EMBRACING THE DIGITAL AGE: THE FUTURE OF WORK IN THE WESTERN BALKANS

NEW FORMS OF EMPLOYMENT AND PLATFORM WORK

Implications for youth employment policies and skills development

COUNTRY REPORT: BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA
Disclaimer

This report was prepared for ETF by PPMI
Author: Hatidža Jahić
Editors: Vaida Gineikytė-Kanclerė and Ugnė Pilkionytė, PPMI
Coordination and supervision: Iwona Ganko, ETF

The contents of the report are the sole responsibility of the ETF and do not necessarily reflect the views of the EU institutions.
© European Training Foundation, 2022
Reproduction is authorised, provided the source is acknowledged.
PREFACE

The European Training Foundation (ETF) is engaged in the international debate about the future of work in developing and transition countries, in particular in the EU Neighbourhood and Central Asia. It has launched several actions analysing global transformations that impact labour market performance and skills demand, identifying the implications for workers and learners. Updating and consolidating the knowledge on recent changes in work patterns driven by digitalisation sheds light on key issues for employment and skills development.

This report is a part of the ETF study conducted in the 6 Western Balkan countries, following the work in the 6 Eastern Partnership countries The future of work: New forms of employment and platform work in the Eastern Partnership countries. The country-specific research and consultations in Bosnia and Herzegovina took place between December 2021 and May 2022. The manuscript was completed in June 2022.

The analysis confirms the huge impact of technological change on Western Balkan economies, including Bosnia and Herzegovina, with the Covid-19 pandemic accelerating digitalisation trends and increasing labour flexibility. New economic models with efficient matching of labour and skills demand and supply provide online-based employment opportunities and, to some extent, skills development. Young people take up those opportunities, which open up new markets and new ways of work, often becoming an alternative to migration. Therefore, beyond the inherent volatility of contractual relationships, issues of quality and inclusiveness, new forms of work are an important source of income, a place to use and develop skills, and a chance to harness entrepreneurial potential.

The ETF would like to thank the author - Hatidža Jahić, the PPMI team led by Vaida Gineiktė-Kanclerė and Ugnė Pilkionytė, as well as all the institutions and individuals in Bosnia and Herzegovina contributing to the reflection throughout the study. The report also benefited from a valuable input of the ETF experts – Cristina Mereuta, Eva Jansova, Anthony Gribben, Florian Kadletz and Stylianos Karagiannis. Silvia Ornano supported the implementation of the study. Iwona Ganko coordinated the study and supervised the preparation of this report.
# CONTENTS

## PREFACE

3

## CONTENTS

4

## INTRODUCTION

5

## SETTING THE SCENE

6

## NEW FORMS OF EMPLOYMENT

10

## PLATFORM WORK

12
- Remote platform work
- On-location platform work

## CURRENT REGULATION, POLICIES AND STRATEGIC APPROACHES

20
- Employment, training and digitalisation
- Regulation of the new forms of employment and platform work

## POLICY IMPLICATIONS

24

## SOURCES

26

## LIST OF REFERENCES

27
INTRODUCTION

Social, economic and technological changes within the EU and Neighbourhood countries, including Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH), have fostered a notable increase in labour market flexibility. New and non-standard forms of employment have grown in scale and prominence in recent years. Many of these new forms of employment deviate from traditional conceptions of work, both in terms of their legal and contractual form, as well as in practical working conditions.

Some of the most notable non-standard forms of employment include temporary employment; part-time and on-call work; temporary agency work and other multiparty employment relationships; as well as dependent self-employment. Besides the general trend of increasing flexibility in the labour markets, digitalisation enhances the development of non-standard forms of employment. Work through digital labour platforms is one of the more notable manifestations of recent transformations in the employment landscape, especially given the context of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Platform work is a new and expanding phenomenon and the key focus of this report. It can be defined as services provided on demand and for remuneration by people working through digital platforms. These platforms can facilitate the provision of both remote and on-location services that require varying skill levels, and – depending on the business model of the platform – exert various levels of algorithmic control over workers. Platform work has also different names, for example gig work, online freelancing, app work; or is simply better known by the brand of individual platforms such as Uber, Glovo, Upwork and many others.

This report examines the emergence of new forms of employment and platform work in BiH by relying on a mixed-method approach to data collection and analysis, involving desk research, interviews, and analysis of automatically collected data from the platforms. The in-depth research was complemented with a survey to identify priorities for policy actions.

The desk research and interviews were conducted in English and Bosnian between December 2021 and February 2022. Interviews targeted policy makers, representatives of business and worker associations, as well as platform companies operating in BiH and people working through these platforms.

The automatic data collection was conducted between November and December 2021, and targeted four platforms that are popular among freelancers from the Western Balkans - Freelancer.com, People Per Hour, Guru.com, and Hubstaff Talent. These platforms were selected based on the number of people from the region working through them, as well as the possibility to collect data in an automated way from the platforms. Upwork, one of the major platforms, could not be scraped automatically due to measures implemented by the platform to limit such activities at the time the automated data collection took place. Therefore, this platform was covered through alternative data collection methods.

---


SETTING THE SCENE

Bosnia and Herzegovina’s labour market has undergone a serious transformation in terms of transition and European integration reforms. The shift from centrally planned to a market economy, structural changes within the real sector of the economy, and developments within the education system (reforms, Bologna process implementation, etc.) have altered the context and framework of education, employment, and workforce in the country. However, many issues remain. Even though integration into the European Union (EU) has been identified as a “strategic goal” by BiH, a recent European Commission (EC) progress report outlined “limited progress visible.”

The health crisis resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic led to an economic crisis that has further limited progress in the country’s reforms. Data show that the pandemic led to a decrease in the real GDP growth by expenditure approach in the third quarter of 2020 compared to the same quarter of the previous year. This amounted to a decrease of 6.3%. According to seasonally adjusted data, GDP increased by 3.9% in the third quarter of 2020 compared to the previous quarter. Nevertheless, BiH and the entire Western Balkans region was recovering faster than expected by late 2021.

