a dental technician and following a language course in her new country, she now hopes to create a better future for her family by getting a skilled job.

When people move countries, they take risks and face change as a matter of course. Being able to rely on one's professional skills and personal competences is a precondition for a new start. Slava and Marva have benefitted from inclusive systems that recognised their prior skills, gave them access to further training and prepared them for the needs of their new societies. Their story is the story of thousands of people on the move across borders.

Skills are valuable tools, and yet the data show that they are underused. The EU’s Entrepreneurship 2020 Action Plan (2013–20) has highlighted that migrants’ skills are under-exploited in the EU labour market, and that migrants are under-represented within the entrepreneurial population. Yet in many sectors in the EU, demand for labour exceeds available supply: it is in our common interest to develop new and creative solutions to unlock the potential of cross-border migration.

Firstly, formal mechanisms are needed to grant recognition – or partial recognition – to skills obtained through formal education. Use of skills should be maximised through complementary courses to meet any local job-market requirements, including language. In parallel, skills acquired through informal learning should be validated by authorised bodies in line with relevant standards.

Secondly, skills offered should be matched to skills needed in order to maximise employability. Data collection is key to this, and policy makers need to track qualifications and monitor success in the labour market to strengthen counselling services and adapt policies.

Finally, strategies should be developed to facilitate the social and economic integration of third-country nationals in host communities, to maximise the economic potential of migrants to the economy.

The EU is fully committed to this process: it supports skills assessment and access to training through the Action Plan on the Integration of Third Country Nationals. This assists Member States in verifying the qualifications of new arrivals through the EU Skills Profile Tool for Third Country Nationals and facilitates social and economic integration through the Entrepreneurship 2020 Action Plan.

At the same time, the EU is working with neighbouring countries to boost domestic job markets and strengthen the vocational education systems. As the only EU agency supporting the EU’s global action in the area of education and training, the European Training Foundation (ETF) is supporting this process in nearly 30 countries – from Belarus, to Azerbaijan, to Tunisia. We provide countries with advice and guidance to enable validation and recognition of skills, in line with EU and international best practice.

More broadly, we support citizens’ access to opportunity through better vocational education and employment policies. Throughout all our activities, we promote cooperative approaches, supporting domestic reform efforts at national and regional levels. The EU and its neighbours are closely interconnected, and the outlook is for ever closer proximity. Economic growth and stability are common goals for the EU and its neighbours, requiring close cooperation and a shared vision, not least in the area of education and training.

Skills are in everyone’s backpack. In this world on the move, it is in our common interest to make them more visible, understandable and portable.

Cesare Onestini
ETF Director
Public bodies and business boosting skills
The European Training Foundation (ETF) organised its first ever workshop on the topic of public-private partnerships on 10 April. Representatives from international organisations – including the OECD and ILO – and countries neighbouring Europe – Serbia, Ukraine, Jordan and Kazakhstan – gathered in Turin to explore methodologies for action. EU relevant employers’ organisations and Eurofound also contributed expertise. Participants will set up two committees to oversee an in-depth study of successful partnerships in different contexts.

Central Asia: Linking employers and educators
High-level delegations from Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan gathered for the Central Asian Education Platform on 15–16 March in Warsaw. The platform is part of the EU’s efforts to promote educational outcomes across the region. The three-day meeting focused on enhancing cooperation between employers and education providers, including vocational education and training. Representatives from the European Commission, including the ETF, also took part.

Southern Neighbourhood: SBA wrap-up
Promoting the entrepreneurial spirit through education and training, women’s entrepreneurship, and helping business go global is the focus of the latest series of Small Business Act assessments, which have wrapped up in the EU’s Southern Neighbourhood region. Assessments in Algeria, Egypt, Israel, Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, Palestine* and Tunisia began in April 2017. Since then, ETF staff have been busy working with government officials, the private sector and the education and training community to determine progress. Results will be published later in 2018.

Lebanon: Setting up employer surveys
To better understand skills and training needs, Lebanon is planning a national employers’ survey, to be implemented by a new multi-stakeholder taskforce. The ETF welcomed taskforce members, representing government, national employment office, chambers of commerce and industrial association, to Turin for a coaching seminar on 20–22 February. ETF experts guided the taskforce to elaborate a draft survey concept. Once approved, a pilot survey is foreseen to take place in Tripoli and Saida.

Ukraine: A future vision for vocational education
What does a skills, labour market and vocational education system of the future look like? Ukraine is addressing the questions as it sets out a shared vision for a modern, agile vocational education system. Ukraine’s Minister of Education Liilya Hrynevych and the EU Delegation’s Head of Cooperation Berend de Groot joined ETF experts, parliamentarians and stakeholders from the worlds of work and education on 22 February in Kyiv. Workshop outcomes will help shape the future strategy.

Western Balkans: The EU sets out new flagship initiatives
The European Commission’s renewed Strategy for the Western Balkans sets out six new flagship initiatives to support countries on their path towards EU integration. These include strengthening the rule of law, reinforced cooperation on security and migration, lowering roaming charges and rolling out broadband. Employment, education, social policies, governance, the digital agenda and youth also feature. More on pp. 18–19.

Supporting young people in the Western Balkans
Leaders of the EU, its 28 Member States and their Western Balkan counterparts have agreed to invest more in skills, employability and prosperity of young people. The special focus on youth and socio-economic development are among the priority areas of the Sofia Declaration, agreed to at the EU-Western Balkans Summit, Bulgaria, 17 May. A pilot project for mobility in vocational education builds upon the EU’s commitment to double funding for the Erasmus+ programme. A Western Balkans Youth Lab will be set up in 2018, providing space for innovative policy making on youth issues. The recognition of qualifications will be enhanced through the development of the Regional Economic Area.

