



**FOCUS ON  
INNOVATIVE PRACTICES  
IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING  
IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES**



**etf**  
SHARING EXPERTISE  
IN TRAINING

**THE EUROPEAN TRAINING FOUNDATION IS THE  
EUROPEAN UNION'S CENTRE OF EXPERTISE  
SUPPORTING VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING  
REFORM IN THIRD COUNTRIES IN THE CONTEXT OF  
THE EU EXTERNAL RELATIONS PROGRAMMES**

**HOW TO CONTACT US**

Further information on our activities, calls for tender and job opportunities can be found on our web site: [www.etf.eu.int](http://www.etf.eu.int).

For any additional information please contact:

External Communication Unit  
European Training Foundation  
Villa Gualino

Viale Settimio Severo 65

I – 10133 Torino

**T** +39 011 630 2222

**F** +39 011 630 2200

**E** [info@etf.eu.int](mailto:info@etf.eu.int)

**INNOVATIVE PRACTICES  
IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING  
IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES**

*This is an official translation of the original French text.*



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1. INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2. THE VOCATIONAL TRAINING SYSTEMS</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>3. TRAINING OCCUPATIONS</b>	<b>11</b>
3.1 Occupations	11
3.2 Regulations	12
3.3 Trainers' tasks	12
3.4 Trainer recruitment	13
3.5 Staff assessment and career development	14
3.6 Conclusion	15
<b>4. TRAINING OF TRAINERS</b>	<b>17</b>
4.1 Training of trainers' institutions	17
4.2 Training schemes	19
4.3 Financing	23
4.4 The quality and relevance of training of trainers	24
<b>5. WHAT STRATEGY CAN BE USED TO DEVELOP TRAINING OF TRAINERS?</b>	<b>25</b>
5.1 Analysis of the system	25
5.2 Strategies adopted	28
<b>6. STRATEGIC PROSPECTS AND TARGETS</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>35</b>



## 1. INTRODUCTION

# 1

The economies of the Maghreb countries are in a process of change, “in transition” towards an open market economy. The private sector is developing and companies must face competition and improve their competitiveness. The State is taking a less exclusive and specific position. At present, the burning question is how this transition can take place without negative social consequences but instead to the benefit of the whole nation. Education and training have an essential role to play. In order to do so, reform of the vocational training system is necessary.

Staff, and above all trainers, have a central role to play if the reforms are to succeed. This begs the question of whether their training is suited not only to present-day vocational training, but also to the changes taking place and what will be required of them in future.

There is a growing awareness of the importance of the training of trainers

internationally. This was clear at the international congress organised by UNESCO in Seoul in 1999<sup>1</sup> and the conference organised in Turin in 2000 by the World Bank and the European Training Foundation<sup>2</sup>. More specifically, the documents relating to these conferences stress two points, the inclusion of companies’ experience in training and continuing training of trainers:

- “We need to reconsider what qualifications trainers need(...), including a better balance between training given in the institution and in the workplace” and “trainers’ work experience has been recognised as a critical factor” (Seoul).
- “Trainers need continuing vocational training in order to carry out their new role, namely that of motivator rather than instructor” (Turin).

The present report is a summary of three reports on Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia,

<sup>1</sup> *Second International Congress on Technical and Vocational Education, Lifelong Learning and Training: A Bridge to the Future*. Seoul, April 1999.

<sup>2</sup> *Knowledge and Skills for Development: the Role of Secondary Education and Training in the Middle East and North Africa*. Turin, May 2000.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

written by Messrs Salah Belkacem-Filali, Abderrahim Taiebi and Bohrène Chakroun respectively. It contains certain passages from these reports. The reader should refer to these reports to obtain further information on each country.

The national reports and the summary report are aimed at helping the three countries manage their current reforms. They are intended primarily for decision-makers and their partners, including employers' associations and trade union organisations, as well as for international bodies which may provide support. They will certainly also be of interest to other countries.

This report is, therefore, an attempt not only to describe the present position but also to place it in a context of change as well as against the present requirements of the economy and vocational training. For

this reason, the main section on the training of trainers is preceded by a brief description of the national vocational training systems and their development, followed by the training occupations and the changes that can be expected in these. A section follows on the current strategy for development and change. The conclusion is an attempt to open up prospects.

All types of vocational training are considered: initial and continuing, public and private, training carried out by the Ministry of Vocational Training or other ministerial departments, residential, in-service training and that provided by companies. We shall not cover technical training, which is provided by the Ministries of Education and which is not truly vocational, particularly since relatively few people take such training in the Maghreb countries.

## 2. THE VOCATIONAL TRAINING SYSTEMS

# 2

Vocational training has a similar structure in all three countries

- It is based on a network of public institutions controlled by the minister of vocational training, either directly or through a separate organisation.
- There are also public institutions controlled by other ministries such as Agriculture, Industry, Health, Youth and Sports and Tourism which originally mainly trained second-line government employees.
- A training sector made up of private institutions has recently emerged.
- Some public and private companies have training centres.

This structure was set up at a time when economic development was mainly directed by the State through the various ministries, each of which wished to train its second-line employees. The transition to a market economy and the process of opening up to the world such as membership of the World Trade Organisation and partnership with the European Union are causing the role of the

state to shrink and that of the private sector to grow. International competition calls for improvements in the companies' performance and competitiveness. The public training sector is therefore growing and becoming centred on the Ministry of Vocational Training. A private training sector is making an appearance, although its size varies from one country to another. It does however tend to be made up of small institutions which concentrate on training courses that are not expensive to set up.

**In Algeria**, in 2000 the public institutions of the Ministry of Vocational Training accounted for almost two-thirds of training capacity, the other ministries 18%, the private institutions 12% and companies, mainly public, 5%. The Ministry of Vocational Training also has a larger number of trainees due to the diversification of training methods which allows resources to be shared such as apprenticeships, evening courses, distance learning or working with two groups a day. In addition to training centres, this ministry's network comprises support

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

structures responsible for training personnel and preparing programmes, training techniques, studies and research into the qualifications and employability of graduates, the development of continuing training in companies and technical and teaching equipment. There is also a national apprenticeship and continuing training development fund, which manages income from taxes relating to these two fields.

In spite of the fact that private institutions have grown rapidly in recent years, they do not in fact seem to use their capacity to the full. Their training courses are not very specialised and cover vocational fields where training is inexpensive, particularly the services sector. Training carried out by other ministries and by companies has declined, mainly as a result of companies' financial situations.

**In Morocco**, the public vocational training sector accounts for 64% of trainees and the private sector 36%. The main operator is the Vocational Training and Job Promotion Service [Office de formation professionnelle et de la promotion du travail] (OFPPT), which comes under the Ministry of Employment, Vocational Training, Social Development and Solidarity. It accounts for 44% of trainees, more than two-thirds of the public sector, in its Institutes of Applied Technology and Higher Institutes of Applied Technology. This ministry also has another training scheme, part of its national support services, which provides apprenticeships for disadvantaged members of the population, who are often excluded from other types of training, in order to aid their social and professional integration. In addition, eleven other government departments provide training, something which makes for wide diversification and strong heterogeneity. The private sector has developed rapidly to compensate for the insufficient number of places in the public centres, but during the second half of the 1990s, demand lagged behind the growth in the number of institutions. The private sector is made up of numerous small institutions and its capacity, almost equivalent to that of the OFPPT, is less fully used. Women make up the majority of

its trainees (58%), whereas in the public sector they account for only 31%. An act governing private vocational training became law in 2000 and the ministerial departments have taken steps to modernise, regulate and monitor this sector to ensure that its quality is high and that it complements the public sector.

**In Tunisia**, the vocational training system has undergone major changes over the last decade. Reform began in 1993 with an act to oversee vocational training and to set up four operating structures under the Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment. These are the Tunisian Agency for Vocational Training (ATFP), the Tunisian Agency for Employment, the National Centre for the Training of Trainers and Educational Science (CENAFFIF) and the National Centre for Continuing Education and Professional Promotion. The ATFP is the main public training body. It accounts for 86% of public centres' trainees. There are also centres controlled by other public bodies, such as the Agricultural Advisory and Training Agency (AVFA) and the Tunisian National Tourist Office. Private training is very developed. Its number of trainees even exceeds that of the ATFP. As in Algeria, however, it is above all service-sector based and not very varied. 98% of its trainees are in only four specialist fields. It is also very female dominated (70% of the trainees are women) compared with the public sector (around 30% women).