Notably, BiH struggles with structural unemployment, which implies a lack of jobs in relation to the number of job seekers. Relevant organizations and institutions at entity and local levels have sought a solution to this problem by stimulating the creation of new jobs through various programmes, projects, and initiatives, which are often supported by international organisations. However, these initiatives usually lack coordination and cohesion.

The labour market and its respective policy framework are highly decentralised, just like the majority of institutions in BiH, because of the complex administrative structure of the country. There are numerous relevant institutions at all levels: state level (Labour and Employment Agency of Bosnia and Herzegovina), entity level (Employment Bureau of the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Employment Bureau of Republika Srpska), at the cantonal level within the Federation (Employment services for each canton) and municipality level. The labour statistics from statistical offices at the entity level are not fully comparable, however, significant improvement is visible in capacity building at the state-level Agency for Statistics and its harmonisation with Eurostat and other international standards.

The overall labour market situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina is characterised as one of the most challenging in the Western Balkan region. The rate of total employment was 35.5% in 2019, with an unemployment rate of 15.7% and an activity rate of 42.1% in the same year. The share of those aged 25–49 in the total working-age population was 29.2% and 55.8% of those aged 25-49 were unemployed in 2019. The country continues to have one of the lowest female employment rates in the Balkans. The employment rate for females was 26.7% in 2019. and 44.6% for males in 2019.

Despite a downward trend in recent years, total unemployment is high, at 16% in the third quarter of 2021. Youth is especially affected by unemployment, with (36.6%) unemployment rate among those...
aged 15-24 in 2020. The share of youth not in employment, education or training (NEET) was similarly high (22% in 2020). Youth, women, people with lower levels of education, and those living in rural areas are the most affected by unemployment and inactivity.

The economic recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic turned out to be better than expected (from negative 3.2% growth of GDP in 2020 to estimated positive growth of 4.6% in 2021). However, the labour market recovery has been still lagging during the time of this study. According to ILO calculations, the country saw a decline in working hours of 7.4% in 2020 which is equivalent to 85,000 full-time jobs. In 2021, the loss of working hours decreased compared to 2020 but was still at 3.3% (equivalent to the loss of 37,000 full-time jobs).

The informal economy in the country is another notable problem. Although limited studies on the share of the informal economy in BiH exist, it was estimated that around 30% of the country’s GDP in 2016 was created in the informal economy. The share of informal employment within total employment was also relatively high at 30% in 2021.

Recent studies on the problems faced by the country’s youth, besides unemployment, emphasise international outward migration. The country is facing severe demographic challenges. The Global Competitiveness Report has ranked BiH, Croatia, North Macedonia, and Serbia at the top of the list of countries with the highest levels of brain drain. The same report estimates that BiH lost around 400,000 people in the period 2011-2019. Several recent reports have analysed in depth the reasons why young, educated and, in recent times, well-paid persons are leaving the country. Negative perceptions about the ongoing political and economic situation have become more significant factors in deciding whether to emigrate compared to individual motivations that have dominated in the past. These studies also show that the aspirations to leave the country could be minimized only with urgent and systematic socio-economic and political reforms.

Decentralisation of the education system is a relevant feature when talking about certain inefficiencies and inequalities at various education levels. The institutional and legal framework of the BiH education system is complex and consists of 14 institutions from all levels of government: state, entity (Federation of BiH - FBiH and Republika Srpska - RS), Brčko District (BD) and cantonal levels. The competencies of institutions from these levels are defined by the Constitution of BiH, the constitutions of the entities and the cantons, and the Statute of the Brčko District. Further significant decentralisation in education is present at the FBiH level compared to the institutional framework in the other entity (RS). Accordingly, in the FBiH the most important competencies are at the cantonal level, while in the RS it is at the level of the Ministry of Education and Culture (MPK). The Education Department of the Brčko District is an institution of the education system here.

10 Break in series for 2020 due to methodological adjustments
Fragmentation and decentralisation manifest on all education levels. As a result, spending on education is low and uneven among different cantons. The decentralized education system in BiH does not provide for a common vision and goals, leads to high administrative costs, and is a significant obstacle to improving existing learning outcomes. The current reforms are mostly dependent on the initiatives of international donors (EU, USAID, etc.) through various projects.

The rate of young people leaving education and training early decreased significantly in 2020 (when it stood at 9.9%) compared to 2010 (13.8%) and is lower than the EU-27 average, as well as the defined target. However, PISA 2018 results have shown the necessity for reforms regarding the quality of education. Over half of 15-year-olds were low achievers in all three PISA areas (mathematics, reading and science) when tested in 2018. Of the 79 participating countries, BiH ranked 62nd. In all three areas, adolescents in BiH are on average three years behind their peers in OECD countries. This has once again raised the question of education reform and the need for improving the functional literacy of BiH’s students.

A large proportion of students in secondary education attend Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). A recent study conducted by ETF showed less exposure to unemployment and vertical skills mismatch among people with VET attainment, compared to those with non-VET education. Also, the inactivity rate was higher for people with non-VET upper secondary education compared to VET graduates. Nonetheless, a mismatch between school-based occupations (occupations that emerge from school) and labour market needs remains. The complex and rigid institutional and legislative framework of the education system in BiH is struggling to meet the demands of the evolving labour market.

The participation of adults in lifelong learning programmes is very low and BiH lags significantly behind the EU average. Only 3.3% of adults aged 25-64 participated in training 2020, with young and highly educated more actively benefiting from lifelong learning opportunities (i.e., 9.4% of people aged 25-34 and 7.9% of the highly educated took part in trainings).

The process of digitalisation in BiH is also lagging behind other economies in the region. Eurostat data show that the percentage of individuals who have used the internet in the last 12 months in BiH increased in the period from 2018 to 2021 from 72% to 77%, respectively. Meanwhile, the percentage of households with internet access in BiH has increased from 69% in 2018 to 75% in 2021. Despite this progress, these shares remain the lowest among the countries in the Western Balkans.