Opening the door to EU accession
The European Commission recommends that the Council open accession discussions with the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Albania, in the light of progress achieved. To support this, the Commission will apply the reinforced approach for negotiating the chapters on judiciary and fundamental rights and justice, freedom and security. It is also working towards an opinion on the applications of Bosnia and Herzegovina and Kosovo**.

* This designation shall not be construed as recognition of a State of Palestine and is without prejudice to the individual position of the Member States on this issue.
** This designation is without prejudice to positions on status, and is in line with UNSCR 1244/1999 and the ICJ Opinion on the Kosovo declaration of independence, hereafter 'Kosovo'.
The EU leads education efforts
Work to build a European Education Area by 2025 is being advanced through new initiatives outlined by the European Commission on 22 May. The Youth Strategy (2019–27) will give young people a stronger voice in EU policy making, while the Agenda for Culture will raise awareness of Europe’s shared, diverse heritage. An additional focus is placed on the learning and teaching of languages, and the automatic mutual recognition of diplomas and study periods abroad.

Meanwhile, the European Commissioner for International Cooperation and Development Neven Mimica has called on world leaders to step up investment in the Global Partnership for Education, which supports 60+ developing countries. The EU provides 63% of the partnership’s overall funds, including EUR 100 million committed in 2017.

Discussing the future of vocational education
The Directors General for Vocational Education and Training from the EU Member States gathered in Sofia, Bulgaria, on 24 April to discuss the employment prospects of vocational graduates. Representatives from the EU neighbouring countries, the European Commission, the ETF and Cedefop took part. ETF Director Cesare Onestini chaired a working group on the future of vocational education and graduate tracking.

EU skills tools get an update
The EU Member States have adopted the European Commission’s proposal to revise the Europass framework, simplifying and modernising the Europass CV and other tools for the digital age.

The EU Skills Profile Tool for Third Country Nationals has also been upgraded with extra translations and competence cards for immigration counselling, designed to support the labour market integration of refugees, migrants and displaced people. The ETF has incorporated elements into a similar tool for its partner countries.

European framework to strengthen apprenticeship
The EU Member States have agreed on a new framework, with 14 criteria, to guide policy makers introducing or upgrading apprenticeship programmes. The development is linked to the Skills Agenda for Europe, in particular making vocational education and training a first choice. In order to implement the framework, an Apprenticeship Support Service will be launched during the European Vocational Skills Week, November 2018.

THE FRAMEWORK SETS OUT:

The framework is based on 7 criteria for learning and working conditions and 7 criteria for framework conditions.

7 criteria for learning and working conditions
- Written agreement
- Learning outcomes
- Pedagogical support
- Workplace component
- Pay or compensation
- Social protection
- Work, health and safety conditions

7 criteria for framework conditions
- Regulatory framework
- Involvement of social partners
- Support for companies
- Flexible pathways and mobility
- Career guidance and awareness raising
- Transparency
- Quality assurance and tracking of apprentices

Image: European Commission
Building a fairer and more social Europe is a strategic focus of the Juncker Commission. What does this mean concretely?

European societies and the world of work are undergoing profound transformations. Some trends are likely to accelerate in the next decade, giving rise to new challenges and opportunities. The impact of digitalisation, globalisation, as well as demographic changes will be profound.

Building a fairer and more social Union is a priority for this Commission. This means delivering social rights for citizens. The European Social Model has been a success story, but this is not a given and requires reinforcement for today’s realities. We need to make sure economic and social progress continue to go hand in hand.

The European Pillar of Social Rights (covered in Live&Learn Issue 41) is designed as a compass for renewed convergence towards better working and living conditions. The 20 principles and rights enshrined in the Pillar seek to ensure workers have the right to fair treatment and equal opportunities regarding access to labour market, working conditions and social protection.

How can vocational education and training help to meet future skills demands?

Rapid technological developments, globalisation, and new business models are disrupting traditional forms of work organisation and employer-employee relations in a fundamental way. Demographic ageing and migration also have an impact on skills and diversity.

Education and training systems have been relatively slow in adapting. Vocational education is the education sector closest to the labour market and is expected to respond to current and future skills demands. In order to do so, changes are required in how content is designed, delivered and organised.

In my view, vocational education curricula will need to address two objectives: first, to enable employability of graduates and, second, to equip people with the means for lifelong adaptability, meaning, a high-level of basic skills, including digital skills and transversal competences such as managing a career and transitions.

We may see a future shift from narrow occupation-specific curricula to broader qualifications corresponding to groups of occupations. We will probably experience even more vocational education at higher qualification levels as a response to growing skills requirements.

Vocational education systems will be expected to shorten their reaction time in the face of a rapidly changing environment. Last but not least, we need to have solid skills anticipation and data systems in place analysing labour market outcomes for vocational education graduates in order to make informed policy decisions.
Often the strength of vocational education systems depends on the involvement and buy-in of employers. This is why the Commission remains engaged in efforts to improve the quality of social dialogue not only within the EU, but also in the countries with which the ETF is engaging.

**How will the principles of the European Pillar of Social Rights be put into action?**

Delivering the European Pillar of Social Rights is fundamentally a joint endeavour. EU institutions, Member States, public authorities, social partners and civil society organisations at all levels have a crucial role to play in line with their competences.

More recently, the Social Fairness Package adopted by the Commission proposes concrete new initiatives to further deliver on the European Pillar of Social Rights. It includes a proposal for a European Labour Authority, to make sure that EU rules on cross-border labour mobility and social security coordination are enforced in an equitable, simple and effective way.

You previously held the position of Deputy Director-General for Enlargement when Croatia joined the EU. In your experience, what are the elements for a successful accession process?

In the past year, in the EU we have really reaffirmed our commitment to a credible enlargement perspective for the Western Balkans. Now, it is important that the enlargement countries strengthen their efforts towards achieving real progress and carry out the necessary political and socio-economic reforms. It is important to progress with accession negotiations, but also to focus on structural reforms to improve the economic and social situation of the citizens of the region.