There are high numbers of vocational trainees: over 400,000 in Algeria, some 190,000 in Morocco (43% women) and 57,000 in Tunisia (49% women). In the three countries, training is mainly carried out by the residential method, which implies that there is little connection with companies. This may explain the low employability of those who have completed their training. In Morocco, for example, only 55% have found work nine months after completing training and this rate has gone down in recent years. Enterprise-based training, particularly apprenticeships, is growing however. Apprenticeships play an important role in Algeria as 37% of trainees in the Ministry of Vocational Training's public institutions are enrolled in these

## 2. THE VOCATIONAL TRAINING SYSTEMS

schemes. In Morocco, the various forms of enterprise-based training account for only 17% of trainees.

There are several levels of training. In Algeria, there are five, corresponding to the qualifications of semi-skilled worker, skilled worker, highly-skilled worker, technician and higher technician. The last two are trained in different institutions from the first three. In Morocco there are four: semi-skilled worker, skilled worker, technician, higher technician. In Tunisia there are three: the Certificate of Vocational Aptitude for skilled manual and non-manual workers, the Vocational Technical Diploma and the Higher Technical Diploma. In all cases, the technical and higher technical training courses are tending to grow.

The state is no longer the only one to decide how the system is run. Cooperation with both sides of industry appears essential but this does not mean it is easy to achieve. In Algeria, the largest and most populous country, the organisation of the Ministry of Vocational Training is decentralised to each administrative area or wilaya. The direction taken by vocational training is decided upon locally as part of the implementation of national policy. The administrative areas have wide powers of decision over the development of training programmes, how to adapt them to local

conditions and the recruitment and management of staff. Similarly, in Morocco, the OFPPT is structured along regional lines and management of the programme is decentralised.

The sector is developing along similar lines in all three countries. Vocational training is being restructured, so that its main goal is no longer to train young people excluded from other parts of the education system, but to provide the skills needed by the economy. A transition from the principle of social supply and demand to the principle of economic demand is underway. Dialogue is being established with both sides of industry, there are more varied programmes, sources of finance are becoming diversified and there are higher performance levels in the educational, administrative and financial management of the institutions.

By way of example, this is the goal of the Algerian government's programme in the field of vocational training which began in August 2000. In Tunisia, MANFORME, a vast programme aimed at modernising vocational training and employment, is running from 1996 to 2004, supported by the European Union. It is designed to work alongside the modernisation of the Tunisian economy. Its overall aim is to place "high quality vocational training at the service of the system of production".



## 3. TRAINING OCCUPATIONS

# 3

The typology of training occupations and staff regulations are expressed most clearly in the public sector, particularly within the Ministry for Vocational Training. In Tunisia, for example, the law states: “*vocational training staff mainly comprise trainers, apprenticeship advisors, training advisors and vocational training inspectors*”. In addition, the ministry and the National Centre for Training of Trainers and Educational Science (CENAFFIF) have defined terms of reference for skills (see the box for the terms of reference for the job of trainer).

### 3.1 OCCUPATIONS

The biggest category is, of course, that of trainers. We are including in this category tutors who work in enterprise-based training, particularly apprenticeships. In Algeria, the public vocational training sector has some 9,500 trainers. In Morocco, the public vocational training sector has slightly over 6,000 trainers: 30% are women, over 60% are aged between 35 and 45 and 60% belong to the OFPPT. The private sector employs around 5,000 trainers, according to statements made by the institutions. In Tunisia, there are around

3,000 trainers in the public sector (about a quarter of whom are women) and 2,000 in the private sector. 80% of them belong to the ATFP. Around 350 are apprenticeship advisors, who take responsibility for placing apprentices in companies and following the progress of the apprenticeship, in addition to their training role.

There are also members of staff who provide the trainers with various kinds of support:

- At vocational training centres, these include directors, bursars, training coordinators (called technical and educational assistants in Algeria, work superintendents or directors of studies in certain Moroccan institutions, technical coordinators in Tunisia), training coordinators of the section or department and general supervisors. Sometimes, these members of staff also carry out training.
- In training institutions for trainers: trainers of trainers.
- Outside the institutions, in charge of what could be called a regulatory function providing encouragement, assessment, organisation, monitoring and advice: these are mainly inspectors.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

- There are also the educational experts who analyse vocational contexts and situations, identify requirements in terms of skills and design and plan training programmes. They also monitor the preparation of the training programmes, take part in their implementation and award contracts.

In the remainder of this report, we shall mainly concentrate on the trainers.

### 3.2 REGULATIONS

The public sector members of staff are usually permanent employees subject to government staff regulations, including any specific regulations specific to each ministry or agency.

It should be pointed out that in Tunisia, the decrees that govern vocational training personnel have not been published. In Morocco, the OFPPT has its own regulations. For the remainder of government staff there is an interdepartmental training regulation. In most cases, the trainers are officials of the ministry concerned such as engineers, technicians and administrators, seconded for training purposes. In Algeria, the Ministry of Vocational Training's trainers are divided into two levels, vocational trainers (PEP) and specialist vocational trainers (PSEP). Only the PSEPs (20% of the total) can train higher technicians and trainers.

In addition, the public sector in all three countries calls upon part-time or contract staff to offset deficiencies in certain special fields and in newly-established institutions. In Morocco, some ministerial departments have no permanent trainers but only part-time trainers. In Tunisia, in recent years the ATFP has recruited young trainers who are just beginning work. This is a programme aimed at providing employment for young graduates.

In the private sector, trainers come under ordinary law. Surveys, although sometimes out-of-date and not always accurate, show that most of them are part-time: nearly 90% in Algeria, 70% in Tunisia and nearly 60% in Morocco. In Morocco, regulations specify that these trainers should be "participants

in the working world", meaning that they should have a main occupation, giving them technical competence, and should not be "full time part-timers". In Tunisia, public sector trainers have a second source of employment as part-time trainers in the private training sector. There are also many self-employed trainers.

Company trainers, particularly the tutors, are company employees who are not subject to specific regulation.

### 3.3 TRAINERS' TASKS

The terms of reference shown in the box for Tunisia give a good idea of the tasks which trainers must, in principle, carry out.

In Algeria, the regulations governing trainers in public institutions state that they are responsible for:

- Providing theoretical and practical training.
- Managing practical courses in the working environment.
- Taking part in organising and conducting tests, examinations and competitive examinations.
- Taking part in looking for apprenticeships.
- Taking part in studies, technical and educational research and preparing training and advanced training programmes.

In practice, trainers usually concentrate solely on preparation and training, giving courses of 18 to 36 hours per week. The staffing rate in the public sector is one trainer for 12 trainees in Tunisia, one for 15 in Morocco and one for 32 in Algeria, where non-residential training courses play a greater part. The staffing rates in the private sector are not representative since most trainers work on a part-time basis. Courses held in the working environment, provided as part of the training programmes and which constitute a good link with the working world, have often gradually become courses conducted at institutions. Trainers involved with apprenticeships, who should coordinate training with that provided by the company tutors, do not do this adequately, mainly through due to lack of resources for travelling.

**Tunisian Ministry of Vocational Training****JOB DESCRIPTION FOR THE ROLE OF TRAINER****(extracts)****DEFINITION**

In order to develop the competences required to practise a trade or skilled profession, the trainer passes on knowledge and personal and practical skills. He or she contributes to meeting the training centre's targets and plays a part in developing the training programme.

**JOB DESCRIPTION**

Within the framework of a given administrative and training organisation, the trainer:

Sets up and runs training courses enabling students:

- to obtain a qualification,
- to find a job.

Conducts assessments:

- of training skills,
- of professional skills.

Takes part in managing and organising training courses.