According to Eurostat, only 24% of individuals in BiH had basic or above basic digital skills in 2019. This level of digital literacy ranks the country among one of the lowest in the Western Balkans and

20 Eg. USAID’s TABLA project (more at: https://www.usaid.gov/bosnia/news-information/fact-sheets/fact-sheet-tabla-general-education); EU’s Education for Employment, Bosnia and Herzegovina project (more at: https://education4employment.eu/about-the-project/) and others.
21 Early leaver from education and training, previously named early school leaver, refers to a person aged 18 to 24 who has completed at most lower secondary education and is not involved in further education or training; the indicator ‘early leavers from education and training’ is expressed as a percentage of the people aged 18 to 24 with such criteria out of the total population aged 18 to 24. Retrieved from: https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php?title=Glossary:Early_leaver_from_education_and_training
22 ETF (forthcoming). Report on skills mismatch measurement in ETF Partner Countries.
way below the EU average which was 58% in 2019. A significant difference exists between rural and urban households in terms of internet access, with 68% and 77%, respectively, having internet access in 2019. At the state level, the Ministry of Civil Affairs has led state-wide discussions on development of digital competences, resulting in the adoption of a state-wide strategy. However, although the state level is responsible for promoting dialogue on policy areas of interest to all education authorities, the Ministry of Civil Affairs does not have responsibility for policy implementation on any education, training, youth or employment initiatives.

Nevertheless, the 2020 Balkan Barometer, in its Analytical Report on Public Opinions, reported steady growth in the number of respondents pursuing training in ICT across the region. Moreover, the survey showed that 29% of people use the internet for education. The most common learning methods were free online training and workplace training. The report also pointed out that for 86% of companies from BiH digital skills were ‘somewhat or very important’.

The IT industry is a driver of innovation, products, and processes in other sectors of the economy. Currently, this sector in BiH generates about KM 500 million annually (approximately EUR 250 million, which is around 2% of GDP), and the average salary of employees in this sector is much higher than the national average (the average salary in BiH is around KM 1,000, approximately EUR 500). Some reports state that the maximum salary in the IT sector in BiH can reach up to KM 3,000 (approximately EUR 1,500). The sector is growing which increases the demand for specific digital skills. Because of this, it is also considered a strategic opportunity for BiH’s economy.

Due to the lack of digital skills among the population, the IT sector is experiencing a labour shortage. According to UNDP findings in 2020, out of the average of 926 vacancies for IT specialists that are posted annually, 388 cannot be filled. In most cases, the reason for this is the lack of candidates with the appropriate knowledge and skills. Employment in the ICT sector in the country is increasing by approximately 15% annually and given the growth of the sector, it is projected that there will be a deficit of around 6,000 employees in the field over the next five years.

Nevertheless, IT companies are cooperating increasingly with education institutions to bridge the gap between the education system and the labour market. This sector has organised itself into an association and is also an initiator of different activities such as scholarship programmes, competitions, and similar.

---

NEW FORMS OF EMPLOYMENT

Non-standard forms of employment are emerging in the context of recent labour market developments in BiH. One of the main factors that sped up the process of digital transformation was the COVID-19 pandemic as it changed the way of doing business. The pandemic also enhanced the labour market flexibility. New forms of work have been receiving increasingly more attention from policymakers and the public because the benefits of more flexibility and less rigid working arrangements, opening a possibility for better work-life balance. Low entry barriers also became more attractive during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Notwithstanding, the country has struggled to provide solid diagnostics and responses to socio-economic challenges, including to the pandemic. The decentralised governmental structure and administrative fragmentation are seen as some of the reasons hampering long-term reforms in education, labour market and social policies.

Limited knowledge exists on the involvement of the BiH workforce in new and non-standard forms of employment, such as temporary employment, part-time and on-call work, temporary agency work, and other atypical employment relationships. According to an interviewed labour market specialist, “lack of relevant and official data is the biggest issue in analysing new forms of employment”. Indeed, none of the three relevant statistical offices – the Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina (state-level institution), the Federal Bureau of Statistics (entity-level institution for the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina) and the Institute for Statistics of Republika Srpska (entity-level institution for Republika Srpska) – report on any of the non-traditional forms of employment. In this context, the findings presented further on the diverse types of non-standard employment are rather scarce. Statistical data is only available on self-employment and part-time employment. New forms of employment are not covered by employment services or active labour market programmes.

In 2019, out of total employment, 21.9% of individuals were self-employed in BiH. Out of total male employment, 22.9% were self-employed and among employed females, 20.4% were self-employed in 2019. Out of total employment, 91.3% were working full-time while 8.7% were working part-time (2019). Sector-wise, out of those employed in the industry sector 96.2% were working full-time and 3.8% were working part-time in 2019. In the services sector, 95.2% were working full-time and 4.8% part-time. When it comes to the average number of hours worked per week, persons in employment worked 41.6 hours per week in total. In the agriculture sector, people worked 38.4 hours per week, in the industry sector it was 43.3 hours per week, and in the services sector 41.6 hours per week in 2019.

---

40 Institute for Statistics of Republika Srpska. Retrieved from: https://www.rzs.rs.ba/front/category/14/
Entrepreneurship (in terms of running a small business) has also been increasing in the labour market, although the scope of these activities is unknown as official statistics are lacking. However, some data show that the number of enterprises is growing.48 Self-employed entrepreneurs and small business start-ups are especially common in the ICT sector. A young and educated workforce is working remotely for foreign markets and foreign employers. This enables them to earn more than they would working for an employer in BiH.49 According to interviews, many ICT experts have left their full-time jobs to work remotely. They provide services through platforms and through direct or indirect outsourcing from international clients. Many started their own businesses to provide ICT services as self-employed persons.

