Torino Process 2022-2024

Monitoring of policy and system performance for lifelong learning: BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA 2023

Mihaylo Milovanovitch
Senior Human Capital Development Expert – Coordinator for System Change and Lifelong Learning
TORINO PROCESS ARCHITECTURE

Level 1
Monitoring policy and system performance

How well do education and training systems deliver good and equitable opportunities for learning?

Level 2
Reviewing national policies and systems

Which policies influence system performance for lifelong learning, and how?

- System-wide overview, all countries (annual)
- In-depth analysis of selected policies and themes (on demand)
MONITORING PERFORMANCE THROUGH OUTCOMES

**SYSTEM AND POLICY PERFORMANCE** = the extent to which countries deliver on their promises (commitments) to learners and other stakeholders in education and training
1. **Access** (Dimension A1)
2. **Participation** (Dimension A2)
3. **Quality/relevance** (Dimension B1)
4. **Excellence** (Dimension B2)
5. **Innovation** (Dimension B3)
6. **Responsiveness** (Dimension B4)
7. **System organisation** (Dimension C1)
8. **Resourcing** (Dimension C2)

(3 areas of commitment)

(8 monitoring dimensions)

(30 policy/system outcomes)
SCOPE OF MONITORING #2

Dimension A.1 ACCESS
Outcome A.1.1 Access and attractiveness: initial VET
Outcome A.1.2 Access and attractiveness: continuing VET
Outcome A.1.3 Opportunities for lifelong learning, including in-company training

Dimension A.2 PARTICIPATION
Outcome A.2.1 Flexible pathways: vertical permeability
Outcome A.2.2 Flexible pathways: horizontal permeability
Outcome A.2.3 Progression of learners to successive stages of education and training

Outcome A.1.1 Access and attractiveness: initial VET
Outcome A.1.2 Access and attractiveness: continuing VET
Outcome A.1.3 Opportunities for lifelong learning, including in-company training

Dimension B.1 QUALITY AND RELEVANCE
Outcome B.1.1 Key competences for lifelong learning and quality of learning outcome
Outcome B.1.2 Adult skills and competences
Outcome B.1.3 Participation in work-based learning
Outcome B.1.4 Employability of learners
Outcome B.1.5 Participation in career education

Dimension B.2 EXCELLENCE
Outcome B.2.1 Excellence in teaching
Outcome B.2.2 Excellence in learning

Dimension B.3 INNOVATION
Outcome B.3.1 Systemic innovation in teaching and learning
Outcome B.3.2 Equitable digitalisation
Outcome B.3.3 Engaging learning environments
Outcome B.3.4 Diversification of VET services

Dimension B.4 RESPONSIVENESS
Outcome B.4.1 Relevance of learning content: green transition
Outcome B.4.2 Relevance of learning content: digital transition
Outcome B.4.3 Responsiveness of programme offering

Dimension C.1 STEERING AND MANAGEMENT
Outcome C.1.1 Data availability
Outcome C.1.2 Participatory governance
Outcome C.1.3 Reliable quality assurance and public accountability
Outcome C.1.4 Professional capacity of staff
Outcome C.1.5 Internationalisation

Dimension C.2 RESOURCING
Outcome C.2.1 Adequate financial resource allocations and use
Outcome C.2.2 Adequate human resource allocations and use
Outcome C.2.3 Adequate material base

Age
- Youth
- Adults

Gender
- Female
- Male

Learning setting
- Formal
- Non-formal

Populations of strategic interest
- Disadvantaged youth
- Long-term unemployed
- Inactive
- Migrants

Pathway
- General
- VET
COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF MONITORING EVIDENCE

- Collection of qualitative data
- Calculation of system performance indices (SPIs)
- Reporting to countries
- Thematic studies
- In-depth analysis through policy reviews (Torino Process Level 2)
TORINO PROCESS VET SYSTEM MONITORING RESULTS
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA 2023
INTERNATIONAL COMPARABILITY AND CONSISTENCY OF MONITORING RESULTS

FIGURE 1. COMPARABILITY AND CONSISTENCY OF MONITORING RESULTS: BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA (2023)

International comparability of performance results (0=least comparable, 100=fully comparable)