**SCOPE OF THE JOB**

The trainer may be involved in initial or continuing vocational training, on a residential, block release, apprenticeship or distance learning basis.

He or she works in a public or private sector vocational education and training organisation or in industry.

**BASIC ACTIVITIES**

- Running training courses.
- Preparing training courses, developing and maintaining educational resources.
- Assessment of outcomes.
- Supervision of students.
- Managing and organising training courses.

**ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES**

- Monitoring of teaching, technical and professional innovation.
- Contributing to the development of training programmes.
- Recruiting and orientating trainees.
- Careers guidance.
- Managing apprenticeships.

**3.4 TRAINER RECRUITMENT**

Permanent members of staff in the public sector may be recruited through competitive examination or by tests and interviews. In Tunisia, competitive examination is used. Both methods are used in Algeria, where competitive examination predominates and tests and interviews are open to self-employed craftsmen with ten years' experience. This category of trainers is intended to provide training in specialist craft fields. In Morocco, recruitment by competitive examination is rare and the process of test or interview is more often used. This is the case in the OFPPT. Outside the OFPPT,

direct recruitment within the public service is twice as common as recruitment by competitive examination.

**In Tunisia**, a degree is required at present. This level of recruitment is a result of the political upgrading of vocational training. Between 1993 and 2000, it was observed that members of staff were younger and their educational level higher. For example, the proportion of graduates increased by some 30% to over 60%. However, although these young trainers have high levels of scientific and technological knowledge (engineers and higher technicians) they often lack occupational skills as a result of their limited or non-existent industrial

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

experience. In the centres, they mingle with former trainers recruited from among workers and technicians from the public and private sectors. The latter have for the most part had experience in companies and long teaching experience, but generally speaking do not have sufficient technical training to enable them to develop and acquire the new occupational skills required for the new technologies and new training approaches.

**In Algeria**, competitive examinations are organised by the vocational training departments in each administrative area (wilaya). There are two levels: PSEPs must have a degree certifying a university education of from four to five years following the baccalaureate; PEPs a higher technical certificate or equivalent qualification. Craftsmen recruited as PEPs do not require a qualification. The employment market situation means that training jobs are increasingly attracting young graduates in search of a first job. In 2001, for example, there were eleven candidates for one position in some specialist fields. This is particularly true of women, for whom these jobs provide flexibility in terms of working hours, whilst being socially advantageous. Conversely, these jobs are not very attractive to professionals, as a result of their lack of advantages in terms of salary and career development.

**In Morocco**, the majority of trainers are recruited from among those completing vocational training courses. Some institutions select their trainers from among their own award-winning students as soon as they have left, before they have acquired occupational experience. The craft section recruits craftsmen to teach their trade in the vocational training centres, without qualification requirements.

In the private sector, recruitment to the job of trainer is not governed by specific rules in Algeria and Tunisia. A survey carried out in Tunisia in 1996 indicated that the level of qualification of the permanent trainers was lower than that of the part-timers. 74% of the permanent trainers were only at the level of skilled employee whereas 71% of the part-timers were at a level at least

equivalent to supervisor. In Morocco, on the other hand, the law has required, since 2003, that trainers in the private sector hold a qualification in vocational training at a level higher than the one they are training for, have work experience and have had at least two months' educational training.

No general recruitment rules apply to companies. The tutors are themselves often craftsmen or skilled workers in small and medium-sized companies.

### 3.5 STAFF ASSESSMENT AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT

In Algeria, by way of example, trainers at public institutions are assessed on two levels. Firstly within the institution by their hierarchical superiors, and secondly externally by education inspectors. The internal assessment affects the performance bonus, which is paid to the trainers on a half-yearly basis, as well as their career progress. The external assessment relates to their establishment as a public officer in the case of trainers who are undergoing a probationary period immediately after their recruitment. It also permanently affects their career development. It also enables the inspectors to decide upon topics to be discussed during training days and to make recommendations to the vocational training institutions on technical and educational topics for advanced programmes. The staffing rates of inspectors to trainers vary from 100 to 180. However, the extent of the work carried out by inspectors in assessment and training, the wide areas they cover and the low resources made available to them reduce the effectiveness of their technical and educational support activities. Similarly, in Morocco, some training ministries do not have an inspection unit, and only 58% of trainers indicate that they have been inspected since their entry into the career.

Trainers may continue their careers in the field of training support, as mentioned above, or in the productive sector. Very few people are, however, involved in these forms of mobility, either because there are not many support positions, or because

targeted jobs do not carry the same level of freedom, or because productive sector jobs are precarious, particularly since the personnel regulations do not always allow return after industrial experience.

#### 3.6 CONCLUSION

The level of true professionalism among trainers is a difficult issue.

In the public sector, the academic recruitment level is high, but those recruited more often than not lack work experience. The competitive examinations do not seem to guarantee technical competence. It is not certain whether academic qualifications alone can guarantee this, still less teaching aptitude. The quality of the trainers does, therefore, depend in the first place on the initial training that follows recruitment and the assessment at the end of the probationary period, which leads to permanent status. This arises from the history of vocational training but if it is to be continued in a rapidly-changing market economy, there will also be a need to provide continuing training for trainers.

For non-permanent personnel, such as the part-timers, it is often their first job and they do not have access either to initial or advanced training courses.

The situation is particularly worrying in the private sector where training is rarely given and where there are many part-timers, even though Moroccan law has now strengthened the requirements.

Also, the trainers' existing skills and those used in training at present do not correspond with the development of vocational training towards a far wider opening to companies and integration within a market economy. This is particularly true of familiarity with educational science, which must accompany the transition to a philosophy of economic demand, and with the information and communication technologies that are needed for enterprise competitiveness. Here again, continuing training of trainers may hold the key to the necessary development, both in order to adapt to current change and, in the future, to take account of the permanent change that is characteristic of the economy at present.

It is not difficult to realise the importance of training. Having said that, there seems to have been no official assessment of the requirements in terms of trainers over the coming years, which makes any policy in this field difficult.



## 4. TRAINING OF TRAINERS

# 4

The public sector vocational training of trainers' scheme was set up during the last two decades, at a time when there was a high level of trainer recruitment. The legal framework has not changed in recent years. In Tunisia, for example, the 1993 Act to direct vocational training states: "Training and retraining programmes on a technical and educational level are implemented in order to prepare personnel to carry out their duties and to adapt them to technological change and changes in teaching methods". This distinction between technical training and educational training is the key to the present organisation in the three countries.

### 4.1 TRAINING OF TRAINERS' INSTITUTIONS

There is no course, whether university or otherwise, which provides a specific qualification for the occupation of trainer. Recruitment is carried out from among graduates who have had initial academic training, which is normal for all professional activities, and, in some cases, from within public departments and from among craftsmen. The vocational training

operators take responsibility for the initial and advanced training of the personnel they have recruited. In each country, each of the main public institutions has its own training of trainers' system. There are also some private institutions that work from time to time with companies with internal training structures. Most trainers in the private sector, and trainers and tutors working in companies do not, however, receive any training at present.

#### 4.1.1 IN ALGERIA

... during the 1970s, at the time when the requirements in terms of trainers were relatively low, the initial technical and educational training of personnel in the vocational training sector was carried out by a single structure, the National Vocational Training Institute (INFP). In the mid-1980s, the increase in the number of institutions led the public authorities to introduce a training of trainers' scheme, conducted by six Vocational Training Institutes (IFPs). These institutions are organised as a network, along with the INFP, which remains responsible for training executives and for educational science.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

The network is two-dimensional, in the sense that each IFP covers a geographical area containing 80 to 85 institutions together with their annexes, as well as being specialised in two or three occupational fields. At the time these institutions were created, their geographical spread was based on the specific fields of the great industrial centres of the time. Each institute conducts the initial and advanced educational training of trainers in its area in all fields. In addition, it provides the institutions with terms of reference and training programmes, plans the subjects for examination at the end of training and assists the vocational training directorates in each administrative area (wilaya) in organising competitive examinations for the recruitment of trainers. In the fields in which it is specialised, it conducts the advanced technical training of trainers throughout the country, which leads to problems of finance and distance, and hence absenteeism.

