



European Training Foundation

# TORINO PROCESS 2018– 2020

## RUSSIAN FEDERATION

REGIONAL STORIES



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	4
REPUBLIC OF BASHKORTOSTAN	5
Background	5
The story	5
Stages of the Torino Process report preparation	6
Main achievements and results	7
REPUBLIC OF TATARSTAN	11
Background	11
The story	11
Stages of the Torino Process report preparation	12
Main achievements and results	12
TVER	14
Background	14
The story	14
Stages of the Torino Process report preparation	15
Main achievements and results	16
SAMARA	18
Background	18
The story	18
Main achievements and results	20
TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS	21

## INTRODUCTION

Russia has participated in the Torino Process since 2010. Since then, four national reports have been prepared, alongside subnational cases for the cities of Moscow and St Petersburg, the Orenburg region and the Republic of Mari El. In 2018–2019, the Republic of Bashkortostan, the Republic of Tatarstan and the Tver, Samara and Khabarovsk regions decided to participate in the preparation of subnational reports. For a number of reasons, not all regions were able to prepare reports. The national-level report for the Russian Federation includes the cases of the Republic of Bashkortostan, the Tver region and the Khabarovsk region ; the subnational reports generally confirm the key trends in the development of the country’s vocational education and training (VET) system.

Brief stories of the Torino Process report preparation at subnational level are presented below. These have been shared by T. Nigmatullina (Republic of Bashkortostan), E. Idiatullina (Republic of Tatarstan), I. Lelchitsky (Tver region), and N. Trofimov (Samara region).



## REPUBLIC OF BASHKORTOSTAN

Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (Branch) of the Academy of Labour and Social Relations

Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Director, UNEVOC Centre based in the Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (BIST-UNEVOC Centre)

### Background

Quote by Tanzilya Nigmatullina: “I first learned about the Torino Process from Olga Oleynikova (ETF expert, Doctor of Pedagogy, Director of the Centre for VET Studies, Head of the UNEVOC Centres in Russia) and Franca Crestani (ETF Country Coordinator for Russia) at the Second Eurasian Humanitarian Forum on VET in the context of UNESCO’s Education 2030 Agenda, held in Ufa, Bashkortostan, on 11 July 2017. I found the Torino Process interesting and learned more about the national reports of the Russian Federation, as well as the experience of the Russian regions that had participated in the process by submitting subnational reports. Together with my colleagues, we decided to take part”.

### The story

The Republic of Bashkortostan joined the Torino Process in March 2018, following a decision by the government of Bashkortostan. This decision was based on the expectation that Bashkortostan – a region with a well-developed VET system – could benefit from the Torino Process not only by learning about the global trends in VET and benchmarking the region’s achievements at national level, but also by replicating locally some of the best international and domestic practice.

The government appointed Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Doctor of Political Science, Director of the Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (Branch) of the Academy of Labour and Social Relations and head of the UNEVOC Centre, as Torino Process coordinator for Bashkortostan.

The Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (Branch) of the Academy of Labour and Social Relations (hereinafter, BIST) had no prior experience of participation in the Torino Process. However, since 2012 BIST has served as a UNEVOC Centre in Russia and has worked to apply the best domestic and international practice to build a technical and vocational education and training (TVET) system that can meet the demands of today’s globalised economy by combining the potential of teachers with the opportunities offered by cluster-based social partnerships involving the government, civil society and business. The UNEVOC Centre thus shares its ideas and approaches with the Torino Process in many ways.

In May 2018 a Torino Process team was formed to involve representatives of stakeholders responsible for implementing the key areas of Bashkortostan’s vision for VET. This team includes:

- Robert Vagapov, Deputy Chairman of the Union of Employers of the Republic of Bashkortostan (the regional employers’ association);

- Zulfiya Garifullina, Director, Social Policy Department, Executive Office of the Government of Bashkortostan;
- Tanzilya Nigmatullina, Director, BIST-UNEVOC Centre;
- Fanur Shaikhislamov, Deputy Minister of Family, Employment and Social Protection of Bashkortostan;
- Gullaria Yalchikayeva, Deputy Minister of Education of Bashkortostan.

The team members were assigned their roles in accordance with the mandates of their respective organisations. Tanzilya Nigmatullina was appointed Torino Process coordinator for Bashkortostan.

The team had no problems obtaining statistics: each member had easy access to data relevant to their area of work. In addition to this, directors of secondary VET (SVET) providers were invited to supply more data in response to requests from the Torino Process team.