Bosnia and Herzegovina: 47.4/100
International average: 33.6/100

Risk of bias regarding system performance (0=highest risk, 100=lowest risk)

Bosnia and Herzegovina: 38.3/100
International average: 45/100

Tendency to be self-critical regarding system performance (most critical=0, neutral=50, least critical=100)

Bosnia and Herzegovina: 41.8/100
International average: 52.8/100

Source: Torino Process monitoring database
KEY TAKEAWAYS

Access and Attractiveness: The VET system of BIH faces accessibility and attractiveness issues, especially for the CVET subsystem. VET supports its learners effectively, reducing dropout rates, but needs increased flexibility for learners who want to switch between parallel educational paths.

Quality and Participation: The quality and relevance of VET in BIH presents a challenge, particularly for younger learners. Despite the satisfactory level of career guidance and the country's adaptability to strategic changes such as digitalization, the skills gained from the program do not necessarily translate into increased employability.

Excellence and Innovation: BIH is committed to achieving excellence and innovation, with mixed results. The efforts to promote high-quality teaching and PD have had average success, while governance and provider management have seen more significant improvement. The system's capacity for promoting inclusivity and innovation could be enhanced.

System Management and Organisation: The VET system demonstrates both strengths and weaknesses in organisational efficiency and performance. Despite a good ability to manage data and strong leadership, engaging external stakeholders needs attention, just like quality assurance, human resources management, and strategic allocation of material resources.
OVERVIEW OF BIH VET SYSTEM PERFORMANCE ACROSS KEY DIMENSIONS

**STRENGTHS:** PARTICIPATION IN LEARNING (DIMENSION A.2) WITH STRONG RETENTION ONCE ENROLLED BUT POTENTIAL BARRIERS AT ENTRY LEVEL; STEERING AND MANAGEMENT (DIMENSION C.1) SLIGHTLY ABOVE AVERAGE

**WEAKNESSES:** LOW ATTRACTIVENESS (DIMENSION A.1), INDICATING NEED FOR IMPROVED ACCESS POLICIES

SUB-OPTIMAL QUALITY AND RELEVANCE OF LEARNING (DIMENSION B.1)

RESOURCE AND RESOURCE ALLOCATION SHORTAGES (DIMENSION C.2)

MODERATE RESULTS REGARDING EXCELLENCE (DIMENSION B.2); MORE EFFORT NEEDED TO INTEGRATE INNOVATIVE PRACTICES (DIMENSION B.3)

AVERAGE ADAPTABILITY TO EXTERNAL CHANGES (DIMENSION B.4), MORE ATTENTION TO LABOUR MARKET NEEDS
OUTCOMES TRACKED: ACCESS TO IVET, CVET, AND OTHER LIFELONG LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES, PERMEABILITY OF THE VET SYSTEM, AND PROSPECTS OF LEARNERS TO GRADUATE AND PROGRESS TO SUBSEQUENT LEVELS

RESULTS - ACCESS: SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCES IN ACCESSIBILITY AND ATTRACTIVENESS BETWEEN IVET AND CVET

BOTH VET SUBSYSTEMS ARE LEGALLY ACCESSIBLE, BUT PERFORM POORLY IN PROMOTING LEARNER ACCESS

ACCESS AND ATTRACTIVENESS ARE KEY AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT IN BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA’S VET SYSTEM

CHALLENGES IN ACCESSING ADULT EDUCATION EXTEND BEYOND VET PROGRAMS, OFTEN DUE TO COSTS BORNE BY LEARNERS
PARTICIPATION AND PERMEABILITY OF VET IN BIH (AREA A)

STRENGTHS: LOW RISK OF FAILURE AND DROPOUT FOR ENROLLED VET LEARNERS

ROBUST SUPPORT FOR VERTICAL PERMEABILITY, ALLOWING LEARNERS TO ADVANCE OR TRANSITION TO DIFFERENT PATHWAYS

AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

CHALLENGES EXIST IN HORIZONTAL PERMEABILITY, I.E., TRANSITIONING BETWEEN PARALLEL TRACKS OF EDUCATION

A ROBUST SYSTEM FOR VALIDATING PRIOR LEARNING AND INCREASED SYSTEM FLEXIBILITY WOULD ENHANCE THE LEARNING AND CAREER PROSPECTS FOR LEARNERS
QUALITY OF LEARNING AND PROVISION OF BASIC SKILLS (AREA B 1)

YOUNG LEARNERS: BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA’S VET SYSTEM FACES CHALLENGES IN DELIVERING QUALITY EDUCATION TO BOTH YOUNG AND ADULT LEARNERS.