The institutions are provided with a high level of flexibility in organising initiatives for training and advanced training. This devolution is aimed at encouraging a high level of trainer participation in the advanced training programmes. It may, however, explain why, despite the network architecture, the IFPs have become gradually independent of one another and are formed as educational islands between which exchanges of experience and practices are infrequent. Another difficulty in training trainers is that the IFPs also carry out another kind of task, this being the training of higher technicians. At the present time, some 60% of these institutions' capacity is taken up by this training, which should, however, be progressively removed.

### 4.1.2 IN MOROCCO

... the situation varies according to the institutions.

For some years, the OFPPT has formalised the occupation of trainer by drawing up terms of reference. On this basis, a skills assessment has been devised, used firstly in both initial and continuing training initiatives. A training

programme has been devised to prepare new trainers for carrying out their jobs, and a continuing training programme is defined each year. Each regional directorate has a unit that prepares the skills assessment and educational part of the training programme. Technical training is conducted by the Skill Development Centres.

Certain other public institutions have, in the past, provided some or all of their trainers with educational and sometimes technical training in specialist institutions. Many others have provided their trainers with no initial or continuing training. They were directly appointed, without educational preparation, and learned their tasks "on the job" as they went along. This is particularly the case for seconded or part-time personnel. At present, it appears that no initial training of trainers exists outside the OFPPT. In the health sector, however, there are plans to reopen educational training programmes that have been closed for some ten years through lack of need.

### 4.1.3 IN TUNISIA

... the three main public vocational training institutions each have a body responsible for training trainers:

- The Tunisian Agency for Vocational Training (ATFP) has the National Centre for Training of trainers and Educational Science (CENAFFIF), which also works for other smaller institutions (Ministries of the Interior, of Defence, etc. and companies). This Centre also carries out other tasks: the development of educational research, the promotion of new training ways and methods, and participation in preparing and updating educational resources. It also takes part in preparing and updating educational programmes and methods, and assessment techniques, as well as developing cooperation and exchanges with similar institutions in Tunisia and abroad.
- The Agricultural Advisory and Training Centre (AFVA) has the National Agricultural Educational and Continuing Training Institute in Sidi Thabet.

- The Higher Institute for the Hotel Industry and Tourism in Sidi Dhrif conducts training of trainers for the Tunisian National Tourist Office. The initial role of this Institute is, however, the provision of initial training for the hotel industry and tourism and, until now, the initial and continuing training of trainers in the tourism sector has for the most part taken place abroad, mainly in Switzerland and France.

In addition, the private institutions provide training of trainers which is mainly intended for large public and private companies, which have training departments as part of their management of human resources. Transport, banking, tourism and the services sector are among those that provide these initiatives.

### 4.2 TRAINING SCHEMES

#### 4.2.1 IN ALGERIA

... permanent trainers in the public sector receive educational training when they take up their jobs. This training is compulsory in order for them to be accepted after a probationary period of nine months' service. During the 1980s, however, there was massive mixed recruitment of people whose abilities did not always prove to be adequate. An upgrading programme was set up in 1990, which resulted in the organisation of advanced technical and educational courses.

- a) *The Vocational Training Institutes (IFPs) plan the initial educational training courses* and send timetables to each vocational training directorate in the relevant geographical area at the beginning of each year. These directorates are then responsible for registering their trainee trainers for the course that appears the most appropriate. They sometimes decide to defer training by some months in order to overcome urgent deficiencies, with the result that trainers have to teach without previous preparation. This situation often leads to trainers acquiring on-the-job educational

reactions that are subsequently difficult to correct, in addition to changes in the Institutes' timetables, which further accentuate the delays in entering training.

The educational training lasts for twelve weeks for PEPs and 24 weeks for PSEPs. It is organised in block release sessions between the IFP and the institution and comprises two stages:

- The first, the content of which is identical for both categories of trainer, is devoted to the acquisition of basic educational knowledge and lesson simulations. It takes place at the IFP.
- Experienced trainers provide the second, lasting from 2 to 12 weeks depending upon the category, in the relevant institutions. During this time, the PEPs prepare a course report and the PSEPs a training completion project. The project topics are left to the initiative of the trainee trainers and can be educational, instructional or technical.

The content is defined by the educational training terms of reference, which were prepared and confirmed in 1993. It is based on educational topics, topics linked with general knowledge of the vocational training sector and the various tasks carried out by the trainer. In actual fact, the only topics usually covered relate to the educational part, supplemented by some general knowledge and lesson simulations.

These topics mainly relate to:

- Psychology of the individual
- Educational objectives
- Teaching sessions
- Assessment
- Educational methods
- Communications
- Group dynamics
- The methodology of programme design
- Knowledge of the vocational training sector
- Inspection.

Among topics which are rarely covered are the design and use of educational aids, documentary resources, the various

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

training methods, the methodological approach to adapting and updating training course content, and equipment maintenance. Also, the number of hours allocated to the various subjects is disproportionate to their importance.

This is explained in part by the profiles of the trainers responsible for the training. They are usually PSEPs, specialised in educational science or industrial psychology, with little experience in the field of applied education or vocational training. They tend to favour theoretical training, reproducing standard content. These trainers of trainers have moreover not received any specific training to conduct this type of course.

In addition, we have seen that the training terms of reference date back to 1993. They should be updated to respond to current needs by expanding the trainers' skills. For example, topics should be provided on in-service training, management styles, negotiating skills, training consultancy, etc.

The courses are mainly based on theoretical papers and group discussions. Work in subgroups is sometimes organised. Note-taking occupies a large amount of time, since photocopied documents are often not available. The blackboard is still the favoured tool. There are overhead projectors, but they are rarely used. Some institutes have cameras but they are rarely used through lack of trained operators, although they could form a means of recording lesson simulations so that trainees could become aware of the improvements they need to make.

The practical course marks the stage at which the trainer puts the acquired educational knowledge into practice. This is somewhat removed from its objective, since the trainee is requested to write a report describing the conditions under which the teaching will take place and the degree of respect for the educational rules shown by other trainers in the institution.

The participants are assessed continually throughout the training course and, upon completion, a certificate is issued to the trainee trainers specifying their ability to provide training.

b) *Advanced technical and educational courses* intended for trainers in-service are planned by the vocational training institutes, which annually publish a guide for each programmed course, specifying its topic and the duration and period in which it will be conducted. This guide is then distributed to the vocational training directorates, which are responsible for registering trainees in each administrative area (wilaya). The trainers can register for topics of their choice without any prior condition. Many register for several topics. The planned improved programme is, however, far from ready and a significant level of absenteeism is noted during the courses. A survey carried out in the Alger wilaya during 2000 revealed an entry ratio of 12% of trainers taking advanced educational courses and a presence ratio amounting to scarcely half of those registered. In addition, the groups are very mixed, which, according to those running the courses, causes serious difficulties.

Since 2000, however, the programme has been strengthened by organised courses during the summer holidays. In the first year, 2 500 trainers were able to take part, including trainers working in the private institutions.

The courses, which last for one or two weeks, are almost always organised in a residential form in the vocational training institutes. Courses held in the productive sector are still exceptional. At the end of each course, a certificate is issued to the participants. These were once used for promotions through aptitude lists, but this form of promotion has now been replaced by promotion through tests and competitive examinations, which is doubtless one reason for the loss of interest in these advanced courses.

The topics for the technical courses generally relate to programmes taught by trainers in their institutions. They are chosen by the training institutes but without in-depth study and, more particularly, without taking account of the recommendations made by the inspectors who visit the institutions. The content of the advanced educational course is often the

same as that for initial educational training, supplemented by topics linked with the new information and communication technologies.

The methods used are, however, often different from those used in the initial educational training. The presentation techniques are more open, case studies are used, work is carried out in small groups, with teaching aids (overhead projectors, flip charts, etc). This situation appears to result from the fact that participants are experienced teachers and do not adapt easily to approaches that do not allow them to take an active part in the discussion and the running of the sessions.