Reforming national policies to support well-functioning and adaptable economies should not be seen as an external requirement, but as a goal for improving people’s lives. A key element for success is also to make better use of available means of EU support. This includes financial means, but also technical assistance, learning exchanges and participation in available EU structures and programmes.

Serbia and Montenegro could join the EU within a 2025 perspective. How do you see the role of the ETF in supporting this process? What can other candidate countries learn?

The ETF has a concrete role, including in establishing the pilot mobility scheme in vocational education and training. Also, in the context of the economic governance process with the enlargement countries, there is a persistent need to address the skills mismatch and align the provision of vocational education and training with the labour market.

**The ETF’s international conference in November will look at how transitioning countries are addressing rapid transformation from a skills perspective. How can the EU help to ensure these countries realise their potential and don’t get left behind?**

Skills can be the lifeline of an economy and society affecting both the perception of a country as well as the lives and opportunities available to its people. A key challenge facing the EU is to support a closer and more effective cooperation between the world of work and that of education and training.

The EU can help transitioning countries by being a vehicle for learning, sharing of information, and cooperation. It can help through projects that support links between education, training and work to create a labour market of people with the right skills, the necessary information and the right opportunities. In the light of high youth unemployment rates in many transitioning countries, promoting the employability of young people is clearly a key priority.

We are now embarking on projects to explore the digitalisation of qualification diplomas, and offering modern online career management tools like Europass. I hope that the EU can help transitioning countries by sharing and offering inspiration on how the technological revolution can be used to highlight and value skills more than ever.

---

*Photo: European Commission*
Moldova is modernising its education system, with a particular focus on curricular reform and a new national qualifications framework, adopted in 2017. To help move forward, high-level officials from the Ministry of Education, Culture and Research joined ETF experts for a three-day training course in Turin, in April.

A broad range of topics were covered including qualification standards, the learning-outcome approach, the European Qualifications Framework (EQF), recognising foreign diplomas, validating non-formal and informal learning, and the role of sectoral committees.

Tatiana Gherstega, who leads the NQF Department, says the ETF has been supporting the reform process every step of the way. ‘For example with the drafting of the legislation. Since then we have approved the qualifications methodology and are developing the concept of a national register of qualifications. We have had the expertise, opinions and consultancy of the ETF’s experts on all these issues since day one!’

Opening doors
Moldova, the country with the lowest per capita GDP in the Eastern Partnership region, has very high levels of labour emigration. According to the United Nations, in 2015 one quarter of the population was living abroad, and young people (15–34) accounted for more than half this group. Russia, Ukraine, Italy, Romania, USA, Germany, Portugal, Spain, Uzbekistan and Israel are the most common destinations.

Aligning the NQF with the EQF will help to make people’s skills and qualifications more readable across borders, including those gained through non-formal and informal learning. ‘Because we lacked a national approach, we didn’t have this type of opportunity to offer workers,’ says Cristina Denita-Boto, who oversees the country’s Lifelong Learning Department. ‘In particular, this development will help people who didn’t have the chance to go to school and those who worked abroad to certify their competences to go for a new job and a new start. The NQF will help us to provide better public services overall for people who really need it.’

Skills mismatch is a problem in Moldova, with an estimated 30% of young people overqualified for the jobs they do. Meanwhile, employers in highly-skilled sectors cite a lack of workers with the skills and competences they need. Improving labour market information on skills supply and demand, and identifying emerging trends in specific sectors, will be supported by the work of sectoral committees, another topic covered during the three-day workshop.

Led by employers, business associations, trade unions and other social partners, the committees have been recognised by a new law which also secures operational funding for their development. With the ongoing support of the ETF, work has begun in the agriculture, food, IT and communication, transport and trade sectors. The EU has been supporting this development through Budget Support (specifically for the implementation of the Vocational Education Strategy, EUR 25 million, ending 2017).

Looking ahead
Closing the workshop, ETF expert Carmo Gomes said it was a pleasure to host such a highly committed group. ‘This is a good example of how the ETF is working together with its partner countries.’

While not directly involved in the NQF development, Vera Erhan, who leads the Institutional Management Department, which advises the ministry on financial issues, said the training was very useful. ‘I am sure I can use the information, good practices and practical exercises in my work, including cross-collaboration with other departments to further develop policy.’

Tatiana Gherstega concurred saying the amount of information has been ‘somewhat mind-blowing.’ ‘Everything we have heard is extremely important for our activities. This training has allowed us to better understand obstacles we have already encountered and to think of possible solutions to solve them!’

Text: Susanna Dunkerley/ETF 
Photo: Ard Jongma
The free movement of people in Europe is one of the most important principles of the European Union. But understanding and recognising qualifications from different education and training systems can be a challenge. To address this, the EU established the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) ten years ago.

Since then, the EQF – a translation device to help make national qualifications more readable across borders – has been supporting employers, jobseekers, educators and citizens alike by facilitating labour mobility and lifelong learning.

More than 300 stakeholders from Europe and around the globe gathered in Brussels on 15–16 March for the EQF: Supporting Learning, Work and Cross-border Mobility conference. The two-day event was an opportunity to reflect upon the impact of the EQF, the challenges faced and opportunities for the future.

In 2008, when the EQF was set up, only France, Malta, the United Kingdom and Ireland had a national qualifications framework (NQF) in place. Ten years on, every EU Member State has set up a national framework, aligned with the EQF.

Considered a global benchmark and catalyst for reform, the EQF’s reach goes beyond Europe’s borders. In fact, 25 of the European Training Foundation’s (ETF) partner countries have an NQF. Those of Montenegro, Kosovo, Turkey and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia are already referenced to the EQF. The ETF continues to work with all its partner countries to improve their frameworks.

