Data and analysis in Denmark
Agenda

1. Introduction
2. Data
3. The Danish Evidence Strategy
4. Discussions
The Danish Employment System

Ministry of Employment

National Labour Market and Recruitment - 3 regional divisions (AMK)

Employment council

KCL

Working Environment Authority, AT

Research Centre for the Working Environment, NFA

Analytical division

Analytical division

Unemployment benefit funds

Municipalities/Jobcenters

Other stakeholders/partners

External researchers/universities

International cooperation

Other interest organizations, DA/DI/FH etc.

Danske A- Kasser

KL

Analytical division

Analytical division

Unemployment benefit funds

Municipalities/Jobcenters

Other stakeholders/partners

External researchers/universities

International cooperation

Other interest organizations, DA/DI/FH etc.
Analytical division in National Labour Market and Recruitment

Data team (Klaus)
- GDPR & data (Teamchef: Søren)
  1. Per
  2. Rasmus
  3. Helle
  4. Mette
  5. Camilla
  6. Charlotte
  7. Teuta
  8. Pernille
  9. Nina
  10. Rasmus R
  + 3 studenter: Sissel, Mathilde og Anisa

- DSDW & data (Teamchef: Amalie)
  1. Moussa
  2. Josefine
  3. Jørn
  4. Mathias
  5. Jan
  6. Sanne
  + 1 student: Andreas

Communication (Teamchef: Amalie)
- Analysis team (Kristian)
  1. Anita
  2. Jonna
  3. Andreas
  4. Asbjørn
  5. Kathrine
  6. Janne
  7. Sarah
  + 1 student: Matthew

Analysis & Evidence
- Analysis & Evidence
  1. Simon
  2. Carsten
  3. Malthe
  4. Cecilie
  5. Sune
  6. Susanne
  7. Kasper
  8. Emilie
  9. Jeppe
  10. Natasha

  + 3 studenter: Natasha, Johnny, Carl
  + 2 Ph.d-studerende: Malte, Hannah

Labor market surveillance
- Labor market surveillance
  1. Kristian
  2. Esben
  3. Christian
  4. Rasmus

  + 2 studenter: Nikolaj og Alexander
1. Data
Great data is essential for good statistics and evaluations

In Denmark every person has an unique identifier. These identifiers can be used to combine elaborate data sets for statistical/research purposes.

Administrative data are collected:
Dates of start/end for example:
- Benefit types: Types and periods of recieving public benefits
- Treatments: Periods and types of participation in active measures, counselling sessions etc.
- Outcomes: Periods and types of jobs (wages in E-income-register, sectors etc) and education (SU-income) etc.

Survey data and interview data collected in evaluations:
- Experiences and opinions of unemployed, caseworkers, managers etc. are collected as part of the evaluation.
An example: DREAM register used for evaluations
Every person has its own “row”. Every treatment has its own number.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Id</th>
<th>week_1_1993</th>
<th>week_2_1993</th>
<th>...</th>
<th>week_19_2023</th>
<th>week_20_2023</th>
<th>week_21_2023</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XXX</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>111</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YYY</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>111</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZZZ</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>215</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

111 = Unemployed, Passive unemployment
213 = Unemployed, Activation Class room training
214 = Unemployed, Activation Ordinary education
215 = Unemployed, Activation Wage subsidy, Private
216 = Unemployed, Activation Wage subsidy, Public
217 = Unemployed, Activation Company based training, Private
218 = Unemployed, Activation Company based training, Public
100 = Employment

Share of people within a project with private wage subsidy jobs in a given week

Share of people within a project in employment in a given week
Databank publicly available on labor market statistics - Used for example by municipalities to compare themselves with each other

Go online: www.Jobindsats.dk
2. Accumulating evidence
What works based on counterfactual analysis – some examples

**Unemployed**
+ Counselling
+ Private wage subsidy jobs and company based training
+ Economic incentives and sanctions

**Vulnerable groups**
+ Personal jobcoach
+ Caseworker “beliefs on citizens”
  ÷ Caseworkers shifts

**Young people**
+ Young people without problems “turn around in door”
+ Vulnerable young: “Brobygningsforløb”

**Sickness benefit recipients**
+ Early contact to workplace and more.
Building the Danish Knowledge Base

A continuous accumulation of knowledge as part of the policy cycle.