### 4.2.2 IN MOROCCO

... at present only the OFPPT organises trainers' initial training. Before being allocated to an institution, the new trainers go through a skills assessment and then, for between nine and twelve months, take educational and technical training based on the terms of reference of their jobs, and a period of practical application in an institution.

64% of the working public sector trainers (mainly those of the OFPPT) have had initial training, of an educational type. During the last three years, only 27% of trainers have had advanced training, advanced technical training being more frequent (62% of trainees) than advanced educational training (38%).

The main topics covered in advanced training are general education (20% of participants) and communication techniques (16%). An effort is made with regard to in-service training and programme preparation (7- 8% of participants). The competency-based approach is a priority field of action for the Ministry for Vocational Training, but at present there is only a modest effort made to train trainers (0.2% of trainees).

Here again, the situation varies widely among the institutions. The OFPPT conducts the most significant and most

organised programmes. Its training programme is prepared each year using skills assessments. The Department of Youth and Sport draws up a training programme based on regional demand. Knowledge of this demand enables it to set up ten training initiatives, of seven days' duration, accommodating around 25 trainees each (for a total of around 350 permanent and 220 part-time trainers). In other public institutions, continuing training is intermittent where it exists at all. It consists more often than not of short-term initiatives. The Ministry for Vocational Training is, however, seeking to ensure that those in charge are aware of the need for a training of trainers' policy. In the last two years, it has financed initiatives for six of these institutions.

A recent survey showed, moreover, that some three-quarters of trainers express a desire to take part in advanced technical and educational training. The proportion is high among almost all the institutions. The highest was recorded at the OFPPT, where it exceeded 80%. It is also true that at present, some trainers refuse to travel to take part in advanced training, because their expenses are inadequately covered. Most officials are also aware of the needs in this field. Their requests are for the most part connected with the foreseeable development of vocational training: the job-training relationship, training equipment, teamwork, educational planning, etc.

Training of trainers is at present non-existent in the private sector. Legislation specifies at least two months' initial educational training, but this measure has still not been implemented.

### 4.2.3 IN TUNISIA

... training of trainers in the two main public institutions, the ATFP and the AVFA, is routinely organised. On the other hand, training in the tourism sector (a hundred or so trainers) is embryonic as a result of the fact that until recently it was subcontracted abroad.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

Since the establishment of the CENAFFIF, this activity has expanded considerably. From 1993 to 2000, training initiatives covered 7 563 participants, one trainer could take up several of these initiatives.

This figure is to be compared with the number of trainers in the ATPF, which at present number some 2 100, having increased five-fold during the last seven years. In addition, the number of participants in training initiatives increased from 113 in 1993 to 1 479 in 2000.

Two-thirds have received educational training and one-third technical training. The duration of the training tends to increase in accordance with the skills required and the trainees' prior knowledge. In some sectors, it can last for sixteen months. In addition, the CENAFFIF organises training sessions for apprenticeship advisors and in the field of educational science. Lastly, it is beginning

to offer training designed for enterprise tutors, with the financial support of international organisations. So far, around 300 tutors have been trained.

At the time of recruitment by the ATPF, trainers receive long-duration training (6 to 12 months), which includes courses in the centres and in companies. Some working trainers can take advantage of all or part of this training when their own training has been inadequate. The massive level of recruitment carried out in the past has led the CENAFFIF to provide technical and educational training for trainers with insufficient experience in the vocational and educational fields. The duration of the initial educational training programme is 390 hours. The programme is divided into modules. The programme offered by way of experiment is shown in the box below.

### **CENAFFIF educational training programme modules**

- The trainer's job: positioned having regard to the trainer's job and educational training
- Introduction to the educational psychology approach
- Communication: communications in the vocational environment
- Introduction to information and communications technology
- The training programme and accompanying documents
- Assessment: assessment of the trainees' knowledge
- Preparation of a training follow-up
- Presentation of a training follow-up
- Monitoring trainees in in-service training: monitoring in the enterprise using support equipment
- Integration within the working environment.

For technical training, the CENAFFIF has for a long time called upon foreign institutions, particularly the Adult Vocational Training Association (AFPA) in France. It then diversified its service providers. Nowadays, this type of training is mainly carried out in Tunisia. The technical training initiatives are usually of short duration, with the exception of retraining, for example in the clothing, leather, footwear, wood and furnishing sectors. For initial training, training programmes are prepared on the basis of ATPF trainer recruitment programmes. For continuing training, they are based firstly on requirements expressed by the trainers

and secondly on the new skills required for curricula to be run in the centres. Since 2000, the CENAFFIF has developed, as an experiment, an approach enabling it to implement these advanced technical training programmes.

Training sessions for enterprise tutors are short (one or two days). They relate to the presentation of the vocational training system and enterprise-based training methods (block release or apprenticeships), communications and human relationships within the tutorial scheme, the tutor's function.

It is a matter of ensuring that the participants are able to identify the legal bases of enterprise-based training and the roles of the various participants in the training, to use working situations as training situations and to assess the trainees' knowledge. The vocational institutions take part in guidance (see box), but the success of most of the initiatives is prejudiced by a low level of enterprise involvement. The attendance rate is not what could have been desired. In addition, it has not really been possible until now to assess the impact upon the quality of training in the company.

**Training of tutors in a partnership context**

The National Federation of the Hotel Industry has concluded a framework agreement with the National Centre for Training of trainers and Educational Science to train employees in the sector who are involved in supporting and training apprentices and in-service trainees. It is a matter of a need identified and expressed by the Federation in connection with its policy of developing the sector's human resources.

This initiative has made it possible to involve the central (ATFP, CENAFFIF) and regional departments (general directorate of vocational training and employment, directorates of the training centres in the hotel industry sector).

The initiative is implemented in three stages:

- Preparation of the initiative and identification of requirements
- Carrying out training sessions
- Assessment of the training provided.

Eight seminars have been organised for 154 tutors, covering several training fields: cookery, pastry-making, and restaurant management, room service and reception.

At the National Institute for Agricultural Education and Continuing Training (INPFCA), educational training is designed for in-service trainers. It lasts for two weeks and its content comprises three parts: the preparation of a modular vocational training programme, the implementation of a modular vocational training programme and the use and production of teaching materials. The technical training offered

covers four fields: agricultural techniques, fishery techniques, the environment and management. Two other fields were added to the 2001-2002 programme: information technology and health and safety at work. The duration of a training session varies from three to five days. The Institute directs its initiatives in accordance with the programme to improve agricultural and fishery training, to develop new training courses and to develop cooperation between the trainers and the departments concerned. During 2000, 165 trainers of a total of 425 took part in the various advanced technical and educational training actions.

Educational methods vary, whether within the CENAFFIF or the INPFCA, with regard to presentations, individual work, company visits, etc. The CENAFFIF has an audiovisual department and multimedia laboratory. There are, however, no standardised training aids. No diplomas are issued, although up until recent years, the CENAFFIF issued certificates covering the objective and duration of the training session.

**4.3 FINANCING**

The financing of the public training of trainers' institutions does not take account of the specific nature of this function or of its present importance. In some cases, the criteria for allocation of budget credits are based mainly on the numbers trained, in the same way as for the vocational training centres. In other cases, the budget is not defined by taking account of the workload plan of the institution concerned, but rather in accordance with the budget for the previous year increased by a given percentage (3% to 4%). In addition, the institutions have little management independence. The support of foreign fund sponsors is an appreciated addition that enables targeted initiatives to be carried out.

The costs of training of trainers are poorly identified and rarely set apart in the institutions' budgets.

#### 4.4 THE QUALITY AND RELEVANCE OF TRAINING OF TRAINERS

The training of trainers at the time of recruitment constitutes one of the most important stages in their job preparation. It enables them to gain familiarity with the basic techniques required for carrying out the work of training.

Such training is, however, still not guaranteed, either in the smaller public institutions or in the private sector, or, generally speaking, for part-timers. Most trainers work, therefore, without having received any occupational training and the problem is further aggravated by the growth in the provision of vocational training.