ETF expert Michael Graham, who facilitated discussions on the EQF and international cooperation, says the tool has influenced broad education and training reform. ‘A big success has been the instrument’s influence beyond the EU. It is now a global model and reference point, through which countries the world over seek a relationship.’

‘In the Neighbourhood region, among the ETF’s partner countries, 25 of 29 are developing NQFs to reform their vocational education and training systems and to produce better qualifications. Notwithstanding these successes, the EQF still needs to be implemented more consistently within countries,’ Graham says, ‘where most citizens and employers still have to encounter the framework.’

Discussion at the conference turned to so-called ‘digital credentials’, which acknowledge learning. These badges, certificates, micro-credentials, etc., exist in various forms and the experts are debating if they are ‘real’ qualifications. ‘They share some characteristics: they are small and usually pursued digitally. So most of these outputs are unregulated or often unknown. The question is: How should the EQF respond?’ Graham adds.

‘The EQF was re-modelled in 2017 – nine years after its initial adoption. To remain useful, we will likely need to update it again quicker than that!’

Text: Susanna Dunkerley/ETF
Photo: Nicolas Lobet/PRYZM Photography/European Commission
10 years of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF)

What is the EQF and how does it work?

- **2008** Launched
  - The EQF is a common reference framework of eight levels based on learning outcomes.
- **2017** Reviewed
- **2018** 10th anniversary
  - Framework of eight levels
  - The EQF covers all types and levels of qualifications, and serves as a translation device between the different National Qualifications Frameworks (NQFs) of participating countries.

What are the EQF's objectives?

The EQF aims to improve the transparency and comparability of people's qualifications.

- It also aims to:
  - modernise education and training systems,
  - increase the employability, mobility and social integration of individuals,
  - link all types of learning and support the validation of learning outcomes.

What are learning outcomes?

- **1** Learning outcomes express what a person is expected to know, understand and is able to do.
- **2** They describe the content of qualifications, clarifying what is expected from a learner.
- **3** They support progression in learning, making it possible to compare and combine learning from different contexts (formal, non-formal or informal).

Which countries participate in the EQF?

- **39** countries currently participate in the EQF.
- **34** have already related their own NQFs to the EQF.

How was the EQF developed?

- Stakeholders from the world of education/training, employment and civil society are involved in the development and implementation of the EQF and of NQFs.
- All qualifications with an EQF level are underpinned by quality assurance mechanisms to ensure their content and level can be trusted.
What are the benefits of the EQF?

**Individuals (workers/learners) can...**

- Better understand their qualifications in terms of what they should know, understand and be able to do.
- Understand the level of their qualification in all European countries and how it relates to others.
- More easily find a job or engage in further learning.

**Employers can...**

- Better understand what potential employees know, understand and are able to do.
- More easily compare and interpret the qualifications of applicants from different countries and institutions.
- Compare the qualifications of foreign applicants with national qualifications, to understand their relevance and how they match company or sector needs.

**Education and training providers can...**

- More easily understand the content, the level and therefore the value of qualifications of those who wish to continue their learning.
- More easily compare and assess qualifications from different countries and contexts.

**Qualification recognition bodies can...**

- Access useful information to better assess qualifications from another country, in particular in relation to their level and content.
- More easily recognise foreign qualifications.

**Sources**

- Learning Opportunities and Qualifications in Europe: https://ec.europa.eu/ploteus/en

© European Union 2018
The fourth industrial revolution or ‘second machine age’ is both transforming and disrupting almost every sphere of human action and influence. How can the European Union create far-reaching policies to form a European approach to the digital revolution and ensure equality for transitioning countries? How will these transform the European Training Foundation’s (ETF) approach to lifelong learning?

These were among the issues discussed when Professor Juan Carlos De Martin, co-director of the interdisciplinary think tank, the Nexa Center for Internet & Society, visited the ETF on 27 March. Professor De Martin, a lecturer in computer engineering at the Politecnico di Torino, shared ideas about how to address this seismic shift and equip people – young and old – with the knowledge and skills to navigate the new waters in which we are swimming.

Negotiating a change of this magnitude does not simply require technical know-how, but a sense of history, of social consequence and a measure of critical thinking. As with the printing press, the TV and the telephone, history has taught us that all new technologies are met with doubt, scepticism and even panic; what is needed is to ‘empower the teachers’ to help students recognise that technology is man-made and thus controllable.

Citing Marvin Kranzberg’s first law of technology, that ‘technology is neither good nor bad; nor is it neutral,’ Professor De Martin invited the audience to consider the questions we might reasonably ask of technology and how we might subject it to ethical scrutiny – it is clear that technology constitutes both solutions and threats to sustainability but, what will prevail?

New policies and reforms should address why ‘computers are special machines’ in education and training, without which technology will remain frail and techno-determinism will be steadfast. Education needs to cover the conceptual and factual basis of the digital revolution, and institutions have to address how to manage these enormous resources responsibly. The skills of responsible use of technology are key to the formation of a ‘first-class’ citizen and thus a good worker; in Professor De Martin’s words, ‘to use the Internet responsibly is not just to consume but to produce and communicate.’
Vocational education and training may be the best game in town when it comes to economic growth and social inclusion but, as everyone knows, you have to pay to play.

Vocational education continues to gain momentum as a driving force for employment, productivity, and international competitiveness across the diverse contexts of ETF partner countries. But as its importance for economic growth and security grows, so do questions about how to organise its financing. A technical approach, based on monetary and resourcing aspects, is unlikely to be as successful as a strategic approach based on a holistic, policy-oriented vision. And, as more partner countries move from policy analysis to implementation, there will be greater demand for strategic insights in the area of financing.

