Gender dimension of labour market transitions

Implications for activation and skills development policies of the EU neighbouring countries

Key findings
Objectives and Method of the Study (1)

**Motivation and Objectives**

- Reducing gender inequalities and promoting female employment increases social justice and increases GDP
- Taking stock of the gender dimension in labour market transitions
- Understanding labour market barriers for women, inequalities, and causes of inequalities in ETF PCs
- Review policy responses in the area of ALMPs and vocational guidance from a women’s perspective (gender sensitiveness, gender-responsiveness and the gender transformative approaches)
- Understanding what works and which challenges for policies
- Recommendations
Objectives and Method of the Study (2)

- **Methods**
  - Reviewing available literature
  - Analysing available data.
  - Survey on active labour market programmes conducted (mainly) among Public Employment Services in ETF Partner Countries (Jan-March 2023)

Countries for which answers to ETF Survey on active labour market programmes (ALMPS) and career guidance were received and/or additional sources consulted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Central Asia</th>
<th>Eastern Partnership</th>
<th>Western Balkans and Türkiye</th>
<th>Southern and Eastern Mediterranean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kazakhstan</strong></td>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kyrgyzstan</strong></td>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Bosnia and Herzegovina</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tajikistan</strong></td>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Kosovo*</td>
<td>Egypt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Uzbekistan</strong></td>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>Morocco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Türkiye</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key findings
Gender inequalities
Employment and activity rates

- **Gender gaps** in labour force participation and gender employment gaps have **narrowed** in a number of ETF Partner Countries over the past decade (and earlier).

- However, **in some countries, progress has been slow**, or have even been reversed.

- Those countries with very **high gender employment gaps** are also characterised by **very low employment rates of women** (mainly in Southern and Eastern Mediterranean countries).

- In a few countries employment rates are comparatively low for both men and women.
Activity and employment gaps in 2021, in percentage points

Note: for DZ 2019, EG 2020, KG 2020, ME 2020, UZ 2020, no female employment rate data available for Algeria

Gaps are calculated at the difference between male and female rates

Source: ETF collected datasets / KIESE, Eurostat for EU 27
Activity rate of women and employment rate of women (15+) in 2021

Note: for DZ 2019, EG 2020, KG 2020, ME 2020, UZ 2020, no female employment rate data available for Algeria

Gaps are calculated at the difference between male and female rates

Source: ETF collected datasets / KIESE, Eurostat for EU 27
Firms with female top manager (in % of firms)

- Kyrgyz Republic - 2019: 32.90%
- Kazakhstan - 2019: 26.00%
- Syrian Arab Republic - 2009: 22.80%
- North Macedonia - 2019: 21.30%
- Belarus - 2018: 21.10%
- Armenia - 2020: 19.10%
- Moldova - 2019: 18.60%
- Serbia - 2019: 18.20%
- Albania - 2019: 18.10%
- Ukraine - 2019: 17.70%
- Bosnia and Herzegovina - 2019: 16.60%
- Georgia - 2019: 16.50%
- Azerbaijan - 2019: 16.50%
- Montenegro - 2019: 15.00%
- Uzbekistan - 2019: 12.40%
- Tunisia - 2020: 10.40%
- Israel - 2013: 10.10%
- Tajikistan - 2019: 6.60%
- Egypt, Arab Rep - 2020: 6.30%
- Lebanon - 2019: 5.90%
- Morocco - 2019: 5.40%
- Turkie - 2019: 3.90%
- Jordan - 2019: 3.10%
- Kosovo - 2019: 2.70%
- West Bank and Gaza - 2019: 0.90%

World Bank Database (IC.FRM.FEMM.ZS)
The gender unemployment gap tends to be larger in those countries where unemployment rates are at a high level for both men and women.

Countries where unemployment rates are at a high level for both men and women (in particular SEMED). The high unemployment rates for women may discourage some women to search for a job.

In contrast, in Central Asian countries and some Eastern Partnership countries, and Israel, the unemployment rate of women is comparatively low, ranging between 2% and 10%, and is close to or even below that for men.