Where it exists, initial training is very variable in terms of duration. More often than not, it is limited to educational aspects, without linking the latter with technical aspects. Also, its content is traditional, based on educational training sessions, which, although admittedly essential, does not encourage the acquisition of skills connected with new trainer requirements.

Advanced training during career development does not appear to respond to demand. In one of the countries, there is a high level of unsatisfied demand. In another, absenteeism from courses is high and only a small number of trainers have had the benefit of advanced training to overcome weaknesses, and update and strengthen educational knowledge. In the third country, a survey of trainers showed that information relating to training (objectives, content, duration, etc.) appeared to be difficult to obtain.

The identification of requirements and their expression in specific training programmes and actions seem, therefore, to form weak links in the process of organising the schemes put in place. Most initiatives are based on the principle of supply and are set out in training brochures that have been drawn up without taking account of actual requirements. The impression is that there is no concerted and coherent plan, based on a national programme, but rather a series of actions from which the trainers can “pick and choose” or in which they may be nominated to take part.

The educational approaches and methods used to train trainers are various and correspond overall to the objectives set. They do, however, retain a rather traditional approach with almost no educational innovation, which does not encourage the trainees to introduce any into their own work. Training generally taken place within the institutions and rarely calls upon companies, even for the technical aspects.

The trainer trainers are often young and highly-qualified academically, but in general have no teaching experience in the centres or vocational experience in companies, which hardly adds to their credibility among trainers. Their skills are rarely assessed. Foreign assistance is still necessary, particularly in the technical fields, but there appears to be some difficulty in integrating this within the training dynamic and ensuring that it responds to the country's requirements.

Finally, it is difficult to reach any decision regarding the effectiveness of the training initiatives due to lack of assessment either of the results obtained or the improvement in the trainers' performance.

## **5. WHAT STRATEGY CAN BE USED TO DEVELOP TRAINING OF TRAINERS?**

# 5

### **5.1 ANALYSIS OF THE SYSTEM**

In each of the three countries, the training system is well-established for the main public institution. It has allowed vocational training to develop and, up to a point, to respond to the challenges set out at the end of Section 3. The terms of reference for training occupations have now been defined and training of trainers can be based on these. There are also some innovative pilot projects, where the training of trainers is well-linked with the economic world. The boxes below give examples of this.

We have, however, seen that a relatively high number of trainers have not received job training. Also, the training sessions are too short to enable all the necessary skills to be acquired, and there is difficulty in taking account of the new requirements that arise from the necessary development of the vocational training systems.

Some of these difficulties arise from the fact that there is no preparation for the job of trainer prior to recruitment. The smaller vocational training institutions do not have the resources to train their trainers. When such training exists, it takes place after recruitment. It cannot, therefore, be too long for cost reasons. It is expected that technical skills will have been acquired before recruitment, but this is not always verified. They do not, therefore, form part of the initial training and such skills are, therefore, incorrectly linked with educational skills.

This lack of job training before recruitment also results in the institutions responsible for training trainers directing the training more towards initial training than continuing training. This is, generally speaking, a feature of the vocational training systems in the Maghreb countries that is no longer compliant with the requirements of an uncertain and rapidly changing world.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

### **A new initial training of trainers' model in the clothing sector in Tunisia**

The Tunisian universities train few if any clothing technicians or technologists. The ATFP has carried out massive recruitments of trainers in this field (around 150) but without technical or vocational experience. The CENAFFIF has been given responsibility for designing an initial training scheme for these trainers.

Trainer training is implemented in three parts:

- Basic and specialised technological training
- Educational training at the CENAFFIF and in the centres
- Training within companies, finishing with vocational and educational projects.

A networked operation:

- A network of training centres for technological training and for introduction to the occupation of trainer
- A network of trainers and resources for training new trainers, most of whom have been retained to form a first generation of trainer-assessors.

Enterprise-based training: agreements have been signed with companies to take on trainee trainers on the basis of a specification and with specific monitoring by international experts.

Competency-based training: the programme for training trainers was established on the basis of skills to be taught to the young.

Multiple assessment: assessment of the scheme, assessment of the trainees, assessment of the scheme by the trainees.

### **Training of information technology trainers in Algeria**

At the beginning of the year 2001-2002, the Ministry for Vocational Training, in partnership with Microsoft, implemented a training initiative for all specialist information technology trainers. The project is planned for three years and will cover more than 200 trainers in its first year of implementation, with the possibility of several years' renewal. The training programme relates to Microsoft products and enables the participants to be MCP (Microsoft Certified Professional) certified on the basis of international standards. The training is carried out by a private institution approved by Microsoft.

The Ministry for Vocational Training is establishing, for each IFP, "group resources" which will then be responsible for multiplying this kind of training and also enabling institutions to be recognised as "Certified Technical Education Centres".

Another reason for the difficulties relates to the dispersed nature of the institutions as well as of the vocational training institutes. The present architecture corresponds with a historical situation characterised by a multiplicity of ministerial training departments and by the absence of a national vocational training policy coordinator. The programmes for training of trainers are still heterogeneous, both in terms of content and approach. The main institutions (the Ministry for Vocational Training network in Algeria, the OFPPT in Morocco, and the ATFP in Tunisia) have a sound training of trainers' system, such as that of the IFPs in Algeria or the CENAFFIF in Tunisia. Most of the sector-based public and private institutions do not, however,

attain the critical size that would enable them to set up adequate training, whether initial or advanced.

The training of trainers' institutions also generally carry out other functions. It is for this reason that the Tunisian CENAFFIF contains educational science in its actual title. Similarly, in Algeria, the network formed by the IFPs and the INFP is responsible for drawing up and distributing curricula and, more broadly, for educational science (see box). Upon analysis, the link between training of trainers and educational science is of dual interest. Firstly, the programmes and curricula, which are the result of the national educational science programme, have to

## 5. WHAT STRATEGY CAN BE USED TO DEVELOP TRAINING OF TRAINERS?

be implemented by the trainers and thus form one of the bases for their initial and advanced training. Secondly, the development of vocational training, and in particular that of continuing education, requires the centres to organise training to respond to the local requirements of companies and individuals, and requires their trainers to be prepared. In Morocco, 28% of public sector trainers say that they are involved in the preparation of training programmes, but this preparation is still considered too centralised.

### **Revitalisation of the educational science network in Algeria**

This relates to the establishment of national educational specialist-field committees and national educational sector-based committees. These committees provide an area of cooperation and analysis regarding the development of vocational qualifications. They make decisions on all aspects of the terms of reference, the educational programmes and the inclusion or removal of specialist fields. They also provide opinions on and suggestions for the definition of policy in the vocational training sector.

The committees are composed of trainers from public and private institutions, of programme designers, inspectors and professionals. To ensure their continuity, it is planned that they will have a statutory foundation.

The relevant ministry will determine their work programme, on the basis of requirements expressed by the various participating organisations (companies, professional associations, training institutions, etc.)

The project is in its initial stage, which consists of choosing the members of the committees.

Educational research and exchanges with foreign institutions provide other bases for training of trainers and it is good that these run alongside such training. On the other hand, the participation of the Algerian IFPs in training higher technicians, which takes up half of their personnel and equipment resources, acts to the detriment of training of trainers. It also influences, in a way that is not necessarily positive, a level of confusion between the advanced training of trainers in the technical field and the initial training of technicians.

There is yet another interest in the proximity with educational science, to be found in the definition itself of training of trainers' programmes. In Morocco, for example, the OFPPT bases trainers' initial and continuing training programmes on a job-reference system and skills assessments. In Tunisia, the CENAFFIF has set up, by way of experiment, an approach starting from identification of the skills required by the trainers to run the new curricula in the vocational training centres. This definition should still not be left solely to the training of trainers' institutions, and the latter should have, for reference, a policy covering the management of human resources in the vocational training sector. This does, however, seem rare.