At the same time, the rise of systemic approaches reflects increasing participation by employers and other social partners in vocational education reforms. In turn, this highlights vocational education’s complex, multi-stakeholder environment, which contributes to it being relatively expensive compared to other parts of the education system. In an economic climate still dominated by budget cuts, particularly for social policy areas like education and training, policy makers urgently need to change the view that vocational education is a cost borne by the State. Instead, policy makers responsible for vocational education are urged to make a robust business case for vocational education as a shared investment in human capital development – with all its potential economic and social benefits. This is the first step towards more integrated and robust policy choices. This in turn will open a fundamental discussion about the role of the State in vocational education.

Here to help

The ETF has been studying the funding and financing of vocational education systems over the past few years, in order to respond to a range of challenges partner countries have identified. A powerful new set of concepts and tools aimed at helping partner countries explore vocational education financing is being developed. The ETF has proposed an innovative methodology to support policy dialogue. The overarching aim is to help partner countries change the way they address vocational education financing, and start to make the move from a technical to a systemic approach.

Through its position within the European Commission and wider international networks, the ETF is also well placed to share case studies which illustrate the structure, implementation and impact of different methods of raising funds and managing finances. The Torino Process analytical framework has included vocational education financing as an area for progress monitoring since 2012, and in 2015 the ETF published Cost and Financing Analysis in VET*, a guidance note to identify the financial aspects of different reform scenarios and to inform the policy-making process. This was followed by a position paper, Financing Vocational Education and Skills Development: A Policy Area for ETF Support** published earlier this year. The ETF can also facilitate national awareness-raising workshops on financing for partner countries.

While there is no simple route to a holistic perspective, making good decisions on financing at the outset of the policy process will greatly enhance the resilience of the whole system. With its combination of up-to-date information, technical and methodological support, and exposure to international good practice, the ETF is here to help partner countries make those good decisions.

Text: Ezri Carlebach
Photo: Ard Jongima

* Available here: europa.eu/1q683Qd
** Available here: europa.eu/1Fu88XR
TAKING THE TORINO PROCESS TO THE REGIONS

The European Training Foundation’s (ETF) flagship programme is set for a major expansion during its fifth round (2019–20), spreading the benefits locally in its partner countries.

An increased focus on regional analysis during the last round of the Torino Process – the analytical review of vocational education and training (VET) systems in ETF partner countries – highlighted the demand for – and value of – a more detailed analysis of vocational education at sub-national level.

Experience from Ukraine – where 25 regional Torino Process reports were prepared as part of an ambitious decentralisation scheme – and other countries that piloted sub-national reporting, including Kazakhstan, Tunisia and Russia, created a foundation for taking this approach further.

The regional evolution of the Torino Process was put under the spotlight in February when delegates from 31 regions and cities in four countries met in Turin to discuss progress at the Regions and Cities for VET and Skills Development focus group workshop, on 27–28 February, in Turin.

Opening the two-day conference, ETF Director Cesare Onestini said it was an opportunity to ‘reflect on how to make the next Torino Process round even more useful and exciting and further the reform process’ – a momentum that the ETF has been backing since the programme’s launch in 2010.

‘When we move to the sub-national level, we are really talking about implementation; about making things happen, trying to find ways in which we translate the bigger ideas we have in the country and internationally to see what it means in practice,’ Onestini said.

From little things, big things grow

ETF expert Abdelaziz Jaouani, recently appointed Torino Process Coordinator, says the regional dimension is growing fast, ‘a good thing in terms of ownership and multi-level governance.’ In the programme’s next round there is likely to be as many as 50 or more regions involved, he notes.

The experience of those who have already taken evidence-based policy monitoring and analysis to the regions is stimulating others to follow the same path.

Dnipropetrovsk was among the 25 regions that piloted Ukraine’s regional approach. ‘Involvement in the Torino Process was the first attempt by Ukrainian regional authorities to look at the...’
situation in vocational education and training as a whole’, says Irina Shumik, Deputy Head of the region’s Science, Higher and Vocational Education Department. ‘After the collapse of the Soviet Union (in 1991), the planned economy system was broken and no one had reviewed the system since.’

Regional vocational education managers in Dnipropetrovsk – an industrial region in the east of the country – obtained a detailed picture through the new approach. ‘This process has helped us to analyse the changes in the system and identify the main weaknesses and opportunities. I think this will become the main basis for us to develop a new concept on the development of vocational education in Ukraine as a whole,’ says Shumik, who is taking a new position in Kyiv with the Ministry of Education’s Directorate of Professional Education.

Challenges identified in the region include the mismatch between curricula and labour market demand and weaknesses in teacher training, prompting a reorganisation of the regional institute of post-graduate education. Strengths include good employer contacts, which would assist the reform of teaching programmes.

A driving force for change

In Kazakhstan’s north central Kostanay region, Aygul Nurikini, Head of the Methodological Office of the Education Department, says the new approach is developing professional training in an area with high levels of educated workers. A large agricultural region that borders Russia, Kostanay is also a centre of the Kazakh car industry, with foreign firms including Daewoo, SsangYong and Chevrolet.

‘It was very important for us to understand how to develop professional training programmes for our region,’ she says. The regional programme prompted the development of a more inclusive approach to technical vocational education and an initiative to upgrade teaching skills.

The success of Kostanay’s scheme – one of four pilot projects in Kazakhstan – will see 12 more regions begin implementing sub-national programmes. One of them, Almaty, the country’s largest city with a population approaching two million, where 65,000 students attend 84 colleges (of which only 22 are State-run), will prioritise vocational education alignment with labour market demands.

Turning the tide

Tunisia’s south-eastern region of Medenine, with key sectors that include tourism and manufacturing, came up with a number of key recommendations for the new approach: supporting the autonomy of regional training centres, greater involvement of stakeholders, and upgrading teacher training. Lassaad Labassi, Regional Director for Vocational Training and Employment, says: ‘The (sub-national) process should be institutionalised so that each stakeholder can be empowered, take ownership and become more involved and engaged. We also need to work in tight cooperation with the central level; to harmonise our intention we need to follow the national guidelines of the vocational training strategy.’