Among young NEETs, young men tend to be more often unemployment, while young women are more often inactive.
Unemployment rates by gender, 2021

Source: ETF collected datasets / KIESE, Eurostat for EU 27
Quality of job matters

- Women are at higher risk than men to be in **vulnerable employment**
- High share of women among helping family members, and high share of men among own-account workers
- **The gender pay gap is generally high**
  - Women tend to be more often employed in **occupations and sectors where pay is relatively lower** for a given level of education and skills.
  - Another reason is that women are **weakly represented in managerial positions**.
Root causes for gender inequalities at the labour market
Gender stereotypes and social norms

- Gender stereotypes and social norms **a great impact on**
  - the **female labour market participation** rate
  - the guidance and **choice of VET and tertiary education** study fields
  - gender distribution of **unpaid care work and lack of quality childcare facilities**
  - They also influence **men’s beliefs and attitudes**.
  - They influence **employers’ behaviours in their recruitment choices**, generate and foster prejudices on women’s abilities and competences, and influence employers’ human resources management **approaches to career progression**.
  - They influence **access to productive and financial resources**
  - They **render labour market integration of migrant women and female refugees even more difficult**

- **There are large differences with respect to the strictness of social norms and the breadwinner models:**
  - between urban and rural areas
  - between education levels
  - between the four ETF PCs regions, and within these regions.
Level of inequality in access to productive and financial resources as well as score for discrimination in the family

Source: OECD 2019, own compilation
Raising educational levels of women but gender segregation remains a concern

- **Women have caught up in terms of education** and often have a higher qualification level than men.
- Nevertheless, they have more difficulties in accessing the labour market.
- One reason is a focus on specific study fields; **educational and occupational gender segregation prevails**.
- However, compared to EU, **in many ETF PCs women are more often pursuing STEM studies**, including ICT and engineering.
- **Women are still largely underrepresented in technical occupations** of the vocational education and training system.
- **Current and future challenges are related to the digital and green transitions**, as women may be less well equipped with relevant skills, and as women may face **higher barriers than men in accessing STEM-related jobs and retaining their employment** in these jobs.
Participation in lifelong learning (LLL), by gender (rates in %)

Source: ETF collected datasets / KIESE, Eurostat for EU 27, compilation by the author
Policy responses:

ALMPs

Career guidance and training measures
ALMPs

- PCs’ policies prioritize reducing gender inequalities.
- Several ETF PCs developed comprehensive strategies and introduced targeted employment services (including profiling unemployed and inactives and reaching out to inactive women)
- More women than men registered with Public Employment Services (PES)
- ALMPs targeted at specific groups of women
  - In particular, women with caring responsibilities, including single parents and women returning to the labour market
  - Women in rural areas
- There are significant differences in the share of female participants in different types of ALMPs (more likely employment incentives, less likely support to self-employment)
- Programmes for female refugees
- Limitation: low budgets for ALMPs
- Other policy areas: expansion of childcare, awareness raising
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labour Market Policy</th>
<th>For women only / or with a particular attention or focus on women</th>
<th>For both men and women</th>
<th>For women with young children or other caring responsibilities</th>
<th>Single parents</th>
<th>Women returning to the labour market after a child rearing break</th>
<th>Women in rural areas</th>
<th>Female university graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job search services</td>
<td>BA (attn), RS (attn), TJ (attn)</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, XK, KG, MD, RS, TJ, TN, TR, UA</td>
<td>AL, ZU</td>
<td>AL, KG, RS, ZU</td>
<td>AL, KG, TJ</td>
<td>AL, JO, KG, MD, RS, TJ, UZ</td>
<td>AL, KG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment incentives</td>
<td>AL, BA (attn), XK, RS (attn), TN</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, XK, ME, MD, RS, TN, TR</td>
<td>AL, GE, XK, ME, TR, UZ, AL</td>
<td>AL, RS, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, AM</td>
<td>AL, RS, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, TR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supported employment and vocational rehabilitation</td>
<td>RS (attn), TJ (attn), UZ,</td>
<td>AL, GE, JO, KZ, XK, KG, MD, RS, TJ, TN, TR, UA</td>
<td>AL, AM, UZ</td>
<td>AL, RS, TJ, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, TJ, UZ</td>
<td>AL, RS, UZ, AL</td>
<td>AL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct job creation programmes</td>
<td>RS (attn), TJ (attn)</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, KG, ME, MD, RS, TJ, TN, TR</td>
<td>AL, UZ</td>
<td>AL, KG, RS, TJ, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, KG, TJ</td>
<td>AL, KG, RS, UZ, KG</td>
<td>AL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start-up incentives</td>
<td>BA (attn), JO, RS (attn), TJ (attn)</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, KG, ME, MD, RS, TJ, TN, TR, UA</td>
<td>AL, UZ</td>
<td>AL, RS, TJ, UZ,</td>
<td>AL</td>
<td>AL, KG, RS, TR, UZ, AL</td>
<td>AL, UZ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Career guidance, upskilling and reskilling measures: some good practices