Freelance activities have become rather common in the BiH labour market. Despite the common belief that the demand for freelancing activities exists only for IT professionals, people with very different occupational profiles and skills engage in freelance activities for a living.50 According to claims of the Association of Freelancers in BiH, the estimated number of freelancers in the country is approximately 10,000,51 covering various types of freelancing (e.g., freelance business owner, “diversified employee”, “moonlighter”, independent contractor, etc).52 Nevertheless, despite the increased flexibility in the labour market, traditional employment remains preferable for the majority of workers and employers. An interviewed labour market specialist pointed out that “employers still prefer physical presence compared to working from home (remote work or online work). Both employers and workers are more form-oriented (i.e., focusing on the number of hours of work) than result-oriented.”

49 Interview with an ICT expert date 2021-12-16.
PLATFORM WORK

Various news outlets’ reports, online discussions, studies, and articles illustrate the growing popularity of platform work in BiH as one of the new forms of employment. Significant interest in platform work started when the question of taxation of income received from abroad was raised by the relevant tax authorities in BiH from 2015 to –2018. Subsequently, the Association of Freelancers of BiH “Freelance” was founded in 2018. As discussions on taxing income from abroad continued, the Association stirred up the public debate by lobbying for recognition of this new form of work, fair taxation, and social protection.53 As a result, the issue became very visible in the media.54 Since 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic has exposed the advantages and flexibility of this form of employment. The development of the IT sector and the increased demand for digital skills has further contributed to the popularity of platform work.

Digital labour platforms are gaining a foothold in the BiH economy, as more international and local platforms enter the market. Work on the platforms has been highly and continuously advertised on social media and popular web portals (e.g., www.klix.ba). The local on-location platforms are also proliferating and growing. For instance, a local on-location platform, Korpa, announced at the beginning of February 2022 that besides expanding in BiH, it will also enter the market in North Macedonia.55

However, legislation gaps and the challenges that platform workers face somehow impede the realisation of opportunities that this form of work can bring. As of early 2022, work via online platforms has gained the attention of policymakers regarding income taxation.

Remote platform work

The evidence collected throughout this research points to a trend of growing engagement on remote labour platforms56 in BiH, as people increasingly choose to provide their services through platforms such as Upwork, Freelancer.com, Guru.com and others. Besides the international platforms, there is also a domestic platform in BiH. Beecreative.ba, for remote platform work, launched in late 2020 and was developed by the Nahla Centre for Education and Research in Sarajevo, with the help of the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation SDC and the MarketMakers project.57 Beecreative.ba is advertised as a meeting place for professionals in the field of creative industry, IT and administration who are available and competent for occasional engagements on demand, as needed by employers (mostly SMEs).58

However, the exact number of platform workers from BiH is unclear. Due to limited data, the following findings are triangulated based on three available sources: the Online Labour Index (OLI)59, the Gigmetar60 report, and data automatically collected for the purposes of this study. It is important to

---

53 Association Freelance in BiH. Retrieved from: https://ufubih.org/
56 Remote labour platforms refer to digital labour platforms which provide a marketplace for freelancers to offer their services remotely and for companies or individuals to offers jobs/tasks/ projects. The platform intermediates services that are solely or mostly performed in the online world (e.g. AI training, image tagging, design projects, translations and editing work, software development). Examples of such platforms are: Upwork, Fiverr, Guru.com, etc.
note that while the data from the three sources complement each other and provide accurate indications of the scope of online work, the findings are not directly comparable:

- The Gigmetar report from August 2021 presents data on registered platform workers on Upwork, Freelancer.com and Guru.com.

- Automatically collected data in November 2021 represents registered platform workers on Freelancer.com, Guru.com, Hubstaff Talent, and People Per Hour platforms, which is the key data source used in this report.

- OLI data retrieved in January 2022 presents information on active (not registered) platform workers on four English language web-based freelancing platforms Fiverr, Freelancer.com, Guru.com, and People Per Hour.

OLI data illustrates the overall trend of increasing numbers of people form BiH engaged in remote platform work, although fluctuations in the numbers of active workers have been notable since 2017.61 Engagement in online work peaked in April 2021 and, as of early 2022, activity have been decreasing.

Figure 1. Change of engagement in online work among BiH workers on digital remote labour platforms in time, relative to 2017

Note: The graph presents the percentage change between the number of active workers from BiH on a specific day compared to the number of active workers at start of data collection in 2017, which is used as a reference date. This graph was based on OLI data which calculated a weighted estimate of currently active workers by periodically sampling workers on the four largest online platforms once every 24 hours.

Meanwhile, Gigmetar measurements of registered platform workers from August 2021 indicated that, overall, platform work in the region was stagnating after the strong expansion recorded in previous years. However, an increase in the number of remote platform workers was noted in some economies including a significant almost 40% increase in BiH (39.3%) between February 2021 and August 2021.62

Based on the automatically collected data from November 2021, there were 2,473 registered online workers from BiH on four selected online platforms.63 Considering the country’s total working-age population (aged 15-64) in 2020, the share of platform workers in BiH stood at 0.11%. However, out of

63 The four selected platforms for web-scraping were: Guru.com, Freelancer.com, Hubstaff Talent and People Per Hour.
the registered online workers around 19.3% were active workers while the rest had not received feedback or completed any projects. Guru.com was to be the most popular platform out of the four, with 1,626 (65.8%) BiH remote platform workers registered on this platform; however, very few of them were active – 0.3%. The distribution of BiH online workers across the four platforms is presented in the figure below.

Figure 2. Number and share of registered platform workers from BiH, by platform (November 2021)

![Figure 2](image)

However, these figures do not represent the total number of registered BiH platform workers as many could be working on other freelancing platforms. According to the Gigmetar report, the most popular platform was Upwork as 54.1% of all BiH freelancers were registered on this platform in August 2021. As of early 2022, there were about 10,700 reviews for individuals from BiH registered on Upwork, while on the four investigated platforms the sum of reviews was 10,500 in November 2021. It can be estimated, therefore, that the automatically collected data on the four platforms represents less than half of BiH activity on remote labour platforms.