The Danish knowledge-base plays an important role in evidence based policy making and implementation process:

1. Firstly policy proposals, which have been negotiated by political parties are articulated.
2. Secondly the political parties agree on new policy initiatives/legislations.
3. Then, initiatives/legislations are implemented.
4. Finally, the effects of new initiatives/legislations are evaluated.
   ❖ In almost every political agreement an evaluation of the initiative/reform is part of the agreement.
Governance model for the work on evaluations within National Labour Market and Recruitment

Evaluations are increasingly conducted within STAR.

1. **Policy making processes.** Decisions on evolutions are considered within the policy making process

2. **Political agreements.** Responsibility and organisation of evaluations are decided.

3. **Progress.** Twice a year status within STAR on the work of progress
The Danish Evidence Strategy

The framework for STARs work on evidence is formally described in the evidence strategy of the Ministry of Employment.

Jobcenters/social unemployment funds play an important role: They give input to determine where knowledge lacks, participate in projects, engage in networks etc.

• **Track 1: Accumulate knowledge about what works**
  - Literature reviews

• **Track 2: Innovate / create new insights**
  - RCT’s and econometrics/mathematical control groups

• **Track 3: Disseminate to politicians and practitioners**
  - Jobeffekter.dk and STAR.dk

A. Literature reviews

B. RCTs and effect evaluations based on econometrics

C. Other studies

Read more:

https://www.star.dk/viden-og-tal/hvad-virker-i-beskaeftigelsesindsatsen/reviews/


https://www.star.dk/viden-og-tal/analyser/
A. Literature reviews

- **A systematic collection of effect studies from research data bases.**
  - Conducted by external researchers
  - Define target groups, treatments or other dimensions subject to investigation
  - Define search words and search data bases
  - Search the litterature by title and abstract
  - Do a first screening to narrow down number of studies
  - Full text reading to find the final number of studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method: PICOS (Population, Intervention, Comparison, Outcomes, Study design)</th>
<th>“Distance meetings” - Search words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population</strong></td>
<td>employment; unemployed; displaced; job-seekers; job-search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intervention, outcome, comparison</strong></td>
<td>video, virtual, telephone, skype, online, web-based, distance meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Study design</strong></td>
<td>RCT; randomized/randomised controlled trial; experiment; case-control; review; meta-analysis; causal effect; impact; evaluation; natural experiment; quasi-experiment; instrumental variable; IV; exclusion restriction; regression discontinuity; propensity score matching; difference-in-difference; regression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Search databases - online-database</strong></td>
<td>Academic Search, EconLit, PsycInfo, Sociological Abstracts/Social Services Abstracts (samsøgt), Social Sciences Citation Index (Web of Science), Soc.Index Campbell, Proquest Dissertations &amp; Theses, IDEAS/RePEc. and others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Already conducted literature reviews:**

**Target groups:**
- Unemployed seniors
- Young people
- Non-western immigrants
- Former criminals
- People on sickness benefit
- People with affective illness and anxiety

**Treatments:**
- Training courses for young people
- Ordinary education within the employment system
- Company based training
- Counselling sessions

**Other:**
- Economic incentives
- Behavioral insights and nudging
- Progression indicators
- Caseworker issues and distance meetings
B. RCTs and other counterfactual effect evaluations based on econometrics

RCTs: 2005-2022:

- Hurtig I gang 1, 2005-2006 (Focus on early and intensive intervention, caseworker interviews and early activation, new UIB)
- Hurtig I gang 2, 2008-2009 (Focus on early and intensive intervention, caseworker interviews and early activation. Different design from Hurtig I gang 1)
- Alle I gang, 2008 (Focus on caseworker interviews, long-term recipients of social benefits)
- Aktive Hurtigere tilbage, 2009 (Focus on caseworker interviews, activation of recipients of sickness benefits)
- Unge-Godt I gang, 2009-2010 (Focus on caseworker interviews, early activations, mentors – young people under the age of 30 with and without education)
- På rette vej I job, 2010-2012 (Focus on caseworker interviews, company-based training, company based mentoring – recipients of social benefits)
- LVU-forsøget, 2011-2012 (Focus on job centre intervention versus intervention by private agencies – unemployed persons in long-term education/academics)
- Mentorforsøget, 2012-2013 (Focus on social mentors – young persons under the age of 30 who are recipients of social benefits)
- IPS 2012-2017: A systematic treatment for recipients with mental health problems
- Jobbro til uddannelse, 2018-2020: Focus on vulnerable young people into education
- + several RCT’s in the field of nudging /behavioral economics.

Econometric studies 2018-2021:

- Evaluering af projekt IPS: https://star.dk/media/9153/ips-rapport.pdf
- Evaluering af udvikling i fleksjob: https://star.dk/media/8743/udvikling-i-fleksjob.pdf
- Kvantitativ slut evaluering af Håndholdt indsat i Ressourceforløb: https://star.dk/media/13582/hir-kvantitativ-slutevaluering-2010582-1_1.pdf
- Evaluering af projekt Bedre Ressourceforløb: https://star.dk/media/13557/hir-sammenførsels.pdf
RCT - a systematic approach to gain new knowledge about effects

- Describe:
  - Target groups
  - Treatments
  - Outcome measures
  - Data

- Also describe:
  - Randomization procedure
  - Fidelity measures
  - Power calculations
  - GDPR

- Select municipalities
- Do a pilot
- And more...

Close cooperation with researchers and partners at the local level

- Dialogue before/during and after RCT with municipalities/jobcenters and unemployment benefit funds
- Define programs
- Technical issues: Collection of data, randomization procedures, fidelity measures, monitoring reports etc.
- The need for support of local level during projects like engaging in workshops, protocols, monitoring reports etc.
C. Many other analysis (50+ since 2018)

Unemployed close to the labor market

- Evaluering af pulje til nedbringelse af sygefravær (2023)
  Evaluering af puljen til nedbringelse af sygefravær i ældreplejen (star.dk)
- Evaluering af aftale om trYGgere dagpengesystem (2022)
  Evaluering af dagpengereformen – Et trYGgere dagpengesystem (star.dk)
- Evaluering af projekt med uddannelsesambassadører (2021)
  Ny evaluering af Projekt Uddannelsesambassadør II (star.dk)
- I hvilket omfang fører virksomhedsrettet indsats til beskæftigelse (2020) Analyse af virksomhedsrettede forløb (star.dk)

More vulnerable groups

- Afdækning af langvarig kontanthjælpsmodtagere (2022)
  Afdækning af langvarige kontanthjælpsforløb (star.dk)
- Udvikling i fleksjob II (2021)
- Kvalitativ erfaringopsamling af Udvikling i fleksjob II (star.dk)
- Evaluering af projekt Flere skal med 1 (2020) FLERE SKAL MED SLUTEVALUERING (star.dk)
- Evaluering af personlig assistance (2019) Rapport om evaluering af ordningen med personlig assistance (star.dk)
- Uddannelsesmodtageres veje i og uden for ydelsessystemet (2019) Uddannelseshjælpsmodtagernes veje i og uden for ydelsessystemet (star.dk)
- Uddannelseshjælpsmodtageres overgange til uddannelse og beskæftigelse (2018) Unges vej fra uddannelseshjælp til uddannelse og beskæftigelse (star.dk)
3. Communication channels
Jobeffekter.dk go online: www.jobeffekter.dk

Search for a job effect
The search feature allows the user to search for the effect of an intervention on a given target group.