Taking the regional roll out forward, participants from Azerbaijan, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kazakhstan, Morocco, Russia, Tajikistan, Tunisia, Ukraine and Uzbekistan, will focus on:

• building sustainability;
• fit-for-purpose regional analytical frameworks;
• supporting national and sub-national links;
• statistics and evidence collection;
• developing support tools.

Text: Nick Holdsworth
Photo: Andrea Guermani
Image: Chapple Cartoons
‘When we want to understand each other on the issue of labour market and skills, we speak the language of the Torino Process,’ says Kestutis Jankauskas, Head of the EU Delegation to Azerbaijan.

Referring to the European Training Foundation’s (ETF) flagship programme, – an analytical framework for partner countries to monitor and enhance vocational education and training systems – the Ambassador made these remarks during a high-level workshop on the future of skills and education in the Nakhchivan Autonomous Republic (NAR), bordering Armenia, Iran and Turkey.

Ambassador Jankauskas, Mammad Garibov, NAR Minister of Education and ETF experts were among the speakers at the Sharing Experiences for Improved Economic Growth and Competitiveness workshop on 1 May. Forty high-level delegates from Nakhchivan and the Azerbaijan government, the State Agency for Vocational Education, local business leaders and other key stakeholders joined the event, which laid the groundwork for the new Torino Process cycle 2019–20.

Minister Garibov said vocational education reform is a top priority. ‘It plays a central role in the lives of our people. Improving vocational education is a long-term activity, and one that matters for every young person in our country.’ Programmes designed to strengthen the NAR skills base are being developed and implemented in the country’s five vocational schools, he noted. ‘But in order to enhance the economic capacity of the country it is necessary to continue to improve the attractiveness of these courses. That’s why this workshop is of great importance. Only through discussion and dialogue can we learn how to develop highly qualified vocational education and training graduates.’

ETF Head of Operations Anastasia Fetsi addressed the question of innovation and competitiveness, while ETF expert Margareta Nikolovska, Country Desk Officer for Azerbaijan, led the discussion on lifelong learning, sharing examples from EU Member States. She highlighted the role of the Torino Process in supporting stakeholders’ dialogue and a holistic approach to vocational education. ‘Investment in education and training is one of the major priorities for jobs, growth and competitiveness, and the involvement of State and regional government, social partners, and leaders from the vocational education sector is proof of the commitment Azerbaijan is making to the future of its people,’ Fetsi said. ‘We are delighted to be working alongside our partners in the Azerbaijan policy-making community and in the EU Delegation on this important development area.’

Ambassador Jankauskas concurred, highlighting the benefits of sharing best practice and the combined expertise of all EU Member States. ‘There is no better investment than investment in our future, our children and education. In education, we know that it is not only diplomas that matter, but skills. And I see the EU and Azerbaijan as partners in vocational education and training!’
YOUNG PEOPLE AND THE TRANSITION TO WORK

The EU is committed to improving the quality of education, training and employment opportunities for young people in Europe and its neighbouring countries.

To assist this work, the European Training Foundation (ETF) has taken an in-depth look at the transition to work of young people in the Eastern Partnership region – Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Moldova and Ukraine. By mapping youth policy measures, the role of related institutions and available support programmes, the research aims to help national stakeholders to identify challenges and develop innovative development approaches.

Spotlight on Azerbaijan

Azerbaijan has a high youth population, with 15–29 year-olds making up around one quarter of the 9.87 million population (2017). Oil exports and economic diversification has seen Azerbaijan rapidly transform into an upper-middle-income country. Despite the economic growth, youth unemployment is high, close to 10% in 2016 and twice the national average. According to the World Bank, the share of 15–24 year-olds not in employment, education or training (NEET) is also high, around 30% in 2013.

Around 90% of young people in work are medium or highly educated, yet many are not in high-skilled jobs, revealing the skills mismatch and the demand for unskilled labour. More than a quarter of young employed people work in manufacturing, around 20% in information and communication, followed by agriculture and transportation. Many young workers are not protected by official labour contracts and do not have access to professional development.

Skills mismatch

Despite high education attainment levels, the transition to work for young people remains a challenge. While there is no available data on the average time to find a job, graduates struggle to find quality positions. A 2016 State Statistical Committee’s study showed that 37% of young people aged 15–29 were not in jobs that matched their qualification and skill set, mainly due to a lack of appropriate positions, self employment and low salaries.

On the other hand, employers say they cannot find skilled workers, citing problems with the education system, in particular the lack of transversal skills such as literacy, problem solving, communication and teamwork (World Bank, 2013). Another challenge is employers’ requirements for prior work experience, despite very limited programmes to support such opportunities.

Policy framework and actions

Azerbaijan is moving to modernise its education system, develop youth policy and promote favourable conditions for young specialists. A good example is the SABAH programme, supporting highly-skilled graduates in higher education. More than 23,000 students in 45 specialisations were involved in 2016–17.

This was among 17 measures and programmes identified in the ETF’s mapping. The State Employment Service implements the majority of measures, particularly in the area of career guidance and job search support. International donors, including the EU, the United Nations, the German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ), the World Bank, and a raft of youth organisations are also working to support youth employability at national, regional and local levels, but the key challenge of coordination and overlap remains.

The EU is a major international donor through the EUR 19 million Education Support Programme, which aims to modernise education and increase the attractiveness of vocational education – around 20% of upper secondary enrolments. Azerbaijan is also a beneficiary of the EUR 8.5 million EU4Youth programme covering the entire Eastern Partnership region.

Looking forward

Despite positive trends in youth transition identified in the mapping, the coordination, effectiveness and scope of measures remain a challenge. The following actions could help to improve the situation.

• Preparing youth before they make the transition
  Improving the quality and effectiveness of career guidance and counselling measures, and expanding the existing network. Matching curricula with labour market needs and strengthening social partnerships.