Other data sources also show larger numbers of BiH remote platform workers on platforms other than the four selected. For example, as part of the Freelancing.ba initiative, backed by the JSGuru and MarketMakers project supported by the Swiss Government, a survey on the freelancing scene in BiH was conducted in 2020. The total number of respondents was 3,102 with an average age of 28 years old. The most commonly used platforms among the survey respondents were Upwork (44.1%), Freelancer.com (28.2%), Fiverr (20.8%), 99designs (8.7%), Toptal (4.8%), People Per Hour (3.1%), and Guru.com (3.6%). Out of the surveyed freelancers, 34.4% responded that they are not using any platforms for freelancing.

The automatically collected data from the four selected platforms showed that there were clear preferences for certain occupations among BiH online workers (see the figure below for occupational distribution). The most dominant occupation was creative and multimedia services, as 35% of registered workers from BiH indicated skills for such services. Creative and multimedia work was the most popular occupation on Freelancer.com, Guru.com, and People Per Hour (PPH), while on Hubstaff Talent more workers engaged in software development and technology work (which was the second most popular occupation at the regional level). The least popular occupations among registered BiH freelancers were professional services and sales and marketing support. Only around 100 workers were registered in each of these occupations (which is around 4% of all registered workers).

65 Freelancer.com, Guru.com, Hubstaff Talent, and People Per Hour platforms.
These findings are confirmed by the Gigmetar report and the Freelancing.ba survey conducted in 2021. According to the Freelancing.ba survey, the two fields that were the most common among the respondents were design and art (28.3%) and software development (21.8%). According to Gigmetar data on Upwork, Freelancer.com and Guru.com, in August 2021, 37.5% of registered platform workers from BiH were engaged in creative and multimedia work, 25.8% were working in software development and technology, and 17.1% in writing and translation.

Based on the automatically collected data, men were 2.8 times more likely to work on the four selected platforms than female workers from BiH. Out of all registered workers, 69.4% were male. Female workers represented only 24.4% of all registered freelancers, and the gender of 6.2% of profiles could not be identified (marked as ‘Other’ in the figure below). Male dominance was recorded on all four platforms; however, the share of female workers was higher on PPH and Hubstaff Talent platforms compared to Freelancer.com and Guru.com.

Male dominance was also observed in all occupations among BiH online workers. The most significant difference between male and female workers was in software and development work, where only 6% of female workers were engaged in this field compared to 15% of male workers.
11.7% of registered workers were female. The smallest difference was in writing and translation in which 44.6% of workers were female and 52% were male.

Figure 5. Gender of registered BiH platform workers, by occupation (November 2021)

![Gender of registered BiH platform workers, by occupation (November 2021)](image)

As mentioned above, the average respondent to the Freelancing.ba survey was 28 years old. The freelancers’ geographic location indicated that 75.5% of the survey respondents were from the Federation of BiH, 22.6% from Republika Srpska and 1.9% from Brčko District. Around 41.2% of surveyed freelancers had completed secondary school education.

The automatically collected data from the four selected platforms showed that the average hourly rate demanded by BiH freelancers was USD 13.8. The hourly rate differed markedly by platform. Online workers from BiH demanded higher rates on Hubstaff Talent and PPH platforms (USD 18 and USD 16.7, respectively) than on Freelancer.com and Guru.com (USD 14.3 and USD 14.5, respectively).

Figure 6. Average hourly rate in USD demanded by BiH platform workers, by platform (November 2021)

![Average hourly rate in USD demanded by BiH platform workers, by platform (November 2021)](image)

---

The difference in average hourly rate by gender was not as prominent as by platform. Out of all registered BiH freelancers, male workers tended to, on average, demand around one dollar more per hour than registered female workers (see the figure below). The Gigmetar report confirms these findings. It found that in August 2021, female platform workers on average demanded USD 17.7, compared to USD 18.9 requested by their male counterparts.\(^70\) This could be partially explained by the fact that more females engage in low-paid occupations online, such as clerical and data entry tasks and writing and translation.

**Figure 7. Average hourly rate in USD demanded by BiH platform workers, by gender (November 2021)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average total</td>
<td>13.93</td>
<td>12.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The requested hourly rates also varied depending on the occupation. Freelancers providing professional services demanded the highest rates – USD 17. Around USD 16 was requested by online workers in software development and technology and sales and marketing support. BiH freelancers in clerical and data entry and writing and translation occupations demanded the lowest rates – around USD 10.

**Figure 8. Average hourly rate in USD demanded by BiH platform workers, by occupation (November 2021)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clerical and data entry</td>
<td>10.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing and translation</td>
<td>10.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative and multimedia</td>
<td>13.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software development and technology</td>
<td>16.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales and marketing support</td>
<td>16.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional services</td>
<td>17.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, remote platform work offers **higher earnings** compared to the traditional market – although this remains highly dependent on successfully building a client base and client reviews.\(^71\) The average monthly wage in BiH in December 2021 was estimated to be around USD 560 (KM 1,007) which


\(^{71}\) Interview with a freelancer and an entrepreneur date 2022-01-20.
would roughly translates to USD 3.4 per hour. By contrast, USD 13 is the average hourly rate demanded on the four investigated platforms. Therefore, national rates are significantly lower and could seem less attractive to BiH workers looking for work. For example, software developers on Upwork demand hourly rates between USD 15 and USD 30 per hour, while some BiH freelancers on the platform charge rates of up to USD 80. Monthly salaries of developers in BiH range from USD 1,000 to USD 1,750. This means that the hourly rate for regular jobs in this sector ranges between USD 6 and USD 10. Nevertheless, according to the president of the Association Freelancers in BiH, securing a stable workload and ensuring a regular inflow of money remains the biggest challenge that freelancers face.

Information on career prospects, skills development and other work specific conditions of platform workers is unavailable in BiH. Popular digital labour platforms for remote platform work are very transparent in terms of skills, reviews, and earnings. However, upskilling remains the responsibility of the worker.