STUDENTS IN VET DO NOT ACQUIRE ADEQUATE LEVELS OF BASIC LITERACY AND NUMERACY

ADULTS: ADULT LEARNERS POSSESS BASIC SKILLS MORE FREQUENTLY THAN YOUNGER LEARNERS, BUT THESE COMPETENCIES ARE LESS DEVELOPED COMPARED TO OTHER COUNTRIES.

LACK OF COMPREHENSIVE MONITORING SYSTEM FOR ADULT EDUCATION MAKES PROFICIENCY EVALUATION A CHALLENGE.

SHARED GAPS: EMPLOYERS INDICATE INSUFFICIENT FOREIGN LANGUAGE, DIGITAL, IT, SOFT AND SOCIAL SKILLS AMONG ADULT LEARNERS.
EXPOSURE TO WORK AND EMPLOYABILITY OF GRADUATES (AREA B 1)

**LINKS TO WORLD OF WORK**: AVERAGE EXPOSURE TO THE WORLD OF WORK IN VET PROGRAMS; EXAMPLE OF GOOD WORK-BASED LEARNING IMPLEMENTATION IN SOME CANTONS. INCREASE IN PRACTICAL TRAINING HOURS IN IVET EXPECTED TO ENHANCE VET ATTRACTIVENESS.

**EMPLOYABILITY**: BIH LAGS BEHIND THE INTERNATIONAL AVERAGE IN TERMS OF EMPLOYABILITY OF VET GRADUATES; LONG-TERM UNEMPLOYMENT COMMON AMONG IVET GRADUATES.

**CAREER GUIDANCE**: EMPHASIS ON CAREER GUIDANCE, WITH GOOD PROVISION OF INFORMATION ON PROFESSIONS AND EDUCATION PROGRAMS.
**RELEVANCE OF VET AND RESPONSIVENESS TO LABOUR MARKET NEEDS**

(AREA B 1)

**ACTIONS:** EFFORTS TO IMPROVE RELEVANCE, SUCH AS INCREASED PRACTICAL WORK HOURS AND COLLABORATION WITH INDUSTRY PARTNERS.

**GREEN TRANSITION:** REASONABLE LEVEL OF ATTENTION SUSTAINABILITY AND CLIMATE CHANGE AWARENESS IN CURRICULA; PROGRESS IN INTEGRATING GREEN SKILLS.

**DIGITAL TRANSITION:** SOMEWHAT WEAKER PERFORMANCE IN DIGITAL SKILLS INTEGRATION IN THE FACE OF EVOLVING DIGITAL ECONOMY.

**CAREER GUIDANCE:** SPI SCORE FOR VET PROGRAM RESPONSIVENESS SLIGHTLY EXCEEDS THE INTERNATIONAL AVERAGE; READINESS TO ADDRESS BOTH STRATEGIC AND IMMEDIATE CHALLENGES..
EXCELLENCE AND INNOVATION IN THE VET SYSTEM (AREA B 2)

EXCELLENCE IN TEACHING AND CONTENT: EFFORTS TO PROMOTE HIGHEST QUALITY OF TEACHING, PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT, AND PROGRAMME CONTENT HAVE AN AVERAGE IMPACT.

EXCELLENCE IN GOVERNANCE AND PROVIDER MANAGEMENT: ACTIONS TO PROMOTE EXCELLENCE IN GOVERNANCE AND PROVIDER MANAGEMENT WERE MORE SUCCESSFUL.

EXCELLENCE FOR INCLUSION: THE SYSTEM’S ABILITY TO PROMOTE INCLUSIVITY COULD USE IMPROVEMENT.