### Stages of the Torino Process report preparation

**July 2018.** BIST hosted the international forum 'Focus on the Individual', attended by the Torino Process team and directors of VET providers in Ufa. The forum was also attended by Franca Crestani, ETF Country Coordinator for Russia, and Olga Oleynikova, ETF expert, Doctor of Pedagogy, Director of the Centre for VET Studies and Head of the UNEVOC Centres in Russia. Franca Crestani presented the Torino Process and its goals and objectives to the forum participants. Olga Oleynikova focused specifically on the importance of Russia's participation in the Torino Process.

The forum outlined key objectives for the region: to collect data from education providers and support it with statistics, monitoring findings, analytical reports and details of specific methods and techniques, to cover the following:

- overview of the current state and vision for VET in the Republic of Bashkortostan;
- effectiveness and efficiency of VET in addressing economic and labour market demand;
- effectiveness and efficiency of VET in addressing demographic, social and inclusion demand;
- governance and policy practices in the regional VET system;
- recommendations.

**November 2018.** The international seminar 'New cycle of the Torino Process 2018–2020 in Russia' was held on 27 November 2018 in Moscow. The purpose of the seminar was to explain the key features of Torino Process 2019–2020 and to discuss its implementation at regional level in Russia in 2019.

Presentations by international and Russian experts and representatives of cities and regions involved in the Torino Process provided answers to key questions such as what needs to be addressed and updated as a matter of priority, which indicators require special attention, and what principles of VET policy analysis can be used as guidelines in preparing analytical materials.

The seminar informed the further work of the Torino Process team to collect the statistics and analytical data needed for the report.

**January 2019.** The website ‘Republic of Bashkortostan, a participant in the Torino Process’ (<http://torinoprocess-ufa.ru/>) was created, and included sections on News, Best Practice, Events and Resources.

**March–April 2019.** Reports were received from the region’s Ministry of Education and Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Protection of the Population, in accordance with the required indicators.

**May 2019.** The regional Torino Process team, jointly with directors of SVET providers, discussed current developments in the regional VET system.

**August 2019.** The team developed a questionnaire for assessing the effectiveness of SVET, to be completed by regional VET providers. A register of SVET providers involved in providing data for the Torino Process was established. The first version of the report was prepared.

**September 2019.** The team met with Ekaterina Esenina, coordinator of the Torino Process working group responsible for preparation of the national report, to discuss matters relating to the content of the regional report and to seek advice. The regional report was further improved based on the advice received.

**October 2019.** The second version of the report was prepared and presented to the national coordinators and ETF experts. It was discussed at regional level and finalised, and the final version was presented to the national coordinator.

Throughout the entire process of the regional report preparation, the team benefited from guidance and advice provided via webinar by Franca Crestani and Mihaylo Milovanovitch, and during international seminars in Turin and Moscow by ETF and Russian experts. Joint discussions and Q&A (question and answer) sessions by experts contributed to an in-depth understanding of the key ideas and principles behind the Torino Process which, in turn, informed the preparation of the regional report.

### Main achievements and results

The subnational report was prepared and incorporated in full in the national Torino Process report.

A SWOT analysis of the functioning of the regional VET system made it possible not only to pinpoint issues that needed to be addressed – in particular, the challenge of matching the skills supplied by VET to labour market needs – but also to develop recommendations for actions needed to support positive changes in the economic and social spheres, to strengthen human capital and to ensure decent living standards. The key challenges were caused by inconsistencies in the data provided by different stakeholders for the preparation of the report.

### 'Focus on the Individual' forum (3 July 2018)



**pictured:** **F. Crestani**, ETF Country Coordinator for Russia, **T. A. Nigmatullina**, Torino Process Coordinator in the Republic of Bashkortostan, **Z. N. Garifullina**, Director, Social Policy Department, Executive Office of the Government of Bashkortostan, **O. N. Oleynikova**, ETF expert, Doctor of Pedagogy, Director of the Centre for VET Studies, Head of the UNEVOC Centres in Russia

### Forum participants



### International seminar (27 November 2018, Moscow)



Tanzilya Nigmatullina briefed the attending experts and participants on the developments in the region's VET system and on the key steps made in implementing the Torino Process.