• Continuing development of skills
  Prioritising skills development beyond the classroom. The validation of informal learning can be supported through the development of the national qualifications framework.

• Supporting a first work experience
  Increasing access to work experience, training and internships, supported by the increased budget earmarked for active labour market policies.

Texts: Susanna Dunkerley/ETF
Photo: Mohammad Novruzov/Azerbaijan State Agency of Vocational Education
Employment, education, social policies, governance, the digital agenda and youth are among the new initiatives included in the European Commission’s renewed strategy to support the path towards EU integration for the Western Balkans.

“The European Commission is charting the European path ahead for the Western Balkans,” European Commission President Jean-Claude Juncker said, referring to the renewed Strategy, which he presented to the European Parliament on 6 February, and subsequently discussed with Western Balkan leaders during a regional tour from 25 February to 1 March.

‘Investing in the stability and prosperity of the Western Balkans means investing in the security and future of our Union. With strong political will, real and sustained reforms, and definitive solutions to disputes with neighbours, the Western Balkans can move forward on their respective European paths.’

The Strategy sets out an action plan with six flagship initiatives and actions covering the rule of law, security and migration, socio-economic development, transport and energy connectivity, the digital agenda, reconciliation and good neighbourly relations, with concrete actions foreseen between 2018 and 2020.

The Socio-Economic Development initiative, for example, aims to boost private investment, support start-ups and SMEs and facilitate increased trade. Employment and social policies will be strengthened, with more financial assistance available for the social sector, in particular education and health. Funding for Erasmus+, – the EU programme for education, training, youth and sport providing millions of young people in Europe and its neighbourhood with opportunities to gain experience abroad – will also be doubled. The Digital Agenda initiative focuses on improving digital skills and infrastructure. A roadmap will be set in place to lower roaming costs, increase access to broadband and e-services including eGovernment, eProcurement and eHealth.

How will the initiatives be implemented?
The EU is the biggest investor, political and trade partner of the Western Balkans. In order to deliver on the Strategy, the Commission proposes to gradually increase funding under the Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA) until 2020. In 2018, EUR 1.07 billion of pre-accession assistance for the region is foreseen, on top of almost EUR 9 billion for 2007–17. Increased funding is necessary for improved transport energy and digital infrastructure. A dedicated coordination group is being established to ensure implementation of the initiatives. As the only EU agency working in the Neighbourhood region, the European Training Foundation continues to be a key partner for the Commission, the EU Delegations and countries in the region, supporting human capital development through better skills, education and labour market systems.

Next steps on the path towards EU integration
The EU’s enlargement policy is part of the larger strategy to strengthen the Union by 2025 set out by President Juncker in his 2017 State of the Union speech and Roadmap for a More United, Stronger and More Democratic Union. In order to meet the EU membership criteria, comprehensive reforms must be realised, in particular through the rule of law, fundamental rights and governance, judicial reforms combating corruption and organised crime. Public administration and economic reforms must address structural weaknesses, low competitiveness and high unemployment. Reconciliation and solving open issues is another key focus area.

The enlargement perspective of the Western Balkans is first and foremost in the hands of the countries. The Strategy explains the indicative steps that need to be taken by Montenegro and Serbia – the two countries with accession talks already underway – to complete the accession process in a 2025 perspective. The timeframe is ambitious and requires strong political will and substantial reforms and results. Montenegro needs to place a particular focus on the rule of law and the fight against corruption and organised crime. For Serbia, substantive reforms are necessary on the rule of law, the economy and promoting reconciliation and a normalisation of relations with Kosovo.
As the only countries in the region negotiating at present, Montenegro and Serbia are the current front-runners, but reforms are more important than timelines. The two countries have a strategic interest in being advocates of the aspirations of their neighbours, who are inter-dependent and will progress faster if they help each other along the way.

Open doors
All Western Balkan countries can move forward on their respective European paths with the ability to catch up or overtake each other depending on progress. The European Commission has recommended that the Council should open accession discussions with the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Albania, in light of the progress achieved, and with continued reforms in the area of judiciary and fundamental rights and justice, freedom and security.

With sustained effort and engagement, Bosnia and Herzegovina could also become a candidate for accession. Kosovo has an opportunity for sustainable progress through implementation of its Stabilisation and Association Agreement – the framework of relations between the EU and Western Balkan countries.

Presenting the annual Enlargement Package to the European Parliament in Strasbourg on 18 April, High Representative/Vice-President of the Commission Federica Mogherini said: ‘Enlargement is an investment in peace, security, prosperity and stability in Europe. It is in our own interest to have a successful enlargement policy. ‘The Strategy provides a shared, clear, unequivocal, credible and concrete perspective for each country’s integration. To make the process of the Western Balkans towards the EU irreversible and keep reuniting the Continent.’

The European Commissioner for European Neighbourhood Policy and Enlargement Negotiations, Johannes Hahn, concurred that the door to the Union is open. ‘We are strengthening the enlargement process which requires credible efforts and reforms in return, in particular to strengthen the rule of law. We have to work for the benefit of the citizens.’

Both High Representative/Vice-President Mogherini and Commissioner Hahn joined President Jean-Claude Juncker on the tour of the Western Balkans.

Text: Susanna Dunkerley/ETF
Infographic: European Commission

OVERVIEW OF THE EU RELATIONS WITH THE WESTERN BALKANS

| Bosnia and Herzegovina – Candidate country |
| Submitted application to join the EU in February 2016. |

| Montenegro – Candidate country |
| Opened chapters – 30 |
| Provisionally closed chapters – 3 |

| Serbia – Candidate country |
| Opened chapters – 12 |
| Provisionally closed chapters – 2 |

| Kosovo – Potential candidate |
| In April 2016, the Stabilisation and Association Agreement entered into force. |

| Albania – Candidate country |
| On the basis of fulfilled conditions, the Commission recommends to open accession negotiations. |

| The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia – Candidate country |
| On the basis of fulfilled conditions, the Commission recommends to open accession negotiations. |

PROVIDING THE FINANCIAL MEANS FOR A SUCCESSFUL ACCESSION
The Torino Process is renowned among the ETF’s partner countries as being a sharply focused tool for analysing and monitoring progress in vocational education and training reform.