On-location platform work

The popularity of on-location services provided through platforms has increased significantly during the COVID-19 pandemic. This has been especially notable in the food delivery sector. Three food delivery service platforms are present in the BiH market: Donesi, Korpa and Glovo. The story of Donesi dates to 2006 when it was founded in Serbia and was limited to only eight restaurants in Belgrade. Since then, the company has expanded throughout Serbia and the wider region, including BiH and Montenegro. In 2021, this company was acquired by Glovo, a Spanish food delivery company operating through its mobile app. Meanwhile, the food delivery platform Korpa began operating in October 2020, during the pandemic. In fact, COVID-19 drove the demand for food delivery services to its peak in BiH. The founder of Korpa proudly said that during a time when “many were forced to close the doors and their business, [he] was working on the new project”.

Other types of on-location platforms are also present in BiH. A platform called “Savršeni krug” offers childcare services and specialises in matching parents with nannies. OLX is another highly popular platform that offers a wide range of services and was cofounded by the founder of Korpa. As of early 2022, around 6,000 services were provided through the platform in the areas of food, tourism, design and print, education and training, ICT, transport, law and finance, construction, etc. The highest-paid services on this platform are tow truck transport services, while printing services are the least well-paid. Although most services on OLX are location-based, some workers also provide remote services.

72 State Agency for statistics (2021). Retrieved from: https://bhas.gov.ba/Calendar/Category/13?lang=en. The hourly rate was calculated by using the average weekly working hours in BiH – 41.6 hours per week. The average working hours in BiH are presented in the Setting the Scene section of the report.
76 Beecreative.ba is offering possibilities for paid training in cooperation with partners and Nahla Education Center as one of its founders.
82 https://www.olx.ba/
83 Servisi i usluge. https://www.olx.ba/servisi-i-usluge
When it comes to on-location ride-hailing platforms, international platforms such as Uber, Bolt and others are not present in BiH. The platform Moj taxi\(^4\) was developed locally with funds from the Challenge to Change project and the Swedish embassy. It offers on-location taxi services, however it does not disclose any data on the number of drivers or vehicles available on the platform.

People learn about on-location platform work available on these platforms through promotional materials and ads which highlight the benefits of this form of employment. The increase in the daily number of orders and the expansion of platforms to different cities has led to an increase in the demand for couriers as of early 2022.\(^5\) For instance, Korpa was looking for couriers in eight different cities and was advertising the flexible working hours, the payment per delivery and per hour option, and the freedom to choose the means of transport via which the work would be conducted.\(^6\) Glovo was also advertising flexibility in terms of working hours and the compensation that is offered depending on experience and ratings. The recruitment process on Korpa and Glovo was conducted in an analogous way, through online applications which require candidates to submit a CV.

Working for on-location platforms is an attractive employment opportunity for some young people. It offers the ability to choose one’s working hours and receive decent earnings. For example, in Sarajevo, a courier can earn around KM 1,000 (around EUR 500) in five days working 8 hours per day.\(^7\)

Although most interviewees mention that delivery couriers are generally young men, there is no systemic information on the profiles of on-location workers in BiH, including the distribution according to age, gender, education and other demographics.

When it comes to the skills needed for employment in on-location platform work, the requirements are usually low and focus more on soft skills, such as basic communication skills. For example, Korpa listed the following skills needed to work as a courier: “kindness, creativity, responsibility are some of the basic qualities that every member of the Korpa team has”.\(^8\) Desk research also revealed that on-location platforms do not provide information on skills development and trainings, career prospects, or similar support for on-location platform workers.

\(^{4}\) More at: https://www.mojtaxi.ba/

\(^{5}\) Interview with an on-location platform worker working through Korpa, date 2022-01-15.

\(^{6}\) Dostavljaj za korpu. Retrieved from: https://korpa.ba/kurir

\(^{7}\) Interview with an on-location platform worker working through Korpa, date 2022-02-12.

\(^{8}\) Being part of Korpa team. Retrieved from: https://korpa.ba/kurir
CURRENT REGULATION, POLICIES AND STRATEGIC APPROACHES

Employment, training and digitalisation

The COVID-19 pandemic has exposed gaps in employment legislation and labour market policies in relation to new forms of employment, including remote employment, particularly when it comes to job protection. In some areas progress has been made, although limited.

The current strategic framework, which could encompass new forms of employment in BiH, is composed by the Employment Strategy of Republika Srpska for 2021-2027, and the Employment Strategy of the Federation of BiH (which, at the time of the study, was being revised). However, a uniform approach is missing. This is due to the complex administrative structure of BiH (including entities, districts, and cantons) and the fact that labour market and employment policies are often implemented at the entity level.

The provision of employment services in BiH is highly decentralised and consists of the following institutions: the Federal Employment Service and ten cantonal employment services within the Federation of BiH; the Employment Service of Republika Srpska in Republika Srpska; and the Employment Bureau of the Brčko District of BiH in the Brčko District. The existing institutional framework is based on numerous strategic documents and legislative acts. In FBiH, the focus of ALMPs is on career orientation and employment training, as well as on developing joint and co-funded programmes with other local and international institutions. In RS, ALMPs target employment mediation, work with employers and unemployed persons, career planning, lifelong learning, capacity building and the development of the employment service itself. Meanwhile, the Employment Bureau of the BD in BiH focuses the majority of its activities on reforming the institution itself in the direction of strengthening IT capacities, establishing an advisory council of employers, and other initiatives. The aim of this body is to strengthen assistance in professional orientation and career guidance and offer specific training in entrepreneurship, IT and other fields.89

As of early 2022, poor mediation function, career counselling and additional training activities as main issues related to employment service capacities in BiH. Some of the weaknesses have been substituted, to some extent, by international projects and activities. For example, in September 2020, the European Union started a very comprehensive project focusing on improving labour market research in BiH, targeting all public employment bureaus.90 Prior to this, the Youth Employment Project (YEP) was implemented from 2011 to 2020 across BiH, targeting different youth problematics. As of January 2022, the programme entered its third phase.91 These and similar projects focus on strengthening the employment service capacities.