### Webinar (12 March 2019, Ufa–Turin)



**Pictured:** Turin: Franca Crestani and Mihaylo Milovanovitch, ETF. Ufa: Tanzilya Nigmatullina and BIST staff.

Comments from Tanzilya Nigmatullina: “Our participation in the Torino Process has helped me take a fresh look at skills training in Bashkortostan, to benchmark my region’s performance against that of other Russian regions and against international best practice, and to gain a better understanding of what needs to be changed and what we have to share with our colleagues.

Working on the Torino Process implementation in Bashkortostan, the team members could see how the engagement of all stakeholders in addressing the needs of VET can contribute to better public policies.

On behalf of the Republic of Bashkortostan, I wish to thank the ETF colleagues and the Russian coordinators for their assistance with the preparation of the regional report and for their willingness to respond at any time by answering questions and giving advice. I am certain that together we can achieve the goals and objectives set out by the Torino Process initiators and ultimately make substantial progress towards social stability and decent living standards for all.

The Torino Process, without a doubt, is a relevant and timely endeavour, and all Russian regions should be encouraged to participate in it.

Our plans include further improvement of the VET system in our region based on Russian and international best practice.

Our recommendations are as follows:

- to create a website for Torino Process participants to showcase practices, techniques and ideas and to answer questions in a Q&A section accessible to all users;
- to convene an international conference – Russia’s Participation in the Torino Process: Prospects for Development – to discuss current issues in VET, provide recommendations and share best practice”.



## REPUBLIC OF TATARSTAN

Almetyevsk State Oil Institute (ASOI)

Enze Idiatullina, Vice Rector for Institutional Development, ASOI

### Background

On 24 September 2018 Tatarstan's VET cluster for the oil and gas industry met with the regional Torino Process team working to prepare a subnational report on VET in Tatarstan as part of the Torino Process. The meeting was attended by representatives of the Tatneft Company, the Tatarstan Ministry of Education and Science, municipal authorities, directors of VET providers, and ETF representatives and coordinators of the Torino Process in Russia. Franca Crestani, ETF representative and Country Coordinator for Russia, and Olga Oleynikova, Director of the Centre for VET Studies, explained the Torino Process methodology as a tool for shaping a strategy for VET development and updated the audience on the work ongoing in Russia as part of the Torino Process.

### The story

Following the meeting of Tatarstan's VET cluster for the oil and gas industry, it was decided that the Republic of Tatarstan should participate in the Torino Process and engage with the Centre for VET Studies in applying the Torino Process principles and methodology to prepare an analytical report on the current state and future outlook of the region's VET system.

The international seminar 'New cycle of the Torino Process 2018–2020 in Russia', held in Moscow in 2018, featured a presentation entitled 'Torino Process in Russian Regions' by Enze Idiatullina, ASOI Vice Rector for Institutional Development.

In September 2019 Enze Idiatullina represented ASOI at the international meeting 'Torino Process in Russia 2018–2020', at which various aspects of the Torino Process implementation in Russia in 2020 at national and subnational levels were discussed.

At the aforementioned 24 September 2018 meeting of Tatarstan's VET cluster for the oil and gas industry, a decision was made to set up a regional working group consisting of representatives of the regional Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Labour, Employment and Social Protection, and the VET cluster for the oil and gas industry, to prepare a regional report as part of the Torino Process.

The working group – consisting of Andrey Glazkov, Head of the Human Resources Department at Tatneft, Robert Nurgaliev, Acting Rector of ASOI, and Enze Idiatullina, ASOI Vice Rector for

Institutional Development – decided to prepare information on the operation of the region’s VET cluster for oil and gas, which includes Tatneft, TagraS-Holding, Neftekonsorcium, Tatneft Personnel Training Centre, ASOI, Almetyevsk Polytechnic College, Leninogorsk Petroleum College, and Bugulma Machine Building College.

The Steering Committee of Tatarstan’s VET cluster for oil and gas, approved by Order No. 1508-r of 19 August 2013 of the Cabinet of Ministers of Tatarstan, is composed of chief executive officers (CEOs) of Tatneft and other oil companies, directors of VET providers, and heads of municipalities in which relevant VET and higher education providers are located.

### Stages of the Torino Process report preparation

The process was as follows:

- a detailed discussion and reflection on the relevance and usefulness of the case to be prepared;
- the outlining of a clear process and a time-bound action plan;
- group meetings as required.

The working group faced a number of challenges in preparing the report. The group was not able to collect data on certain indicators that were not included in the official national statistics, such as results from the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA), participation in VET by gender, unemployment rate by gender, small and medium-sized enterprise policy index, and entrepreneurship training.