- Several PCs have implemented gender transformative actions in vocational career guidance
  - To encourage women to take up training in male-dominated professions
  - To strengthen interest of girls and young women in STEM, in particular technology, engineering and ICT
  - Targeting girls and young women but also their social environment and parents, teachers and school curricula
- Support for the development of digital skills, in cooperation with local stakeholders
- Enhancing participation of women in education and training measures (e.g. through scholarships)
- Examples for implementing packages of measures, including counselling, mentoring, internships in addition to the training measures.
- Evaluations worldwide show a positive impact of training measures on women.
### Career guidance and training measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Labour Market Policy</th>
<th>For women only / or with a particular attention or focus on women</th>
<th>For both men and women</th>
<th>For women with young children or other caring responsibilities</th>
<th>Single parents</th>
<th>Women returning to the labour market after a child rearing break</th>
<th>Women in rural areas</th>
<th>Female university graduates</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career counselling and guidance</td>
<td>RS (attn)</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, XK, KG, MD, RS, TN, TR, UA, UZ,</td>
<td>KG, RS</td>
<td>AL</td>
<td>RS, TN, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, KG</td>
<td>GE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Re)training measures (all forms including skills assessment and validation)</td>
<td>BA (attn), RS (attn), TN</td>
<td>AL, AM, GE, JO, KZ, XK, KG, ME, RS, TJ, TR, UA, UZ,</td>
<td>AL, AM, KG</td>
<td>AL, AM, KG</td>
<td>AL, AM, KG</td>
<td>AL, KG</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations
Recommendations for PES and other employment and training stakeholders’ attention (1)

- **Improving the information base** by including a gender dimension in reporting in monitoring of PES activities, stocktaking of activities of other stakeholders, conducting studies and evaluations.

- **Designing comprehensive approaches** by considering the multitude of employment barriers women face, including:
  - access to affordable quality childcare,
  - taking actions to change male attitudes and perceptions,
  - conduct awareness raising activities,
  - linking training measures to workplace activities,
  - internship and placement.

- **Working in partnership**, and consolidate cooperation:
  - among public, private and civil society organisations
  - to address stereotypes in education, access to employment, insufficient gender sensitivity of social protection measures or business practices.
Recommendations for PES and other employment and training stakeholders’ attention (2)

- **Balancing gender-mainstreaming and dedicated gender-sensitive and gender transformative approaches in programming and policy development:**
  - **Implementation of a gender mainstreaming** approach for PES activities, including funding, monitoring and evaluation of services and programmes.
  - **Address deep inequalities** and employment gaps through for example
    - gender sensitive career guidance
    - introducing **transformative actions** to attracting women in male-dominated professions and men in female-dominated professions.

- **Investing** in removing barriers to women’s economic empowerment by
  - leveraging effective measures and **thus increasing budgets for PES services and ALMPs**
  - Continue measures and activities **co-financed** by international donors, to render successful or promising activities **sustainable**.
Thank you for your attention!

😊

Looking forward to the discussions and exchange of experiences