The management of training of trainers too often follows bureaucratic methods, which do not encourage professionalism or any development of relationships of the customer-supplier type. Few initiatives are carried out on a contractual basis, the vocational training institutions rarely draw up genuine specifications and the training of trainers' institutions rarely draw up genuine offers. The methodology to be used for needs assessment and setting them out in programmes is inadequate or nonexistent. The initiatives are rarely assessed, which makes it difficult to analyse the results and effectiveness of the training. The method of budget allocation does not assist the emergence of discussion on requirements and responses. Even though there are striking exceptions, as we have already mentioned, the economic world is more often than not left out of the procedure for training trainers.

The result of this situation is that many training of trainers' initiatives are split up and intermittent and a number of advanced training initiatives are implemented under a principle of supply which does not respond in full to the requirements in terms of trainer skills. Furthermore, the schemes introduced do not lead to a certification of skills, and successful completion of training is not automatically marked. To summarise, the lack of transparency in relationships between the various participants (trainers, the heads of the

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

vocational training institutions, training of trainers' institutions and the economic world) has a considerable effect upon efficiency.

All this may explain the slow adaptation to new requirements in training jobs, which is due in part to educational reflexes acquired during many years of work by trainers and educational chiefs. It could even be said that trainers, as a body, are still passive or even hostile to the new directions taken by vocational training, such as in-service training, the greater level of independence of the centres, partnerships with companies and economic organisations, etc. Some skills, which are necessary to ensure that the vocational training systems attain new objectives, are rare among working trainers. It is no longer sufficient for them to possess educational skills. They also need technical, organisational and training management skills. These are needed for the introduction of new programmes, with consequential physical and educational adjustments, the management of in-service training, the design and organisation of continuing training, the evaluation and recognition of skills acquired within the working environment, etc.

It is also necessary to work with the trainers' trainers, who are perhaps still more cut off from the realities of the economy and employment. For them, there is hardly any training or advanced training. At present, they only receive training provided for small numbers through international cooperation. This situation does not encourage them to question their educational methods. In particular, the use of information technology and communications techniques should be considerably expanded in training of trainers.

The advanced training given to the trainers is, however, not restricted to formal courses in the training of trainers' institutions. It also takes place during their work at the centres, through teamwork, where colleagues assist with adaptation and retraining programmes, through drawing up and introducing new programmes, through implementing new

educational practices and through enterprise-based training initiatives that enable trainers to identify new working methods whilst monitoring trainees in companies. The training of trainers' institutions appear to give little attention to this "informal" training. They do not have the tools and mechanisms needed to identify the trainers' level of knowledge outside the training courses.

The establishment of a resource centre providing access to educational documents (course aids, audiovisual and multimedia tools, etc.) in connection with educational research and international cooperation, would provide a support for this "informal" training. In Tunisia, the Higher Institute for the Hotel Industry and Tourism has carried this out in the tourism sector. In Algeria, there is an Intranet network project which will initially provide the trainers with a method of experience exchange and later a method of distance learning.

## 5.2 STRATEGIES ADOPTED

### 5.2.1 IN ALGERIA

... the Government programme for vocational training, when defining the priority objectives and the strategies implemented (August 2000), points out:

*"The improvement in the level of trainer qualification depends upon a vast programme of advanced training, upgrading and retraining working trainers. This will run intensively for a period of five years and will then become permanent. It will also revise the educational programmes in force in the training of trainers' establishments, raise the level of educational requirements for internal and external recruitment and organise immersion courses in the working world. The higher education institutions will form a contribution, as well as bilateral and multilateral cooperation programmes".*

This strengthening of training of trainers will be made possible by the decision to remove the training of higher technicians from the six vocational training institutions.

## 5. WHAT STRATEGY CAN BE USED TO DEVELOP TRAINING OF TRAINERS?

This training will be removed from the IFPs in June 2003.

Also, the establishment of institutions in regions of high industrial density, in accordance with their special fields, should allow contact with the working world, as long as this dynamic is conducted by leaders and trainers with the ability to convince companies of the interest in such a partnership.

Achievement of the set objectives will, however, call for a revision of the terms of reference covering training of trainers and additional financial resources.

In addition, it should be mentioned that the project aimed at upgrading vocational training in Algeria (April 2001), which is supported by the European Union, provides for *"the training of trainers in the public and private institutions on the basis of these programmes"*. This forms part of the design and implementation of training programmes adapted to company requirements.

### 5.2.2 IN MOROCCO

... increased trainer professionalism is a major concern for the leaders of the public vocational training institutes. The ministries responsible for training, at the instigation of those responsible for vocational training, are trying to introduce continuing training schemes. The establishment of a national training of trainers' centre is one of the planned solutions.

In addition, legislation lays down training requirements for trainers in the private sector. These should be effective from 2003. With this in mind, the Ministry for Vocational Training has recently prepared terms of reference for the job of trainer in private vocational training, and has planned advanced training initiatives.

### 5.2.3 IN TUNISIA

... the training of trainers' strategy arises from the objectives of the MANFORME programme (1996-2004), particularly its component relating to strengthening the

quality and quantity of training to bring it into line with demand in terms of enterprise skills. It is based in particular on *"training trainers in the public and private institutions to meet the requirements of the new terms of reference adapted or developed by the CENAFFIF"*.

Various initiatives have been introduced:

- Intensification of the initiatives designed for new trainers and in part for those already working. These initiatives are organised by the CENAFFIF and directed jointly with the ATFP for the purpose of respecting the timetables contained in the projects for designing or restructuring vocational training centres. 6 297 people took part between the beginning in 1997 and the year 2000.
- Standardisation of the training occupations, accompanied by the establishment of a unit directing this training under the technical direction of the CENAFFIF, and new procedures for managing this training (see box).
- Preparations for the establishment of a pole of excellence, named FORMAPOLE, in educational science and training of trainers. This project is aimed at providing the national vocational training system with a structure and expertise capable of supporting the relevant reform.
- Jointly conducting certain projects to build up new links between the various training of trainers' institutions. In the long term, the CENAFFIF must play in full its role of general institution, and consequently widen its services to all the vocational training institutions. In order to advance in this direction, an initial partnership agreement was signed in September 2001 between the Agricultural Advisory and Training Centre (AVFA) and the CENAFFIF. Its objective is *"the consolidation of joint work in the field of training of trainers and educational science, for the purpose of supporting these two functions within the National Agricultural Education and Continuing Training Institute"*. A second agreement is in the process of preparation between the CENAFFIF and the Higher Institute for the Hotel Industry and Tourism.

## INNOVATIVE PRACTICES IN TRAINERS AND TEACHERS TRAINING IN THE MAGHREB COUNTRIES

### **Definition of trainers' qualification standards**

The Ministry of Vocational Training and Employment has established a project entitled "Training of trainers' Strategy", which is aimed at standardising training occupations and introducing a permanent training of trainers' function. The main results anticipated are:

- The drafting of terms of reference for trainers' educational training using the terms of reference for the job of trainer which were adopted in 1999. The programme has been developed in accordance with competency-based approach.
- The introduction of a permanent trainer training function, basically in the form of a "training of trainers" unit established within the CENAFFIF technical department. The preparation and establishment of training of trainers and the establishment of a team of permanent trainers for the educational training courses.
- The production of terms of reference for the jobs of apprenticeship advisors, educational scientists and trainer trainers.

The tenth economic and social development plan (2002–2006) contains a new set of aims and initiatives. These include:

- The training of trainers who can consolidate skills acquired in the fields of enterprise-based training and the competency-based approach. The aim is to train 500 tutors and 500 trainers per year in the field of in-service training, and 500 trainers per year in the competency-based.
- The training of trainers in new information and communications technologies so that they can master these technologies, become involved in wider skills networks and pass these skills on to young trainees.
- Consolidating the CENAFFIF's experience and expertise in order to train educational consultants and trainers of trainers.
- Promoting networking between the training of trainers' and educational consultancy institutions and linking this network into a much wider international network.

## 6. STRATEGIC PROSPECTS AND TARGETS

# 6

The training of trainers has seen many strategies and initiatives in the past. Despite their number however, they are not the result of a real strategic analysis of the problems of developing vocational training, as seen at the end of Section 2. Training of trainers is only given a small place in the strategies for developing vocational training. In Algeria's project aimed at upgrading vocational training (April 2001), it occupies fifth place in the list of aims. In Tunisia's MANFORME programme, it does not make an appearance among the first three levels of importance. What is more, dialogue with trainers on the reforms planned and their role within them is still lacking. This is one explanation for their passivity and hostility.