### Main achievements and results

The working group has prepared a case describing the regional VET cluster for oil and gas as an example of cooperation between employers and VET providers in the Republic of Tatarstan.

Comments from Enze Idiatullina:

Our participation in the Torino Process helped us develop a better understanding of the fundamental value of cooperation for developing the VET system. The Torino Process has served us as a vehicle for monitoring progress, forging a shared vision and further strengthening VET in our region.

Our conclusions, recommendations and plans are as follows.

- Build a champion team to explain the value of the Torino Process to the regional authorities.
- Have the courage to look at your performance from a new perspective, taking into account the international trends; make use of the guidance and advice offered by the ETF and bring up issues for consultation.
- Remember that we are not alone! The boundaries between training and the workplace are mostly illusory in today’s world, and therefore, we need to look together for solutions to advance and support the VET system.

### Meeting of the VET cluster for oil and gas in Tatarstan (24 September 2018)



In the picture: **Olga Oleynikova**, Director, Centre for VET Studies, **Franca Crestani**, ETF, Country Coordinator for Russia, **Andrey Glazkov**, Head of Human Resources Department, Tatneft, **Rifdar Hamadyarov**, Deputy Chairman, Labour Union Committee for Institutional Development, Tatneft, **Elena Durneva**, Head of Corporate University, Tatneft, **Olga Tsygina**, Head of International Cooperation Department, Corporate University, Tatneft, **Robert Nurgaliev**, Acting Rector, ASOI, **Enze Idiatullina**, Vice Rector for Institutional Development, ASOI

### Almetyevsk (24 September 2018)



In the picture: Robert Nurgaliev, Enze Idiatullina, Franca Crestani, Olga Oleynikova, Andrey Glazkov



## TVER

Tver State University

Igor Lelchitsky, Director, Institute of Pedagogical Education and Social Technologies, Tver State University

## Background

Tver State University learned about the Torino Process by attending events organised by the ETF jointly with the Centre for VET Studies, and specifically from presentations made by the centre's director, Olga Oleynikova. Subsequent seminars, conferences and networking allowed us to learn more about the Torino Process methodology as a tool used for VET system development, both domestically and internationally.

## The story

The Tver region joined the Torino Process in 2018, following a decision made by the regional government in connection with the ongoing reform of the region's VET system. The Tver Regional Ministry of Education appointed Igor Lelchitsky (Professor, Director of the Institute of Pedagogical Education and Social Technologies at Tver State University and Chairman of the Tver Regional Consortium of Continuing Teacher Training, which includes regional SVET Resource Centres) to serve as the project coordinator. In the context of VET reform, relevant international experience can be particularly useful.

The Torino Process working group included representatives of major stakeholders, such as the government, VET system administrators, employers and training providers, specifically:

- Tver State University;
- Tver Region Ministry of Education;
- Tver Regional Consortium of Continuing Teacher Training;
- Tver Regional Council of VET School Directors;
- Advisory Board of Industry CEOs with the Tver City Administration;
- Tver Association of Builders, a self-regulatory organisation;
- Tver Region Tourism Association.

The following team was directly involved in the report preparation:

- Igor Lelchitsky, Director, Institute of Pedagogical Education and Social Technologies, Tver State University, and Torino Process Coordinator for the Tver region;
- Tamara Golubeva, Associate Professor, Institute of Pedagogical Education and Social Technologies, Tver State University;
- Andrey Tsurkan, Chairman, Tver Regional Council of VET School Directors, and Director, Konyaev Tver College;
- Nikolay Pashuev, Chairman, Advisory Board of Industry CEOs with the Tver City Administration;
- Yuri Serkovsky, Head, Tver Association of Builders;
- Irina Sheremetker, President, Tver Region Tourism Association.

Each team member had a defined role in the preparation of the report. In addition to the core team, directors of SVET providers were consulted as experts on specific issues. Therefore, the team had no problems with access to the statistical database.

### Stages of the Torino Process report preparation

**5 July 2018.** Tver State University hosted the international seminar ‘Torino Process 2018: Recognising and Identifying Priorities’, attended by Franca Crestani, ETF representative; Olga Oleynikova, Director, Centre for VET Studies; Dmitry Kulikov, Tver Region Minister of Education; Lyudmila Skakovskaya, Acting Rector, Tver State University; Andrey Tsurkan, Director, Konyaev Tver College, and Chairman, Tver Regional Council of VET School Directors; and directors of VET colleges and representatives of social partners.