Launched in 2010, the flagship programme enters its fifth round in 2019. This time, the ETF plans to turn the laser beam of its own tools on itself by evaluating where the Torino Process is going and if it is on course to address the fast evolving needs of skills education and training systems.

As a first step, the ETF drew together a group of top international experts on policy evaluation for a one-day brainstorming session in Turin, in late February to explore what policy evaluation means, its implications and feasibility.

Billed a ‘closed-door’ day of reflection on evaluation and the future of the Torino Process, the meeting brought together people with a wide range of experience in public and private institutions, extending beyond the realm of vocational education. This included UNESCO’s Paris-based International Institute for Educational Planning, the UK-based International Institute for Environment and Development, Lithuania’s Public Policy and Management Institute, and the UN Women Global Evaluation Advisory Council.

Live&Learn spoke to two international experts to understand more about the world of policy evaluation and why it is a growth industry.

‘Evaluation for international development is being driven by the need for transparency,’ says Susan D. Tamondong, an advisor to the UN Women Global Evaluation Advisory Panel and vice president of IDEAS – the International Development Evaluation Association. ‘Stakeholders are demanding to know where their money is going; people in the West pay a lot of tax and they want to know what happens to that international development spend.’

Philippines-born Tamondong, who has more than 20 years’ experience in international development in more than
50 countries, working for the World Bank, the UNHCR, NGOs and private consulting companies, says the demand for evaluation is not restricted to the public sector. ‘For the private sector there is more transparency in terms of markets and products – corporate responsibility demands evaluation. In both the private and public sectors there is a need for transparency and knowledge.’

Evaluation as a science has been around since the 1960s, but today’s expanding evaluation industry received a major boost in 2005 with the OECD’s Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness, driving the concept of ‘impact evaluation,’ she notes. ‘Take, for example, the Philippines policy of elementary school attendance, which is mandatory but free. However, you must pay for uniforms and other items and though literacy rates have improved, one of the unintended consequences is that it prevents kids helping out in the household or on the farm.’ ‘Governments often overlook the needs that arise; with evaluation you learn what is missing.’

Tamondong, who contributed a chapter on the developing world to The Future of Evaluation: Global Trends, New Challenges, Shared Perspectives*, says countries such as Kenya, Nepal, India and Sri Lanka are all looking now at introducing policy evaluation at a governmental level. ‘They can see the merit in having more transparency and public accountability as tools for economic development,’ she says, adding that evaluation can also help ‘curb corruption.’

Observing that ‘evaluation is becoming a key tool for social justice internationally,’ she remarks: ‘The Torino Process is commendable; it is going in the right direction, but monitoring is not enough alone – you only look at outcomes. You need to look at what worked in policies or implementation; what made it work or not and how.’

Rafael Popper, Principal Scientist in Business Innovation and Foresight at VTT Technical Research Centre of Finland, Helsinki, has a resume that spans the world of commerce and academia. An economist who studied at the Central University of Venezuela, he is Professor of Foresight and Innovation Management at Moscow’s Higher School of Economics and an Honorary Research Fellow at the Manchester Institute of Innovation Research. Multilingual Professor Popper – his languages include Spanish, English and Hungarian (the result of spending several of his teenage years there when his parents were working in Budapest) – is also CEO of a UK and Czech Republic-based consultancy firm, Futures Diamond.

Professor Popper says the answer to what is driving the increased use of evaluation internationally ‘depends on who is doing the evaluation and for what purpose,’ adding: ‘If the evaluation is done by an international agency such as the ETF, the EU or the United Nations, there may be an explicit or implicit interest in shaping an agenda, because there is an existing policy agenda to which you want countries to align.’

The Torino Process is ‘a fascinating programme’ he says, which ‘if well implemented, could lead to the alignment of policy development and the political agenda’ of the EU. A programme supporting improved policies and implementation in vocational education in EU partner countries could have direct relevance to the political debate on ‘what kind of immigrants’ are needed, he says, adding that targeted evaluation could help improve it. ‘If you understand EU demand and you evaluate supply and the gaps between supply and demand and can shape future supply to future demand, you have a powerful programme.’

Raising awareness of the value of evaluation in policy development will help to shape the next round of the Torino Process.

Text: Nick Holdsworth
Photos: Gary Bonge/ETF

OFF THE PRESS AND ON THE WEB | NEW

NEW PUBLICATIONS

Guide to policy analysis
Based on the ETF’s long-running experience, this guide provides operational guidance to partner countries on policy analysis techniques across the entire cycle: agenda setting, policy formulation, policy implementation and policy evaluation. It includes key notions, conceptual frameworks and applications, as well as useful case studies.

europa.eu/!qY74pd

Continuing professional development of vocational teachers and trainers in the Western Balkans and Turkey
Aimed at policy makers and responsible agencies, this regional overview covers the extent and character of provision across the region: Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Kosovo, Montenegro, Serbia and Turkey.

europa.eu/1rQ99Rm

TUNE IN ON THE TUBE

Did you know there are 200+ mini movies on the ETF YouTube channel? www.youtube.com/etfeuropa

The skills dimension of migration
Meet Slava from Belarus, a lift installer in Helsinki, Finland, and Marva from Syria, a dental technician updating her skills to find a similar job in Kyiv, Ukraine. What do they share in common? They are both young migrants benefiting from having their skills and qualifications recognised and validated.

Ukraine: goo.gl/1Fw4TK
Finland: goo.gl/rhSGgg

NEW WEBSITE

The ETF’s new-look website is coming soon!