The reasons for this situation are to be found at the point where two seemingly opposite trends, one conservative, one innovative, meet. In spite of the official statements on the importance of training of trainers, institutions and their staff are resistant to change. Therefore policy-makers find it hard to tackle this area. The second trend, which uses the demands of the competency-based

approach as its justification, has the following line of reasoning: The vocational training system should be at the service of the productive sector. It is up to employers to define which skills they need. The training system can then prepare programmes and organise resources to produce these skills. Trainers are one of these resources and must be trained to teach the programmes. But, if people are to adapt to an uncertain and rapidly-changing world, initial training must be targeted and brief and should then be expanded through continuing training.

This mechanical line of reasoning does not encourage professionalism. Human resources are not an inert resource. Members of staff play a part at all levels and the success of an endeavour depends upon their motivation and commitment. The productive sector is, therefore, not only at the service of the employers but also of the workers and society in general. We need to find a meeting point between the different viewpoints of these various partners, something which is difficult during a period of rapid change. Training can help to reach a consensus. However, in training, those to

be trained are not just inert material to be shaped, but are active participants in the process. Here again, common ground must be found between the trainers, the trainees and the content. The trainers must be trained to build this. In this respect, they are educational scientists rather than plain skill producers. They must be aware of the needs of companies, workers and society as well as the aspirations of the trainees. They therefore need a window on the economy and society and need the tools to find the common ground that underpins training. This provides the guidelines for the trainers' training, in which they in turn are the participants, in the same way as they are participants in the development of vocational training. It is on this basis that one can speak of trainer professionalism.

Philippe Perrenoud wrote that professionalism increases when, within the job, the use of pre-established rules makes way for strategies directed by objectives and a code of ethics<sup>3</sup>. As far as the trainers are concerned, they do not have a performance occupation consisting of transmitting knowledge defined in full from the outside, by means of set teaching programmes. It also covers:

- Contributing to a definition of the skills to be acquired, through liaison with companies.
- Assessing the expectations, abilities and prior knowledge of the people to be trained.
- Using these assessments as a basis, developing the educational methods that are most likely to help the trainees acquire the skills they need both inside and outside the training centres.
- Building partnerships to allow for in-company training, by placements in companies.
- Assessing the knowledge acquired by trainees, during and at the end of training.
- Personal development to improve their own professionalism.

- Involvement in running the training centre and developing the national vocational training system.

A process of strategic planning for training of trainers should make it possible to develop a sense of collective responsibility between the Ministry for Vocational Training, other training departments, representatives of the private training sector, both sides of industry and trainers to provide greater coherence in terms of objectives, programmes and initiatives. Coherence is also needed within initiatives to train support personnel, as described in Section 3.

Using as our basis the analysis of the training of trainers' scheme mentioned in 5.1, a number of strategic targets stand out:

- The first consists of looking at the possibility of **designing training of trainers, within the context of professionalism in the higher education institutions**, to be fed by specific technical training courses, linking technical and educational aspects. The existence of such training courses would allow a more rigorous recruitment of trainers and would bring fresh impetus to the question of their training and mobility.
- Questions should be asked on **the multiplicity of public institutions and of training of trainers' institutions**. This is something which is more a result of the historic situation than with the present-day development of the economy and the labour market. Encouraging the existing institutions to work as a network, particularly with regard to training of trainers could be a start<sup>4</sup>. Since the private sector is a significant player in VET, it is important to ensure its trainers receive both initial and continuing training. This begs the question of whether the public and private training of trainers' institutions can complement each other in order to reach this goal.

---

<sup>3</sup> "Formation initiale des maîtres et professionnalisation du métier (partie I)", *Revue des sciences de l'éducation*, [Initial Training and Occupational Professionalism (Part I), Science and Education Review], Vol 18, No 3, Montreal, 1993.

<sup>4</sup> The Turin Conference (May 2000), mentioned above, recommends "strengthening the networking of training institutions".

- Changes in the labour market require a **search for a new balance between initial and lifelong continuing training** with the emphasis on the latter, whether it relates to vocational training in general or training of trainers<sup>5</sup>. This highlights the importance of educational science as a tool for what we have called linking between the various partners and further links with training of trainers. As things stand, providing an effective response to requests for continuing training from individuals and companies very much depends upon trainers' attitudes and skills including needs assessment, diagnostics and arranging tailor-made training initiatives.

Training of trainers also calls for a transition from **a philosophy of supply to a philosophy of demand**, through the introduction of occupational terms of reference, tools for identifying needs, discussion between the participants and partners and assessment of initiatives. In particular, the trainers' characteristics should be better known and observations made by inspectors in the centres should be used more effectively. Initiatives should be confirmed and taken into account in the members of staff' careers and mobility. In addition, training of trainers should be related to the world of work in terms both of its design and its performance<sup>6</sup>.

- Change is also necessary *in the methods* used for training of trainers. This can be made possible by developing information and communication technologies in the training of trainers' institutions in order to diversify the methods of training -

through distance learning, for example - improving their educational effectiveness and encouraging trainers to pass on these techniques. It is also important to raise awareness of the existence of trainers' "informal" training during their work and encouraging this by setting up resource centres together with educational research and international cooperation. This informal training must also be taken into account within the career, particularly with regard to trainers' participation in innovative actions underway in the institutions where they work. All these changes will require the implementation of a programme of **initial and continuing training for trainer trainers**<sup>7</sup>.

These directions should result in progress in achieving the aim, which is that training of trainers should constitute a tool for involving the staff in the development of vocational training, as well as in defining and acquiring the new skills needed for this development.

Finally, our study shows the great similarities in training of trainers in all three Maghreb countries. This would justify an increased level of exchange and cooperation between them in this field. As was said during the Turin conference, "exchanges of experiences between countries can avoid the need for difficult tasks involved in defining professional standards for teachers and trainers, in addition to their inclusion within training programmes upon recruitment or during the course of employment".

5 See, in the introduction, the quote on this subject from the Turin conference.

6 See, in the introduction, the quote on this subject from the Seoul conference (April 1999), mentioned above.

7 "As things stand at present, teacher training has been considered problematic because the universities responsible for training also need better training and industrial experience" (Seoul Conference).



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- ATFP:** Agence tunisienne de la formation professionnelle  
*Tunisian Agency for Vocational Training*
- AVFA:** Agence de vulgarisation et de formation agricole (Tunisie)  
*Agricultural Advisory and Training Centre (Tunisia)*
- CENAFFIF:** Centre national de formation de formateurs et d'ingénierie de formation (Tunisie)  
*National Centre for the Training of Trainers and Educational Consultancy (Tunisia)*
- IFP:** Instituts de formation professionnelle (Algérie) : organismes de formation de formateurs (il en existe six)  
*Vocational Training Institutes (Algeria): Training of trainers Institutions (six)*
- INFP:** Institut national de la formation professionnelle (Algérie) : organisme chargé de la formation des cadres et de l'ingénierie pédagogique  
*National Vocational Training Institute (Algeria): Executive Training and Educational Science*
- INPFCA:** Institut national pédagogique et de formation continue agricole (Tunisie)  
*National Agricultural Educational and Continuing Training Institute (Tunisia)*
- MANFORME:** Programme de mise à niveau de la formation professionnelle et de l'emploi (Tunisie)  
*Programme to Upgrade Vocational Training and Employment (Tunisia)*
- OFPPPT:** Office de la formation professionnelle et de la promotion du travail (Maroc)  
*Vocational Training and Job Promotion Service (Morocco)*
- PEP:** Professeurs d'enseignement professionnel (niveau inférieur, Algérie)  
*Vocational Trainers (lower level, Algeria)*
- PSEP:** Professeurs spécialisés d'enseignement professionnel (niveau supérieur, Algérie)  
*Specialist Vocational Trainers (higher level, Algeria).*