The seminar examined the region’s preparedness for participation in the Torino Process, and, in particular, provided an overview of the VET system, its current status and outlook, priorities for VET reform and international cooperation of training providers.

**27 November 2018.** A group of representatives of VET providers and employers from the Tver region attended the international seminar ‘New cycle of the Torino Process 2018–2020 in Russia’ held in Moscow. The participants learned about the key features of the Torino Process 2019–2020 and discussed the outlook for its implementation at regional level in Russia in 2019, with a special focus on the Torino Process methodology, data collection and interpretation, VET policy at regional level, challenges of and opportunities for collecting information for the report, and building a team of participants. The recommendations from the seminar informed the report preparation.

**January 2019.** A working group hosted by the Tver Region Ministry of Education was established. Each group member was assigned a role, and the data collection started. The materials to be collected were determined, with a focus on SVET policies in the Tver region.

**February 2019.** The working group collected statistical and analytical information for the report from the regional Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Protection, and Ministry of Economic Development, in accordance with the required indicators.

**March 2019.** The first version of the regional report was prepared and discussed internally with stakeholder representatives.

**April and May 2019.** The report was finalised in consultation with regional education and labour market experts. The second version of the report was drafted and discussed with directors of regional VET providers and officials of the regional Ministry of Education.

**June 2019.** The final version of the regional report was submitted to the ETF.

**30 September 2019.** The regional report was presented in Moscow at the seminar on the Torino Process 2018–2020 in Russia. The team received recommendations from the seminar participants on making improvements to the report and benefited from an expert review of the report provided by the National Torino Process Coordinator, Ekaterina Esenina.

At all stages of working on the regional report, the team benefited from guidance and advice provided through webinars by Franca Crestani and Mihaylo Milovanovitch, and at international seminars in Turin and in Moscow by ETF and Russian experts. This ongoing cooperation helped the team to gain a comprehensive, in-depth understanding of the Torino Process principles and ideas as they prepared the report.

### Main achievements and results

The subnational report was prepared and incorporated in full into the national Torino Process report.

The analysis identified the main problems with SVET development in the Tver region and informed potential solutions.

**Torino Process 2018: Recognising and Defining Priorities (international workshop, Tver, 5 July 2018)**



**Pictured:** Igor Lelchitsky and Olga Oleynikova



**Pictured:** In the middle A.I. Kovalev, Director of Zapadnodvinsk Technological College, and employers of college graduates

Comments from Igor Lelchitsky:

“Our participation in the Torino Process helped us to build a solid foundation for a comprehensive stakeholder dialogue involving the authorities, employers and VET providers. The Torino Process is another step towards creating a strong and competitive VET system for training the region’s workforce”.



## SAMARA

Nikita Trofimov, Agency for Professional Qualifications,  
Federation of Restaurateurs and Hoteliers

### Background

The Agency for Professional Qualifications works to create regional development projects in the fields of hospitality and healthcare in Russia. The agency engages closely with the VET system as a consumer of the system's outputs and as a party interested in business development, which largely depends on the availability of a skilled workforce.

Tikita Trofimov explained as follows: "I also represent the Federation of Restaurateurs and Hoteliers. I learned about the Torino Process through my interactions with the VET system via regional development projects in hospitality and healthcare and via the Agency for Professional Qualifications. In relation to the VET system, I am a stakeholder interested in business development and thus in the availability of skilled employees".

### The story

As part of the engagement between the Federation of Restaurateurs and Hoteliers and the Presidential Council on Vocational Qualifications, it has been agreed that specific solutions need to be developed for the VET system. This makes the Torino Process – and related engagement between the professional community and the VET system – particularly relevant. It is considered that the Torino Process can be a vehicle for creating an institutional platform to support policy dialogue involving business, government and the VET system.

The following problems are particularly important for the VET system in the Samara region today.

1. Local businesses are demanding quality vocational training.
2. There is a need for better engagement between entrepreneurs and VET providers.
3. There is a need for institutionalised dialogue between businesses and the VET system.

In this context, we are interested in learning more about the engagement between employers and VET in the light of international experience. In our opinion, the Torino Process can help us to find solutions to the problems we are facing, and participation in the Torino Process can enhance the government–business–VET dialogue.

The decision to participate in the Torino Process was made by the Samara Region Ministry of Education, and the Deputy Minister of Education was appointed to coordinate the process.