INNOVATION: THE SYSTEM’S OPENNESS AND CAPACITY FOR INNOVATION IN SUPPORT OF ACCESS AND PARTICIPATION IN LIFELONG LEARNING COULD USE IMPROVEMENT TOO.
SYSTEM ORGANISATION (AREA C): DATA MANAGEMENT, STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT, AND INTERNATIONAL EXPOSURE

EVIDENCE AND DATA: OUTPERFORMS IN PROFESSIONAL CAPACITY OF STAFF IN LEADERSHIP POSITIONS, BUT VARYING OPINIONS ON THEIR COMPETENCES..

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT: AVERAGE ENGAGEMENT FROM THE PRIVATE SECTOR AND EXTERNAL STAKEHOLDERS IN DECISION-MAKING PROCESSES.

QUALITY ASSURANCE AND PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY: SCOPE FOR IMPROVEMENT IN PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY AND QUALITY ASSURANCE MECHANISMS.

INTERNATIONALISATION: MODEST EXTENT OF INTERNATIONAL EXPOSURE; NOT WIDESPREAD OR SYSTEMIC ACROSS VET LANDSCAPE. ERASMUS+ PROGRAMS HELP.
SYSTEM ORGANISATION (AREA C): STAFFING AND RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

LEADERSHIP CAPACITY: BIH OUTPERFORMS IN PROFESSIONAL CAPACITY OF STAFF IN LEADERSHIP POSITIONS, BUT VARYING OPINIONS ON THEIR COMPETENCES.

HUMAN RESOURCES: NEED FOR MORE EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES FOR PERSONNEL DEPLOYMENT AND CAREER MANAGEMENT IN VET SECTOR.

FINANCIAL RESOURCES: GOOD PERFORMANCE IN TERMS OF AVAILABLE FINANCIAL RESOURCES; HOWEVER, STRATEGIC ALLOCATION AND UTILISATION, ESPECIALLY FOR TEACHING RESOURCES AND INFRASTRUCTURE, NEED ENHANCEMENT.

MATERIAL BASE: SUBSTANTIAL INVESTMENTS IN PHYSICAL INFRASTRUCTURE, YET MORE REQUIRED, PARTICULARLY IN SMALLER CITIES.
GENDER ANALYSIS OF VET SYSTEM PERFORMANCE IN BIH

**YOUNG WOMEN:**

INCREASED ENROLLMENT IN 3-YEAR VET PROGRAMMES, ESPECIALLY IN SOME REGIONS

DEMONSTRATED RESILIENCE IN PARTICIPATION AND PROGRESSION WITHIN VET, EXCEEDING THE NATIONAL AVERAGE.

BENEFITING EQUALLY FROM QUALITY AND INNOVATIVE LEARNING STRATEGIES, ALIGNING WITH ALL LEARNERS REGARDLESS OF AGE OR GENDER.

POSSIBLE HIGHER OPPORTUNITIES FOR TERTIARY EDUCATION CONTINUATION, AS SUGGESTED BY PISA DATA.

**ADULT WOMEN:**

FACE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES ACCESSING VET, ESPECIALLY IN RURAL AREAS.

DESPITE ACCESS DIFFICULTIES, THEY DEMONSTRATE STRONG PARTICIPATION AND PROGRESSION WITHIN VET, SLIGHTLY MORE SUCCESSFUL THAN YOUNGER FEMALES.

ALSO BENEFITING FROM THE QUALITY, RELEVANCE, AND INNOVATIVE STRATEGIES OF VET LEARNING AS MUCH AS ALL OTHER LEARNERS.

PERSISTENT NEED FOR IMPROVEMENTS IN THEIR ACCESS TO VET FOR A MORE EQUITABLE SYSTEM.
ACCESS TO VET: FOR DISADVANTAGED YOUTH IS ABOVE NATIONAL AVERAGE DUE TO PERCEIVED SWIFT TRANSITION TO WORK, AND STRATEGIC SUPPORTS (SCHOLARSHIPS, FREE TRANSPORTATION, TARGETED PROGRAMMES).

PARTICIPATION AND PROGRESSION: DESPITE INITIAL ACCESS, PARTICIPATION AND PROGRESSION (DIMENSION A.2) FALL BELOW AVERAGE DUE TO SOCIO-ECONOMIC HURDLES.