Nevertheless, both national and international initiatives providing opportunities for education, training, and career development target employment in the “traditional” sectors only. No measure has been identifies as targeting people in new/atypical forms of employment or remote and on-location platform workers.

91 YEP. Retrieved from: https://impakt.ba/eng/yep-youth-employment-project/
BiH had two strategic frameworks concerning education and training as of early 2022. At the beginning of 2021, BiH adopted two important documents for VET education:

- Improving the quality and relevance of vocational education and training in Bosnia and Herzegovina - based on the conclusions of Riga (2021-2030);
- Priorities in integration Entrepreneurial Learning and Key Competences in Education Systems in Bosnia and Herzegovina (2021–2030).

Although the initiatives looked promising in terms of improving the links between education and the labour market, as well as increasing the employability and attractiveness of vocational education, no data existed on their effectiveness as of early 2022.

Finally, measures related to digitalisation and digital skills are mainly implemented through the education system. However, they often do not consider developments in the labour market. The Development Strategy of the Federation of BiH\(^2\) defines the measure as “Improving digital skills of the population, especially skills tailored to the needs of the labour market”. The measure stresses the importance of developing digital skills, however, it does not elaborate further on subsidizing the costs of developing the necessary skills or reimbursing the salaries of new employees as a form of tax incentives. One of the interviewed experts stated: “I think that in the context of acquiring digital skills, employers are the most important as well as self-study through crash courses and other online courses.” Therefore, it is unclear how digital skills are going to become an essential component of effective employment policies.\(^3\)

**Regulation of the new forms of employment and platform work**

**New forms of employment** are not specifically regulated in the BiH system at any administrative level. Thus, they fall under the existing regulatory frameworks, which are often characterised by rigidity. Moreover, regulation relevant to platform work is fragmented, as labour law obligations differ in the Federation of BiH, Republika Srpska and Brčko District. The COVID-19 pandemic has also demonstrated gaps in the legislation specifically concerning remote work and job protection mechanisms.

The employment framework in BiH recognizes several employment statuses which fall under different labour regulations (see the table below). All three employment statuses of the labour force, employed, self-employed and unemployed, are common in platform work. As no regulation in BiH specifies which labour contracts should apply to platform work the decision is left to the discretion of platforms and the workers themselves.


Labour legislation in both entities of BiH (FBiH and RS) recognises two main types of labour contracts for those who are employed or self-employed: limited and unlimited duration contracts. These are specific types of contracts for full and part-time employees. When there is a need to hire an individual who will perform a specific job, i.e., “work”, other types of contracts can be also concluded: service contracts or author’s work contracts. In practice, those various types of contracts are often confused and understood as the same, but they are essentially different, both in legal terms and the tax liabilities arising from them. A “service contract” applies to specific limited activities (e.g., consultancy, design services etc.). However, it does not provide an employment status; thus, people working with those contracts might be considered inactive or unemployed in administrative statistics. They are also not covered by social security measures to the extent that employees are. Service contracts are often abused by local employers because they allow employers to pay lower taxes and employees to receive higher net salaries.

Remote platform workers are most likely to be working on service contracts, which entail lower tax obligations and less social security. Parallel to the increase in the number of freelancers, the tax authorities have become keener on regulating online platform work as freelancers often do not pay the necessary taxes. A major reason for this is the inadequate regulatory framework which does not clarify the status of freelancers. Thus the policy debate has centred on taxing remote platform work, rather than facilitating and promoting employment in this form of work.

The organisation of remote platform workers remains limited. Freelancer groups on social media with thousands of members compensate for the absence of a common and integrated space for freelancers and the relatively late development of domestic platforms and associations. However, the lack of systemic organisation among remote platform workers results in the lack of social dialogue to clarify their status.

As of early 2022, the legislative framework does not provide remote platform workers with enough space to manoeuvre in terms of customized regulations that fit their profession, mode of work and earned income. Furthermore, the legislation does not protect their rights but rather discriminates

---

Table 1. Employment statuses in BiH and their prevalence in platform work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labour market status of a person</th>
<th>Does it fall under the Labour Code or Civil Code?</th>
<th>What type of contracts can they conclude?</th>
<th>Is it a common status among platform workers? If so, which type (remote/online)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>Labour Law in FBiH. Labour Law in Republika Srpska.</td>
<td>Full-time and part-time employment contracts</td>
<td>Yes, it is a common employment status among on-location platform workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Labour Law in FBiH. Labour Law in Republika Srpska.</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>According to the research, it is common among remote platform workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>Labour Law in FBiH. Labour Law in Republika Srpska. Law on mediation in employment and social security in the unemployed person.</td>
<td>None or Service contracts</td>
<td>Yes, it is common among remote platform workers who conclude service contracts for specific services, consulting, translation services, etc. But they are not necessarily visible to BiH authorities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

94 In local legislation is “autorski ugovor”
95 Please refer to the example explained earlier in text regarding the contribution paid by the freelancers.
97 Interview with an NGO worker date 2022-02-09.
against them, e.g., their tax base is not deduced compared to that of workers in standard employment.\(^9\)

Meanwhile, the contractual agreements in on-location platform work are not entirely clear. Desk research and interviews revealed that the most common contracts among on-location platform workers are temporary employment contracts (full-time or part-time\(^1\)) and service contracts (which do not provide an employment status).\(^1\) In some cases, on-location platform workers are employed through intermediary companies and enjoy all the entitlements that come with an employment relationship.\(^2\)

Overall, the regulatory framework in BiH makes it difficult for new forms of work to develop further. For example, the regional manager of Glovo stressed in an interview the unfavourable regulatory framework for on-location platform work in BiH.\(^3\) The interviewee criticised the outdated legislation on invoicing, taxation, and work contracts which lack flexibility.\(^4\) As such, entering the BiH market entailed high financial costs for Glovo. Political instability and the fragmented regulatory framework exacerbate challenges related to regulatory frameworks in BiH and impede improvements.\(^5\)

Furthermore, a significant lack of employment transparency in on-location platform work creates a favourable environment for informality. Complicated and insufficient legislation on tax and social contributions in both entities of BiH and Brčko District is further contributing to informality in platform work. Furthermore, the systems for tax obligations and social protection are fragmented which exacerbates confusion as to how platform workers should be treated. Platform workers are often registered to provide services under contractual arrangements which do not ensure the right to a pension, health, or other forms of insurance. The Association of Freelancer is strongly advocating for changes to this legislation, although, as of early 2022, still unsuccessfully.\(^6\)


\(^1\) Interview with an on-location platform worker working through Korpa, date 2022-01-15.