The report preparation faced a number of challenges linked to the following factors.

1. Barriers of misunderstanding exist between the regional VET system and businesses in matters concerning labour market analysis. The experience of our participation in the Torino Process confirms that fostering dialogue really does take time.
2. The business community had problems accessing VET system statistics, making it difficult to analyse the current status and trends of the VET system. Such barriers occurred between the regional employers and the Ministry of Education.

However, at VET provider level, both in SVET and in higher education, school engagement with employers within the framework of the Torino Process was active, positive and productive. In particular, the academic staff of higher education institutions appreciated the opportunity to use the Torino Process data for in-depth research on the VET system.

As part of the Torino Process implementation, the Samara Region Federation of Restaurateurs and Hoteliers initiated sectoral strategic discussions on current concerns, such as how companies can develop their human resources and how this will impact on the sector's economic performance. This topic brought together a wide range of other stakeholders in addition to employers, including representatives of VET providers, the government, professional communities and industry experts.

As part of their involvement in the development of strategic projects, the stakeholders reflected on questions relating to the Torino Process reporting framework. The working groups that were set up as part of the Torino Process and included representatives of businesses and industry associations worked to address issues arising from the stakeholder dialogue.

For example, they proposed adjustments to the current practice of interaction between business owners and senior managers concerning human resources; this discussion also involved VET providers. Two key aspects of potential cooperation were identified:

- How, in practice, can employers make better use of the skills of graduates of higher education institutions and VET colleges?
- How can VET providers deliver training that uses our current production chains and, more broadly, our current business operation?

We consider these to be the key points of engagement. As a potential solution, companies could assign permanent workplaces to be used by VET providers for practice-oriented learning, while VET providers should make an effort to develop a better understanding of where the business is going and update the training programmes accordingly, keeping in touch at all times with the company – the consumer of skills supplied by the VET provider.

Our efforts to forge dialogue between employers and VET within the framework of the Torino Process revealed a few internal issues concerning the VET system. For example, it has been discovered that a company's business performance and development depend heavily on its ability to implement and integrate knowledge-based processes. Difficulties may arise when a company needs to operationalise an innovative method but its employees do not have the necessary qualifications. This can be resolved through collaboration between a VET provider and the relevant company staff; as an added bonus, the new method can immediately be translated into a training programme. This is an important message for the industry.

## Main achievements and results

Despite intense efforts, it was not possible to produce a report.

I believe the main reason to be a lack of shared understanding and assessment of the Torino Process results on the part of the key stakeholders from education and business: while employers assess their performance using specific short-term targets, the VET system does not always accept responsibility for meeting these targets since the training of a skilled workforce according to these specifications takes more time.

Nevertheless, as a result of our participation in the Torino Process, we learned the following lessons which could benefit all employers.

- For productive engagement, all stakeholders must be able to negotiate and reach agreements, set shared goals and follow through.
- Stakeholder dialogue is essential both for identifying and sharing best practice and for revealing factors that can create problems and obstacles.

Comments from Nikita Trofimov:

Here is what the Torino Process methodology has taught us.

- We could see how to ask questions that are helpful for understanding the actual situation. Answers to such questions reveal the key elements of an institutional approach that can change the relations between different actors at regional level (and perhaps even at national level) by influencing the market for qualifications in the region. The Torino Process methodology leads to conclusions that reveal potential growth points for each stakeholder. Indeed, the stakeholders begin to realise that staying where they are is not an option, and they need to move forward. The Torino Process produces a report containing valuable findings and recommendations that can serve as a basis for joint multistakeholder efforts.
- The Torino Process provides a structure for meaningful stakeholder dialogue. Strategy sessions had been held previously to identify issues, but these did not lead to systemic action, leaving the participants to deal with the issues on their own. In contrast, the Torino Process uses a system approach that has a role for each stakeholder. The Torino Process report makes recommendations for actions, including those that involve amending the legislative framework. Such steps must be taken responsibly as they can affect thousands of people. But, if successful, this approach can be a real contribution to a region's development. The Torino Process methodology works in conjunction with relevant national and regional practices and thus serves as a systemic instrument to improve VET.

## TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASOI	Almetyevsk State Oil Institute
BIST	Bashkir Institute of Social Technologies (Bashkortostan)
CEO	Chief executive officer
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
SVET	Secondary vocational education and training
TVET	Technical and vocational education and training
VET	Vocational education and training