THE IMPACT OF SUPPORT INITIATIVES REMAINS LIMITED, WITH MOST GRADUATES OPTING FOR IMMEDIATE WORK RATHER THAN HIGHER EDUCATION.

CHALLENGES EXIST IN NAVIGATING BETWEEN VET AND GENERAL EDUCATION PATHS.

QUALITY AND RELEVANCE: PERFORMANCE ALIGNS WITH NATIONAL AVERAGE IN QUALITY/RELEVANCE (DIMENSION B.1) AND INNOVATION IN ACCESS/PARTICIPATION (DIMENSION B.3).

EVIDENCE SUGGESTS DISADVANTAGED LEARNERS CAN MATCH THE ACHIEVEMENT OF ADVANTAGED STUDENTS WITH APPROPRIATE SUPPORT, YET IMPROVEMENTS NEEDED FOR OVERALL SUCCESS.
LONG-TERM UNEMPLOYED LEAN TOWARDS VET, PERFORMING ABOVE AVERAGE IN ACCESS TO LEARNING DUE TO SUPPORTIVE STAKEHOLDERS AND CVET OPPORTUNITIES.

ECONOMICALLY INACTIVE ADULTS AND THOSE WITH LOW/NO EDUCATION FACE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES IN ACCESSING VET, UNDER-UTILISING CVET OPTIONS DUE TO LIMITED RELEVANCE OR APPEAL IN THE ACQUISITION OF BASIC SKILLS AND TRANSITION TO LABOUR MARKET, BOTH LONG-TERM UNEMPLOYED AND ECONOMICALLY INACTIVE GROUPS PERFORM LOWER THAN AVERAGE, INDICATING A NEED FOR PERSONALISED SUPPORT MEASURES.

ALL LEARNER GROUPS BENEFIT FROM INNOVATIVE APPROACHES LIKE DIGITAL SERVICES, JOB MATCHING SYSTEMS, AND THE ESTABLISHMENT OF DEDICATED DEPARTMENTS.

WHILE VET SYSTEM SHOWS NO MAJOR BIASES, THERE IS STILL ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT TO ENSURE SYSTEM-WIDE BENEFITS FOR THESE DISADVANTAGED GROUPS.
Migrants can access VET on par with other groups, but face significant challenges within the VET system upon entry. Significant limitations for migrants in active participation and successful completion within the VET system. Limitations for migrants may be influenced by perceptions of Bosnia and Herzegovina as a non-permanent destination. Language barriers and issues with recognition of prior learning act as hurdles for migrants' performance. Best performance for migrants is in quality and relevance, but limited data on basic skills and competencies acquisition. Lack of comprehensive data on migrant learners hinders development of effective policies and programmes.
**KEY TAKEAWAYS**

**Access and Attractiveness:** The VET system of BIH faces accessibility and attractiveness issues, especially for the CVET subsystem. VET supports its learners effectively, reducing dropout rates, but needs increased flexibility for learners who want to switch between parallel educational paths.

**Quality and Participation:** The quality and relevance of VET in BIH presents a challenge, particularly for younger learners. Despite the satisfactory level of career guidance and the country’s adaptability to strategic changes such as digitalization, the skills gained from the program do not necessarily translate into increased employability.

**Excellence and innovation:** BIH is committed to achieving excellence and innovation, with mixed results. The efforts to promote high-quality teaching and PD have had average success, while governance and provider management have seen more significant improvement. The system’s capacity for promoting inclusivity and innovation could be enhanced.

**System Management and Organisation:** The VET system demonstrates both strengths and weaknesses in organisational efficiency and performance. Despite a good ability to manage data and strong leadership, engaging external stakeholders needs attention, just like quality assurance, human resources management, and strategic allocation of material resources.
THANK YOU!

Web

Twitter
@etfeuropa

Facebook
facebook.com/etfeuropa

YouTube
www.youtube.com/user/etfeuropa

Instagram
instagram.com/etfeuropa/

LinkedIn
linkedin.com/company/european-training-foundation

E-mail
info@etf.europa.eu

OpenSpace
openspace.etf.europa.eu