\(^2\) Interview with an on-location platform worker working through Korpa, date 2022-02-15 and 2022-12-12.

\(^3\) Interview with an NGO worker date 2022-02-09.

\(^4\) Interview with Glovo regional manager, date 2022-02-14.

\(^5\) Interview with Glovo regional manager, date 2022-02-14.

\(^6\) Association Freelance in BiH. Retrieved from: [https://ufubih.org/](https://ufubih.org/)
POLICY IMPLICATIONS

The advantages of platform work and other new forms of employment signal important opportunities for BiH labour market. However, the COVID-19 crisis has shown that the labour market in BiH is missing both, flexibility and security, which should be the main areas for improvement.

New technologies, digitalisation and the emergence of labour platforms challenge the current employment setting. However, these developments offer opportunities to create new jobs. New flexible forms of employment, particularly through labour platforms, have an important inclusiveness potential. They could contribute to increase youth and women employment and greater integration of vulnerable groups such as minorities. High unemployment in the country, particularly among youth, could be partially tackled by strategic orientation towards new forms of employment. However, this has not yet been recognised in the initial version of the Employment Strategy of the Federation of BiH\textsuperscript{107} or in the Employment strategy of Republika Srpska for 2021-2027.\textsuperscript{108}

BiH is facing severe demographic challenges, primarily in terms of brain drain. Therefore, the opportunity to earn a good salary without having to relocate outside the country by working through domestic or international platforms may reduce migration and brain drain in BiH. Policymakers should be aware of new trends in employment and make them more attractive through effective policies and initiatives. In turn, this could improve the net migration balance.\textsuperscript{109}

Enhancing access to support services and information, for example through employment services and career guidance and counselling structures is another important way to contribute to this goal. Those services could include new sectors and flexible forms of employment in the career development portfolio for young professionals. A recent review\textsuperscript{110} of career development support in BiH showed however that career guidance needs to innovate to remain relevant. It would be important to offer career education as part of curricula focused on developing career management skills throughout formal education to empower people. This is essential to manage one's career autonomously in the context of non-standard forms of employment. Strengthening career guidance within employment services would support employment transitions.

The BiH labour market suffers from labour shortages in ICT and other sectors\textsuperscript{111} thus skills development is another crucial aspect for attention. Particularly important is fostering skills in the growing sectors, such as ICT and creative industry. In addition to education and training programmes, skills development happens on-the-job. For example, young people could gain experience in many fields within labour platforms, particularly in ICT.\textsuperscript{112} Therefore, recognising this work and skills gained would be important. Transversal skills, such as communication or entrepreneurship, that are needed for the new flexible jobs should be covered as well. Furthermore, one of the biggest challenges remain in the legislative framework for labour relations beyond standard forms of employment. The most frequently discussed issues relate to the unclear status of platform workers and the lack of labour protection beyond standard employment. Those include poor working conditions and health and safety

standards, unclear notice periods, as well as a lack of social protection and representation. All of those issues became more visible during the COVID-19 pandemic.

As labour market evolves and labour relations become more flexible in BiH, the protection of workers must be ensured at all levels. Short-term measures could include the expansion of health and social benefits for platform workers, while comprehensive and coordinated structural reforms of the labour markets, education system and business environment should be implemented in the medium term. The issues between tax authorities and freelancers in BiH have shown that more social dialogue is needed throughout the process.

Legislative clarifications on employment status and taxation are the first precondition to reaping the benefits of new opportunities and mitigating challenges. The current legislation should be updated regarding the following aspects:

- Clarification of the employment status of platform workers who could be recognized as self-employed.
- Additional specification of the modes of additional work and work outside the employer’s premises (remote work).
- Reduction of abuses related to the transition from fixed-term contracts to permanent contracts.
- Defining rights, obligations and conditions for social protection and benefits, including healthcare, maternity and paternity benefits, unemployment benefits and others.
- Clarification of tax obligations and benefits.

Finally, a significant precondition for addressing labour market challenges related to the increased prevalence of new non-standard forms and increased flexibility is the development of adequate metrics necessary for evidence-based decision making and subsequent monitoring and evaluation of implemented measures by public institutions. The lack of respective official statistics and other data shows how much improvement is needed in terms of labour market and education metrics. This is necessary for evidence-based policymaking, monitoring, evaluation and design, and implementation of much-needed reforms.
### SOURCES

**List of interviews**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date of the interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GrowUp Business and Innovation Hub</td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>2022-01-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students Career Development Center</td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>2022-01-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Economics and Business</td>
<td>Associate professor and labour market specialist</td>
<td>2022-01-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of the Prime Minister of the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina</td>
<td>Economic Policy Advisor</td>
<td>2022-01-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAHLA Center for education and research</td>
<td>Coordinator for business community</td>
<td>2022-02-01 2022-02-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head of Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Market Makers Project BiH</td>
<td>2022-01-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korpa</td>
<td>Courier 1</td>
<td>2022-01-15 2022-02-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korpa</td>
<td>Courier 2</td>
<td>2022-02-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symphony d.o.o.</td>
<td>Head of Service Delivery</td>
<td>2021-12-16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF REFERENCES


